Edward Fitzpatrick Crangle

The Origin and Development of Early Indian Contemplative Practices
Edward Fitzpatrick Crangle

The Origin and Development of Early Indian Contemplative Practices

1994

Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden
This work is dedicated to Sylvia
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE ................................................................................. xi
ABBREVIATIONS ..................................................................... xiii

1 INTRODUCTION
The Problem ............................................................................... 1
The Project .................................................................................. 8
The Methodology ......................................................................... 11
The Structure of the Work ....................................................... 15

2 EARLY VEDIC CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES
Introduction ................................................................................. 19
The Texts ..................................................................................... 19
Vedic Religious Practice ............................................................ 22
Early Vedic Contemplatives ....................................................... 24
The Rsis (Seers) .............................................................................. 25
The Munis (Ecstatics) .................................................................. 28
The Yatis (Ascetics) ................................................................. 31
The Brahmacārin ....................................................................... 32
Early Vedic Contemplative Powers ........................................... 36
Brahman ....................................................................................... 36
Dhī: Devotional Prayer/Visionary Thought ................................ 39
Power and dhīh ........................................................................... 44
The instrumentality of dhīh ...................................................... 45
Yoga in the Rg Veda........................................................................ 46
"Yoking", "directing" etc. of manas (mind) .................................. 48
Tapas .......................................................................................... 53
Practices in the Brāhmanas and Aranyakas ............................... 55
Upāsanā ....................................................................................... 59
Conclusion .................................................................................. 62

3 CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES IN THE UPANISADS

Introduction .................................................................................. 65
Upāsanā ......................................................................................... 72
The Nature of Upāsanā ................................................................. 73
   (a) Vedic deities as manifestations of Brahman ...................... 76
   (b) Perceptible forms as contemplative symbols .................... 77
   (c) The imperceptible forms of contemplative symbols ........... 79
Vidyās and legends regarding upāsanā ....................................... 82
Qualifications of the worshipper ............................................... 85
Yoga .............................................................................................. 90
Terms Derived from "Dhyai" .......................................................... 91
Meditation on "Om" .................................................................... 94
Meditation (dhyāna) on the gods............................................... 95
The combination of dhyāna with upa + ās ................................ 97
Terms Derived from "Yuj" ............................................................. 99
On the Term "Yoga" .................................................................... 103
Definition of Yoga in the Upanisads ......................................... 104
Control of the sense-organs ...................................................... 106
Tapas ............................................................................................ 107
Process of upāsanā and yoga techniques: a synthesis ............... 109
Different Stages in the Process of Yoga ..................................... 111
Prānāyāma: introversion and breath control ............................ 112
Pratyāhāra: withdrawal of the senses from external objects ...... 114
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dhyāna: profound meditation</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dhārāna: concentration of the mind</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarka: contemplative enquiry</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samādhi: absorption</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Physiological/Anatomical Details of Yoga</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The yogin as worshipper and meditator</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turya: the fourth state of consciousness</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The restraint/destruction of mind</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4 CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES IN THE PALI SUKTAS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Threefold Training (Tividha Sikkhā)</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Meditative Methods</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Religion of Self-Mastery</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two Trainings in Insight: Metaphysic and Realisation</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner vs. Perfected One</td>
<td>155</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Five Powers</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The seven factors of enlightenment (bojjhangas)</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sīla</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Buddhist Metaphysic</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Samādhi</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sammā Vāyāma: Right Effort</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skilled states of mind vs. unskilled states of mind</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The divine abodes (brahma-vihāras)</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sammā Sati: Right Mindfulness</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catu-satipatthāna: the four applications of mindfulness</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kāyānupassanā: mindfulness of body</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vedanānupassanā: mindfulness of feelings</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cittānupassanā: mindfulness of consciousness</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Table of Contents

- **Dhammānupassanā: mindfulness of mind-objects** ........................................ 193
- **The six recollections (anussati)** .............................................................. 195
- **Resemblance of satipatthāna to upāsanā** ............................................. 198
- **Summary of sammā sati** ........................................................................ 199
- **Sammā-Samādhi: Right Concentration** .................................................. 200
- **The jhānas** ............................................................................................. 201
- **Anāpānasati: mindfulness of in-and-out-breathing** .................................... 207
- **Paññā** ........................................................................................................ 214
- **Abhiññā: Supernormal Knowledges** ....................................................... 214
- **Sammā jāna: right insight** ....................................................................... 224
- **Cessation: the Synthesis of Concentration with Insight** ....................... 235
- **The cessation of bodily, verbal, and mental formations** ......................... 239
- **The means to cessation according to the Buddha** .................................... 244
- **Nine cessations: the meditative object determines the result** .................. 248
- **Jhāna and cessation as objects of meditation** .......................................... 250
- **The impermanence of concentration of mind in insight** ......................... 252
- **Sammā Vimutti: Right Liberation** ......................................................... 255
- **Conclusion** ............................................................................................. 256

- **5 CONCLUSION** ..................................................................................... 267
- **APPENDIX 1** .......................................................................................... 275
- **APPENDIX 2** .......................................................................................... 279
- **APPENDIX 3** .......................................................................................... 285
- **BIBLIOGRAPHY** ...................................................................................... 297
PREFACE

This book arises from my abiding, compelling interest in consciousness or awareness. I have found the subject to be the most elusive of research topics. In exploring the limits of what might present a reasonable grip on the overall problem and thus help satisfy this interest, I turned to the study of early Indian contemplative practices as a means of perhaps gaining some experiential insight and intellectual understanding of consciousness. Given the nature and extent of the topic, the results of my efforts are necessarily limited. In spite of its defects, however, I hope that this work will help illuminate a small, yet important corner of Indian religious life, and also stimulate further interest and research in consciousness studies.

On the whole, this book embodies my dissertation bearing the same title. The thesis was accepted by the University of Queensland for the award of Doctor of Philosophy in the School of Studies in Religion. I am indebted to many scholars who gave invaluable aid during the research and preparation of the manuscript. Of those in India, I wish to thank in particular Prof. K.P. Jog, Deccan College Post-graduate and Research Institute, Poona; Dr. Shiv Kumar, University of Poona; and Dr. Neela A. Velkar, University of Bombay. In Australia, I thank in particular Dr. Philip C. Almond, The University of Queensland; Dr. Peter G. Fenner, Deakin University; and Dr. Greg Bailey, La Trobe University. All offered instrumental advice that resulted in significant improvements to the book. I am particularly indebted to my supervisor, Dr. Rod S. Bucknell, for his compassion, calm encouragement, and expert critique.
It was his unfailing and evident interest in both my work and progress that ensured the completion of the task and set an example I hope to emulate. I also wish to express my appreciation for the concern and assistance of the late Professor A.L. Basham who helped launch this project. Certainly, none of these people are responsible for any remaining errors or deficiencies.

In writing this preface, I think especially of my mother May, father John, and sister Janet who gave their wholehearted, unqualified support to the project, as did Alison and Les Lohmann, my parents-in-law. I am saddened that my mother did not live to see the book completed and published.

In connection with this publication, I thank Dr. Michael Lattke, The University of Queensland, for his foresight and direction; and the Editor of this Harrassowitz series Prof. Dr. Hans-Joachim Klimkeit, Universität Bonn, for undertaking publication of the book.

My research was aided, in part, by an Australian Commonwealth Postgraduate Research Award. The main financial burden, however, was carried by my wife, Sylvia. I am forever grateful for her love and support.
ABBREVIATIONS

A. Anguttara Nikāya
Ait. Aitareya Upanisad
AitAr Aitareya Aranyaka
AitBr Aitareya Brāhmaṇa
AV Atharva Veda
Brh. Brhadāranyaka Upanisad
Chānd. Chândogya Upanisad
D. Dīgha Nikāya
Kaus. Kausitakī Upanisad
KausBr Kausitakī Brāhmaṇa
M. Majjhima Nikāya
Mund. Mundaka Upanisad
RV Rg Veda
S. Samyutta Nikāya
Svet. Svetāsvatara Upanisad
Tait. Taittirīya Upanisad
TS Taittirīya Samhitā
Vism Visuddhimagga

In the transcription of Sanskrit and Pāli, retroflex consonants, the capital ā, and the capital ō are printed in Italics.
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

The Problem
Early Indian contemplative practices have rightly been the subject of much scholarly research and debate. The Vedic technique of realising of a vision (dhi) through word and the sacrifice; Upanisadic worship-meditation (upāsanā); and Buddhist techniques of mindfulness (satipatthāna), of concentration (dhyāna), and the cultivation of insight practice (vipassanā) -- these varied techniques of mental development, here covered by the broad term "contemplative practices," occupy a prominent place in the Indian religious traditions and therefore deserve close scholarly attention.

One aspect of early Indian contemplative practices that holds particular interest is the problem of their origin and development.1 Unfortunately, this problem has not received the attention it deserves; and the few books and articles that do address the problem present some sharply conflicting opinions.2 Such opinions - or theories - can be categorised into two main types: (1) those which argue for a Vedic (and thus Aryan) origin, from which contemplative practices have developed in a linear fashion through the Upanisads to the Buddhist Tipitaka; and (2) those which propose some form of synthesis of indigenous (i.e. non-Aryan) practices with Aryan methods. The synthesis theory is the more prevalent in Western scholarly works, while the


2 The following discusses these opposing opinions found in the works of authors such as A.B. Keith, J.N. Farquhar, and H. Zimmer etc.
linear argument is the preferred one among Hindu scholars. To date, this conflict of opinions remains unresolved. The debate continues.

This work is a contribution to the debate. It is an attempt to provide a body of evidence which may contribute to an eventual resolution of the question of the origin of early Indian contemplative practices.

The linear theory was adopted by early western researchers particularly in the days before the Indus Valley finds. For example, Monier-Williams stated that the Buddhist meditational ideal corresponds to meditational practices depicted in the Rg Veda\(^3\).

A. Berriedale Keith, writing in 1923, supported this view arguing further that *yoga* was

... a development and rationalization of asceticism, Tapas, which is acclaimed in the Veda as all powerful, and it stands clearly in close relation with the metaphysics of both the Upanisads and the early Śāṅkhya.

Keith understood early Buddhism to have inherited the practices perfected by Brāhmaṇic ascetics.\(^4\)

Hauer saw the forerunners of *yoga* as being Ksatriya (and thus Aryan) contemplatives whose practices strongly influenced and combined with yoga-


like practices of the sacrificial priests. This, according to Hauer, resulted in the *Upanisads.*

Heesterman's view on the debate calls for a Brāhmanical source of the typical yogic or contemplative practice of world-renunciation. As he sees it, the mutual dependence of groups led to independence from rivals and to


> From the primitive concentration of the consecration, in which the mind was directed in hot passion or wild rage at the loved or hated object, through concentration on the deity plus its being during the sacrifice which led to states of rapture, there developed gradually a mystical-philosophical trance/union with the ground of all things [i.e. *Brahman*], which led the mortal out of the bewilderment of the world of multiplicity back into the world of the deity, from which he had once arisen.


7 That is to say, renouncing the human condition. As a concept, renunciation is usually associated with a pessimistic world-view and the recognition of the need for salvation via the pursuit of a path of world-negation and abandonment of desire. Heterodox groups such as Jainism and Buddhism hold such a view. According to Feuerstein,

> Where the world is viewed merely as a seat of disaster and sorrow, there is ultimately no other choice than to step out of it. This implies that man has to renounce and abandon everything that the universe harbours in its infinite circumference. Renunciation is the only road to salvation.

Georg Feuerstein, *The Essence of Yoga,* (London: Rider, 1974), p. 52. Terms which denote a turning away from worldly objects and values include "vairāgya" (aversion, freedom from worldly desires, etc.) and its Pāli synonym "virāga" (passionlessness, absence of desire, etc.: a term widely used in Buddhism). As Feuerstein sees it, vairāgya is a post-Vedic term which, in practice, means the same as thirstlessness (*vīrūṣṇa*), abandoning (*pīṭha*), and renunciation (*samyāda*). Ibid., p. 35.

Mahāvīra, the founder of Jainism, renounced all possessions to practise meditation and asceticism because of his profound disinclination for worldly life. His adoption of such practices is referred to as "The Great Renunciation". Padmanabh S. Jaini, *The Jaina Path of Purification,* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1979), pp. 12-15. In addition to trance states (*dhyāna*), Jain austerities include the renunciation of all egoistic thoughts (*vyutsarga*) as well as the renunciation of passions which effectively block a mendicant from the total renunciation of evil actions, i.e. actions that could harm himself and others. Ibid., p. 120 & p. 251.

The Buddha's early abandonment of a luxurious home-life to become a contemplative with no longing for sensual desires is similarly referred to as "The Great Renunciation". Edward J. Thomas, *The Life of the Buddha as Legend and History,* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1975, 1st publ. 1927), pp. 51-60. In addition to his early life and public career, legends about the Buddha are also arranged around his Renunciation and Enlightenment. Ibid., p. 227.
individualisation of the Brāhmaṇic ritual. This, in turn, brought about interiorisation of the ritual followed by world-renunciation as Brāhmaṇical praxis.\(^8\) That is to say, the true Brahmin was the renouncer or individualised sacrificer.

Indian researchers have generally also favoured the linear theory. For example, both Barua and Radhakrishnan present detailed arguments favouring the *Upanisads* as the source of yoga.\(^9\) Barua sees the *Māndūkya Upanisad*’s conception of four planes of consciousness as having afforded a basis for the four modes of meditation found in the Buddhist, Jaina, and Patañjala systems.\(^10\)

Such scholars attempt to interpret the origin and development of early Indian contemplative practices as a sequential growth from an Aryan genesis. They do not acknowledge the possibility of a non-Aryan component. This alternative possibility has, however, been favoured by a number of scholars, particularly in more recent times, thus challenging not only the scholarly lin-

---

\(^8\) Heesterman argues that

It is often thought that the institution of renunciation emerged as a protest against brahminical orthodoxy or that it originated in non-brahminical circles or even non-aryan circles. ... there is full scope for recognizing the influence of extraneous beliefs and practices, for instance the various forms of asceticism. But the important point is that these influences do not seem to have made a decisive irruption causing a break in the development of religious thought. They seem rather to have fitted themselves into the orthogenetic, internal development of Vedic thought. Or one might say that these extraneous beliefs and practices were not in principle dissimilar from those that obtained among the adherents of the pre-classical ritual.

Heesterman, op. cit., p. 11.


\(^10\) ibid., pp. 183-184.
ear interpretation but also traditional Hindu assumptions about the *Vedas* as the source of all spiritual knowledge.

One early form of this alternative argument was that advocated by J.N. Farquhar. He maintained that yogic practices sprang ultimately from popular magic and self-hypnosis applied to win supernatural powers. He saw the austerities associated with such activity as the application of religious discipline to the body and mind by the *Vânaprasthas* (forest-dwellers). The term "*yoga*" came to be used to cover all of these methods of physical and mental control. From the discipline of the *vânaprasthas* and under the influence of Upanisadic philosophy there emerged the *parivrâjahs* (wanderers), *bhiksuks* (mendicants), and *samyâsis* (renunciates). Farquhar attributed Jaina practices to the same source. His argument raises the possibility of a third theory: popular magic may have been practised not only by the indigenous population of pre-Aryan India but also by the *Aryans*, yielding the possibility of a popular Aryan but nonetheless non-Vedic origin of *yoga*.

The most notable opponent to the linear argument is Heinrich Zimmer. In his *Philosophies of India*, published in 1951, he points out that the chief feature of Upanisadic mysticism is a search for the realisation of the ultimate identity of the universal soul within the individual by a life involving the practice of *yoga*. Zimmer contends that the term "*yoga*" acquires its specific meaning in the context of three major concepts, all of which are found in the thought of the early Jainas. These are the concepts of: (1) souls, (2) rebirth, and (3) release from rebirth. Neither the *Rg Veda*, nor the later *Vedas*, give any indication of the doctrine of transmigration of souls or rebirth which

---


is firmly established by the time of early Buddhism.13 As well, the Rg Veda offers no themes of salvation or of desire to end repeated death and rebirth; nor does it even contain evidence of belief in a cycle of death and rebirth.

Such themes characteristically associated with specific yoga practices are, Zimmer states, without Vedic antecedents. They appear unexpectedly in the Upanisads, which suggests that they represent a tradition indigenous to India, i.e. that they were non-Vedic and non-Aryan.14 Buddhism and Jainism, which give prominence to contemplative practices and do not accept Vedic authority, represent, Zimmer contends, the thought and practices of pre-Vedic India.15 Sāmkhya-Yoga16 and Vedānta also incorporate non-Vedic contemplative practices, though they accept Vedic authority. Zimmer therefore argues for a synthesis of Aryan and non-Aryan systems17 in the post-Vedic period. The non-Aryan or Dravidian18 component is most purely retained in

13 Horsch considers that the idea of rebirth need not be attributed to non-Aryan sources: it could have been evolved by the Kṣatriyas out of Vedic tradition. He notes further, however, that it probably did come from pre-Aryans -- especially in the north-east (Magadha, Banares, etc.). The Kṣatriyas, he states, were more in contact with the pre-Aryans than were the Brāhmīns. Horsch, op. cit., pp. 446-447 & p. 475.


15 ibid., p. 217.

16 In contradistinction to the linear/synthesis debate, Oldenberg argues that resemblances between Buddhism and Yoga indicate reciprocal borrowing, rather than unidirectional borrowing. As he sees it, however, it is Buddhism, in the main, that has borrowed from Yoga -- Sāmkhya and Yoga being the source of much Buddhist doctrine and praxis. Buddhism, though, was not merely an offshoot of yoga. The Buddhist contribution, according to Oldenberg is: 1) emphasis on causality; 2) reading of "being" into "becoming" - especially resolving the soul into processes. H. Oldenberg, Die Lehre der Upanishaden und die Anfänge des Buddhismus, (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1923), p. 279 & pp. 285-286.

17 See Appendix 1 for a brief appraisal of the identity of ethnographic groups in early India.

18 See Appendix 1.
Jainism.\textsuperscript{19} Indus Valley archaeological evidence also suggests an indigenous \textit{yoga} tradition.\textsuperscript{20}

Zimmer's views have won some strong support, particularly among Western scholars. For example, Ninian Smart, in his \textit{Doctrine and Argument in Indian Philosophy}, supports Zimmer's hypothesis, arguing that, although yogic concepts were discussed by Upanisadic authors, yogic practices were atypical of early Brâhmanism:

... yogic practices, later to be formulated in classical Yoga ... were developed in a tradition if anything hostile, like Jainism and Buddhism, to theism.\textsuperscript{21}

Belvalkar and Ranade also argue for an early non-Aryan influence. They maintain that unusual non-Aryan practices and modes of worship transformed early Vedic ritual into an act of sympathetic magic which then evolved into the contemplative practices called \textit{yoga}. They contend that

... the sudden impulse towards the contemplative life of a recluse which comes upon us towards the end of the Upanisadic period ... could not have been invested with the glory and glamour that we see it being done in the absence of that fusion of cultures and philosophies that probably took place in the course of the Aryan advance along the Ganges.\textsuperscript{22}

The arguments for a non-Aryan origin of early Indian contemplative practices and ideas are pervasive, particularly Zimmer's. Yet the linear argument continues to find support. The conflict of opinions remains, demonstrating that the problem is far from being resolved.

\textsuperscript{19} Zimmer op. cit., p. 219.

\textsuperscript{20} See Appendix 1.


Introduction

The Project
The present study attempts to contribute to this debate by examining certain of the most relevant textual evidence from an historical perspective. Although metaphysical notions are important in articulating the goal of Indian meditative practices, they are not a major concern in this study. Attention here is restricted mainly to how Indian contemplative practices are depicted in three major groups of texts: the Rg Veda, the thirteen principal Upanisads, and the Pâli Sutta Pitaka.

Broadly, the task is to examine the pertinent portions of those texts in order to determine the degree to which they support either the linear theory or the synthesis theory. In particular, attention is directed to details regarding contemplative praxis as depicted in the texts. It is this that provides the organising structure of the study, within which the data may reveal relevant relationships, lines of development, and possible sources of influence.

The choice of the Rg Veda, the principal Upanisads, and the Pâli Suttas as the texts to be studied calls for some justification. According to Max Müller, whose relative chronology of the texts is adopted in this study, the Vedic period may be divided into four periods: 1) the Chandas period, to which belong the primitive Vedic hymns, 1200-1000 B.C.; 2) the Mantra period, including the later sections of the Rg Veda, 1000-800 B.C.; 3) the Brahmanas (to which are appended the Aranyakas), 800-600 B.C; and 4) the period of the Sûtra literature, 600-200 B.C. Berriedale A. Keith, "The Age of the Rig Veda," in E.J. Rapson (ed.), The Cambridge History of India, vol. 1, (Cambridge: Cambridge Uni. Press, 1922, pp. 77-113), p. 112, quoting Max Müller, Rigveda Samhitá, vol. IV, pp. vii, sq. Gonda is not entirely happy with Müller's relative chronology of the texts. He feels that

As far as the Rgveda is concerned this computation is not unreasonable, but, ... the ideas of chronological succession of 'literary genres' and of corresponding forms of religious interest can no longer be maintained. ... Where we would like to base our historical research on reliable facts [re dating] the only information given to a student of Indian literature often consists of a mythologized biography or some vague, general and contradictory statements. This is not only due to the fact that most literary works
Introduction

... only the most rudimentary elements of the characteristic features of all Indian literature after Buddhism, the belief in metempsychosis, pessimism, and the search for deliverance.\textsuperscript{24}

The \textit{Aranyakas} and the \textit{Upanisads} bridge the gap between the \textit{Brāhmanas} and the later fully established doctrine of transmigration coupled with enquiry into the nature of \textit{Brahman} -- to the detriment of the Vedic sacrifices etc. Scholarship fixes the death of the Buddha, and therefore the origin of the \textit{Pāli Suttas}, at approximately 480 B.C. The older \textit{Upanisads}, on the whole, are dated earlier than 550 B.C.; \textsuperscript{25} the later ones extend some centuries into the Buddhist era, some, especially the \textit{Maitrī}, showing strong Buddhist influence.

The \textit{Brāhmanas} and \textit{Aranyakas} represent a shift in emphasis away from polytheism and the power of ritual towards a recognition of the potency of mind and contemplation. This new interest is represented in an intermingling of scattered post-Vedic material which, according to Macdonell, may be predated by the oldest Upanisadic material.\textsuperscript{26}

By way of example, Macdonell discusses the \textit{Gopatha Brāhmaṇa}:

are little historically conditioned but also, and in many cases primarily, to the well-known tendency of pre-literate and traditional societies to subordinate the individual to the group; to the static, and theoretically unchangeable nature of the traditional Indian society -- to a comparatively weak sense of individuality.

J. Gonda, \textit{Vedic Literature (Samhitās and Brāhmaṇas)}, (Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1975), p. 3 & p. 22.

\textsuperscript{24} ibid.


This Brāhmaṇa consists of two books, the first containing five chapters, the second six. Both parts are very late.... The matter of the former half, while not corresponding or following the order of the sacrifice in any ritual text, is to a considerable extent original, the rest being borrowed from Books XI and XII of the Satapatha Brāhmaṇa, besides a few portions from the Aitareya. ... The mention of the god Śiva points to its belonging to the post-Vedic rather than to the Brāhmaṇa period. Its presupposing the Atharva-veda in twenty books, and containing grammatical matters of a very advanced type, are other signs of lateness. The latter half bears more the stamp of a regular Brāhmaṇa, being a fairly connected account of the ritual in the sacrificial order of the Vaitāna Srauta Sūtra; but it is for the most part a compilation. The ordinary historical relation of the Brāhmaṇa and Sūtra is here reversed, the second book of the Gopatha Brāhmaṇa being based on the Vaitāna Sūtra, which stands to it practically in the relation of a Samhitā. About two thirds of its matter have already been shown to have been taken from older texts.... A few passages are derived from the Satapatha, and even from the Pañcavimsa Brāhmaṇa.27

Farquhar, in his remarks on the constant addition of fresh Brāhmaṇa material to the old, states:

It is impossible to set down this mess of material in strict chronological order, because each Brāhmaṇa is a collection of pieces of different age and origin.28

In light of the above observations, it cannot be overemphasised that the problems of disentangling such components would be enormous and the returns would be relatively slight. Therefore, although the Brāhmaṇas and Aranyakas contain material that would be useful and relevant in the present context, these two classes of text attract meagre reference and are for the most part excluded from the study on mainly practical grounds. Consequently, as regards orthodox literature, attention is focused on the Rg Veda, which according to the linear theory is the ultimate source of later accounts of contemplative practice, and the Upanisads which contain an abundance of explicit references to such practices, and which can be located within a relatively clear chronology. Occasional reference is also made to the Yajur Veda - and the Atharva Veda. The reasons for including the Pāli Suttas are self-evi-

27 ibid.
dent: it is in the *suttas* that Indian contemplative practice is described most fully, explicitly, and coherently. The reasons for excluding the Jaina and Yoga texts are again largely practical. Although the systematic Yoga treatises as they exist today were written down long after the rise of Buddhism, some brief reference is made to the practices systematised in Patañjali's *Yogasūtras* by way of comparison. The same applies to Jaina sources for similar reasons.

Jainism has much in common with Buddhism, while presenting a marked divergence in essential points, i.e. it lays far more stress on asceticism while holding an elaborate belief in the soul etc. The Jains claim their works predate early Buddhism. Although Jainism is older than Buddhism, Jaina contemplative practices are excluded from this present study mainly because their early texts are no longer extant. Only brief descriptions survive in later literature. Also, Jaina works containing instructions in meditation and concentration, like the systematic *Yoga* treatises, post-date the rise of Buddhism. On the whole, important references to Jaina contemplative practices are located mainly in the mediaeval period. Consequently, they occur too late for inclusion in this study. Though tantalising similarities between the Buddhist and Jaina contemplative practices can be found, the above facts place investigation into such techniques beyond the scope of this work.

**Methodology**

The source texts were examined in the original Sanskrit or Pāli, and in English translation. For the *Rg Veda*, the source text used was Sontakke's

---

Ralph T. Griffith's *The Hymns of the Rgveda* was adopted as the standard English translation. J. Gonda's exhaustive study, *The Vision of the Vedic Poets*, was found valuable as a secondary source aiding in the examination of the early Vedic contemplative practices. Here, Gonda makes the term "dhā" (religious thought, devotion, prayer) and its derivatives the exclusive subject of an entire work.

For the thirteen principal *Upanisads*, S. Radhakrishnan's *The Principal Upanisads*, was employed for the original texts and for a reliable English translation with valuable notes. Hume's *The Thirteen Principal Upanishads* was also referred to for a variant translation. Neela Velkar's unpublished work, *Upāsanā in the Upanisads*, proved to be an exceptional secondary source assisting in the study of Upanisadic contemplative practices. Finally, for the *Pāli Suttas*, the Pāli Text Society's publications furnished both the original texts and reliable English translations. Of the numerous instructive other translations of these texts are consulted also.

---


secondary sources in the Buddhist area, Vajirañāna's *Buddhist Meditation in Theory and Practice* was found particularly useful.36

The research technique consists principally in (1) identifying, in the source texts, significant terms that appear to refer to contemplative practices, and (2) examining the usage of these terms in context. This second process involves analysing the distributions, frequencies, and juxtapositions of specific terms in order to clarify their signification, and to expose probable influences among traditions; for example, between the later Upanisads and the Buddhist *suttas*. This method avoids the assumptions implicit in the more traditional method of relying on classical commentaries. Thus reference to the recorded views of Sankara regarding the *Upanisads* and those of Buddhaghosa regarding the *suttas* is avoided in favour of examining the source texts directly. The identification and interpretation of terms referring to contemplative practices, terms such as *dhiḥ*, *yoga*, etc., clearly presents certain problems. As J. Gonda notes, such terms

... retain a definite - though often not easily definable - "central meaning" or semantic nucleus which they often have in "non-technical" or otherwise different contexts [but may] denote what would appear to us to be complex ideas from different points of view ... In attempting to gain an insight into the meaning and function of "concepts" such as *dhiḥ* ... it would be wise to realize, first, that there was in those ancient times no hard and fast line between "religion" and "poetics", between a "prophet" and "poet" ....37

This is a general problem requiring that various additional procedures be adopted in order to clarify the significance of the various terms and concepts. One obvious procedure is to make use of any definitions of terms provided in the texts themselves. Another is to obtain direct guidance from the immediate context, as for example when the *Upanisads* speak of the practice of *dhāranā* in the context of describing the ability to hold the mind on a se-


lected physical or mental object. Much use is made, particularly with the Buddhist material, of Eimer's technique of comparing parallel lists of stages with the aim of recognising semantic equivalence or near-equivalence. However, flexibility of method is clearly called for, and clear cut answers are not to be expected. As Gonda says,

... historians in attempting to discover the "original" use of a term of social, economic or religious import - have often failed to realize the considerable semantic difficulties with which they are confronted. Study of the meaning and change of meaning of terms [requires, among other skills,] ... an insight into semantic possibilities and intricacies and a readiness systematically to investigate the 'semantic fields' to which the terms belong and the cultural systems to which they are related.

The tracing of terms in their textual environment was done with the assistance of relevant indices and concordances. For the Rg Veda three texts were of particular value: Sontakke and Kashikar's Indices to the Rg Veda; Vishva Bandhu's A Grammatical Word-Index to Rgveda; and Macdonell and Keith's Vedic Index of Names and Subjects. For the Upanisads, assistance was had from G.A. Jacob's A Concordance to the Principal Upanishads and Bhagavadgītā. And for the Buddhist suttas, terms were traced via the

Pali Tipitakam Concordance and appropriate indices accompanying individual volumes in the Pali Text Society edition.

The identifying, tracing, and interpreting of key terms presents different problems in the different texts. For example, the Pali Suttas are far more explicit regarding meditative practices than are the orthodox sources. But this can present a different kind of problem: in the Sutta Pitaka, significant terms such as jhāna and samādhi occur too frequently for all individual occurrences to be considered. Such difficulties were overcome to some extent with computer assistance. In the case of Buddhist contemplative practices, significant terms, along with data on their location within the suttas and their specific textual environment, were recorded on microcomputer. This database was subsequently sorted and searched for the terms in question.

Structure of the Work

Broadly, the Vedic and Upanisadic traditions are covered in Chapters 2 and 3 while the Buddhist is dealt with in Chapter 4. Chapter 5 is the Conclusion. In Chapter 2, the contemplative dimension of the hymns of the Rg Veda is analysed. This is done in order to determine if, and to what degree, there exist likely Vedic antecedents for meditative practices found in the principal Upanisads and the Pali Suttas. First a brief survey is made of the various types of spiritual practitioners mentioned in the Rg Veda: the rsi, the muni, etc. Then the terminology of contemplative practice is examined. Words recognised as derivatives of the roots "yuj and "dhi" -- e.g. yoga and dhyāna - - are identified and examined in context to assess possible relationships between the practices they denote and later Upanisadic and Buddhist

---


45 See Appendix 2 for further details regarding the assembly of the database, methodological literature employed, etc.
practices. In addition, the Vedic term *brahman* is similarly examined, it being a possible precursor to emergent notions of potency of mind and contemplation depicted in later literature. Attention is drawn to the early Vedic application of the mind, by various methods, to bring about various desired results.

Keeping in mind the possible corruption and uncertain authenticity of passages, brief attention is given to the practices in the *Brâhmanas* and *Aranyakas* in order to trace any signs of a transition from early Vedic practices to Upanisadic techniques. These texts were examined in translation and pertinent portions studied in the original Sanskrit in order to identify passages that suggest a shift from belief in polytheism and the power of ritual towards a recognition of the effectiveness of mind and contemplation. First, attention is drawn to the mental performance of the sacrifice in close association with the external rite as a possible precursor to practices aimed at gaining self-control over one's destiny. Thereafter, this ability is noted as developing to the full interiorisation of the material sacrifice by the technique of worship/meditation (*upâsanâ*) to gain the same outcome.

As Zimmer's theory points out, Upanisadic contemplation involves concepts that are without Vedic antecedents and which are characteristically associated with specific *yoga* practices. The unexpected appearance of these themes in the *Upanisads* suggests that they represent a tradition indigenous to India. Zimmer's theory thus calls for some form of synthesis of indigenous (i.e. non-Aryan) practices with Aryan methods. The data derived from this examination of Vedic texts is seen as revealing an early distinction between two meditative approaches which mingle later. It is seen as undermining theories arguing for a purely Vedic/Aryan origin for Indian contemplative practices.
In Chapter 3, the principal *Upanisads* are similarly examined. The technique of contextual analysis is applied to some of the more important terms identifiable as relating to contemplative praxis: *upāsanā, yoga, dhyāna, samādhi, dhāraṇā, and ekāgratā*. The possibility of cross-fertilisation of ideas with early Buddhism and other heterodox systems is considered. The moving focal point of the search for *Brahman* in the *Upanisads* is traced as it switches progressively from extroversion to introversion, that is to say, from the external, concrete world to the internal world of the mind. Another major focus of this chapter is the practices of *upāsanā* and *yoga*, which together encompass most aspects of *Upanisadic* contemplation. The ultimate synthesis of *upāsanā* and *yoga* techniques in later *Upanisads* is examined.\(^{46}\) The *Maitrī Upanisad* is subjected to particular study and shown to have developed this synthesis to a high degree. This is seen as suggesting that the fundamental techniques of *yoga* were appropriated by the *Upanisads* from heterodox sources. On the basis of terminology, Buddhism is identified as the most probable source. Evidence examined in Chapters 2 and 3 is thus seen as pointing to a synthesis of Vedic contemplative methods with indigenous (i.e. non-Aryan) yogic techniques rather than to a purely linear development from a Vedic origin.

The main subject of Chapter 4 is the rôle of *samatha, jhāna, samādhi, vipassanā, paññā*, etc. in Buddhist *yoga*. This chapter appraises the extent of possible influences on Buddhist practices from Brāhmaṇic sources and from other sources such as Jainism and Yoga.

\(^{46}\) On the basis of internal evidence, Macdonell divides the *Upanisads* into four classes: 1) in chronological order, the oldest group consists of the *Bṛhadāraṇyaka, Chāndogya, Taittirīya, Aitareya, Kaushātaki* and the *Kena* which forms a transition to a decidedly later class; 2) the *Kāthaka, Isa, Svetāsvatara, Mundaka*, and *Mahānārāyana*; 3) there follows the *Prasna, Maitrīyanīya*, and *Māndākya* which use a much less archaic type of prose than that of the first class; and finally 4) consisting of the later *Atharvan Upanisads*. Arthur A. Macdonell, *A History of Sanskrit Literature*, op. cit., p. 191.
Chapter 4 aims mainly to gauge the extent to which vipassanā, paññā etc. were practices and concepts independently developed in Buddhism. In doing so, it also determines to what extent these practices may be a carry-over from orthodox sources.

The concluding chapter 5 summarises the evidence and offers a discussion regarding the origin and the development of meditative practices in India noting possible influences, cross-fertilisations, etc. In addition, the conclusion recounts the basic elements of these meditative activities and their intrinsic relation to the early Indian religious world-views. It is concluded that the origin and development of early Indian contemplative practices was neither a linear development nor a single synthesis, but, rather, a zigzag progression wherein Aryan/Brāhmanical contemplative practices both influenced and were influenced by indigenous yogic disciplines.
CHAPTER 2
EARLY VEDIC CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES

Introduction
This chapter analyses mainly the contemplative dimension of the earliest important religious documents of India: the hymns of the Rg Veda, in order to determine whether, and to what degree there exists an Aryan basis for meditative practices found in the principal Upanisads and in the Pâli Suttas. Brief attention is given to the Atharva Veda and to the practices mentioned in the Brâhmanas and Aranyakas.

The Texts
Texts documenting early Vedic religious beliefs and contemplative practices are gathered in four collections (samhitā). Two collections comprise original hymns while the remainder consist largely of poems stemming from the first two. The Rg Veda Samhitā and the Atharva Veda Samhitā represent the original collections of hymns. They are the most important of the four Vedas. The Rg Vedic hymns offer praises and prayers to various deities for different favours such as long life and material blessings. The Atharva Veda deals exclusively with spells, witchcraft, and incantations. They are of great antiquity. Scholars differ regarding the actual date of composition of this literature. The generally accepted beginning of the Vedic age with its corresponding literary stratum is about 2,000 B.C. to 1,500 B.C.1 Some,

1 See Macdonell, A History of Sanskrit Literature, op. cit., pp. 9-10.
however, place its inception far earlier. The Rg Veda is indisputably the oldest of the Samhitâs while the Atharva Veda (judged on the basis of its language and contents) came into existence considerably later than the Rg Veda.²

The Rg Veda is the main samhitâ examined here because of its great antiquity and religious significance. The hymns of the Rg Veda are grouped in ten books (mandalas). Each of the books from number two to number seven is supposed to be the work of a different seer (rsi) and his descendants. Books one, eight, and ten consist of groups of hymns by different authors rather than by a single family of seers. The ninth mandala is a collection of hymns to the god Soma. On the basis of internal evidence, Macdonell sees mandalas II to VII as forming the core of the Rg Veda to which the remaining mandalas were successively added: mandalas I and VIII being definitely adjoined to a previously existing collection. This combination results in the formation of book nine. The composition of book ten betrays the prior existence of the first nine books.³

Speaking generally, Macdonell understands that:

The language of the Atharva is, from a grammatical point of view, decidedly later than that of the Rgveda, but earlier than that of the Brâhmanas.⁴

Of the twenty books comprising the Atharva Veda, the first thirteen (shown both by its arrangements and its subject-matter) represent the original text.⁵ The style of writing of some books, however, suggests a later period. As Macdonell understands it: "The whole of book XV and nearly the whole

² ibid., pp. 24-25.
³ ibid., pp. 35-36.
⁴ ibid., p. 164.
⁵ ibid., p. 157.
of XVI ... are composed in prose of the type found in the Brâhmanas."6

Though inconclusive, the above suggests the recording of practices in a period immediately prior to (if not contemporaneous with) the composition of the Brâhmanas.

The remaining collections are "the book of chants", i.e. the Sâma Veda Samhitâ, and a book of prayers named the Yajur Veda Samhitâ. Both books are compiled exclusively for ritual use in the sacrifice (yajña). These four collections together are named "veda" signifying primarily "knowledge". The term, in a derivative sense, also means "sacred book".

The combination of sacred verse and rite evolves within sacerdotal tradition to theological, prose works named Brâhmanas explaining the mutual relation between the sacred text and the sacrifices to those familiar already with the rite. The Brâhmanas of the Rg Veda (the Aitareya and the Kausitaki) note mainly the duties of the priest named hotr (reciter or invoker). He selects, from the hymns, the verses applicable to the rite. The Brâhmanas peculiar to the remaining Vedas serve similar functions. Fundamentally, they deal with the same objects while having the same characteristic features.

The later portions of the Brâhmanas form philosophical discussions named "Aranyakas" (forest books or treatises). These appended chapters are written mainly in Brâhmana language and style. The contents, however, differ in beginning with material extremely like the Brâhmanas then shifting to mystic allegory (i.e. the Aranyakas) and to philosophic speculation (upanisad). The final part of these become philosophical texts called "Upanisads". The oldest Upanisads are evidently partly embedded in the Aranyakas and partly appended to them. The whole is sometimes entitled

6 ibid.
Upanisad. The Aranyakas and the Upanisads represent integral parts of the Brāhmaṇas. Thus, the Śamhitās, Brāhmaṇas, Aranyakas, and oldest Upanisads represent four successive stages of Vedic literature ranging from the beginning of the Vedic age (circa 2,000 B.C. to 1,500 B.C.) to circa 800-500 B.C.

The Aryans, representing the centre of culture creating these poems, migrated to reside in the territory of the Indus river valley. These migrants, while calling themselves "āryas" (kinsmen), named the indigenous people non-Aryans (anārya). The Aryans differed mainly from the aborigines in religion, in that the aborigines had the phallus as their deity (sisnadevāh), i.e. they worshipped the phallus.

Vedic Religious Practice

On the whole, early Vedic religious practice involves the performance of prescribed rituals and sacrificial ceremonies by a refined sacerdotal class. Sacrifice thus forms the centre of the Aryan cult providing the opportunity to recite the prayers. With the chanting of prayers, the worshipper offers oblations to a god. He expects the god to grant him desired blessings in return. That is to say, the sacrificer seeks the gratification of the gods so as to obtain favours from them. The ceremony engenders a degree of awe and wonder. The worshippers see visions of the gods. Power is experienced.

Rg Vedic sacrifices divide into two types: 1) the simplest type offering milk or grain etc. into the fire (representing the mouth of the gods) using particular hymns and verses of the Rg Veda as invocations of divine blessing

7 See Farquhar, op. cit., p. 28.
8 RV 7.21.5.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

at birth, marriage, and death etc., and 2) sacrifices performed particularly regarding the *Soma* cult involving Indra. These were extensive and expensive affairs requiring a host of officiating priests performing many elaborate rites on behalf of the sacrificer. The sacrifice, at this stage, represents the means of influencing the gods for the benefit of the sacrificer. The first sacrifice that was performed by the great Primal Being (*purusa*) created the universe. The *Hymn of Creation* known as the *Purusa-sûkta* of the Rg Veda\(^\text{10}\) describes this sacrifice in detail.

Nearly five hundred hymns of the *Rg Veda* are addressed to just two deities, Indra and Agni. Almost exclusively, the gods therein appear as beneficent beings granting long life and prosperity. One notable exception is the god Rudra. He attracts few hymns. These express mainly fear of his malevolence. The poets describe him as fierce and destructive like a wild beast.

On the whole, the *Rg Vedic* worshipper of the gods depends on their compliance. Prayers and sacrifices are believed to win their benevolence or forgiveness. To a certain degree, the gods depend on the sacred hymns and ceremonial ritual for their might. The abilities of the *Rg Vedic* seer (rsi) generate the appropriate conditions for overall success of the relationship with the divinity. Thus lie the rudimentary pretensions of the belief that ordained priests possess sacramental and sacrificial powers. Such belief grows gradually during the Vedic age.

The *Brâhmanas* and *Aranyakas* represent a shift in belief in polytheism and the power of ritual towards a recognition of the potency of mind and contemplation. Much of the ancient and purely Vedic content of these texts intermingles with non-Vedic material which may be predated by the oldest

\(^{10}\) RV 10.90.
Upanisadic material. Non-Vedic material can be recognised sometimes by its advanced grammatical construction\(^\text{11}\) or possible reference to non-Vedic terms.\(^\text{12}\) Positive identification of the genuine Vedic content is difficult if not impossible. Hence, these texts are of little or no use in this historical work and attract brief reference only.

**Early Vedic Contemplatives**

Vedic literature records an abundance of information on a wide variety of topics ranging from astronomy to witchcraft while commenting on the social, political, and religious life of the Vedic Aryans. Problems in identifying early Vedic contemplatives in the midst of this enormous volume of data were overcome mainly by the consultation of a comprehensive index on Vedic literature.\(^\text{13}\) This furnishes complete information on all the historical material (as represented by names and subjects) that can be extracted from these early documents.

Evaluation of practices recorded in the relevant index of names and subjects identified contemplatives depicted in the Rg Veda. These were found to comprise two main types: the *rsi* and the *muni*. Minor contemplatives recognised by Macdonell and Keith as belonging also to the Rg Veda included the *yati* and the *brahmacārin*. The terms relating to the Rg Vedic contemplatives were traced in the Rg Veda via the relevant indices. This

\(^{11}\) For example, one half of the *Gopatha Brāhmaṇa* contains advanced grammatical constructions and other signs of lateness while referring also to the god Śiva. Such suggests that this section belongs to the post-Vedic period. The other half of the text, however, displays the style of a regular Brāhmaṇa. Therefore, the Brāhmaṇa is a compilation. Macdonell, *A History of Sanskrit Literature*, op. cit., p. 184.

\(^{12}\) Macdonell notes the words *sramana* and *pratibuddha* etc. occurring in the *Satapatha Brāhmaṇa*. He finds it interesting to inquire into what relation this Brāhmaṇa stands to the beginnings of Buddhism. Here, the terms are not used in the technical sense given to them in Buddhism. Though these locutions may be pre-Buddhist, they could also represent a late inclusion. Ibid., p. 182.

\(^{13}\) Macdonell & Keith, *Vedic Index of Names and Subjects*, op. cit.
permitted the examination of such contemplatives and their practices in context. The frequency of occurrence of terms relating to particular contemplatives such as "rsi" suggested their relative importance to the composers of the 
Rg Veda: i.e. greater frequency of occurrence of the term indicated greater significance. Other terms such as muni, though only occasionally mentioned in the Rg Veda, are included in the evaluation of practices because of their importance to ascetic and contemplative techniques and their possible influence in the development of early Indian contemplative practices.

The rsi's area of expertise involved a remarkable application of the mind by invoking the gods via his "visioning" (dhī). The muni appears to have been an ecstatic ascetic practising some form of yogic technique. The practice of the yati embraces an early form of asceticism while the brahmacārin involves religious studentship.

**The Rsis (Seers)**

Essentially, the title rsi concerns the faculty of 'seeing' "... the secrets of the divine powers and the hidden connections between and behind the phenomena."\(^{14}\) Rsis of the Rg Veda, in a sense "see" the hymns in sudden flashes of intuition. Thus, the term "rsi", in this context, means "a wise composer of hymns": i.e. a poet gifted with insight, a seer. In principle, the word indicates identity of mental and other qualities attributed to the gods. The title rsi, applied to humans, indicates those with the ability to contact divine power or the transcendent, i.e. the unseen. As Gonda points out, it is applied to one who

---

As such, rsis were believed to possess, or be able to access, special, supersensible knowledge. They may achieve mental contact with the transcendent whilst having "... certain abilities in 'the sacred and social sphere' derived from these (including the composition of "hymns") ...".

The rsi composed the Vedic hymns by rendering his vision into beautiful language. The seer's use of the mind, i.e. the application of his inner vision, to achieve his particular goal represents an extraordinary ability whereby his skill was regarded as heaven-sent. Consequently, he is called the most exalted of the Brāhmaṇas.

Brahman of Gods, the Leader of poets,  
Rsi of sages, Bull of savage creatures,  
Falcon amid the vultures, Axe of forests ....

RV 9.96.6

The Rg Veda depicts his expertise as a spontaneous or intuitive skill rather than to developed mastery. The Rg Veda mentions specially the

---

15 This ability suggest the powers of the tathāgata outlined in the Buddhist Pāli Suttas. Rg Vedic references to this skill are: 1.164.6; 18; 10. 114.2.
16 RV 10.129.4.
17 RV 1.164.5.
18 RV 7.86.3.
19 RV 1.95.8.
20 op. cit., p. 48.
21 ibid., p. 50.
22 RV 1.37.4; 7.36.1, 9; 8.32.27, 57.6.
23 Griffith, op. cit., p. 515. As this is the standard English translation used throughout, further citations of this text will be in a simplified form: e.g. Gr 515.
24 See RV 9.10.6.
Seven Seers regarding them as the founders of the original Brâhmanical communities. Revelation, the hymn, and the power of tapas are associated in the following Rg Vedic hymn with Indra and Varuna:

What ye in times of old, Indra and Varuna, gave Rsis - revelation, thought, and power of song,
And places which the wise made, weaving sacrifice, - these through my spirit's fervid glow have I beheld.

RV 8: Vâlakhilya 11.6

Sacred knowledge equates with the flash of intuition: a spontaneous realisation of a greater reality via the open doors of the mind of the seer. The following verse of the Rg Veda alludes to this ability:

The singing-men of ancient time open the doors of sacred songs, - Men, for the mighty to accept.

RV 9.10.6

According to J. Gonda:

Verb forms for 'seeing' are ... in the Veda not infrequently used in a ... general and rather vague sense of 'perceiving' .... 'To see' here means 'to have an insight into problems which are beyond human understanding.'

The composition of the hymn arises from extraordinary insight generated by the rsi's innate power to invoke a vision. Power, in the Rg Veda, is

---

25 RV 4.42.8; 10.109.4; 130.7
26 Srutam: that which was heard, i.e. sacred knowledge.
27 Tapasâ.
28 Gr 471.
29 Gr 475.
30 Gonda, The Vision of the Vedic Poets, op. cit., p. 27.
implicit to the term *brahman*. Some *Rg Vedic* verses depict the rsis as possessing or wielding *brahman*.\(^{31}\)

**The Munis (Ecstatics)**

Early Vedic practices involve, by and large, a worldly attitude whereby the worshipper seeks to appease the gods by performing various ritual sacrificial ceremonies. The *Rg Veda*, however, mentions some opposed to Aryan ritual. For example, *RV* 2.12.5 notes unbelievers of Indra and his abode. Another reference talks of pious worshippers in battle with the riteless.\(^{32}\) Book 7.104.24 shows worshippers of Indra calling upon the god to slay their harassers (both male and female) who fight and destroy their rituals. Some opponents of the ritual may have been Aryan. The above establishes a religious context of antagonism to the accepted practices depicted in the *Rg Veda*. Outstanding in this regard were the munis or silent ascetics (sometimes referred to as kesins\(^{33}\)). Although the *Muni-sūkta* is an isolated composition at odds with the worship of gods and the performance of the sacrifices depicted elsewhere throughout the *Rg Veda*, it is noteworthy for suggesting explicitly alternative practices to the ritual sacrifice. The *Rg Veda* offers the earliest literary evidence for the existence of the munis.\(^{34}\) They differ entirely from worshippers performing the sacrifice to the gods. A hymn to the Maruts states:

> Your flame is shining brightly, your minds are irritable: your bold troop's blustering is like an ecstatic (or inspired) person (*muni*).

*RV 7.56.8*

---

\(^{31}\) See *RV* 7.28.2; 7.70.5; 8.3.4; 10.89.16.

\(^{32}\) *RV* 1.33.5.

\(^{33}\) Kesinah: i.e. wearers of fine or long loose hair.

\(^{34}\) *RV* 10.136.2,4,5.
Another *Rg Vedic* reference depicts Indra as the friend of the *munis*:

Strong pillar thou, Lord of the home! armour of Soma-offerers: The drop of Soma breaketh all the strongholds down, and Indra is the [*munis’*] Friend (*indro mūnīnām sakhā*, the friend of the *munis*, sages, saintly men or ascetics).\(^{35}\)

RV 8.17.14

The most important reference to the *munis* occurs in the *Muni-sūkta*, a late hymn in Book 10. This provides a curiously isolated description of the *munis*. This passage and other factors (such as reference to the *brahma-carin*) dealt with below indicate a new emerging religious situation and thus attest to the lateness of this hymn.

\(^{35}\) Gr 407.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

1. He with the long loose locks supports Agni, and moisture (visyam), heaven, and earth:
He is all sky to look upon: he with long hair is called this light.

2. The Munis, girdled with the wind, wear garments soiled of yellow hue.
They, following the wind's swift course go where the gods have gone before.

3. Transported with our Munihood we have pressed on into the winds:
You therefore, mortal men, behold our natural bodies and no more.

4. The Muni, made associate in the holy working of every God,
Looking upon all varied forms flies through the region of the air.

5. The Steed of Vāța, Vāyu's friend, the Muni, by the Gods impelled,
In both the oceans hath his home, in eastern and in western sea.

6. Treading the path of sylvan beasts, Gandharvas, and Apsarases,
He with long locks, who knows the wish, is a sweet most delightful friend.

7. Vāyu hath churned for him: for him he poundeth things most hard to bend,
When he with long loose locks hath drunk, with Rudra, water from the cup.

RV 10.136

This depiction suggests the demonstration of skills (akin to yogic techniques) separate from those involved in the worship of gods and the practice of sacrifices as applies to the rsi. The hymn begins by indicating the


37 Munayo vātarasand; meaning, possibly "naked". The Taittirīya Aranyaka (2.7) uses the term "vātarasand" as an adjective describing a type of sages who were "sramanas" and "urdhvamanthins".

38 Yad devāso aviksatah. That is to say: "attained the status of gods".

39 That is, with the power of Munihood (mauneyena) they enjoy the highest pleasure or ecstasy (unmadita).

40 Kesin.

41 That is, knows every thought: ketasya vidvan.

42 The term here is "visa", interpreted normally as "poison". Griswold, op. cit., p. 339 interprets the line as "When he, the hairy one, has drunk With Rudra from the poison-cup."

long hair of the muni. Verse two notes that the muni's garments have a soiled yellow appearance. The muni flies through the air, is the steed of the wind (Vâta), and is impelled by the gods. He dwells in the eastern and western oceans. The muni also traverses the path of Apsarases, the Gandharvas and the beasts of the wild forests. Finally, he drinks with Rudra from the magic cup which is poison to mortals. Rg Vedic references to the munis suggest a yogic context altogether alien to mainstream Vedic methods.

The Yatis (Ascetics)

The Rg Veda, in two passages, describes the yatis as men of an ancient clan of ascetics connected with the Bhrgus (priests and devotees of the fire cult). Thus they appear, through this association, to be on agreeable terms with the gods. For example:

44 In the RV, the god Rudra demonstrates little of the magnitude given to him in later Vedic literature. For references, see A. Berriedale Keith, The Religion and Philosophy of the Veda and Upanishads, vol. 1 of 2 vols, (Cambridge, Ma.: Harvard University Press, 1925), p. 142 ff. He is mentioned casually in about seventy-five references, and shares one with Soma. As well, he is the subject of just three hymns. He stands apart from the other Rg Vedic gods by his malevolence. Rudra reaches his peak in the Brâhmanas where other gods fear his ability to kill them. In the later Sûtras, snakes are his servants.

45 For a survey of the various interpretations of the Kesin hymn, which generally conclude that the kesin was an orgiastic drug-addict, see Werner, Karel. "The Longhaired Sage of RV 10,136: A Shaman, a Mystic or a Yogi," in his The Yogi and the Mystic, London: Curzon Press, 1989, pp. 33-53. Werner's analysis, however, concludes on p. 45 that the hymn ... gives evidence of the existence of another ancient type of spiritual tradition which expressed itself in what we can call, using a term which appeared later, the Yogic way of life. This consisted in renouncing worldly life, abstaining from the current forms of religious worship and practising a meditative approach to the transcendent.

46 The Sâma Veda (2.304) mentions the yatis in association with the Bhrgus who were generally regarded as a group of ancient priests and ancestors devoted to the fire cult. See Macdonell & Keith, Vedic Index of Names and Subjects, vol. 2, op. cit., pp. 185 & 108.

47 ibid., p. 109.
I crave of thee the hero strength, that thou mayst first regard this prayer, Wherewith thou holpest Bhrigu and the Yatis and Praskanva when the prize was staked.\textsuperscript{48}

RV 8.3.9

In another Rg Vedic reference, the \textit{yatis} seem mythical, being like gods credited with mysterious powers:

When, O ye Gods, like Yatis, ye caused all existing things to grow. \textsuperscript{49}

RV 10.72.7

The \textit{Samhitās} of the \textit{Yajur Veda}, however, depict Indra, in a disagreeable frame, giving the race of \textit{yatis} to the hyaenas (sālāvrka). The exact significance of this reference is unclear.\textsuperscript{50} The \textit{Taittirīya Samhitā}, in a section regarding the exposition of the \textit{soma} sacrifice, states:

In that he sprinkles the high altar, verily thus does the sacrificer repel his foes to the quarters. Indra gave the Yatis to the Sālāvrkas; them they ate on the right of the high altar. ... He should think of whomever he hates; verily he brings affliction upon him.\textsuperscript{51}

TS 6.2.7.5

Little more of substance can be said about the \textit{yatis} - they being a somewhat obscure group of ascetics.

\textbf{The Brahmacārin}

Another early contemplative is the \textit{brahmacārin} (religious student). \textit{Brahmacarya} denotes the condition of life of a religious student

\textsuperscript{48} Gr 392. See also RV 8.5.18.

\textsuperscript{49} \textit{Yad devā yatayo yathā bhuvandnyapinvata}. Gr 585.

\textsuperscript{50} Macdonell & Keith, \textit{Vedic Index of Names and Subjects}, vol. 2, op. cit., p. 185.

(brahmacārin). The tenth Mandala of the Rg Veda first records the technical sense of the term. It states:

The Brahmacārī goes engaged in duty: he is a member of the Gods' own body (sa devānām bhavaryekamangam).

Through him Brhaspati obtained his consort, as the Gods gained the ladle brought by Soma.52

RV 10.109.5

The Brahmacarya-sūkta of the Atharva Veda53 praises the power of continence (brahmacarya), i.e. the strength and vitality derived from the exercise of self-restraint from sexual activity. It asserts that with the aid of brahmacarya and tapas the gods were able to conquer death. Living a life of rigorous discipline, the religious student clothed himself with heat, stood with fervour (tapas), and acquired power.

Prior born of the brahman, the Vedic student (brahmacārin), clothing himself with heat, stood up with fervour (tapaso 'dhitisthat); from him [was] born the brāhmaṇa, the chief brahman, and all the gods, together with immortality.54

By Vedic-studentship (brahmacarya), by fervour, the gods smote away death ....55

AV 11.5.5, 19

52 ibid., p. 620. The Rg Vedic hymn of Lopāmudrā and her aged husband Agastya refers also to the powers acquired by continence. (RV 1.179) According to Keith: "... the hymn of Lopāmudrā and Agastya ... appears, despite its obscurity, to express the two kindred ideas of the magic potency engendered by continence on the one hand, and on the other of the cosmic importance of the rite of generation, both doctrines of the later system." (See Ṣhāṇyogaprādīpikā 1.61 ff.; 3.83 ff.) Keith, The Religion and Philosophy of the Veda and Upanishads, vol 2, op. cit., p. 401.

53 AV 11.5. Further Atharva Vedic citations will adopt an abbreviated form: e.g. AV 11.5.


55 ibid., p. 639.
Indeed, many features of the brahmacārin locate the religious student within the context of contemplative practices associated with the Rg Vedic muni and the god Rudra: for example,

... the Gandharvas went after him ... he fills the gods with fervour (tapas). ⁵⁶

AV 11.5.1

The Atharva Veda depicts the brahmacārin as having a great penis and as the pourer of seed:

Roaring on, thundering, the ruddy white-goer has introduced in the earth a great virile member (bṛhacchepā); the Vedic student pours upon the surface (śānu), on the earth .... ⁵⁷

AV 11.5.12

Other descriptions of the brahmacārin in this hymn run counter to the notion of the hymn extolling the Vedic student: i.e. he has a long beard. ⁵⁸ Indeed, the various claims made above, with regard to the brahmacārin, appear incompatible with the notion of normal Vedic studentship. On the basis of these indications (and others), R.N. Dandekar feels that the Brahmacārī-śūkta represents "the glorification of a specific religious cult called the brahmacārin-cult ... very closely related to the Rudra-worship." ⁵⁹

The above indication that yogic disciplines were practiced initially as a separate method from those documented in the early Vedic hymns is supported by Karel Werner:

⁵⁸ AV 11.5.6.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

There is ... no evidence in the Vedic hymns or in the *Upanisads* that Yoga actually was a by-product of religious practice which only later developed into a separate method. It is therefore perfectly justifiable to try to reverse the usual assumption and to propose that Yoga is likely to have been a very old discipline which did not owe its origin to the religious development, but even may itself have exercised some influence on the development of ancient Indian religious views and practices.  

It is difficult to identify and delineate contemplatives of the *yogin* type as opposed to the *rsi*. The *Rg Veda* scarcely notes the *muni* whereas the *rsis* and their practices abound. The *Muni-sūkta* describing the *munis* is perhaps the work of an outsider or observer not quite congenial to the *rsis*. Their designation as *munayo* (connoting ecstatic and ascetic practices) suggests contemplation rather than worship of gods as their main absorption. The naked (*vātārasana*) *munis* were possibly early *yogins* whose practices were not quite understood by the *rsis*. Their techniques may have awakened interest and thus started exercising some influence on the Vedic ritual. It is, however, impossible to state with any certainty the actual course of events. The profile of the *rsis* in the *Rg Veda* differs from the description of the other contemplatives by its lack of austerities and self-denial etc. Such yogic practices must therefore be found beyond the Vedic/Aryan context.

The following section considers *yoga* (and the related term *tapas*, mystical heat) in the *Rg Veda* following examination of the main early Vedic contemplative abilities or powers.

---


61 ibid., pp. 181-182.

62 ibid., p. 183.
Early Vedic Contemplative Powers

Early Vedic contemplative powers depicted in the Rg Veda mainly concern devotional prayer/visionary thought (dhi) involving the powerful force brahman.

Brahman

The Rg Veda mentions a mysterious factor called brahman. The term occurs on some twenty-six occasions. Some contexts depict brahman as the magical power in the holy utterance (mantra). Other circumstances give it a wider connotation implying a supernatural life force. Regarding power in the mantra, Franklin Edgerton notes:

Any holy, mystic utterance is brahman. This is the regular, if not the exclusive, meaning which the word has in the Rig Veda. But from the point of view of those times, this definition implies far more than it would suggest to our minds. The spoken word had a mysterious, supernatural power; it contained within itself the essence of the thing denoted. To 'know' the name of anything was to control the thing. The word means wisdom, knowledge; and knowledge, as we have seen, was (magic) power. So brahman, the 'holy word', soon came to mean the mystic power inherent in the holy word ... mystically speaking, the word and the thing were one; he who knew the word, knew and controlled the thing. Therefore, he who knew the brahman knew and controlled the whole universe.64

The Vedic term brahman, here meaning the power implicit in the word uttered in the Vedic ritual, is examined here in context. The rsi, by accessing brahman when uttering the holy hymn (i.e. the power manifested as sacred word and formula), demonstrates his peculiar ability to generate spiritual insight in order to fully understand the transcendent speech. This ability reflects a meditative skill characteristic of this early orthodox contemplative. In the rsi's utterance of the holy hymn, words become manifestations of the

63 RV 6.16.36; 7.28.1; 7.29.2; 8.35.16; 8.90.3 etc.

underlying cosmic power named brahman. Hymns are utilised to invoke the gods. For example, the rsi summons Indra:

I call with hymns (gṛbhīḥ) as 'twere a cow to milk, the Friend who merits praise,
The Brahman who accepts the prayer (brahmānam brahmavāhasam).\(^{65}\)

RV 6.45.7

In a sense, the inspired thoughts of the rsi become materialised via his powerful ability. Somehow the imaginative mind of the rsi creates the concrete reality. In another hymn to Indra, the seer exercises this power to generate boons:

May plentiful libations of the people, and singing Rsis' holy prayers (brahmāni) rejoice thee.

Hearing with love this invocation, come unto us, pass by all those who praise thee.

O Indra, thus may we be made partakers of thy new favours that shall bring us profit ....\(^{66}\)

RV 10.89.16-17

The seer's ability to apply brahman for his ends is the mystic visualisation (dhiḥ) of speech: the envisaging of the mystic form of vāc (speech) is considered not only eternal or imperishable but also imperceptible and mysterious to the ordinary person. Thus the seer applies brahman in visualisation in order to manifest brahman in articulation of the holy hymn. Only those with sufficient spiritual insight understand the transcendent speech pervaded with brahman. Jñānam or "knowledge of higher truths" is the subject of the following hymn:

\(^{65}\) Gr 310.

\(^{66}\) Gr 602. See also RV 7.28.2;70.5.
With sacrifice the trace of Vāk they followed, and found her harbouring within the Rsis.\(^{68}\)

They brought her, dealt her forth in many places: seven singers make her tones resound in concert.

One man hath ne'er seen Vāk, and yet he seeth: one man hath hearing but hath never heard her.

But to another hath she shown her beauty as a fond well-dressed woman to her husband.\(^{69}\)

RV 10.71.3-4

The rsi alone "sees" and "hears" the mystic visualisation (\(dḥīḥ\)) of the holy utterance. In an official capacity, the rsi acts by entering into contact with divinity:

\[
\text{Rsi, invite the Marut band with offerings, as a maid her friend ... Thinking of these now let him come, as with the escort of the Gods ...}^{71}
\]

RV 5.52.13 & 15

As such, the rsi possesses insight with regard to the greatness of the gods.\(^{72}\) He extols and addresses them.\(^{73}\) Indeed, the abilities of the rsi are such that he may call on their help and benevolence\(^{74}:\)

\(^{67}\) Here, \(vāc\) is the voice of the hymn regarded as the means of communication between the rsis and the gods.

\(^{68}\) Translator's footnote states: "... they discovered, in the course of sacrifice, that the inspired Rsis alone understood Speech as required for religious purposes." Gr 584.

\(^{69}\) ibid., p. 584.

\(^{70}\) The "flashing or shining ones", the storm-gods who act as Indra's companions. Sometimes the Maruts represent the gods or deities in general.

\(^{71}\) Gr 265.

\(^{72}\) RV 10.54.3.

\(^{73}\) RV 8.26.10 & 8.23.4.

Mighty One, whom the Rsis of old time invoked for their protection and their help, O Usas, graciously answer our songs of praise with bounty and with brilliant light.\textsuperscript{75}

RV 1.32.14

In a hymn to the Asvins, the rsis call for the empowerment of their thought:

Give spirit to our prayer (brahma) and animate our thoughts (dhiyo) \textsuperscript{76}

RV 8.35.16

Thus, religious insight, application of brahman, and communication with divinity represent powerful abilities exemplified by (and distilled in) the rsi's mystic visualition (dhih): that is to say, devotional prayer or visionary thought.

Dhi: Devotional Prayer/Visionary Thought

Great skill in hymns allows the rsi to take hold of the mystic visualisation or holy thought (dhih).\textsuperscript{77} RV 5.81.1 reads:

The priests of him the lofty Priest [Savitari] well-skilled in hymns harness their spirit, yea, harness (yuñjate) their holy thoughts (dhiyo).\textsuperscript{78}

RV 5.81.1

Gonda raises a question of interpretation concerning the phrase "yuñjate dhiyah". He wonders whether it refers to the initial stage of receiving visions or inspirations or if it refers to the elaboration of the poet. He invites the possibility of the involvement of yogic skills in generation of visionary inspiration. He asks:

\textsuperscript{75} Gr 32.

\textsuperscript{76} Gr 424.

\textsuperscript{77} Gonda, \textit{The Vision of the Vedic Poets}, op. cit., p. 115.

\textsuperscript{78} Gr 279.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

Is the subject, the inspired sages, said to put their "mind" and dhiyah to the sacrificial performances like horses to a chariot? ... or do they in turn, direct and concentrate their thoughts (upon the source of inspiration) ...?79

An understanding of the visionary experience of the rsi requires further that the term dhih be further defined and investigated. The frequency of occurrence of the term in the Rg Veda is extensive.

"Dhi", as it occurs in the Rg Veda, is rendered in English generally as "religious thought, devotion, prayer".80 J. Gonda feels that such simple translation is impossible.81 Consequently, Gonda makes the term "dhi" and its derivatives the sole subject of an entire study exhausting all such investigation. For this reason, his results, insofar as they relate to early Vedic contemplative practices, comprise mainly this section.

Being made up of mantras (i.e. hymns, prayers, or sacred speech as an instrument of thought),82 the Veda equals both knowledge and word.83 Vedic seers (rsi) come about by actually attaining the vision of mantras rather than through heredity or office as mere priests. Such vision or revelation comprises both a form of thought plus speech. It is thus both intuitive

79 Gonda, The Vision of the Vedic Poets, loc. cit.


82 See the portion of the Veda containing the texts called Rc (sacred verse sung in praise of a deity as opposed to sacrificial words or formularies etc.).

83 Franklin Edgerton remarks that ... the Rg Vedic hymn 10.125 is a self-laudation of Vāc, literally 'speech', to be rendered 'Holy Utterance', since it ... is a personification of Vedic hymnal composition. Especially in the first two verses, [Vāc] supports or inspires the chief gods of the pantheon ... In another hymn to Vāc, RV.10.71, the interest is less cosmic; rather, strictly ritualistic, centring on the priestly sodality and their search for the inspiration of Holy Utterance. Later Hindu tradition makes 'knowledge' (jñāna) the theme of this hymn .... Edgerton, op. cit., p. 19.
and expressive. The meaning of the term *dhī* suggests this. Vedic tradition
gives the vision of the seers (*rsīs*) ultimate rank.

The gods participate in the operation of the word for their creativity:
i.e. the process whereby the word gives rise to anything represents the gods'
zone of productivity. The seers become creative through vision and word.
Their ability thus corresponds with that of the gods. Nearness of the individual
to the divine renders him a *rsī*. The word thus acts as the sacred vehicle
or medium by which both the *rsī* and the gods actualise specific mental images.

Divine power lies within the word. The speaker thus represents such
power. In the context of contemplative practices, the term "*dhīh*" denotes a
power concept as well as an empirical phenomenon. The *rsī* generates *vāc*
(speech or holy utterance) by means of his intentional thought. The term
"*dhīh*" expresses a mental image or idea to be realised. Gonda explains the
visionary process in this way:

A particular emotion, an idea without a definite form presses for expres-
sion in the poet's mind or "heart". Under the influence of the emotional urge
to give form to his inner experience the poet attempts to express it by
a suitable, rhythmical arrangement of words. How the conscious mind
helps to transform the intuitive images into a piece of literary art is difficult
to ascertain. The mental "eyesight" enables the seer to visualise the sphere of the
gods, as is suggested in the following verse:

As there ye, Mitra, Varuṇa, above the true have taken to yourselves the
untrue with your mind, with wisdom's mental energy,

So in the seats wherein ye dwell have we beheld the Golden One,

84 G.C. Pande, *Spiritual Vision and Symbolic Forms in Ancient India*, (India: Books and

85 ibid., pp. 60-61.
Not with our thoughts (\textit{dhfbhis}) or spirit, but with these our eyes, yea, with the eyes that Soma gives.\textsuperscript{86}

\textit{RV 1.139.2}

Such supranormal "vision" or sight looking into the divine world is ascribed to "\textit{dhityah}". Gonda remarks here,

The Sanskrit noun \textit{dhih} is like \textit{vision} closely associated with a verb expressing the idea of "seeing". By "vision" is ... to be understood the exceptional and supranormal faculty, proper to "seers", of "seeing", in the mind, things, causes, connections as they really are, the faculty of acquiring a sudden knowledge of the truth of the functions and influence of the divine powers, of man's relation to them etc. etc. It is this "vision" which they attempt to give shape, to put into words, to develop into intelligible speech, to "translate" into stanzas and "hymns" of liturgical value.\textsuperscript{87}

The following verses demonstrate the application of another verb (from the root \textit{pas}), used in a general sense, "for seeing" to the awareness of the divine:

Look ye (\textit{pasyata}) on Visnu's works, whereby the Friend of Indra, closely allied, Hath let his holy ways be seen.

The princes evermore behold (\textit{pasyanti}) that loftiest place where Visnu is,

Laid as it were an eye in heaven.\textsuperscript{88}

\textit{RV 1.22.19-20}

For the rsi, mere "revelation" of a "vision" does not satisfy requisites for such extraordinary sight. This requires \textit{dhis} to be acquired, cultivated and developed. Thereafter, the experience needs suitable articulation in order to exert influence on the gods\textsuperscript{89} for the well-being of both sacrificer and the po-

\textsuperscript{86} Gr 95.

\textsuperscript{87} Gonda, \textit{The Vision of the Vedic Poets}, op. cit., pp. 68-69.

\textsuperscript{88} Gr 13.

\textsuperscript{89} See RV 3.27.6. This verse says: "The priests with ladles lifted up, worshipping here with holy thought, Have brought this Agni to our aid." ibid., p. 173.
ets. The vision becomes embodied in the rsi's words. Thus, the term "dhīh" suggests "prayer" as another aspect of the complex of meaning.

The response and subsequent advancement of the rsi's dhīh by the gods corresponds, in effect, to answering his prayers. The dhīh acts as a hymn, prayer, or poem with an unmistakable power and particular function. Essentially, dhīh represents the materialised vision, the hymns, prayers and recitations, accompanying the ritual acts. The realisation of dhīh by the rsi resembles an instinct designed to protect the interests of the seer. According to Gonda, such instinct can be attributed to intuitive knowledge. Thus, he translates dhīh by "instinct" or "intuition". By obtaining the dhīh or divine vision (elaborated so as to be a recitation), the rsi accomplishes his task both religiously and socially.

The Rg Veda applies a number of adjectives qualifying dhīh. These indicate the exceptional, cogent qualities of dhīh. One poet addresses Indra with dhīh described as "most prominent or excellent" (paramā). Another poet talks of "the bright or pure colour" (sukram varnam) of dhīh enhanced by Indra for the poet. Among these terms, the most significant adjectives qualifying dhīh concern its effectiveness and power to assist. For example, the word "pārya", meaning "effective" or "decisive", is used in this instance:

91 RV 6.38.3.
92 RV 3.34.5.
93 According to some sources, two powers lie behind every thought: the power to convey meaning known in the Vedas as vāk, and the power of will known in the Vedas as kratu. Both these powers have their source in dhī... the intuitive faculty located in the heart. [fn. 'Varuna has implanted kratu in the heart.' RV 5.85.2] When dhī is awakened, thoughts acquire great power and luminosity and reveal subtle or hidden truths. The Vedic seers knew this and so everywhere in the veda we find prayers for the awakening of dhī (like the celebrated Gayatri)... "Meditation and Sacrifice-III," Prabuddha Bhrata, (88 (1983), 282-287), 286.
Men call on Indra in the armed encounter that he may make the hymns (dhiyas) they sing decisive.94

RV 7.27.1

Thus, dhīh assists the rṣi knowing how to receive, develop, and articulate it. Indeed, the dhīh belongs to worship or sacrifice (yajñīyā) while itself being worthy of worship, i.e. holy (yajatā).95 Dhīh is divine:

Singing their praise with God-like thought (devyā dhiyā) let us invoke each God for grace, Each God to bring you help, each God to strengthen you.96

RV 8.27.13

Dhīh, though, generates its own power.

**Power and dhīh**

Power resides in the liturgical word. As Gonda has it:

One of the chief characteristics of oral recitation is, indeed, its power to confirm or consolidate the potencies which it describes and with which man finds himself confronted.97

In its mechanism, poetical language appeals to the intuitive mind rather than to discursive thought. Well-formulated and rhythmically pronounced words, when spoken by the inspired seer, convey power. Vision and creative inspiration become transformed into powerful words conducive to the welfare of the world. Worshippers revere the Rg Vedic texts, revealed by vision, as the expression of truth and ultimate reality. They recite the words "... as a rite to give immediacy to their inherent power."98 Divine power re-

94 "Indram naro nemadhitā havante yat pāryā yunajate dhiyas tāh." Gr 347.
95 RV 10.101.9.
96 "Devam devam kuve ma vājasātaye grnanto devyā dhiyā": Gr 419. Also see Gr 648: "Bring forth the God with song divine ...." RV 10.176.2.
98 ibid., p. 64.
sides in inspired poetry. Therein it supports and maintains existence. The inherent power in dhīḥ renders the rite perfect. The inspired ritual poem equals a creative exercise of such power. Consequently, it represents an indispensible factor in a successful performance of the ritual. Sometimes the officiants employ the sacred words alone. The ṛṣis aim, also, to strengthen the divine powers for the benefit of the reciters and their patrons by praising and worshipping the holy powers. Dhīḥ and worship (which is often verbal) therefore make up alternative approaches to divinity. As such, dhīḥ, as the seer's holy word gained from ideas of superhuman origin, aims to achieve certain effects.

*The instrumentality of dhīḥ*

In liturgical form, the general function of dhīḥ is to bring the gods to the sacrificial ceremony:

May our songs (*dhiyo*) bring you hither to our solemn rites ....

RV 1.135.5

*Dhīḥ*, in this way, achieves definite effects such as gaining an object or favourable conditions. For example, the instrumentality of dhīḥ and its association with profit is indicated in this way:

99 RV 8.4.20 indicates a clear manifestation of the power assigned to dhīḥ:

... by his morning songs (*dhiḥbhīḥ*) Kāṇḍa, the powerful [Ṛṣi], hath ... gained - The herds of sixty thousand pure and spotless kine ...

Gr 394.

100 Gonda, *The Vision of the Vedic Poets*, op. cit., pp. 139-140.

101 Gr 93. Dhīḥ is related intimately with the sacrifice. See RV 3.3.6:

Agni, together with the Gods and Manu's folk, by thought (dhīḥ: i.e. the vision) in varied form, Goes, car-borne with those who crown each rite (i.e., make the sacrifice effective) ....

Ibid., p. 162.

102 See RV 5.45.11: "... Through this our hymn (dhīḥ) may we have Gods to guard us: through this our hymn (dhīḥ) pass safe beyond affliction." Ibid., p. 261.
The mortal man whom, Rbhus, ye and Indra favour with your help, Must be successful, by his thoughts (dhih or dhfbhir) at sacrifice and with the steed.103

RV 4.37.6

Further, dhīḥ engenders protection by the gods.104 In bringing about such conditions and effects, the visionary thought/devotional prayer, i.e. dhīḥ, denotes a "... 'vision' in the sense of 'faculty of evoking by the power of inspiration or imagination specific mental pictures and realizing these so as to create concrete objects."105 That is to say, the power of evocation represents the capacity or means to bring about a desired reality in a sense similar to yogic skills in their capacity to potently shape and thus transform the mind for whatever motive.

**Yoga in the Rg Veda**

The word "yoga" is regarded as derived from the root yuj meaning "to yoke or to harness to", "to join or fasten", "to unite or bring together", or "to turn [the mind] to".106 The term is used, in the Rg Veda, in various senses, i.e. (1) accomplishing the unaccomplished, (2) relation or combination,107 and (3) yoking or harnessing. Throughout the Rg Veda, yoking or harnessing generally refers to the securing of horses etc. For example, the sacrificers call on Indra to harness his steeds.

---

103 Ibid., p. 145. Translator's footnote indicates that "With his steed" refers to "... the warrior who will be victorious in battle with his war chariot." Material goods may be acquired also via dhīḥ. See 7.93.3-4.

104 "Through this our hymn (dhīḥ) may we have Gods to guard us : through this our hymn (dhīḥ) pass safe beyond affliction." Ibid., p. 261. RV 5.45.11.


106 Monier-Williams, op. cit., p. 853.

107 Yoge yoge: RV 1.30.7; AV 20.26.1; Sama Veda 1.163.2, 93; Vājasaneyi Samhitā 11.14; Taittirīya Samhitā 4.1.2, 1.
Graciously listen to our songs, Maghavan, be not negligent.

As thou has made us full of joy and lettest us solicit thee, now Indra, yoke (yojä) thy two Bay Steeds.\(^{108}\)

RV 1.82.1

Similar verses note yoga (i.e. yoking) in the same context as brahman (power). In another hymn to Indra, brahman is associated with yoking Indra's horses and, subsequently, with the success of the sacrifice.

Harness (yuksvā) thy pair of strong bay steeds, long-maned, whose bodies fill the girths,

And, Indra, Soma-drinker, come to listen to our songs of praise.

Come hither, answer thou the song, sing in approval, cry aloud. Good Indra, make our prayer (brahma) succeed, and prosper this our sacrifice.\(^{109}\)

RV 1.10.3, 4

In the following two examples, brahman appears explicitly as the means for yoking Indra's steeds. Further, the sacrificer wields the power to yoke.

With holy prayer (brahmand) I yoke (yunajmi) thy long-haired pair of Bays: come hitherward; thy holdest them in both thy hands.\(^{110}\)

RV 1.82.6

Those who are yoked by prayer I harness (brahmāna te brahmeyujā yunajmi), fleet friendly Bays who take their joys together. ...\(^{111}\)

RV 3.35.4

In a late hymn of the Rg Veda, the sacrificer utilises namas (reverential salutation) to yoke, and thus control, power.

---

\(^{108}\) Gr 52. The reference to yoking is repeated throughout this hymn.

\(^{109}\) Gr 6.

\(^{110}\) Gr 52.

\(^{111}\) Gr 180.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

I yoke (*yuja*) with prayer (*namobhir*) your ancient inspiration (*brahma*): may the laud rise as on the prince's pathway.

All sons of Immortality shall hear it, all the possessors of celestial natures.\textsuperscript{112}

RV 10.13.1

In addition to the numerous references associating *yoga* with the harnessing of horses, the *Rg Veda* sometimes refers to the yoking of *manas* (mind).

"Yoking", "directing" etc. of *manas* (mind)
The hymns of the *Rg Veda* display on the whole an optimistic world-view giving few references to death and the future life. The funerary hymns of the last book offer most information regarding Aryan views on the next life. At death, mind or spirit (*manas*) is said to separate from the body. This happens not only after death but also during unconsciousness.\textsuperscript{113} In the Vedic view, mind (*manas*) appears capable of alteration and movement, though in a more rudimentary, material understanding than in the classical *yoga* sense where *manas* may be controlled, shaped, and directed towards a specific target or goal. In the *Rg Veda*, the potency of mind, as utilised by classical *yoga*, goes unrecognised. Nevertheless, the *rsi* appreciates the management of mind.

According to Oguibenine, *yuja* (to yoke or to harness to)\textsuperscript{114} has as one of its references, the act of the Vedic poet (an officiant at the sacrifice) of

\textsuperscript{112} Gr 537. Also at AV 18.3.39; Vêjasaneyi *Samhitā* 11.5; Taittirîya *Samhitā* 4.1.1.2.

\textsuperscript{113} For example, the following hymn is a speech to recall the fleeing *manas* of a dying man:

Thy spirit (*manas*), that went far away to Yama ... We cause to come to thee again that thou mayst live and sojourn here.

RV 10.58.1

Gr 572.

setting up correlations and identifications between phenomena of various
realms, especially between the microcosmic ritual and the macrocosmic
mythical world, between human and divine realms. The poet sets out the na-
ture of the correlations or links, or equations.115

Setting up these links is likened to pointing out a path, e.g. a way to
the deity. This is effected by the poet's words, thoughts, and the whole sacri-
fice. For example, the thoughts and words are "yoked" to the task and they
effect the yoking of the object, e.g. the deity. Thus we find compound words
like brahmayuj, vacoyuj, manoyuj, and also vacasā yuj, manasā yuj.116

By attributing this linking to speech and mind, their linking rôle is
thrown into relief and the explicative value of the link is highlighted. Thus
yuj refers to the action of bringing into correlation objects which have char-
acteristics in common, or which acquire them through the linking.117

Regarding the Vedic attitude of mind as akin to a material substance,
R.N. Dandekar notes that the Sanskrit term "manas" did not designate origi-
nally what we today call "mind". On the original view, manas denoted a
comprehensive all-penetrating magic force similar to the mana of the primi-
tives. As he understands it:

... Manas was, therefore, regarded as being as much 'material' in nature as
mana. This original notion about manas, as a form of 'matter', has been
preserved, to a considerable extent, in the Vedic literature, even after
manas came to denote human mind.118

115 ibid., p. 132.
116 ibid., p. 133.
117 ibid., p. 134.
118 R.N. Dandekar, "Somatism of Vedic Psychology," in his Exercises in Indology,
Vedic descriptions of the several activities of *manas* attest to the fact that *manas* denotes originally a type of "material substance" capable of alterations normally associated with "matter". For example, *manas* is understood to be able to move in space: it is always said to be shifting from one location to another. Any function of *manas* necessitates a degree of movement on its part.

The Rg Veda suggests a similar feature of *manas* when the poet speaks of "moving" the *manas* of the god Indra:

Quick, Indra, give us room and way to riches, and let us bring thy mind to grant us treasures.\(^{119}\)

**RV 7.27.5**

Additionally, references depict the "placing" of *manas*: "In thee, O Food, is set the spirit of great gods."\(^{120}\); "The mind of Rudra, fresh and strong, moves conscious in the ancient ways, With reference whereto the wise have ordered this."\(^{121}\) The idea of the "material" nature of *manas* intensifies with the suggestion of the "grasping" by *manas*:

They ask of him : not all learn by their questioning what he, the Sage, hath grasped, as 'twere, with his own mind.\(^{122}\)

**RV 1.145.2**

\(^{119}\) "ṇā indra rāye varivas kṛdhi na ā te mano vavtyāma maghāya", Gr 348.

\(^{120}\) "rve pito mahānm devānām mano hitam", RV 1.187.6. Ibid., p. 126.

\(^{121}\) "mano yatrā vi tad ḍadhuh", RV 8.13.20. Ibid., p. 404.

\(^{122}\) "svene 'va dhīro manasā yad agrābhīt", ibid., p. 99.
Further, *manas* is described as being "controlled", "bound down", "driven from afar", etc.\(^{123}\) The Vedic poets speak additionally of the "tension" of *manas*. It could be "loosened" or "unyoked" like a horse:

To gain thy mercy, Varuna, with hymns we bind thy heart, as binds the charioteer his tethered horse.\(^{124}\)

RV 1.25.3

Other Vedic sources note the vigorous agitation or shaking of *manas*:

As the wind here shakes the grass off the earth, so do I shake thy mind.\(^{125}\)

AV 2.30.1

In addition, the *Rg Veda* refers to the "controlling" or "disciplining" of it:

Indra himself hath said, The mind of woman brooks not discipline, Her intellect hath little weight.\(^{126}\)

RV 8.33.17

The following *Rg Vedic* references illustrate also the "yoking" or "directing" of *manas*. A hymn to Savitar associates the sacrificer's powerful skill with hymns generating an ability to yoke their holy thought (*dhi*) and their mind (*manas*).

The priests of him the lofty Priest well skilled in hymns harness (*yuṅjate*) their spirit (*mana*), yea, harness (*yuṅjate*) their holy thoughts (*dhiyo*).


\(^{124}\) "vi mṛliḍya te mano rathir asvāṁ na sanditam / gībhir varuna śīmahi", Gr 15.


\(^{126}\) Gr 423.
He only knowing works, assigns their priestly tasks. Yea, lofty is the praise of Savitar the God.\textsuperscript{127} 

RV 5.81.1

In the following instance, the term \textit{yuj} is applied in the sense of "to turn the mind to".

The princes who, O Usas, as thou comest near, direct their thoughts (\textit{yuñjate mano}) to liberal gifts.\textsuperscript{128}

RV 1.48.4

Other verses utilise the word \textit{prayukti} (impulse). \textit{Prayukti} derives from the prefix "pra" ("before", "forward", or "in front") combined with the root \textit{yuj}. Here, the term suggests harnessing or controlling the mind for instrumental reasons. For example, the following verse applies the locative plural form of \textit{prayukti} in the phrase "\textit{manaso na prayuktisu}" to suggest "through stirrings of the mind". \textit{Prayukti} is rendered also as "with swift exertion of the spirit".

With sacrifices and with milk they deck you first, ye Righteous Ones, as if through stirrings of the mind (\textit{manaso na prayuktisu}). To you they bring their hymns with their collected thought, while ye with earnest soul come to us gloriously.\textsuperscript{129}

RV 1.151.8

The next verse utilises \textit{prayukti} in a similar fashion.

As 'twere with swift exertion of the spirit (\textit{achā manaso na prayukti}), let the priest speed to the celestial Waters ....\textsuperscript{130}

RV 10.30.1

\textsuperscript{127} Gr 279. Also at Vājasaneyi Samhitā 5.14.11; 4.37.2; Taittirīya Samhitā 1.2.13.1; 4.1.1.1; Taittirīya Aranyaka 4.2.1.

\textsuperscript{128} "yuñjate mano dāndya", ibid., p. 31.

\textsuperscript{129} "manaso na prayuktisu", ibid., p. 102.

\textsuperscript{130} "apo acchā manaso na prayuktih", ibid., p. 551.
Dandekar indicates such descriptions "... may not be explained away as mere imaginative or poetical representations of the activities of manas. They clearly betray the original 'somatic' nature of manas. Manas must have been regarded as a kind of 'material substance', and its activities were, therefore, necessarily described as mechanical and dynamic modifications of that 'substance'."¹³¹ Such suggests that, in the early Vedic age, mind was malleable to some degree. The Vedic seers and ascetics worked with it in their peculiar ways to fulfil their particular material goals. It is impossible, however, to infer a substantial influence on the development of yoga techniques per se from these scant early Vedic references to "yoking" etc. of manas. The above indicates, rather, the early Vedic aspiration and limited ability to direct and apply the mind for particular material ends. Here, such desire recognises later the appropriateness and efficiency of yogic skills in their ability to powerfully shape and thus modify the mind for whatever purpose.

Conscious or even calculated effort made in order to bring about a particular end generates a state of mind and experience accompanied by a sense of "arousal" or "inflaming".

**Tapas**
The term "tapas" means literally "heat" or "ardour". It is directly related to religious austerity, bodily mortification etc. The Rg Veda at times records the word tapas and its derivations.¹³² Via the powers of tapas, the ascetic realises clairvoyance. The following verse implies this:

> What ye in time of old, Indra and Varuna, gave Rsis -- revelation, thought, and power of song,


¹³² For example, see RV 8.59.6; 10.83.3; 136.2; 154.2,4,5; 167.1 etc.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

And places which the wise made, weaving sacrifice, - these through my spirit's fervid glow (tapas) have I beheld.133

RV 8. Vālakhilya 11.6

Tapas generates also enormous power:

Invincible through Fervour (tapas), those whom Fervour hath advanced to heaven, Who showed great Fervour in their lives, - even to those let him depart.134

RV 10.154.2

The generative power of tapas is linked directly with creation:

From Fervour (tapaso) kindled to its height Eternal Law and Truth were born : Thence was the Night produced, and thence the billowy flood of sea arose.135

RV 10.190.1

The Nāṣadīya-sūktā, the greatest hymn of origins of the universe in the Rg Veda, says:

Then was not non-existent nor existent : there was no realm of air, no sky beyond it ... All that existed then was void and formless : by the great power of Warmth (tapas) was born that unit.136

RV 10.129.1-3

133 Gr 471.
134 Gr 643.
135 Gr 651. Note, the Kausitaki Brāhmaṇa of the RV (6.1) depicts tapas as instrumental (via its creative power) for the incarnation of the gods:

Prajāpati, being desirous of propagation, underwent penance; from him when heated were born five, Agni, Vayu, Aditya, Candramas, and Usas as a fifth. He said to them, 'Do ye also practice fervour.'

Kausitaki Brāhmaṇa 6.1


136 Gr 633. Griffith remarks in a footnote: "Warmth : Prof. Wilson, following Sāyana, translates tapasah by 'austerity,' meaning the contemplation of things that were to be created."
Tapas was such that the god Indra utilised it to exploit heaven:

... O Indra ... Bestow upon us wealth with many hero sons: thou, having

glowed with Fervour (tapas), wonnest heavenly light.\textsuperscript{137}

RV 10.167.1

Thus, early Vedic contemplatives used the word tapas to denote a

conscious or intentional effort applied so as to bring about a particular ob­

jective. Such effort produces a state of mind and experience accompanied by a

sense of inflamed arousal. This intense stimulation, they believed, gives rise

to creative powers by which contemplatives may realise clairvoyance etc. As

such, it represents a powerful utility employed not only by the early contem­

platives but also by the gods to achieve their peculiar goals, worldly or other­

wise. Tapas relates directly to asceticism.

**Practices in the Brāhmanas and Aranyakas**

Max Müller wrote of the Brāhmanas:

However interesting the Brāhmanas may be for the researcher in the field

of Indian Literature, they are of little interest for the general educated pub­

clic. Their chief content is prattle and - what is worse - theological prattle. No­

body who does not know the role that the Brāhmanas play in the history

of the Indian mind could read more than ten pages without closing the

book.\textsuperscript{138}

Theological prattle they may be. Nevertheless, the Brāhmanas serve a

limited purpose here by indicating, along with the Aranyakas, the emerging

transition in early Vedic religious practices. The term Brāhmaṇa means

chiefly the expression or explanation of a learned priest regarding sacred

knowledge or doctrine especially for use in the sacrifices. The term indicates

a collection of extensive prose texts containing such discussions from the

\textsuperscript{137} ibid., p. 646. This notion is greatly extended in the Brāhmanas where the gods utilise
tapas to win their rank. See Taittiriya Brāhmaṇa 3.12.3 etc.

priests. The later portions of the Brāhmanas form the Aranyakas or "Forest Treatises". Being of a special philosophical character, they are meant to be studied in the solitude of the forest. The chief contents of the Aranyakas concern sacrificial symbolism, philosophy, and sacrificial mysticism. The Aranyakas constitute a transition to the Upanisads, which "... are either embedded in them or more usually form their concluding portion."  

The Brāhmanas and Aranyakas denote a change from belief in polytheism and the power of ritual in the direction of a recognition of the effectiveness of mind and contemplation. For example, the Kausātakī Brāhmaṇa of the Rg Veda enjoins reverence or faith (sraddhā) as an offering, involving the mind, in the absence of earthly oblations:

Now the imperishableness of what has once been offered is faith (sraddhā); he who sacrifices with faith, his sacrifice perishes not.  

KausBr 7.4

This is known as the "Sraddhā-homa" or "offering of reverence". As well, it is termed "Bhāvanā-homa" because of the predominance of the mental aspect of the offering.  

139 The contents of the Brāhmanas may be classified under three categories: (1) practical sacrificial directions (vidhi), (2) explanatory remarks (arthā-vāda), and (3) philosophical speculations (upanisads). In addition, they contain tales and legends, cosmogonic myths, and epic poetry in praise of heroes.


The *Aitareya Brâhmana* of the *Rg Veda* cites a similar instance of a mental performance derived from the *Agnihotra* sacrifice. The *Agnihotra* is a compulsory, twice-daily sacrifice to be performed by orthodox Brahmins using cow’s milk. Should milk be unavailable through some accident or other, the oblation is offered with reverence alone. For example, if the milk should be spilt, the *Brâhmana* states:

... then he should summon another (cow) and milk her and offer with, but there must be an offering, even if only in faith (*sraddhā*). That is the explanation in this case. All becomes for him suited for the strew, all is secured, who knowing thus offers the Agnihotra.\(^{143}\)

*AitBr 5.5.27*

Elsewhere, the *Aitareya Brâhmana* goes further still with the mental sacrifice. Performance of the *Agnihotra* requires the joint participation of the sacrificer and his wife. On such an occasion, the rules always call for the presence of his wife because their hands are tied together when sacrificing.\(^{144}\) A widower, to continue his sacrificial vocation, is enjoined to perform the sacrifice mentally by proffering faith or trust (*sraddhā*).

How does one without a wife perform the *Agnihotra*? The wife is faith (*sraddhā*), the sacrificer truth (*satya*); faith and truth are the highest pair; by faith and truth as a pair he conquers the world of heaven he should reply.\(^{145}\)

*AitBr 7.2.10*

There is perhaps some difficulty with this quotation. On the one hand, A. Berriedale Keith, believes this passage dealing with mishaps of one sort or another to an *Agnihotrin* is corrupt. He points to Sāyana, the great Vedic

---


scholar of the latter half of the fourteenth century, whose commentary admits these passages were absent from particular places in the texts. Furthermore, previous commentators did not explain them. If Keith's reckoning is to be followed, this places some uncertainty on the authenticity of similar passages of the Brāhmanas and Aranyakas being truly ancient and purely Vedic in content. Martin Huag, on the other hand, doubts whether this paragraph is an interpolation of later times. As he understands it: "The piece may (to judge from its uncouth language) even be older than the bulk of the Aitareya." Be that as it may, the practice of the Agnihotra using faith as offering, while being understood as Bhāvanā-homa due to the predominance of the mental aspect of the offering, is known also as Mānasa Agnihotra: i.e. an Agnihotra performed in the mind. Thus the sacrifice becomes distanced from the external ceremonies and oblations of the Agnihotra. The performance appears to be wholly internalised.

Later Vedic and non-Vedic records containing descriptions of the sacrifices (plus discussions regarding their worth) indicate that the sacrifice could fulfil every wish if performed perfectly according to the dictates of the sacrificial manuals: i.e. the Brāhmanas. That is to say, the value of Vedic prayers, in the sacrificial stage of development, depends on their being uttered in accordance with particular canons of interpretation. Thus, the indi-

146 ibid., pp. 30-31.
147 Haug, op. cit., fn. p. 311.
148 Basu, op. cit., p. 188. Biardeau and Malamoud note the importance of the Aranyakas in evidencing the interiorization of the sacrifice. They develop the "mental sacrifice", mānasa-yajña. Madeleine Biardeau, & Charles Malamoud, Sacrifice dans l'Inde Ancienne, (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1976), pp. 65-66. See also p. 67 where Biardeau and Malamoud also refer to the prāṇāgniḥotra (oblation into the fire of the breath) mentioned in the Kaushātaki Upanisad 2.5. This theme is particularly developed in the Taittirīya Upanisad and the Mahānārāyana Upanisad which describe ātma-yajña.
vidual gains self-control over his destiny. Performance of the mental sacrifice in close association with the external rite represents both an initial recognition of the efficacy of mind and contemplation to acquire further self-control, and a movement towards the utilisation of yoga techniques via complete internalisation of the sacrifice. That is to say, meditation eventually substitutes for the complete external sacrifice.

**Upāsanā**

In the Aranyakas, the form of mastery develops further to a stage where the individual seeks to internalise fully the material sacrifice in order to obtain the same outcome. The external sacrifice, with applied visualisation involving a degree of attention, becomes a form of worship/meditation (upāsanā) eventually taking various forms. In the embryonic stage of development of upāsanā, the worshippers still regard the sacrifice as most important. By itself it is sufficient to bring about the desired benefits. The upāsanā practised along with it is, at this early stage, considered supplementary. Worship/meditation helps gain some additional merit. Its omission does not affect the sacrifices. Later in the Aranyakas, meditations of this type separate from the external rituals. They become symbolic representations of the external sacrifice. That is to say, the complete external rite shifts to the mind. The discussion of the mental Agnihotra of the Aitareya Brāhmaṇa above concludes, in the Sānkhyāyana Aranyaka, with the "spiritual and internal Agnihotra" (ādhyātmikam-antaram Agnihotram).

S.N. Dasgupta calls this type of sacrifice a "substitution-meditation":

i.e.

---

149 See also the editorials of the following articles for an outline of the process from yajña to upāsanā: "Worship as a Spiritual Discipline-II," *Prabuddha Bhrātara*, 85 (June, 1980), 242-250, and "Meditation and Sacrifice," *Prabuddha Bhrātara*, 88 (1983), 282-287.

150 *Sānkhyāyana Aranyaka* 10.1. Basu, op. cit., p. 188.
... these attempts to intellectualise sacrifices took the form of replacing by meditation the actual sacrifices, and this substitution was believed to produce results which were equally beneficial... It should not be supposed that the sacrificial forms were entirely supplanted by these new forms of substitution-meditations.\textsuperscript{151}

The sacrifice could now be performed by a practice of holding continually in mind the deity or process. This new method of worship, however, does not entail prolonged contemplation or logical thought: it is merely an interiorisation of the sacrifice. The following passage from the \textit{Aitareya Aranyaka} depicts the internalisation of deity whereby aspects of the sacrificer/meditator represent its various microcosmic features.

Speech (\textit{vāk}) is fire (\textit{agni}), eye is the sun (\textit{āditya}), mind (\textit{manas}) is the moon (\textit{candras}) and the directions are ears; this conjunction (aspect) of the predestined is microcosmic (aspect). These deities are his manifestations only...\textsuperscript{152}

\textit{AitAr} 2.1.5

In the depiction of the internalisation of deity, mind (\textit{manas}) here represents the various materials such as stall and sacrificial potsherds in the sacrificial process.\textsuperscript{153} Another passage similarly depicts the internalised sacrifice. In this instance, the gradual manifestation of the activities of speech, ears, sight and mind (i.e. of their presiding deities) is a sacrifice. That is to say, the performance of a sacrifice depends upon the action of the sense organs etc. stimulated by the internalised presiding deities.\textsuperscript{154}

The purusa is made up of five elements; what is hot is fire, the organs are ether; the blood, phlegm and semen are water; the body is earth; the vital air is air. The air is also five-fold Prāṇa, Apāṇa, Vyāṇa, Udāna and Samāna. The gods of sight, ear, mind and speech have entered the Prāṇa


\textsuperscript{153} ibid., p. 25.

\textsuperscript{154} ibid., p. 72.
Early Vedic Contemplative Practices

and Apāna. On the departure of the prāna they also depart. It is a sacrifice of the speech and chitta [thinking, imagining, or reflecting] in a gradual order. The sacrifice is of five kinds, viz: Agni Hotra, New and Full moon sacrifices, Chātmāvyā, Animal sacrifice and Soma sacrifice. The soma is the perfect amongst the sacrifices.\textsuperscript{155}

\textit{AitAr 2.3.3}

The internalised sacrifice is performed on a single preferred anatomical region of the sacrificer/meditator where the internalised deity permeates the body of the sacrificer/meditator. At the commencement of creation, for example, Brahma enters man through the tips of his toes and proceeds higher up to the thigh, stomach, heart and head before branching out into sight, hearing, mind, speech and vital air. In the following passage, the internalised sacrifice represents worship/meditation (\textit{upāsanā}) on Brahma in either the stomach or the heart.

Those who are farsighted thinkers worship (\textit{upāste}) Brahma in the stomach and the thinkers of the Aruni clan worship him in the heart. It is certainly Brahma (everywhere).\textsuperscript{156}

\textit{AitAr 2.1.4}

A later part of the \textit{Aitareya Aranyaka} demonstrates further the movement away from the outward ceremonial towards internal worship/meditation by asking the question:

"Who is the Atman (self) whom we worship (\textit{upāsmaha})?"\textsuperscript{157}

\textit{AitAr 2.6.1}

The development of substitution-meditation or \textit{upāsanā} (wherein appears a shift from external sacrifice to internal worship/meditation to realise

\textsuperscript{155} ibid., p. 71.

\textsuperscript{156} ibid., p. 18.

\textsuperscript{157} ibid., p. 121. Note, this passage forming part of the second \textit{Aranyaka} is generally classified as part of the \textit{Aitareya Upanisad}. See Radhakrishnan, Hume, Mitra, etc.
Conclusion

The Rg Vedic rsi (seer) represents the main practitioner of contemplative skills depicted in the early Vedic texts. The "vision" or supersensible knowledge of the rsi -- "seen" in sudden flashes of intuition -- becomes rendered into holy utterance to invoke the gods for a particular end. The rsi generates holy utterance by means of his intentional thought which embodies a mental image or idea to be realised. Visionary thought equates with the ability to evoke specific mental images (which become realised in order to create concrete objects) via the power of inspiration or imagination. This germinal practice, whereby a vision becomes actualised, prefigures the practice known as worship/meditation (upāsanā) in the Brāhmanas and Aranyakas. In these texts, the individual seeks (via imagination) to internalise fully the material sacrifice. The complete external rite of the sacrifice becomes a substitution/meditation by shifting to the mind. As such, this practice represents an embryonic stage in the growth of upāsanā which, as will be shown in the next chapter, becomes fully developed in the Upanisads.

In addition to the Rg Vedic seer, the Rg Veda and Atharva Veda also depict other contemplatives: the munis (ecstatics), brahmacārins (religious students), and yatis (ascetics). They show contemplatives involved in the demonstration of skills and powers seemingly akin to those obtained by yogic techniques and different from those involved in the worship of gods and the performance of sacrifice by the rsi.

The evidence suggests that such ascetics etc. represent the forerunners of later yogic contemplatives whose practices may have imparted some sway on the Vedic ritual of the rsis as well as influencing the techniques of
yogic contemplatives found in the *Upanisads* and the *Pàli Suttas*. The profile of the rsi in the *Rg Veda* differs from the description of the other contemplatives by its lack of austerities and self-denial etc.

To conclude, Vedic derivatives of the Sanskrit root "dhi",\(^{158}\) indicate the medium by which both the rsi and the gods actualise specific mental images. That is to say, the power of evocation represents the capacity or means to bring about a desired reality.\(^{159}\) The method of the rsi, in his use of *dhi*, thus provides the basis for the development of orthodox contemplative praxis. Examination of Vedic derivatives of the Sanskrit root "yuj", from which the important word *yoga* is derived, reveals only the rudiments of classical *yoga* with its customary pessimism. The term *brahman*, as denoting the power implicit in the Vedic ritual, suggests a possible precursor to emergent notions of potency of mind and contemplation depicted in later literature. The *Muni-sûkta* of the *Rg Veda* is noteworthy for suggesting explicitly the forerunner of the later yogic contemplatives: i.e. the samnyásins and the bhikṣus. The *Muni-sûkta*'s reference to the yellow garments of the muni prefigures perhaps the later monastic dress of the Buddhist yogins. The power of the muni to travel consciously and deliberately through different regions and paths suggests the later notion that the yogin develops supernormal powers which generate the ability of unhindered movement. This idea features both in the *Pàli Suttas* where the Buddha maintains the ability to move in celestial and atmospheric regions as well as in the *Yoga-Sûtras* of Patañjali. The gen-

\(^{158}\) The practice of tracing the development of terms derived from root verb-forms in the Sanskrit language is a linguistic convenience utilised by etymologists. The tradition is continued here also for expedience whilst bearing in mind that such connections between terms have no probable basis in reality.

\(^{159}\) This is a significant point when considered in the context of the following chapter where the later Vedic worship/meditation (*upásandā*) internalises both concrete and abstract symbols or "images" so as to engender desired results. In a sense, the early Upanisadic sages forgo the social and material benefits derived from the early Vedic utilisation of internal states to utilise perhaps a similar creative process, using internal "images" or "visions" so to speak, to realise a specific ontological condition: i.e. union with *Brahman*. 
eral picture of early Vedic contemplative practices suggests an influence on Vedic contemplatives by pre-Aryan yogins of aboriginal origin. At the period of the early Vedas, Indian contemplative practices indicate an emerging synthesis of indigenous (i.e. non-Aryan) yogic practices with Aryan practices.
CHAPTER 3

CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES IN THE UPANISADS

Introduction
According to Macdonell, "... the earliest of [the Upanisads] can hardly be dated later than 600 B.C. since some important doctrines first met with in them are presupposed by Buddhism." On the basis of internal evidence, Macdonell divides the Upanisads into four classes consisting of, (1) the oldest group, the Brhadâranyaka, Chândogya, Taittirîya, Aitareya, Kausîtaki (c. 8th BC) and the Kena which forms a transition to a decidedly later class; (2) the Katha, Isa, Svetâsvatara, Mundaka, and Mahânârâyana (c. 4th B.C.); (3) the Prasna and Maitrî which use a much less archaic type of prose than that of the first class (c. 1st A.D.) ; and finally (4) the late Atharvan Upanisads. According to Macdonell, the Katha and Svetâsvatara are considered to be older than the Maitrî which, it seems, borrows from them. On the one hand, the Svetâsvatara, in its present form, is later than the Katha Upanisad

... since it contains several passages which must be referred to that work, besides many stanzas borrowed from it with or without variation. Its lateness is further indicated by the developed theory of Yoga which it contains besides the more or less definite form in which it exhibits various Vedânta doctrines either unknown to or only foreshadowed in the earlier Upanisads.

2 ibid.
3 ibid., p. 197.
On the other hand, relevant parts of the *Katha* are thought to be scarcely earlier than the fourth century B.C. Indeed, the sixth chapter may be a later addition.⁴ Thus the *Katha* and *Svetâsvatara* are located after the rise of Buddhism.

Macdonell declares that the language and style of the *Maitrî* (also known as the *Maitri, Maitreya, Maitrâyana, Maitrâyanî, and Maitrâyanîya Upanisad*) render it unmistakably post-Buddhistic. He states:

> The various Upanisads of the Black *Yajurveda* all bear the stamp of lateness. The *Maitrâyana* ... consists of seven chapters, the seventh and the concluding chapters of the sixth forming a supplement. The fact that it retains the orthographical and euphonic peculiarities of the *Maitrâyana* school, gives this Upanisad an archaic appearance. But its many quotations from other Upanisads, the occurrence of several late words, the developed *Sâmkhya* doctrine presupposed by it, distinct reference to anti-Vedic heretical schools, all combine to render the late character of this work undoubted. It is, in fact, a summing up of the old Upanisadic doctrines with an admixture of ideas derived from the *Sâmkhya* system and from Buddhism .... Though pessimism is not unknown in the old *Upanisads*, it is much more pronounced here, doubtless in consequence of *Sâmkhya* and Buddhistic influence.⁵

Van Buitenen's critical essay entitled *The Maitrâyanîya Upanisad* points to the existence of different versions of this work. He calls the most generally known text the "Vulgate of the *Maitrâyanîya*", and states that its first five chapters appear to present a uniform character while the sixth and seventh chapters seem "... to be full of inconsistencies and desultory portions, which have been described as appendices, accretions, and, in part, interpolations."⁶ He names another version (which cannot be explained as a derivative

---


from the Vulgate) the "Southern Maitrāyaṇī". Omissions represent the major differences between the two versions.

Van Buitenen's analysis of the various components of the present text leads him to conclude that the Southern Maitrāyaṇī

... existed as a separate text, which is separately preserved as the Southern version of [the Vulgate], and that this separate text ... at one point was incorporated in another text to form the composite Vulgate.

That is to say, the Southern Maitrāyaṇī was deliberately or accidently combined with an ancient prose Upanisad, which he sees as the original Maitrāyaṇīya to become the later Maitrī/Maitrāyaṇīya Upanisad. According to his reconstruction, the original Maitrāyaṇīya Upanisad, i.e. the Vulgate minus the Southern Maitrāyaṇī and some late appendices,

... is not a late archaizing scribble that somehow got attached to another text. It is archaic; it represents a stage which is prior to [passages of] the TaittīUp ... It very evidently connects with the very first section of the Vulgate; and in between these connected, upanisadic and archaic sections intervenes a large text, of obviously more recent date ... and, on external evidence, demonstrably secondary.

Van Buitenen also suggests that an editor may have been responsible for some additional passages and alterations, designed to impose a spurious unity on the combined texts of the original Maitrāyaṇīya Upanisad and the

7 ibid., p. 14. Further, van Buitenen decides that there were two manuscript traditions of the Southern Maitrāyaṇī. See p. 22.

8 According to van Buitenen, the major deviation is that the Southern Maitrāyaṇī omits 1.1; 4.1; 4.4-6 of the Vulgate version. Ibid., p. 15.

9 ibid., p. 17.

10 ibid., p. 21; p. 23; & pp. 27-28. Van Buitenen identifies chapters 1.2-5.2 of the Vulgate as the insertion from the southern tradition. See pp. 27-28.

11 On the basis of internal evidence, van Buitenen decides that the original text was an Upanisad of the Maitrāyaṇīya branch of the Black Yajurveda. Ibid., p. 21.

12 ibid., p. 33.
Southern Maitrāyanī. Finally, he regards the additional sections (i.e. 6.18-21) containing miscellaneous discussions and yogic practices as a late appendix. 

Eliade regards the Maitrī as "... the point of departure for the whole group of middle-period Upanisads ..." and places its composition between the second century B.C. and the second century A.D., that is to say, around the period of the Bhagavad Gītā. He points out correctly that yoga technique and ideology are presented in the Maitrī in a more detailed manner than in the earlier Upanisads. Chapter six, which is unusually longer than the other chapters, contains most of the fundamental components of yogic practices. Furthermore, he judges this chapter to be a later composition. By way of evidence, Eliade notes that all of the verses of this chapter begin with the formula: "For it is said elsewhere ...." He cites this as proof of the dependence of the Maitrī on earlier yogic texts. This may not be strictly so. That is to say, the Maitrī may have been dependent on earlier yogic practices which were not necessarily recorded in textual form, but, nevertheless, "said elsewhere". For example, it was proper practice for the early Buddhists and Jains to hand on their contemplative practices in an oral tradition.

Winternitz and Deussen support Macdonell's chronology. Deussen feels that

13 ibid., p. 84.
14 ibid., p. 85.
16 ibid., pp. 124-127.
17 Winternitz, History of Indian Literature, vol. 1, op. cit., pp. 218-220.
No satisfactory chronology of the Upanishads can be framed, since each of the principal Upanishads contains earlier and later texts side by side with one another. On the whole and generally, however, the classification and order here accepted may be expected to correspond also to the historical succession.  

With Deussen's observation in mind (and for the sake of convenience), this work accepts the Macdonell/Winternitz/Deussen chronological order of the principal *Upanisads*. Thirteen principal *Upanisads* are considered here. They represent groups one to three above and are numbered I to XIII.

This chapter analyses the principal *Upanisads* using a method similar to that utilised in chapter 2 so as to clarify the nature of Upanisadic meditational practices. That is to say, the technique of contextual analysis is applied to some of the more important terms relating to contemplative praxis in order to assess the relationships of these practices. As well, the technique of contextual analysis will be applied to determine any increasing development of Upanisadic methods derived from early Vedic practices, i.e. in the shift from extroversion to introversion. As a consequence of this examination, this chapter aims to determine if, and to what degree, there exists (in the pre-Buddhist texts) an *Upanisadic*, and thus Aryan, foundation for meditative practices which may have made their way into the *Pāli Suttas*, Further, it aims to appraise the possibility of cross-fertilisation of ideas and practices from early Buddhism and other heterodox systems to the post-Buddhist *Upanisads*.

Consultation of Jacob's concordance to the principal *Upanisads* for references to contemplative practices indicates which texts contain references to a particular term. Subsequent examination of those terms in their textual

19 ibid., p. 398.
environment exposes the major contexts in which those terms are used. The words *upāsanā* (worship/meditation), *dhyāna* (profound meditation), and *yoga* (to control, to contemplate) and their derivatives are the most frequent. Of these terms, *upāsanā* with its derivatives excels in number and historical extent. Other Upanisadic terms that were researched, e.g. *moksa* (salvation, deliverance) and *mukti* (salvation, deliverance) are difficult to evaluate because occurrences are minimal -- though this may itself prove significant. As a result, *upāsanā*, *dhyāna*, and *yoga* (along with their derivatives) are the chief words examined here in context, so as to make clear the nature of Upanisadic contemplative practices, as well as to assess their possible relationship to Buddhist practices.

As an aid to contextual analysis, the following table sets out the frequency, distribution, and historical range of important terms relating to contemplative practices in the principal *Upanisads*. Here, the *Upanisads* are numbered I to XIII according to Macdonell's chronology. Numbers I to V represent the pre-Buddhist texts. Number VI, the *Kena*, is probably contemporaneous with early Buddhism. Numbers VII to XIII denote post-Buddhist texts. Hereafter, the words "early" and "earlier" will refer to pre-Buddhist *Upanisads* while the terms "late" and "later" will indicate post-Buddhist texts. The chart is divided into three major related categories listed under "Practice". The categories indicate (1) the number of occurrences of the terms derived from *upa + ās* (e.g. *upāsanā*), (2) terms stemming from *dhyā* (e.g. *dhyāna*), and (3) terms derived from *yuj* (e.g. *yoga*).
Contemplative Practices In The Upanisads

Frequency and distribution of terms in the principal *Upanisads*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practice</th>
<th>UPA + ÂŚ</th>
<th>DHYAI</th>
<th>YUJ</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Brhadāranyaka</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Chāndogya</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Taittiriya</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Aitareya</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Kausitaki</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI Kena</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII Katha</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII Isā</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX Svetāsvatara</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X Mundaka</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI Mahānārāyana</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII Prasna</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIII Maitri</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The term *upāsanā* with its derivatives, by pervading the principal *Upanisads*, represents the primary contemplative technique. Most references to *upāsanā* occur in the oldest *Upanisads*, i.e. the *Brhadāranyaka*, *Chāndogya*, and *Kausitaki*. *Upāsanā*, and terms derived from it such as *upāste* and *upāśita*, are mentioned sixty-three times in the *Brhadāranyaka*²¹.

²¹ Brh. 1.4.7. upāste; upāśita; 8. upāśita; upāste; 10. upāste; 1.4.11. upāste; 15. upāśita ... upāste; 1.5.2. upāste; 13. ... upāste; upāste; 2.1.2. upāse; upāše; upāste; 3. upāse; upāse; upāste; 2.1.4. upāse; upāše; upāste; 5. upāse; 2.1.5. upāse; upāste; 6. upāse; upāse; upāste; 2.1.7. upāse; upāše; upāste; 8. upāse; upāše; upāste; 9. upāse; upāse; upāste; 10. upāse; upāse; 2.1.10. upāste (12); 11. upāse; upāse; upāste; 2.1.12. upāse; upāste; 13. upāse; upāse; upāste; 4.1.2. upāśita; upāste (3-7); upāśita; 4. upāśita; 5. upāśita; 6. upāśita; 4.1.7. upāśita; 4.4.10. upāśate (Isā. 9); 16. upāsate; 5.5.1. upāśate; 5.8.1. upāśita; 6.2.15. upāsate; 6.4.2. upāste ... upāśita.
one hundred and fifteen times in the Chândogya, and fifty-eight times in the Kausitaki. The number of references to upásanā diminishes abruptly thereafter until the Maitrī where upásanā occurs eleven times. The virtual restriction of upásanā to the oldest group of Upanisads, especially the Brhadāranyaka and Chândogya, suggests that upásanā was the predominant practice of that period. For whatever reason, the practice of upásanā, it would seem, was later largely abandoned.

**Upásanā**

The term upásanā (from "upa + ās") means literally the act of sitting or being near an object at hand. It is also associated with adoration, worship, and devoted veneration. The word upásanā is translated variously as "worship" and "meditation". For example, Hume renders Brhadāranyaka 1.4.7 as:

22 Chând. 2.1.1. upásanam; 1.1.1. upāsita; 7. upāste; 1.2.2. upāsā; (similarly in 3, 4, 5, 6, 7); 1.2.10. upāsām; (similarly in 11,12); 14. upāste; 1.3.1. upāsita; 2. upāsita; 3. upāsita 5; 6. upāsita; 7. upāste; 8. upāsita; 1.4.1. upāsita; 1.5.3. upāsita; 1.9.2. upāste; 4. upāste; 2.1.4. upāste; 2.2.1. upāsita 3.1; 4.1; 5.1; 6.1; 2.2.3. upāste 3.2; 4.2; 5.2; 6.2; 2.7.1. upāsita; 2.7.2. upāste; 2.8.1. upāsita 9.1; 10.1; 2.8.3. upāste 9.8; 10.6; 2.21.4. upāsita; 3.13.1. upāsita; 3.13.2. upāsita; 3.13.3. upāsita; 3.13.4. upāsita; 3.13.5. upāsita; 3.13.8. upāsita; 3.14.1. upāsita; 3.18.1. upāsita; 3.19.4. upāste; 4.2.2. upāste; 4.3.7. upāsmāh; 4.5.3. upāste; 4.6.4. upāste; 4.7.4. upāste; 4.8.4. upāste; 4.11.2. upāste 4.12.2.; 4.13.2.; 5.10.1. upāsate; 3. upāsate; 5.12.1. upāsate; 5.13.1; 5.14.1; 5.15.1; 5.16.1; 5.17.1. upāsate (similarly 5 times more); 5.12.2. upāste 5.13.2; 5.14.2; 5.16.2; 5.17.2; 5.18.1 upāste; 7.24.5. upāsate; 7.1.4. upāsā; 7.1.5. upāste (his). 7.2.1. upāsā; 7.3.1. upāsā (similarly down to section 14); 2. upāste (and similarly in each section down to 14th); 8.12.6. upāsate.

23 Kaus. 2.7. upāsanāni; 2.6. upāsita (similarly 5 times more); 3.2. upāsāva ... upāste; 3.3. upāsteteti; 4.3. upāsā (similarly 16 times more); 4.3. upāse (also 16 times); 4.3. upāste (also 16 times).

24 Maitrī 4.4. upāste; 6.2. upāsto; 4. upāstet; 6. upāstā ... upāsito; upāsita; 12. upāsita; 14. upāsita; 16. upāsita; 23. upāsita; 37. upāsita 7.11.
Whoever worships (upāste) one or another of these - he knows not; ... one should worship (upāsīta) with the thought that he is just one's self (ātman), for therein all these become one. ...²⁵

Brh 1.4.7

Radhakrishnan treats the same verse as follows:

He who meditates (upāste) on one or another of them (aspects) is incomplete ... The self is to be meditated (upāsīta) upon for in it all these become one. ...²⁶

Brh 1.4.7

The reason for such variant (and seemingly disparate) translations of upāsanā lies with the relationship between worship and meditation. This will become apparent as the work progresses.

The Nature of Upāsanā
The objects of upāsanā are mainly verbal symbols and abstract ideas. For example, the Brhadāranyaka, the earliest of the principal Upanisads, urges the practitioner to worship one's self (ātman).

When breathing he becomes breath (prāna) by name; when speaking, voice ... when thinking, the mind; these are merely the names of his acts. Whoever worships (upāste) one or another of these -- he knows not; for he is incomplete with one or another of these. One should worship (evopāsīta) with the thought that he is just one's self (ātman), for therein all these become one.²⁷

Brh 1.4.1,5,7

In utilising verbal symbols as objects of upāsanā, the Chāndogya extols the Chant (Śāman) in various forms including the Udgītha.

²⁵ Hume, op. cit., pp. 82-83.
²⁶ Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 166.
²⁷ Hume, op. cit., p. 83.
Om! Assuredly, the reverence (upāṣṭa) of the Śaman entire is good. ... In the worlds one should reverence (upāṣṭa) a fivefold Śaman (Chant). ...

The worlds, both in their ascending order and in their reverse order, serve him who, knowing thus, reverences (upāste) a fivefold Śaman in the worlds.\(^\text{28}\)

Chānd 2.1-2.8

The following verse, also from the Chāndogya, identifies the Udgītha with the syllable Om.

Om! One should reverence (upāṣṭa) the Udgītha (Loud Chant) as this syllable, for one sings the loud chant [beginning] with 'Om'.\(^{29}\)

Chānd 1.1.1

As the objects of upāsanā are mainly verbal symbols and abstract ideas, the process is mental as well as physical. Indeed, should an object of veneration (upāsya) be a material object which is a great distance apart from the worshipper, the separation is covered by a mental process. Briefly, upāsanā means an act of coming near an object due to devotion to that object.\(^{30}\) In the Upanisadic context, critical examination of terms formed from "upa + ās" indicates that upāsanā is, on the whole, a contemplative process wherein the object of worship is an object of concentration. Upanisadic worship/meditation,\(^{31}\) in addition to being mainly a contemplative process, is emblematic and analytical.\(^{32}\) The worshipper's analysis takes the form of attempts to acquire knowledge of the etymological and mythological signifi-

\(^{28}\) And similarly in a rainstorm, in all waters, in the seasons, in animals, and in the vital breaths, prāna. Hume, op. cit., pp. 190-193.

\(^{29}\) ibid., p. 177.

\(^{30}\) Velkar, op. cit., p. 8. See Tait. 3.10 where the worshipper appropriates the object of worship.

\(^{31}\) The use of the dual translation here is to reflect variant translations of upāsanā noted above.

\(^{32}\) Velkar, op. cit., p. 13.
cance of the object of worship while aiming to understand its essential character through constant effort and experimentation. Various tangible objects, in addition to abstract images located internally, are the focus of constant meditation as the means to realise Brahman. Brahman may be contemplated in some form (pratīka), either concrete or abstract, which aids the worshipper in the development of concentration. In their translations of the following passage from the Kausitaki, Hume renders the term "upāsitā" as "reverence", whereas Radhakrishnan prefers "meditate":

The uktha (recitation) is Brahman, ... let him meditate [upāsitā] on it as the Rg (hymn of praise) unto such a one, indeed, all beings offer praise for his greatness. Let him meditate (upāsitā) on it as the Yajus (sacrificial formula) ... Let him meditate (upāsitā) on it as beauty. Let him meditate (upāsitā) on it as glory. Let him meditate (upāsitā) on it as splendour. ...

Kaus 2.6

In the worshipper's aim for a progressive knowing of the nature of Brahman, the search may begin in practice (according to the worshipper's predilection) at one extreme, with phenomenal and physiological forces. At the other extreme, it may be to psychological concepts such as satya (truth, righteousness), vijñāna (intelligence, discernment), and ānanda (bliss). That is to say, the focus for the realisation of Brahman, in the Upanisads, may shift (according to the meditator's ability) from the external, tangible reality to the internal world of the mind. The transition is a progressive one from extroversion to introversion.

33 ibid., p. 517.
34 Hume, op. cit., p. 311.
35 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 765.
36 Velkar, op. cit., p. 27. For satya, see Brh. 2.1.20; 4.1.4; 5.5.1; 5.14.4; Chānd. 7.16; 8.3.4-5; Tait. 2.4; 2.6; Kaus. 1.6; Maitṛī 6.6; for vijñāna, see Chānd. 7.7.1-2; Ait. 5.1-4; Maitṛī 6.13; for ānanda, see Tait. 2.8-9.
The symbols of Brahman taken up for upāsanā meditation by worshippers fall into three broad categories: (a) Vedic deities, (b) perceptible symbols, and (c) imperceptible objects. These types of symbols will now be examined.

(a) Vedic deities as manifestations of Brahman

In the various identifications of the udgītha and of its syllables, the Chāndogya urges worship of one of the syllables as āditya, the sun.

ud is heaven; gī is atmosphere; tha is earth.
ud is the sun (āditya); gī is wind; tha is fire....
Speech yields milk -- that is, the milk of speech itself -- for him, he becomes rich in food, and eater of food, who knows and reverences (upāṣta) these syllables of the Udgītha thus: ud, gī, tha37.

Chānd 1.3.7

The deities worshipped/contemplated include the solar deities, e.g. Sūrya, Savitṛ, and Aditya, as well as other Vedic gods such as Agni, Indra, Rudra-Siva etc. The solar deities are invoked and worshipped by the continuous uttering (japa) of syllables such as "Om". Recitation of Sāman chants and the "Savitr" (Gāyatrī38) verse from the Rgveda are utilised also for the same purpose. With the exception of the Vedic gods Agni, Soma and Aditya who, in some places in the Upanisads, are worshipped with regular external ceremonies, such devoted veneration is mental and symbolical.39 The

---

37 Hume, op. cit., p. 181. Other examples where Savitr etc. are noted include: Maitrī 6.7-9; 6.21-33; 6.34; Aditya at Chānd. 2.21.1; 2.24.11; Brh. 6.5.3; Tait. 1.6; Śvet. 4.2; Maitrī 4.5; 6.35; Sūrya, Rudra, and Indra etc. as symbols of universal life at: Prasna 2.15-13; daily adoration of the sun at: Kaus. 2.7; the sun as unsullied purity at: Katha 5.11; and examples of invocations at: Chānd. 1.12.5; 2.1 etc.

38 Rg Veda 3.62.10. Known as "Savitr" from being addressed to Savitr, the sun as generator: "Tat savitur varenyam bhargo devasya dhīmaḥi dhiyo yo nah pracodayaḥ, May we attain that excellent glory of Savitar the God: so may he stimulate our prayers." Gr 198.

39 Velkar, op. cit, pp. 16-19.
Svetāsvatara, after noting the invocation of Savitr for inspiration and self-control⁴⁰, refers to the one immanent god:

... It is the greatness of God in the world
By which this Brahma-wheel is caused to revolve.

The beginning, the efficient cause of combinations,
He is to be seen as beyond the three times (kala), without parts (a-kala)
too!
Worship (upāsyā) Him as the manifold, the origin of all being,
The adorable God who abides in one's own thoughts, the primeval.⁴¹

Svet 6.1,5

(b) Perceptible forms as contemplative symbols
Symbols of Brahman are often assigned a perceptible form such as the elements in order to aid the worshipper in his efforts at concentration. The Kausūtaki indicates a progressive determination (and subsequent worship) of Brahman in various cosmic phenomena and in the self. The following passage relates to phenomena.

⁴⁰ Svet. 2.1-7.

Let me declare Brahma to you.
... Him who is this person in the sun -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes pre-eminent, the head of all beings.

... Him who is this person in the moon -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes the soul of food.

... Him who is this person in the lightning -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes the soul of truth.

... Him who is this person in thunder -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes indeed triumphant, unconquerable, a conqueror of adversaries.

... Him who is this person in space -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes filled with offspring, cattle, splendor, the luster of sanctity, and the heavenly world; he reaches the full term of life.

... Him who is this person in fire -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes verily a vanquisher amid others.

... Him who is this person in water -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ...
He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes the soul of brilliance.42

Kaus 4.1-10

Thereafter, the Kausātaki refers to the progressive determination and subsequent worship of Brahman in the self.

Now with reference to the self. --
... Him who is this person in the mirror -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus -- a very counterpart of him is born in his offspring, not an unlikeness.

... Him who is this person in the shadow -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, obtains from his double; he becomes possessed of his double.

... Him who is this person in the echo -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, passes not into unconsciousness before the time.

... Him who is this person in the sound -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, deceases not before the time.

... The person here who, asleep, moves about in a dream -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, everything here is subdued to his supremacy.

... Him who is this person in the body -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes procreated with offspring, ... the heavenly world; he reaches the full term of life.

... Him who is this person in the right eye -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes the soul of all these [i.e. the soul of speech, of fire, and of light].

... Him who is this person in the left eye -- him indeed I reverence (upāsa). ... He then who reverences (upāste) him thus, becomes the soul of all these [i.e. the soul of truth, of lightning, and of brightness].

Kaus 4.11-18

(c) The imperceptible forms of contemplative symbols

As objects of concentration, the sense-organs, prāna (breath), and manas (mind) are considered to be the most excellent. In the earlier Upanisads, prāna was superior to manas. It, being immortal, is considered to be an apt symbol and the empirical representative of Brahman. The following

43 ibid., pp. 331-333.
passage from the *Kausitaki* expresses this sentiment in the identity of *prâna* with life and immortality.

... I am the breathing spirit (*prâna*), the intelligential self (*prajñâtman*). As such, reverence (*upâsya*) me as life, as immortality. Life is the breathing spirit, the breathing spirit, verily, is life. The breathing spirit, indeed, is immortality. ... for indeed, with the breathing spirit in this world one obtains immortality; with intelligence, true conception.

So he who reverences (*upâste*) me as life, as immortality, reaches the full term of life in this world; he obtains immortality, indestructibility in the heavenly world.44

*Kaus* 3.2

The later *Upanisads*, however, tend to promote *manas* to a position above *prâna*.45 Manas, also, is described as an excellent instrument for the direct realisation of Brahman. In the *Upanisads*, the mind is frequently equated with the arrow which hits the mark or target, i.e. Brahman.46 The *Mundaka* indicates this in the following:

Taking as a bow the great weapon of the *Upanisad*,
One should put upon it an arrow sharpened by meditation (*upâsânisitam*).  
Stretching it with a thought directed to the essence of That,  
Penetrate that Imperishable as the mark (*laksya*), my friend.

The mystic syllable *Om* (*pranava*) is the bow.  
The arrow is the soul (*âtman*).  
Brahma is the mark (*laksya*).  
By the undistracted man is It to be penetrated.  
One should come to be in It, as the arrow [in the mark].47

*Mund* 2.2.3-4

In the worshipper's gradual progression toward the goal, the focus shifts towards a more abstract and less perceptible symbol of Brahman: the

44 ibid., p. 321.

45 Noble Ross Reat. *The Origins of Buddhist Psychology*, (PhD Thesis, University of Lancaster, 1980), pp. 288-294. For example, see Brh. 5.6; Chând. 3.14.2-3; Tait. 1.6; *Mâtrî* 2.6; 2.2.8.

46 Velkar, op. cit., p. 24. For example, see *Mâtrî* 6.24

47 Hume, op. cit., p. 372.
individualised self (ātman). Mental states such as waking, dreaming, and dreamless sleep are utilised for the progressive realisation of the nature of the individualised self as "Anna-Prāna-Manas-Vijñāna-Ananda" (food-breath-mind-knowledge-bliss). The nature of Brahman is investigated in a similar fashion.48

The uttering of verbal symbols, e.g. Om and udgīta (a singing, a song), represents the "vācakas" (explicit terms or "sound-forms") of Brahman. They too are invested with great power by the worshippers. For example, the Upanisads, when praising the properties of Om, identify the syllable with Brahman49 and the udgīta (loud chant)50. Brahman is understood as omnipotent51, omnipresent52, and omniscient53. As such, Om is the bringer of immortality and the fullfiller of desires54.

48 Brh. 4.3.9-32. See also Chānd. 8.7.4; 10.1; 11.1 on waking, dreaming, and dreamless sleep as well as gradual instruction concerning the real self. Taittirīya 2.1-5 summarises the course of evolution from the primal Ātman through the elements to the human person. After doing so, the text encourages the progressive realisation of the nature of the individualised self as "Anna-Prāna-Manas-Vijñāna-Ananda" (food-breath-mind-knowledge-bliss). Taittirīya 3.1-6 continues in a similar fashion by urging the progressive realisation of the nature of Brahman as "Anna-Prāna-Manas-Vijñāna-Ananda" (food-breath-mind-knowledge-bliss) via austerity (tapas).

49 Tait. 1.8; Katha 2.16; Prasna 5.2; Maitrī 6.22; 6.23.

50 See also Maitrī 6.4 where it is also identified with the udgīta, and 6.3-4 for an explanation of the syllable Om.

51 Svet. 1.9.

52 Mund. 1.1.6.

53 Mund. 1.1.9; 2.2.7.

54 Chānd. 1.1.6-8; Maitrī 6.4. See also Chānd. 2.23.3 where Om is the "world-all"; Tait. 1-8.
... This sound [Om] ... is immortal, fearless. By taking refuge in it the gods become immortal, fearless.

He who pronounces the syllable, knowing it thus, takes refuge in that syllable, in the immortal, fearless sound. Since the gods became immortal by taking refuge in it, therefore he becomes immortal.\footnote{Hume, op. cit., p. 182.}

Chând 1.4.4-5

\begin{verse}
That syllable, truly, indeed is Brahma!
That syllable indeed is the supreme!
Knowing that syllable, truly, indeed,
Whatever one desires is his!

That is the best support.
That is the supreme support.
Knowing that support,
One becomes happy in the Brahma-world.\footnote{ibid., p. 349.}
\end{verse}

\textit{Katha} 2.16-17

With constant repetition, these contemplative forms are thought by practitioners to enable the transcendence of the grosser realms of existence. Their value in this regard is found in meditation utilising \textit{yoga} techniques. Specific references in this regard occur in the later \textit{Upanisads} such as the \textit{Svetásvatara, Mundaka, Prasna,} and \textit{Maitré} to be discussed below.

\textbf{Vidyás and legends regarding upásanâ}

The importance of \textit{upásanâ} is emphasised in the \textit{Upanisads} by the relating of \textit{vidyás}\footnote{See K.N. Aiyar, \textit{The Thirty-two Vidyā-s}, Madras: Adyar Library and Research Centre, 1975; 1st publ. 1916. See also Horsch op. cit.} involving stories or legends in association with \textit{upásanâ}. The term \textit{vidyā} is used here in a specialised sense: rather than signifying mere knowledge, it denotes instructions regarding the nature of meditative symbols. As such, \textit{vidyās} promote different kinds of meditation which conduce to the realisation of knowledge. Most \textit{vidyās} and legends occur in the \textit{Bṛhadāranyaka, Chāndogya, Taittirīya,} and \textit{Kausitaki Upanisads}. 

\footnote{Hume, op. cit., p. 182.}

\footnote{ibid., p. 349.}
The *Brhadâranyaka* instructs the worshipper in his quest for knowledge by indicating the limitations of the sacrifice.

"When the Father produced by intellect and austerity seven kinds of food" -- truly by intellect and austerity the Father did produce them. 'One of his [foods] was common to all.' That of his which is common to all is the food that is eaten here. He who worships (upâste) that, is not turned from evil, for it is mixed [i.e. common, not selected]. 'Of two he let the gods partake.' They are the *huta* (fire-sacrifice) and the *prahuta* (offering). For this reason one sacrifices and offers to the gods.

... 58

Brh 1.5.2

In addition to pointing out the limitations of the Vedic sacrifice, *vidyâs* and legends superimpose sacrificial imagery on different aspects of existence. For example, the initial verses of the first chapter of the *Brhadâranyaka* see the world as a sacrificial horse. 59 In answer to the questions: "Who is our Atman (Soul)? What is Brahma?" 60, the *Vaisvânara Vidyâ* 61, of the *Chândogya* states:

... Verily, indeed, you here eat food, knowing this Universal Atman (Soul) as if something separate. He, however, who reverences (upâste) this Universal Atman (Soul) that is the measure of the span -- thus, [yet] is to be measured by thinking of oneself -- he eats food in all worlds, in all beings, in all selves.

The brightly shining [heaven] is indeed the head of that Universal Atman (Soul). The manifold [sun] is his eye. ... The sacrificial area is indeed his breast. The sacrificial grass is his hair. The Gârhapatya is his heart. Anvâharyapacana fire is his mind. The Ahavanîya fire is his mouth. 62

Chând 5.18.1-2

58 ibid., pp. 86-87. See also Mund. 1.2.7.

59 Brh. 1.1.1-2. See also Chând. 3.16 where a person's entire life symbolically represents a *Soma* sacrifice, as well as Chând. 4.176.

60 Hume, op. cit., p. 234.

61 Chând. 5.11-18.

Furthermore, the *vidyās* express promises of reward\(^{63}\) as well as attempting to offer descriptions of *Brahman*.\(^{64}\) *Vidyās* are understood by some scholars as paradigms of *Brahman*. That is to say, Upanisadic teachers developed and imparted (to worshippers) concept models of *Brahman* as meditation techniques.\(^{65}\) For example, instead of the devotee taking up the ordinary physical form of the sun for worship as *Brahman*, the *Brhadāranyaka* further invests the sun with auspicious, abstract qualities of *Brahman*, i.e. unformed and immortal.

There are assuredly, two forms of *Brahma*: the formed and the formless, the mortal and the immortal, the stationary and the moving, the actual and the yon.

This is the formed [*Brahma*] -- whatever is different from the wind and the atmosphere. This is mortal; this is stationary; this is actual. The essence of this formed, mortal, stationary, actual [*Brahma*] is yonder [*sun*] which gives forth heat, for that is the essence of the actual.

Now the formless [*Brahma*] is the wind and the atmosphere. This is immortal, this is moving, this is the yon. The essence of this unformed, immortal, moving, yonder [*Brahma*] is the Person in that sun-disk, for he is the essence of the yon ....\(^{66}\)

\[\text{Brh 2.3.1-3}\]

The *Chāndogya*, for the continuing instruction of the devotee, adds to this meditational symbol of *Brahman* by providing the person within the sun with the image of a golden beard and golden hair.

\(^{63}\) See the *Dakara Vidyā*, Chānd. 8.1-6, and the *Satyakāma Vidyā*, Chānd. 4.5.3; 4.6.4; 4.7.4; 4.8.4; 4.11.1; 4.12.2; 4.13.2.

\(^{64}\) For *Brahman* with forms such as pleasure and space, see the *Upakosala Vidyā* (Chānd. 5.5). For other conceptions of *Brahman*, see Brh. 2.1; 3.8; 3.9.10-17; 4.1; Tait. 1.8; Svet. 4.19.


\(^{66}\) Hume, op. cit., p. 97.
... Now, that golden Person who is seen within the sun has a golden beard and golden hair. He is exceedingly brilliant, all even to the fingernail tips.67

Chánt 1.6.6

A meditational symbol is connected to a certain framework of meaning, i.e. a spiritual formula which is devised to guide the mind through the symbol to Brahman. Upásanã can involve meditation on these formulas.68 Of the many, varied vidyâs in the Upanisads, each meditator chooses one that appeals most to his taste and temperament.

For worshippers capable of dealing with abstract symbols of Brahman, the vidyâs sometimes attempt to draw an identity between the soul, âtman, and Brahman. The Sandilyâ Vidyâ notes:

Verily, this whole world is Brahma. Tranquil (sâma), let one worship (upâsita) It as that from which he came forth, as that into which he will be dissolved, as that in which he breathes. ...69

Chánt 3.14.1

Qualifications of the worshipper
Impeccable qualifications are called for if the worshipper is to attain realisation of Brahman through his meditation. For example, the vidyâs indicate that every worshipper should be humble, modest, and possess firmness of mind whereby he can realise perfect control over his sense-organs and instruments of action; his mind should be detached from the passions and tranquil; he should be reverent and give undivided devotion to the object of med-

67 ibid., p. 183.
69 Hume, op. cit., p. 209. See also the Uddâlaka-Arunâ Vidyâ (Chánt. 3.7); the Madhu Vidyâ (Chánt. 2.5.19); the Vaisvânara Vidyâ (Chánt. 5.11.1 to 5.18.2); Chánt. 3.14 & 8.14 where the individual soul is identical with the infinite Brahman; as well as Isa 16 & Ait. 2.2.4,6 where Brahman, the Person in the sun, is identified with the self.
Contemplative Practices In The Upanisads

utation. The Mundaka indicates such indispensable conditions for the realisation of Brahman as follows:

This Soul (Atman) is not to be obtained by one destitute of fortitude, 
Nor through heedlessness, nor through a false notion of austerity (tapas). 
But he who strives by these means, provided he knows -- 
Into his Brahma-abode this Soul (Atman) enters.

Attaining Him, the seers who are satisfied with knowledge, 
Who are perfected souls (krtatman), from passion free (vitaraga), tranquil - 

They who have ascertained the meaning of the Vedanta-knowledge, 
Ascetics (yati) with natures purified through the application of renunciation 
-- 
They in the Brahma-worlds at the end of time 
Are all liberated beyond death. 

They who do the rites, who are learned in the Vedas, who are intent on 
Brahma, 
They who, possessing faith, make oblation of themselves .... 
To them indeed one may declare this knowledge of Brahma ....70

Mund 3.2.4-10

Whereas the goals of the worshipper and yogi differ, the process of 
meditation itself is similar insofar as a single object of concentration is 
maintained. Indeed, the process of upasanā is intermixed with yoga tech-
iques.

The position of worship (upasanā) is little recognised or acknowl-
edged by scholars of early Indian contemplative practices. Documentation on 
upasanā is scant. Neela Velkar's unpublished work, Upasanā in the 
Upanisads71, represents the limits of scholarly research on this topic to date. 
Consequently, this chapter draws on Velkar's research.


71 I am indebted to both Professor K.P. Jog of the Deccan Institute, Poona, for indicating 
to me the significance of upasanā in early Indian contemplative practices and to Dr. Shiv 
Kumar, Reader in Sanskrit at the Centre of Advanced Study of Sanskrit, University of 
Poona, for informing me of the existence of Dr. Neela Velkar's research on this topic. I 
am also indebted to Dr. Velkar who kindly gave me a copy of her unpublished PhD thesis, 
Upasanā in the Upanisads.
Velkar’s research is a comprehensive study of the nature and development of upāsanā in the thirteen principal Upanisads. The bulk of Velkar’s work concerns the character of upāsanā, classification of the various forms of upāsanā, instructions and legends etc. depicted in the principal Upanisads. Classification of the types of worship encompasses more than half of the work. Velkar’s findings are summarised as follows:

Upāsanā in the Upanisads is meditative, emblematic, and analytical in character. That is to say, repeated introspection (wherein the worshipper attempts to approach the object of his worship) qualifies it as meditative; it is emblematic due to the utilisation of symbolic forms of Brahman in the worship; and, finally, intellectual attempts to acquire thorough and correct knowledge of the symbols of Brahman by resorting to their significance etc. cause upāsanā to be qualified as analytical.\(^2\)

Velkar concludes that upāsanā evolves out of the concept of sacrifice in the pre-Upanisadic period where the worshipper invokes and seeks communion with the deity by means of external offerings. At the time of the principal Upanisads, external forms of the sacrifice (consisting of ritual ceremonies) lose favour: sacrifice becomes symbolical. That is to say, the ceremonial worship of the earlier period shifts to meditative worship. Instructions and legends work partly to undermine the effectiveness of the earlier sacrifice while promoting symbolic meditations etc. Upāsanā, as a predominantly mental process, becomes the preferred religious practice. Velkar sees the development of worship in the Upanisads as a transition from an emotional mysticism of the Vedic period to cognitive mysticism.

\(^2\) For example, worshippers attempt to analyse concepts such as atman and Brahman in order to help realise their unity.

\(^3\) No doubt the external sacrifice continued to be performed. However, the few who composed the Upanisads probably abandoned the practice.
Further, *upāsanā* in the *Upanisads* involves the essential principles of later schools who develop *yajña* (sacrifice), *yoga* (abstract meditation, mental abstraction), and *bhakti* (worship, devotion). *Upāsanā*, in its movement from the external form of sacrifice, eventually becomes a symbolic sacrifice involving mental one-pointedness in association with self-dedication and surrender.

According to Velkar, the principles of the late *Yoga* school are found in the shift from extroversion to introversion, where worship comes to involve both concrete and abstract objects comprising verbal symbols and ideas, i.e. aids in concentration involving both perceptible and imperceptible symbols of *Brahman*. The uttering of sound-forms also indicates the germs of the subsequent developed *Bhakti* cult. Later *Upanisads* such as the *Katha*, *Svetāsvatara*, and *Maitrī* contain the germs of *Bhakti*.

Velkar finds that *upāsanā*, in its utilisation of concentration and other specific techniques, thus blends with *yoga* to render *upāsanā* more effective. Instruction in the combined techniques is either metaphorical or direct. In the earliest *Upanisads*, i.e. the *Brhadāranyaka* and *Chândogya*, *upāsanā* is performed occasionally to secure material benefits such as long life and material prosperity. *Upāsanā* in later *Upanisads* such as the *Maitrī* aims at attaining a mental perception, if not the complete intuitive realisation, of *Brahman*. *Yoga* techniques become overtly recognised as the efficacious means to enhance *upāsanā* and thereby realise union with *Brahman* in trance (*samādhi*). Simply, Velkar's findings are that "... *Upāsanā* in the *Upanisads* coordinates in itself the essential principles of *Yajña*, *Yoga* and *Bhakti*, which are developed into separate and independent systems in the later period. ... The *Upanisads* have ... interpreted from different angles the then popular and elaborate
sacrificial system of the Brāhmanas and thus paved the way for the Bhakti and the Yoga schools of the later period."\(^74\)

Velkar's examination does not discuss the origins of yoga or consider the possibility that yoga methods may originate outside the orthodox stream. In her work she assumes the application, in the earliest Upanisads, of specific yoga techniques such as dhyāna etc. within the process of worship. Though the early Upanisads suggest some influence of yoga, examination of the texts indicates that the inclusion of specific yoga techniques into the overall process of upāsanā is not as obvious or recognised, at this stage, as Velkar would believe. She gives limited emphasis to the chronology of the Upanisads and thus fails to consider any possible significance of the sudden appearance of explicit, detailed references to yoga techniques in the later Upanisads.

In Velkar's scheme, early Upanisadic suggestions of, or allusions to, yoga techniques provide a direct link to specific techniques lauded in later Upanisads and these techniques in turn develop into the separate and independent system of Yoga. Her work demonstrates the implicit assumption of an orthodox Brāhmanical source of yoga thus making her study an indirect advocate for the linear theory noted above.

This evaluation in no way undermines Velkar's important study of Upāsanā in the Upanisads. Rather, it draws attention to the above problem in historical studies that discuss the development of early Indian contemplative practices. The present chapter attempts to address this question by considering contemplative practices in the Upanisads in light of the larger historical problem.

\(^74\) Velkar, op. cit., p. 620.
Contemplative Practices in the Upanisads

Yoga

The influence of yoga trends, indicated by the occurrences of terms derived from "dhyāi" (to think of, meditate on) and and "yuj" (yoked, harnessed) is observed in the oldest Upanisads noted above (i.e. the Brhadāraṇyaka, the Chāṇḍogya, and the Kausūṭaṭi) as well as the Taittirīya and the Aitareya, though no direct relationship to any school of yoga of the time is apparent.

In comparison with the other early Upanisads, the Chāṇḍogya provides a substantial number of occurrences of terms derived from "dhyāi", i.e. twelve, followed by nine instances in the Kausūṭaṭi. At one section, the Chāṇḍogya refers to "dhyāna" (meditation) though the authors or redactors seem unfamiliar with the concept.75

... The earth meditates (dhyāyat), as it were. The atmosphere meditates, as it were. The heaven meditates, as it were. Water meditates, as it were. Mountains meditate, as it were. Gods and men meditate, as it were.

... 76

Chāṇḍ 7.6.1

Of the principal Upanisads, the Katha, the Svetāsvatara, and the Maitrī, especially in the sixth chapter, best attempt to describe the contemplative process. The greatest number of terms derived from "dhyāi" and "yuj" occur in the late Svetāsvatara and in the Maitrī where, for example, locutions such as "dhyāna" (meditation) are found twenty times. Moreover, words such as "yoga" are mentioned sixteen times in the Svetāsvatara and nineteen times in the Maitrī as opposed to two times in the Brhadāraṇyaka and Chāṇḍogya. The present work now proceeds to analytically examine these terms in their original contexts.


76 Hume, op. cit., p. 254.


**Terms Derived from "Dhyai"**

Introversion and deep contemplation are suggested at a number of places in the *Upanisads* by terms drawn from "dhyai" (to contemplate, meditate on), e.g. "abhi + dhyai" and "nidi + dhyai". For example, in the employment of derivatives of *dhyai*, the earlier *Bṛhadāraṇyaka* uses the term "*dhyayatvā*" ("to think") when relating to the various conditions of the soul.

Which is the soul (atman)?
The person here who among the senses is made of knowledge, who is the light in the heart. He, remaining the same, goes along both worlds, appearing to think (*dhyayatvā*), appearing to move about, for upon becoming asleep he transcends this world and the forms of death.\(^77\)

*Bṛh 4.3.7*

The *Chāṇḍogya* states that meditation (*dhyāna*) is greater than intelligence or thought (*citta*). The passage, however, qualifies this statement by rendering *dhyāna* inferior to understanding (*vijñāna*).

Meditation (*dhyānam*) is indeed greater than intelligence (*cittāt*). The earth is meditating as it were (*dhyayatvā*). The intermediate space ... The heaven ... Waters ... Mountains ... The gods and human beings are meditating as it were. ...

Understanding (*vijñāna*) is indeed greater than meditation (*dhyānam*). Through understanding one verily knows Rg Veda, Yajur-Veda, Sāma-Veda, and Atharva-Veda the fourth one. History and mythology which form the fifth Veda, grammar, the rites for the manes, mathematics ... this world and the other, are all known through understanding alone. ...

*Chāṇḍ 7.6.1; 7.7.1*

---

\(^77\) ibid., p. 134.

The Kausūtaki mainly uses the term "dhyāna" in the context of "thought" in relationship to consciousness. Referring to the supremacy of consciousness in all aspects of existence, the Kausūtaki states:

... With intelligence having mounted on the mind (manas), with the mind one obtains all thoughts (dhyāna). Kaus 3.6

The Mundaka infers the process of contemplation by offering the metaphor of the spokes in the chariot-wheel when calling on the worshipper to meditate on the self as Om. This directive indicates the contemplative course of the worshipper whereby the senses and mind are withdrawn from external wanderings and attention is focused at one's centre.

Where the arteries of the body are brought together like the spokes in the centre of a wheel, within it (this self, moves about) becoming manifold. Meditate (dhyayatha) on aum as the self. May you be successful in crossing over to the farther shore of darkness. Mund 2.2.6

Also, verse 3.1.8 utilises a derivative of dhyai when it states that Brahman can be realised when there is calmness and engagement in meditation (dhyāyamānah).

He is not grasped by the eye nor even by speech nor by other sense-organs, nor by austerity nor by work, but when one's (intellectual) nature is purified by the light of knowledge then alone he, by meditation (dhyāyamānah), sees Him who is without parts. Mund 3.1.8

79 See, for example, Kaus. 2.13 manasa dhyayati (2.14); 3.2 manasa dhyānam ... mano dhyāyat; 3.3 manah sarvaih dhyānaih sahāpyeti (4.20) ... na dhyayati; 3.4 mana evāsmin sarvān dhyānānāy abhivistjyante manasa sarvān dhyānānāy āpnoti.

80 Hume, p. 325.

81 ibid., p. 684.

82 ibid., p 688. See also Velkar, op. cit., p. 160.
The contemplative course, using the terms *dhyāna* and *abhidhyyāna*, is described in greater detail in the *Svetāsvatara*:

Those who follow after meditation (*dhyāna*) and abstraction (*yoga*)
Saw the self-power (*ātmasakti*) of God (*deva*) hidden in his own qualities.

... By meditation (*abhidhyyāna*) upon Him, by union with Him, and by enter­
ing into His being
More and more there is finally cessation from every illusion.

By knowing God (*Deva*) there is a falling off of all fetters;
With distresses destroyed, there is cessation of birth and death.
By meditating (*abhidhyyāna*) upon Him there is a third stage at the dissolu­
tion of the body ....

*Svet 1.3,10,11*

Verses 1.3 and 1.10 state that meditation leads the worshipper to a di­
rect realisation of *Brahman*. Verse 1.11 acknowledges a difference between
knowledge (*jñāna*) and profound meditation (*dhyāna*). Knowledge takes one
to a thorough understanding of the real nature of the self whilst meditation
brings about perfect union with *Brahman*.

Linguistic forms drawn from "*nidi + dhyai*", too, are used to indicate
an intense, focus of consciousness concentrated on the individual self (*ātman*)
and culminating in absorption. In this instance, the *Brhadāranyaka* uses the
word "*nididhyāsitavya*" (to be thought about or attended to).

... Lo, verily, it is the Soul (*Ātman*) that should be seen, that should be
hearkened to, that should be thought on (*mantavya*), that should be ponders­
or on (*nididhyāsitavya*) .... Lo, verily, with the seeing of, with the hear­
kning to, with the thinking of (*matyā*), and with the understanding
(*vijñānena*) of the Soul, this world-all is known.

*Brh 2.4.5*

83 ibid., pp. 394-396.
84 Velkar, op. cit., pp. 162-163; *Svet*. 1.3,10,11.
85 ibid., p. 168. See *Brh*. 2.4.5 and 4.5.6.
86 Hume, op. cit., p. 100.
Such objective meditation aims to locate the source of consciousness by attempting to follow the "sense of I" back to its origin. The idea of profound, continuous meditation is also evoked by forms derived from "abhi + dhyai". The prefix "abhi" suggests the sense of "to, towards, into, or upon" meditation (dhyai). The object of contemplation is, in this instance, the sacred syllable "Om": the three morae of which represent the three states of the individualised self.

**Meditation on "Om"**

The Svetâsvatara at 1.13, 14, 15 describes the process of meditation on the syllable Om. Here, the key term for meditation is dhyana. It is compared to the friction of a drill or the churning of cream etc. as the means to an end.

\[ ... \text{verily, both [the universal and individual Brahma] are [to be found] in the body by the use of Om.} \]

By making one’s own body the lower friction-stick
And the syllable Om the upper friction-stick,
By practicing the friction of meditation (dhyana),
One may see God (deva) who is hidden as it were.\(^8^8\)

*Svet 1.13, 14, 15*

The Prasna, in a similar fashion, employs the form "abhidhyâyîta" (meditate) while spurring the worshipper to meditate on "Om" until death.

---

\(^8^7\) "Types of Meditation-I," op. cit., pp. 203-205. The *nididhyâsana* of the *Upanisads* is practiced to shift the attention of the worshipper from the external world and fix it internally on the conscious self until unity and peace ensues.

\(^8^8\) Hume, op. cit., p. 396.
Contemplative Practices In The *Upanisads*

Then Śaibya Satyakāma asked him [i.e. Pipalāda] "Verily, sir, if one among men here should meditate (abhidhyāyita) on the syllable *Om* until the end of his life, which world, verily, does he win thereby?

If he meditates (abhidhyāyita) on one element [namely *a*], having been instructed by that alone he quickly comes into the earth [after death]. The Rig verses lead him to the world of men. There, united with austerity, chastity, and faith, he experiences greatness.

Again, he who meditates (abhidhyāyita) on the highest Person (purusa) with the three elements of the syllable *Om* [namely *a+u+m*] is united with brilliance in the sun.89

References utilising forms derived mostly from *abhi + dhyai* occur mainly in the *Maitrī*. They include the notions of the creative power of meditation and meditation on the different manifestations of *Brahman* as the effective means (sādhanas) to realise *Brahman*.

**Meditation (dhyāna) on the gods**

The verbal forms "*abhidhyāyanti*" and "*abhidhyāyet*" are employed at *Maitrī* 4.5-6 to encourage the worshipper to contemplate popular Vedic deities such as Brahmā, Rudra, and Visnu as forms or symbols of *Brahman*. These must be eventually discarded. As such, they are the effective means (sādhanas) to the realisation of *Brahman*.

Verses 4.5-6 of the *Maitrī* indicate that the worship/meditation of various gods is allowable, though its rewards are temporary. By representing different concepts of *Brahman*, the deities are supports for worship and contemplation whereby the worshipper achieves deeper levels of awareness which culminate in direct realisation of *Brahman*. The verses state:

Then they said: "... Agni (Fire), Vāyu (Wind), and Aditya (Sun); ... Brahmā, Rudra, and Vishnu--some meditate (abhidhyāyanti) upon one, some upon another. Tell us which one is the best?"

Then he said to them:

89 ibid., pp. 387-388.
"These are, assuredly, the foremost forms of the supreme, the immortal, the bodiless Brahma .... Verily, these, which are its foremost forms, one should meditate (abhidhyayet) upon, and praise, but then deny. For with these one moves higher and higher in the worlds. But in the universal dissolution he attains the unity of [with] the Person--yea, of the Person!"  

Maitri 4.5,6

Verse 6.3 enjoins the worshipper to meditate on the Sun (âditya) by continuous utterance of "Om". However, verse 6.9 states:

... he who knows that this has both these (breath and the sun) as his self, meditates (abhidhyayati) only on his self, sacrifices only to his self; such meditation (dhyâna), the mind absorbed in such practice, is praised by the wise ... having made the sacrifice to the self, he should meditate (abhidhyayet) on the self with the two (formulas) "As breath and fire." "Thou art all." 

Maitri 6.9

Verse 6.22 employs the dual future passive participle form "abhidhyeye" (to be meditated) by way of instruction in meditation on two aspects of Brahman: the sound-form and the non-sound form. By utilising the syllable "Om", the worshipper is guided through deepening levels of meditative awareness thus moving from the concrete to the most sublime:

... There are, verily, two Brahmans to be meditated (abhidhyeye) upon, sound and non-sound. By sound alone is the non-sound revealed. Now here the sound is aum. Moving upward by it one comes to ascend in the non-sound. So (one says) this is the way, this is immortality, this is complete union (sâdyujyantya) and also tranquility (nirvartatya). And now as the spider moves upward by the thread, obtains free space, thus assuredly, indeed the meditator moving upward by the syllable aum obtains independence.

Maitri 6.22

The above references to contemplative practices using terms derived from "dhyai" and "abhi + dhyai" impart the sense of an unbroken focus of

90 ibid., p. 422.
92 ibid., p. 833. Also Velkar, op. cit., p. 167.
consciousness on an object as the representative of *Brahman*. To this qualified extent "*dhyâna*" and "*abhidhyâna*" are similar or analogous in character and function to *upâsanâ*.93

Should features of this meditative process, which aims at union with *Brahman*, be viewed as differences discerned on a continuum (as opposed to discrete states) then *upâsanâ* and *dhyâna* could simply represent degrees of intensity in concentration on the meditative symbol. That is to say, *upâsanâ*, i.e. adoration, worship, or devoted veneration of a symbol of *Brahman*, when applied, intensified, and sustained to an efficient degree, induces *dhyâna* and so leads to unification with the chosen symbol. Consciousness of the symbol is held, in both instances, in a continuous focus. *Dhyâna* thus becomes a part of the process of *upâsanâ*.

*The combination of *dhyâna* with *upa + âs***

In the *Chândogya* 7.6.1,2 *dhyâna* is combined with a form derived from "*upa + âs*". This section of the *Chândogya* describes a hierarchy of contemplative symbols and the rewards obtained from revering/meditating (*upâste*) on the same. The sage gives a stage by stage description of the path to realisation of *Brahman*, beginning with "names" and ending with "hope". The passage refers initially to revering/meditating (*upâste*). It ends, however, with the advice to revere or meditate (*upâssveti*) on meditation (*dhyâna*).

93 Velkar, op. cit., p. 167.
Verily, a Name is the Rig-Veda, the Yajur-Veda, the Sãma-Veda, the Atharva-Veda as the fourth, Legend and Ancient Lore as the fifth, the Veda of the Vedas [i.e. Grammar], ... Mathematics, ... Logic, .... This is mere Name. Revere (upāśvēti) Name.

He who reverences (upāste) Name as Brahma -- as far as Name goes, so far he has unlimited freedom, he who reverences Name as Brahma.

Speech (vāc), assuredly, is more than Name. Speech, verily makes known the Rig-Veda .... Reverence (upāśvā) Speech.

He who reverences (upāste) Speech as Brahma -- as far as Speech goes, so far he has unlimited freedom, he who reverences speech as Brahma [and similarly for mind, will, and intelligence]. ...

Meditation (dhyāna), assuredly, is more than Thought (citta). ... Therefore whoever among men here attain greatness -- they have, as it were, a part of the reward of meditation. ... Reverence Meditation (dhyānam upāśvēti).

He who reverences Meditation as Brahma (dhyānam brahmety upāste) ... he has unlimited freedom, he who reverences Meditation as Brahma."

The phrase "dhyānam upāśvēti" is translated variously. The sense, however, of a continuous focus on the symbol of Brahman is maintained in each translation. Swāmī Gambhîrânanda renders it "meditate on meditation". Hume has "reverence Meditation". Another translator suggests "meditate upon contemplation". Hume's rendering, while literal, is perhaps the most accurate insofar as it clearly differentiates upāśvā and dhyāna and yet maintains their association in the process of upāsanā.

The forms derived from "upa + ās" and from "dhyai" indicate that the worshipper must initially withdraw the mind from outward activities and focus it on a chosen object or symbol of Brahman. For the process to be

94 Hume, op. cit., pp. 251-254.
95 Gambhîrânanda, op. cit., ppp. 510-526.
96 Hume, op. cit., p. 254.
successful, the mind must then be dedicated to the exclusive and continuous contemplation of the symbol.

Terms Derived from "Yuj"
Generally, the term "yuj" means "to unite", "to yoke", or "to harness". References to terms derived from yuj, in the earlier *Upatisads*, tend to be used in a physical sense such as attaching something to a body. For example, the *Brhadāranyaka* uses a derivative of yuj when referring to the yoking of steeds.

He [the Soul, *Atman*] became corresponding in form to every form.
This is to be looked upon as a form of him.
Indra by his magic powers goes about in many forms;
Yoked (yukta) are his ten-hundred steeds.\(^98\)

\[\text{Brh} 2.5.18\]

The *Chāndogya* employs the term yukta in a similar meaning when referring to the spirit being yoked in the body.

... As a draft-animal is yoked (yukta) in a wagon, even so this spirit is yoked (yukta) in this body.\(^99\)

\[\text{Chānd} 8.12.3\]

The transitional *Kena*, when enquiring as to the real agent in the individual, similarly asks:

By whom impelled soars forth the mind projected?
By whom enjoined (yukta) goes forth the earliest breathing?
By whom impelled this speech do people utter?
The eye, the ear -- what god, them enjoineth (yunakti)?\(^100\)

\[\text{Kena} 1.1\]

\(^{98}\) Hume, op. cit., p. 105. See also Brh. 5.13.2 where it refers to all beings united (yujyante) in life.

\(^{99}\) ibid., p. 272.

\(^{100}\) ibid., p. 335. For variations of this sense, see also Tait. 1.11.4; Kaus. 2.6.; Svet. 1.9; 4.15; 5.10; *Prasna* 3.10; *Maitrī* 6.21; 6.25
The later *Upanisads*, beginning with the *Katha*, apply derivatives of *yuj* in a sense different to the earlier texts. That is to say, the application of such derivatives shifts here from a physical connotation to include a psychical nuance by referring to control of the mind in worship (*upāsanā*). In the context of *upāsanā*, "*yuj*" suggests "... the sense of application or devotion of the mind to the object of Upāsanā."101 Verses 3.4 to 6 of the *Katha* state:

> The senses (*indriya*), they say, are the horses;  
> The objects of sense, what they range over.  
> The self combined (*yuktam*) with senses and mind  
> Wise men call the 'enjoyer'.

> He who has not understanding (*avijñāna*),  
> Whose mind is not constantly held firm (*ayuktena*)--  
> His senses are uncontrolled,  
> Like the vicious horses of a chariot-driver.

> He, however, who has understanding,  
> Whose mind is constantly held firm (*yuktena*)--  
> His senses are under control,  
> Like the good horses of a chariot-driver.102

*Katha* 3.4-6

The forms derived from "*yuj*" here imply the idea of complete control over both physical and psychical aspects of the individual. That is to say, such features are "harnessed" or "devoted" to the realisation of *Brahman* with subsequent freedom from rebirth (*samsāra*). Following from this, the forms derived from "*yuj*" allude to *yoga* and associate this with the symbolism of the chariot pulled by horses. Verses 3.4 to 6 of the *Katha* imply that

> ... just as the person in a chariot is led astray (because) the charioteer is unable to control the wicked horses similarly self remains in ignorance as the intellect (charioteer) is unable to control the unrestrained and uncontrolled senses.103

*Katha* 3.4-6

103 Velkar, op. cit., p. 175.
In a similar fashion, other forms derived from "yuj" which are depicted in the Second Adhyāya (chapter) of the Svetāsvatara suggest, to the worshipper, the notion of complete control over all aspects of the mind and its functions via yogic practices. This section, initially, offers an invocation to the god of inspiration, i.e. Savitṛ, for inspiration and self-control. It states:

Savitri (the Inspirer), first controlling (yuñjāna) mind 
And thought for truth, 
Discerned the light of Agni (Fire) 
And brought it out of the earth.

With mind controlled (yuktena) we are 
In the inspiration of the god Savitri, 
For heaven and strength.

With mind having controlled (yuktvā) the powers 
That unto bright heaven through thought do go, 
May Savitri inspire them, 
That they may make a mighty light!

The sages of the great wise sage 
Control (yuñjate) their mind, and control (yuñjate) their thoughts. ...

I join (yuje) your ancient prayer with adorations! 
My verses go forth like suns upon their course. ...  

Svet 2.1-5

In this instance, the worship/meditation as adoration/invocation gathers potency as it takes up yogic practices to achieve, eventually, a vision or realisation of Brahmān. Various conditions for the safe and successful practice of such yogic techniques (and the subsequent composure of mind) are described in verse 2.10 of the Svetāsvatara. Here, the emphasis is on comfort and freedom from distractions as aids to concentration.

In a clean spot, free from pebbles, fire, and gravel, 
By the sound of water and other propinquities 
Favourable to thought, not offensive to the eye,

104 ibid., pp. 175-176; Svet. 2.1-13.
105 Hume, op. cit., p. 397.
Contemplative Practices In The Upanisads

In a hidden retreat protected from the wind, one should practice Yoga (prayojayet).\(^{106}\)

_Svet 2.10_

Thereafter, the _Svetasvatara_ refers to the manifestation of different forms during the practice of _yoga_. These suggest various stages of mental modification as the worshipper progresses towards the realisation of _Brahman_.\(^{107}\) Finally, the worshipper comes to realise _Brahman_ and attains release from the problems of existence. Whereupon, he proffers a salutation:

> The God ... who has entered into the whole world ... to that God be adoration! -- yea, be adoration!\(^{108}\)

_Svet 2.16_

Thus veneration is intensified and extended by the employment of _yoga_ techniques. That is to say, the process of _upāsanā_ applies the mind to the exclusive devotion of the object of worship with such intensity that full cognisance of the divine object ensues.

Referring to liberation from death and from all distinctions of individuality in union with _Brahman_, the _Mundaka_ uses the form "_yuktātmānas_" derived from "_yuj_". On the one hand, Hume indicates the relationship of this expression to worship by rendering it as "devout souls".

> ... Attaining Him who is the universally omnipresent, those wise, Devout souls (_yuktātmānas_) into the All itself do enter.\(^{109}\)

_Mund 3.2.5_

---

\(^{106}\) ibid., p. 397

\(^{107}\) Svet. 2.11.

\(^{108}\) Hume, op. cit., p. 399.

\(^{109}\) ibid., p. 376.
On the other hand, Radhakrishnan, in his translation of the same passage, renders "yuktatmanas" as "concentrated minds".

... having attained the omnipresent (self) on all sides, those wise, with concentrated minds (yuktatmanas), enter into the All itself.110

Radhakrishnan's translation of yuktatmanas, in distinction to Hume's rendering, indicates perhaps the developed nature of worship in the later Upanisads. A more accurate understanding of the locution, however, probably encompasses both devotion and concentration.

On the Term "Yoga"
The word yoga means "yoking" or "uniting" and, as Feuerstein understands it, "... is derived from the root √yuj, a derivative of √yu with the bivalent meaning of 'yoking, harnessing, binding' and 'separating'."111 In the Vedas, the noun "yoga" was used to designate a union or connection between various objects. For example, in the Rg Veda "... where a vedic seer asks as to who knew the yoga (i.e. connection) between the words of a verse."112 In the Atharva Veda, the term "yoga" suggests a team of harnessed bullocks.113 K.S. Joshi believes that, in the Vedic period, the union of bullocks or horses was, perhaps, the most common example of union. These beasts were held together by a frame or yoke. This, Joshi believes, seems to have influenced the meaning of the original term "yoga" in that the meaning shifts from the notion of "union" and comes to denote the "tool of union", i.e. the yoke.114

110 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 690.
113 ibid., p. 54, referring to Atharva Veda VI.xci.
114 ibid.
This usage of the term foreshadows the method by which union with Brahman is achieved, i.e. in the sense that a controlled horse helps ensure a comfortable journey, so too do controlled senses determine a comfortable life. In this sense, "yoga" becomes, perhaps, "... the method by which the senses and, by implication, the mind can be controlled." Such a technical understanding of the word 'yoga' "... presupposes the existence of a well-arranged program or system of practices capable of steadying the mind and thus bringing it under control."

Consequently, yoga, in its Upanisadic form, means at least two things: "to control" and "to contemplate". Joshi refers to one further meaning of the word. Rather than a system or method, it refers to the final state of the worshipper: i.e. the endpoint of the method wherein the mind is in its highest state of steadiness. Joshi, for linguistic convenience, calls rightly for a restriction in the use of the term "yoga" to the method alone.

Definition of Yoga in the Upanisads

Yoga, as it is depicted in the Upanisads, appears to be a constant application of the powers of the mind and body along recommended methods such as regulation of the breath (pranayama). These practices aim to control and perfect both the physiological and the psychological processes and functions.

The Katha describes yogic practice as the contemplation on the self (adhyatma yoga). The second chapter, in particular, of the Svetâsvatara

115 ibid.
116 ibid., p. 55.
117 ibid., referring to Katha 6.11.
118 ibid., pp. 55-56.
119 Katha 2.12.
demonstrates this idea of yoga. Though not discussing them in detail, these late Upanisads seriously commend and identify yoga methods. For example, the sixth chapter of the Katha, in explaining the method of adhyātma yoga as suppression of the lower activity, states:

When cease the five
[Sense-] knowledges, together with the mind (manas),
And the intellect (buddhi) stirs not--
That they say is the highest course. 120

This they consider as Yoga 121
The firm holding back of the senses (sthirāṃ indriya-dhāranām).
Then one becomes undistracted (apramatta).
Yoga, truly, is the origin and the end. 122

Katha 6.10-11

While Hume translates "sthirāṃ indriya-dhāranām" as "the firm holding back of the senses", Radhakrishnan renders it as "the steady control of the senses". 123 Closer analysis of the Sanskrit phrase, however, reveals greater detail regarding the yoga method involved, i.e. fixed concentration associated with breath control. For example, while sthira means "fixed, steady, unavailing", and indriya refers to the "senses", the term dhāranā (interpreted above as "firm holding back" or "steady control") means literally "collection or concentration of the mind (joined with the retention of the breath)". 124 The above phrase describing the yoga method might thus be more accurately (though less eloquently) translated as "the unavailing breath/concentration-control of the senses".

120 Also quoted in Maitrī 6.30.

121 Hume, in a footnote, states: "Literally 'yoking'; both a 'yoking', i.e. subduing, of the senses; and also a 'yoking', i.e. a 'joining' or 'union', with the Supreme Spirit." op. cit., p. 360.

122 ibid., pp. 359-360. See also chapter two of the Svet. and chapter six of the Maitrī.

123 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 645.

Furthermore, yoga is explained by way of the analogy of the "chariot and the horses", where the chariot represents the body, the chariot driver the intellect, the reins the mind, and the horses the senses which are to be firmly controlled.\(^{125}\) In addition to control over the sense-organs, yoga is understood as the process of joining: the perfect unity of the breath, the mind, and the senses. In the Maitri, yoga is defined thus:

... He who has his senses indrawn as in sleep, who has his thoughts perfectly pure as in dream, who while in the cavern of the senses, is not under their control, perceives him who is called Pranava, the leader, of the form of light, the sleepless, free from old age, the deathless, the sorrowless, he himself becomes called Pranava and becomes a leader, of the form of light, sleepless, free from old age, deathless and sorrowless .... Because in this manner he joins the breath, the syllable aum and all this world in its manifoldness or perhaps they are joined, therefore this (process of meditation) is called Yoga (joining). The oneness of the breath, the mind and likewise of the senses and the abandonment of all conditions of existence, this is designated as Yoga.\(^{126}\)

Maitri 6.25

Upanisadic yoga is, therefore, the efficient method to approach and realise Brahman in absorption. In order to do so one must secure concentration of the mind and thus control of the five sense-organs.

**Control of the sense-organs**

Control of the sense-organs may be achieved by rendering them objects of worship. In this way, the sense-organs are considered as vehicles (sādhanas) which enable the worshipper to penetrate the nature of Brahman. They are symbolised as the doorkeepers of the heavenly world where resides the ultimate.\(^{127}\) Continuous uttering of words such as Om (sometimes referred

---

125 Katha 3.3-6. See also Velkar, op. cit., pp. 586-587.

126 "... ekatvam prānāmanasor indriyānām tathaiva ca sarva-bhāva-parityāgo yoga ity abhidhīyate." Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 835.

127 See Chānd. 3.13.1-8; 14.2,4; Prasna 4.8-9.
to as Pranava), plus sacred chants (mantra) serves also to secure a degree of concentration of mind. Continuous enunciation of the "sound-forms" of Brahman yokes the flighty mind of the worshipper to the symbol or object of worship. The mind is gradually caused to withdraw from worldly objects, activities, and distracting mental activity. The field of thought becomes narrowed and diminished by being fixed increasingly to the single emblem until the mind attains one-pointedness, ekâgratâ. Concentration of such intensity is noted only once in the principal Upanisads. The late Maitrî, in referring to yoga and the cessation of thought, states:

... Assuredly, this is the heat of Brahma, the supreme, the immortal, the bodiless -- even the warmth of the body. For that [heat] this [body] is the melted butter (ghee).

Now, although it [i.e. the heat] is manifest, verily it is hidden in the ether [of the heart]. Therefore by intense concentration (ekâgrenaivam) they so disperse the space in the heart that the light, as it were, of that [heat] appears. Thereupon one passes speedily into the same condition [of light], as a lump of iron that is hidden in the earth passes speedily into the condition of earthiness. As fire, or iron-workers, and the like do not overcome a lump of iron that is in the condition of clay, so thought together with its support vanishes away. ...

The ether store-house of the heart Is bliss, is the supreme abode! This is ourself, our Yoga too; And this, the heat of fire and sun ... If a man practises Yoga for six months, And is constantly free [from the senses], The infinite, supreme, mysterious Yoga is perfectly produced.

Maitrî 6.27-28

Tapas

The attainment of control of the sense-organs which renders the mind calm and develops concentration involves purification of the mind via tapas,


129 Hume, op. cit., pp. 440-441.
(religious austerity), brahmacarya (continence and charity), sraddhā (faith, trust), satya (truth, righteousness), etc.\textsuperscript{130}

In addition to physical hardships, observance, etc., tapas involves, here, the hardship resulting from the persistent and repeated application of the mind to the devotional symbol of Brahman to the exclusion of all else. The Svetāsvatara associates profound meditation (dhyāna) with tapas in expounding the highest mystic doctrine.

\[
\begin{align*}
... & \text{By practicing the friction of meditation (dhyāna),} \\
& \text{One may see the God who is hidden, as it were.} \\
& \text{As oil in sesame seeds, as butter in cream,} \\
& ... \text{so is the Soul (Atman) apprehended in one's soul,} \\
& \text{If one looks for Him with true austerity (tapas).} \\
& \text{The soul (Atman), which pervades all things} \\
& \text{As butter is contained in cream,} \\
& \text{Which is rooted in self-knowledge and austerity (tapas) --} \\
& \text{This is Brahma, the highest mystic doctrine!} \\
& \text{This is Brahma, the highest mystic doctrine!}\textsuperscript{131} \\
& \text{sVet 1.14-16}
\end{align*}
\]

This meditational adversity intensifies and hones the mental abilities of the worshipper to the degree where the capacity for concentration is increased and thus aids in the attainment of deepening levels of meditative awareness. As such, tapas forms an important aspect of worship/meditation. Through upāsanā, the worshipper aims at the realisation of Brahman. He seeks "... close proximity with Brahman (samāpatā), mental perception of Brahman (saksātkāra), attainment of the same characteristics (Sarūpatā), of

\textsuperscript{130} Velkar, op. cit., pp. 11-12. See Tait. 3.1-6; Svet. 1.13-16; Maitrī 1.12; Mund. 2.1.7-10; 3.1.5-10; Prāsna 1.2-15.

\textsuperscript{131} Hume, op. cit., pp. 396-397.
the same world, (Salokatâ), and complete absorption into Brahman (Sâyujyatâ or Tâdâtmyaprâpti)."\textsuperscript{132}

\textit{Process of upâsanâ and yoga techniques: a synthesis}

In the \textit{Upanisads}, the process of upâsanâ takes up such yoga techniques. The efficacy of yoga practices to control and master the sense-organs, including the mind, is recognised. The ability of the worshipper to concentrate on the symbol of Brahman is increased by these techniques to the degree where there is consciousness of nothing but Brahman. The \textit{Maitrî} explicitly identifies yoga techniques and utilises yoga for this purpose.\textsuperscript{133}

The techniques are noted in the \textit{Maitrî} in greater detail than references noted in the \textit{Katha} above and alluded to in the \textit{Svetâsvatara}.\textsuperscript{134} In order to control the sense-organs, worshippers are instructed to practise \textit{pratyâhâra} (self-withdrawal). \textit{Prânâyâma} (breath-control) is advised to develop the ability of concentration. On occasion, the ability to concentrate intensely is said to bring the worshipper to \textit{dhyâna} (profound meditation) and eventually to \textit{samâdhi}.\textsuperscript{135}

In the principal \textit{Upanisads}, samâdhi is the most abstract and final stage in a process of devotional meditation resulting in union (or absorption) of the individual soul with Brahman. This differs from the samâdhi of the later \textit{Yoga} of Patañjali, where the final state is understood as the separation and isolation of the individual Self. There is, however, similarity in their meditative process in that each moves from a concrete object of meditation to

\textsuperscript{132} Velkar, op. cit., p. 29.

\textsuperscript{133} See \textit{Maitrî} 6.18. The sixfold Yoga depicted in the \textit{Maitrî} is discussed in greater detail below.

\textsuperscript{134} See Svet. 2.8-13.

\textsuperscript{135} For example, see \textit{Maitrî} 6.18,27,34.
an abstract form; with the worshipper it is, for example, from a nature symbol to a psychological symbol of Brahman. The principal Upanisads employ many forms such as cint (think) to convey the sense of continuous contemplation. For example, The Maitrī utilises the forms "cintayati" (meditates) and "cintayā" (by meditation) in association with knowledge (vidyā) of Brahman and austerity (tapas). In this instance, knowledge, austerity and meditation (when employed together) constitute worship (upāsanā) and the means of union with Brahman.

"Brahman is," said one who knew the knowledge (vidyā) of Brahman. "This is the door to Brahman," said one who had freed himself from evil by (the practice of) austerity (tapas). "Aum is the (manifest) greatness of Brahman," said one who, completely absorbed (suyukta), always meditates (cintayati) (on it). Therefore, by knowledge (vidyā), by austerity (tapas), by meditation (cintaya) is Brahman apprehended. ... He obtains happiness, undecaying, unmeasured, free from sickness, he who knows this and worships Brahman (brahmopāste) with this triad (knowledge, austerity and meditation).\footnote{Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 811.}

Maitrī 4.4

The process of upāsanā incorporating yoga techniques is most developed in the Maitrī. Indeed, the sixth chapter of the Maitrī, of all the principal Upanisads, most thoroughly demonstrates the worshipper's adoption and application of yoga to realise the essential unity of atman and Brahman. A six-fold yoga (joining breath, mind, senses and Om) is prescribed for the attainment of a fourth (caturtha, turya, turīya) state of consciousness, immediate awareness of Brahman.

At the sixth chapter of the Maitrī, upāsanā on the sun (represented by chanting the syllable "Om") brings about absorption or union with the supreme Brahman. Verse three states the method of worship:
... One should meditate (dhyayata) on the Sun as aum and get united (yujita) to it.\textsuperscript{137}

Maitri 6.3

The form "yujita" suggests the harnessing of the mind and devoting it to sustained and exclusive contemplation of the sun until unity ensues. Whereas verse three uses the term "dhyayata" (meditate) to refer to the contemplative process, verse four applies the form upasita (worship) in the same (or similar) context. The two terms appear to be synonymous. Such equivalence of worshipper and meditator is observed elsewhere in the Maitri.

\textbf{Different Stages in the Process of Yoga}

Examination of the forms derived from "yuj" reveals that worshippers are frequently urged to apply yogic techniques whereby the mind can be fixed exclusively on the symbol of Brahman until oneness ensues. Furthermore, it confirms that upasand involves the practice of specific techniques such as "the sixfold yoga" as the method for realising pure unity. The sixfold yoga is noted in chapter six, verse eighteen of the Maitri.

This is the rule for achieving this (oneness), control of the breath (pranayama), withdrawal of the senses (pratyahara), meditation (dhyana), concentration (dharana), contemplative enquiry (tarka) and absorption (samadhi), (this is) said to be the sixfold yoga. When by this (yoga) he beholds the gold-coloured maker, ... the Brahma-source, then the sage, shaking off good and evil, makes everything into oneness in the supreme indestructible.\textsuperscript{138}

Maitri 6.18

In this section, posture (asana), finds no mention -- though the Svetasvatara refers to the mode of sitting by prescribing a holding erect of the three upper parts of the body: i.e. the chest, neck, and head.

\textsuperscript{137} ibid., p. 817. Also Velkar, op. cit., pp. 176-177.

\textsuperscript{138} ibid., p. 830.
Holding his body steady with the three [upper parts, i.e. head, chest and neck] erect,
And causing the senses with the mind to enter the heart,
A wise man with the Brahma-boat should cross over
All the fear bringing streams.  

Svet 2.8

**Prânâyâma: introversion and breath control**

Several *Upanisads* instruct the worshipper to discipline his respiration (*prânâyâma*) in order to render introversion more effective. *Prânâyâma* is alluded to in the *Svetâsvatara*:

Having repressed his breathings here in the body, and having his movements checked,
One should breathe through his nostrils with diminished breath.
Like the chariot yoked (yuktam) with vicious horses,
His mind the wise man should restrain undistractedly.  

Svet 2.9

*Prânâyâma* is also mentioned in the *Katha* at chapter five, verse three. When referring to the real soul of the individual (which is the object of *upâsanâ*) it is described thus: "Upwards the outbreath (*prâna*) he leadeth. The in-breath (*apâna*) inwards he casts."  

The *Maitri* equates the suppression of breath in *yoga* with the sacrifice by which *Brahman* becomes visible. One verse associates *prânâyâma* with the *Om* mantra, *Brahman*, and the absence of respiration:

... Verily even as the huntsman draws in the dwellers in the waters with his net and offers them (as a sacrifice) in the fire of his stomach, thus, assuredly does one draw in these breaths by means of the syllable *aum* and sacrifice them in the fire that is free from ill. Hence it is like a heated vessel. Now as ghee in a heated vessel lights up by contact with (lighted) grass or wood, thus assuredly does he who is called non-breath (*aprânâkhyah*)

139 Hume, op. cit., p. 398.
140 ibid., p. 398.
141 ibid., p. 356.
light up by contact with the breaths. Now that which lights up is a form of Brahman ... 142

Verse 21 enjoins prāṇāyāma in order to reach the state of selflessness and thus obtain the realisation of absolute unity with Brahman, understood, here, as kevalatva: the state of standing by itself or alone, i.e. "aloneness". The term is derived from kevala meaning "alone".

... joined (yukta) by the breath, the syllable Aum and by the mind, let him proceed upwards. By causing the tip of the tongue to turn back on the palate, by binding together (sam-yojya143) the senses, let greatness perceive greatness. Thence he goes to selflessness." On account of selflessness, he is not (ceases to be) an experiencer of pleasure and pain. He obtains aloneness (kevalatva). For thus has it been said: "Having first fixed the breath that has been restrained, having crossed the limit, let him join the limitless in (the crown of) the head.144

Thereafter, yoga is defined simply and acknowledged explicitly as the means to release: i.e. self-control combined with concentration precipitates the conjunction of the mind, the senses, and the breath. As a result, the realisation of unity with Brahman ensues. Indeed, as Deussen understands it, "... the regulated breath takes the place of the sacrifice and seems thenceforward to have been adopted into the Yoga as a symbolic act."145

142 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 836.
143 Radhakrishnan renders this "asam-yojya", "absence of union or connection". (ibid., p. 832.) This is clearly a mistake indicated by his English translation and the devanāgarī script. See V.P. Limaye & R.D. Vadekar, Eighteen Principal Upanisads, (Poona: Vaidika Sansodhana Mandala, 1958), p. 343.
144 ibid.
Also, several upāsanās such as Prānopāsana, Dvārapopāsana, Atmopāsana, etc., imply the practice of prānāyāma.\textsuperscript{146}

**Pratyāhāra: withdrawal of the senses from external objects**

Suppression of the sense-organs or withdrawal of the senses from external objects (pratyāhāra) is noted in most upāsanās in the Upanisads. Throughout these practises the worshippers are admonished repeatedly to apply the means of self-withdrawal in order to discipline and thus to control both body and mind.\textsuperscript{147} For example, the Chāndogya instructs the worshipper to concentrate all the senses upon the ātman (self, soul).\textsuperscript{148} Advocating self-withdrawal, the *Katha*, says:

\begin{quote}
An intelligent man should suppress (yacchet) his speech and his mind.  
The latter he should suppress in the Understanding-Self.  
The understanding he should suppress in the Great Self.  
That he should suppress in the Tranquil Self (sānta ātman).\textsuperscript{149}
\end{quote}

*Katha* 3.13

The *Svetāsvatara*, at chapter two, verse eight, enjoins the worshipper to cause the senses and mind to enter the heart. The *Maitrī* advises the withdrawal from sense-objects into an absence of all thought, a state akin to profound sleep.\textsuperscript{150}

**Dhyāna: profound meditation**

Symbols help the worshipper move towards mental one-pointedness or concentration (ekāgratā). Concentration reflects the intensity of devotion. The worshipper holds the symbol in his mind and concentrates upon it to the

\textsuperscript{146} ibid., p. 592.  
\textsuperscript{147} ibid., pp. 592-593.  
\textsuperscript{148} Chānd. 8.15.  
\textsuperscript{149} Hume, op. cit., pp. 352-253.  
\textsuperscript{150} *Maitrī* 6.19, 25.
degree that, eventually, all other thoughts are excluded and one-pointedness (ekâgratâ) ensues. That is to say, subjective consciousness and the symbol or object of consciousness unite. Subsequently, any notion of individuality vanishes. For example, the following passage from the Maitrī refers to the worship and concentration on both concrete and abstract symbols of Brahman leading to samâdhi and thus union with Brahman.

... Whoever reverences (upâstana) Time as Brahma, from him time withdraws afar....
There are, assuredly, two forms of Brahma: Time and the Timeless. That which is prior to the sun is the Timeless (a-kāla ...) ... Time ... is the Brahma-abode, and is Atman....
He who is in the fire, and he who is here in the heart, and he who is yonder in the sun -- he is one.
To the unity of the One goes he who knows this.
The precept for effecting [this] unity is this: ... meditation (dhyâna), concentration, ... absorption (samâdhi), [etc.] ....
That which is non-thought, [yet] which stands in the midst of thought,
The unthinkable supreme mystery!--
Thereon let one concentrate (nîdhâyeta) his thought (cittam) ....\textsuperscript{151}

Maitrī 6.15-22

Complete devotion involving intense concentration is thus given to the symbol of worship; all other preoccupations, both mental and physical, are discarded. Such concentration moves consciousness beyond the objective form of the emblem while raising the emblem to the status of Brahman. Realisation of Brahman is the goal and concentration on the chosen symbol is the means to reach that goal.\textsuperscript{152} The type of symbol used depends on the propensity of the worshipper; e.g. the worshipper may be disposed to a perceptible or concrete symbol such as is found in nature, or to a more abstract symbol such as the sacred syllable "Om".

Repeated and sustained fixation of the mind to an object or symbol results eventually in an even, sustained focus of concentrated attention (dhyâna) devoted to the object. Consequently, the yogin/worshipper is able to

\textsuperscript{151} Hume, op. cit., pp. 434-435.

\textsuperscript{152} Velkar, op. cit., pp. 8-10.
arrest the flux of ordinary mental activity. As the meditation intensifies mental activity gradually ceases.\textsuperscript{153}

Several locations in the principal \textit{Upanisads} recommend meditation (\textit{dhyāna}) on different symbols of \textit{Brahman} as the most effective method of attaining liberation: i.e. union with \textit{Brahman}. As noted above, utterance (\textit{japa}) of particular sacred words such as "Om" is recommended as a means of attaining \textit{dhyāna}.\textsuperscript{154} These words are thus understood as \textit{vācaka} or expressions which signify \textit{Brahman}. As such, they are seen, at the time of the \textit{Upanisads} and later, as an effective means to profound meditation (\textit{dhyāna}) and liberation.\textsuperscript{155}

Of all the sacred syllables utilised in the contemplative practices of the \textit{Upanisads}, \textit{Om} is the most exalted. It is described in the \textit{Katha} as the essence of the \textit{Vedas} where knowledge of \textit{Om} is knowledge of \textit{Brahman}.\textsuperscript{156}

The practice of \textit{dhyāna} and its association with the sacred syllable \textit{Om}, as outlined above, is within a religious context. Karel Werner, however, points out that \textit{dhyāna per se} is not a religious concept,

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{153} \textit{Yoga-sūtras} 2.11.
\item \textsuperscript{154} Velkar, op. cit., p. 594.
\item \textsuperscript{155} ibid., p. 594.
\item \textsuperscript{156} \textit{Katha} 2.15-17.
\end{itemize}
... has nothing to do with a mythological line of thought and could not be arrived at through philosophical speculation. It is a definite Yoga technique which can be known only where individual practice has been cultivated for a considerable time by advanced Yogis and groups of pupils and where attempts have been made to formulate the resulting experiences for instructional purposes.¹⁵⁷

By way of argument, he states that, for example, the dhyāna section of the Chāndogya¹⁵⁸ quoted above suggests

... a distant echo of such a formulation inserted into a wider context of Upanisadic tracts without full understanding of its significance.¹⁵⁹

This section on dhyāna, Werner feels, is placed into a context which implies that

... the redaction of the Upanisad was done by people unaware of the meaning of the section and the concept of dhyāna, for they refer to scriptural knowledge as higher than dhyāna.¹⁶⁰

On the basis of this, Werner feels that the concept of dhyāna is an introduction into the Upanisads from elsewhere, that it took the seers of the later Upanisads to fully appreciate the notion. Be that as it may, continuous practice of dhyāna in the context of its association with the sacred syllable Om leads the meditator to samādhi, i.e trance, understood by Velkar as stasis or conjunction with Brahman.

**Dhāranā: concentration of the mind**

The principal Upanisads offer no clear definition of the word "dhāranā" (the act of holding, bearing or maintaining; collection or concentration of the mind). Other than one early reference in the Taittirīya where the


¹⁵⁸ Chānd. 7.6.1.


¹⁶⁰ ibid.
term concerns possession, dhāranā occurs only twice in the Maitri where, in isolation, it seems to imply unspecified concentration of mind. When dhāranā is qualified, it refers to another term. For example, verse 6.20 of the Maitri uses the word to identify contemplative enquiry (tarka) as "higher concentration".

... One may have a higher concentration (dhāranā) than this [withdrawal from sense-objects]. By pressing the tip of his tongue against the palate, by restraining voice, mind, and breath, one sees Brahma through contemplation (tarkena). ...

Maitri 6.20

In the light of the above passage and later usage, dhāranā in itself (as a category of the sixfold-path), thus appears to be general concentration of mind. The much later Yoga Tattva Upanisad defines dhāranā as follows:

Whatever the yogin sees with his eyes, hears with his ears, conceives of, scents with his nose, etc., in regard to all such, and of every other movement too, his thoughts should be on the ātman only, i.e., he should instill the ātma-bhāva in both the action and the results thereof.

Yoga Tattva 3

Accordingly, dhāranā appears to be the ability of the mind to concentrate on the object of meditation. As such, it aims to hold the mind in a motionless state by fixing it to a selected mental or physical object by repeated effort. Dhāranā thus differs from one-pointedness (ekāgrata) in that its practice involves the development of concentration, but does not include

161 Tait. 1.4.1.
162 Hume, op. cit., p. 436.
the full realisation of one-pointedness of mind. That is to say, *dhāranā* corresponds to a stabilising of the mind qualified by keen attention and interest in the object of contemplation or worship. In this way, *dhāranā* represents a degree of concentration on the object of meditation coexistent with an awareness of the activity, or non-activity, of the senses including mind. As such, *dhāranā* is similar to Buddhist mindfulness (*sati*). *Dhāranā* generates "... a continued equanimity of the senses, the mind and intellect ..."165 Patañjali speaks of *dhāranā* as "holding the mind onto some particular object" (*desabhandas cittasya dhāranā*.)166 When concentration on the object of meditation is extended in both time and intensity it becomes profound meditation or *dhyāna*.

**Tarka: contemplative enquiry**

In the *Upanisads*, contemplative enquiry or reflection (*tarka*) is a rare term.167 The Maitrī's inclusion of *tarka* (contemplative enquiry), which is not mentioned in the listing of stages in the later systematisation of yoga, thus serves here to distinguish Upanisadic yoga from Patañjali's *Yoga*.

Radhakrishnan equates *tarka* (contemplative enquiry) with *savikalpaka-samādhi*.168 The term "*savikalpaka*" translates as "possessing variety" or "differentiated". As such, *savikalpaka-samādhi* appears to be a trance state wherein awareness recognises and admits distinctions. *Savikalpaka-samādhi* thus represents a subject-object oriented state characterised by deliberation and reflection. According to Radhakrishnan,

165 Velkar. op. cit., p. 593, referring to *Maitrī* 6.20.


167 Occurs at *Katha* 2.9; *Maitrī* 6.18,20; 7.8; *Amrita* 6; 16.

168 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., pp. 830-831.
tarka/savikalpaka-samâdhi could also mean "... an enquiry whether the mind has become transformed or not into the object of meditation or an investigation into the hindrances of concentration caused by the inferior powers acquired by meditation."\(^{169}\) Such enquiry would necessitate the maintenance of distinctions and the opportunity to differentiate in order to form some conclusion as to the quality or status of the trance.

**Samâdhi: absorption**

Samâdhi is attained when the worshipper, whilst meditating on a symbol of Brahman, loses awareness of his separate existence.\(^{170}\) As a result, individuality (i.e. subject-object consciousness) is absorbed into the all-pervading, unitary existence of Brahman. The Maitrî notes the ineffability of such union and points to its direct perception by the meditative hermit.

... Now, where knowledge is of a dual nature\(^{171}\), there, indeed, one hears, sees, smells, tastes, and also touches; the soul knows everything. Where knowledge is not of a dual nature, being devoid of action, cause, or effect, unspeakable, incomparable, indescribable -- what is that? It is impossible to say!

... Having bidden peace to all creatures, and having gone to the forest, then having put aside objects of sense, from out of one's own body one should perceive Him,  
Who has all forms, the golden one, all-knowing,  
The final goal, the only light, heat-giving. ....

With the mind's stains washed away by concentration (samâdhi),  
What may his joy be who has entered Atman --  
Impossible to picture then in language!  
Oneself must grasp it with the inner organ.

In water, water; fire in fire;  
In air, air one could not discern.

\(^{169}\) ibid., pp. 830-831.  
\(^{170}\) Maitrî 6.18-20; 34.  
\(^{171}\) Implying a subject which knows and an object which is known.
So he whose mind has entered in --
Released is he from everything. 172

Maitri 6.7-8; 34

Deussen feels that "Meditation [dhyāna] becomes absorption [samādhi] when subject and object, the soul and God, are so completely blended into one that the consciousness of the separate subject altogether disappears, and there succeeds that which in Maitr. 6. 20-21 is described as nirātmakatvam (selflessness)." 173

In Patañjali's later system of yoga such a merger with the object of meditation is the highest result attainable by yogic techniques.

The Physiological/Anatomical Details of Yoga

Some of the physiological effects generated by meditation are described by the Upanisads. The Svetāsvatara, in referring to the first results from yoga techniques notes that:

When the fivefold174 quality of Yoga has been produced,
Arising from earth, water, fire, air, and space,
No sickness, no old age, no death has he
Who has obtained a body made out of the fire of Yoga (yogāgni).

Lightness, healthiness, steadiness,
Clearness of countenance and pleasantness of voice,
Sweetness of odor, and scanty excretions-
These they say, are the first stage in the progress of Yoga (yogapraavṛttim).175

Svet 2.12-13

172 Hume, op. cit., pp. 428-429; 448.
174 Swāmī Tyāgīśānanda suggests that this section refers to "... the Yoga practice, mentioned also in Patañjali's Yoga-sūtra, 1.35, of steadying the mind through fixing attention on one of the five senses of smell, taste, color, touch and sound. This is done by concentrating on the tip of the nose, the tip of the tongue, the forepart of the palate, the middle of the tongue and the root of the tongue, respectively." Svetāsvatara Upanisad, (Madras: Sri Ramakrishna Math, 1979), p. 53.
175 Hume., op. cit., p. 398.
The second stage in the six-fold *yoga* practice, which consists in securing freedom from sorrow, is referred to in verse fourteen of the same chapter. Freedom from sorrow is physiological insofar as it equals freedom from sickness, old age, and death; the third stage, freedom from all fetters, is also physiological for the same reason. Verse fifteen notes the third stage. The worshipper,

... A practiser of Yoga, beholds here the nature of *Brahma* (and thus) is released from all fetters!  

*Svet 2.15*

In an elaborate description, wherein the passage from the heart (through the sun) to immortality is depicted, the *Chândogya* reserves one *sloka* for anatomical factors that are yogic. Hume calls attention to these factors named "*nâdî*", "channels of the body". He says:

> These vessels are stated to be minute as a hair divided a thousandfold; ... they conduct the *prâna*, or life energy; ... and so on. It is evident that, in using the term *nâdî*, the writers of the Upanishads had in mind those same vessels that are so elaborately described, in later Hindu writings on Yoga and related subjects, as channels of variously specialized vital energy in the subtle 'etheric' vehicle that coexists as a human organism.

*Chând 8.6.6*

---

176 ibid., p. 399, see also Velkar, op. cit., p. 596.

177 ibid., p. 519.

178 ibid., p. 267. This stanza, as Hume points out in a footnote, recurs at *Katha* 6.16. Eliade feels that this reference is of great importance by revealing "... the existence of a system of mystical physiology concerning which later texts, especially the yogic Upanisads and the later literature of tantricism, will give increasingly abundant details." Eliade, op. cit., p. 120.
Similar representations of the physiological factors are noted elsewhere. The *Maitri*, in particular, notes a channel named the *Susumnā*.\(^{179}\) Such conduits are given slightly different descriptions. They are white, blue, yellow, green, and red in the *Bṛhadāranyaka*\(^{180}\), reddish-brown, white, blue, yellow, and red in the *Chāndogya*\(^{181}\), and reddish-brown, white, black, yellow, and red in the *Kausitaki*\(^{182}\).

**The yogin as worshipper and meditator**

Regarding the true ascetic as one who renounces the objects of sense, Radhakrishnan translates the following passage:

> Even as there is no one to touch sensual women who have entered into an empty house, so he who does not touch objects of sense that enter into him is a renouncer (*samnyāsin*), a contemplator (*yogin*), a performer of the self-sacrifice.\(^{183}\)

*Maitri* 6.10

Whereas Radhakrishnan, in the above passage, renders the term *yogin* as "contemplator", Hume (in his translation of the same passage) renders the word *yogin* as "a devotee".\(^{184}\) As reverence or devoted veneration represents the major practice depicted throughout the principal *Upanisads*, the word "worshipper", rather than "*yogin*", best describes the performer in the principal *Upanisads*. Nevertheless, to the degree that the worshipper takes up and applies yogic techniques, he is a *yogin*. Consequently, Hume's rendition of *yogin* as "a devotee" is not at odds with Radhakrishnan's "contemplator". In

\(^{179}\) Hume, in a footnote observes that *susumnā* is "So described, but not so designated, in Chānd. 8.6.6 and Katha 6.16. Hinted at also in Tait. 1.6 and Prasna 3.7." ibid., p. 437.

\(^{180}\) Brh. 4.3.20.

\(^{181}\) Chānd. 8.6.1.

\(^{182}\) Kaus. 4.19.

\(^{183}\) Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 825.

\(^{184}\) Hume, op. cit., p. 432.
the context of the *Maitrī*, a *yogin* is, in fact, both worshipper and contemplator. Thus worship and *yoga* are combined into a single process. Verse four continues by noting the association of worship (*upāsanā*), the syllable *Om*, and *Brahman*.

... This *Brahman* has the name of the "lone fig tree" and of it that is the radiance which is called the Sun and the radiance too of the syllable *aum*. Therefore, one should continuously worship (*upāśita*) it with the syllable *aum*. For thus it is said, "This syllable, indeed, is holy, this syllable is supreme. By knowing that syllable, indeed, whatever one desires (becomes) his."  

*Maitrī* 6.4

In a similar fashion, the *Maitrī* uses the *Gāyatrī Mantra* (*Rg Veda* 3. 62. 10) as a means, also, to worship *Brahman* in the form of the sun. In this instance, meditation (*cintaya*) is the term used for worship (*upāsanā*).

That desirable (splendour) of *Sāvitrī*, yonder Sun, verily, is *Sāvitrī*. He, verily, is to be sought thus, by one desirous of self, so say the expounders of Brahma-knowledge. May we meditate on the splendour of the God. *Sāvitrī*, verily, is God. Therefore I meditate (*cintayāmi*) as that which is called his splendour .... May he inspire (illuminate) our thoughts. Thoughts, verily, are meditations.

*Maitrī* 6.7

In this way the yogin, as meditator and worshipper, aims to fully know *Brahman* as pure unity.

**Turya: the fourth state of consciousness**

In the meditative process, chapter six, verse nineteen of the *Maitrī* notes that awareness abandons the objects of sense and attains the fourth state of consciousness (*caturtha, turīya*, or *turya*) which is void of all thought.

185 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 818.

186 ibid., p. 820.

187 The term "*caturtha*" is used at *Māṇḍūkya* 7 for "the fourth, or superconscious, state". As Hume points out, it is "... the usual and regular form of the ordinal numeral adjective" of which variant forms appear as *turīya* in the *Brh.* (5. 14. 3, 4, 6, 7), and as *turya* in the *Maitrī* (6. 19; 7. 11. 7), op. cit., fn. p. 392.
Restraint of breath and of mind, as well as concentration, are the suggested practices to reach this condition.

... Verily, when a knower has restrained his mind from the external, when his breath has put to rest objects of sense, let him remain void of conceptions ... let the breathing spirit merge (dharayet) his breathing spirit in what is called the fourth condition (turya). ... That which is non-thought, which stands in the midst of thought, the unthinkable, the hidden, the highest, let a man merge (nidyeta) his thought there. Then will this living being be without support (attachment).\(^{188}\)

Maitri 6.19

Radhakrishnan goes a little far, perhaps, in translating "dharayet" as "merge" (though, no doubt, "a merger" or "a merging" is the result of such action). "Dharayet", from "dhr" "to hold", implies here the sense of "holding", "placing" or "maintaining". Hume more accurately renders it as "restrain".\(^{189}\) Note that the word dhāranā (denoting the yogic practice which aims for the collection or concentration of mind) is also derived from dhr. Union or the realisation of Brahman (i.e. the "merger") is the possible result of holding or concentrating the mind.

Radhakrishnan also translates "nidyeta" as "merge". This is derived from "dha" and includes the prefix "ni". Together they mean "to put". When "ni" + "dha" are employed along with "manas" (mind), as they are in the present context, it means "to fix or direct the thoughts upon or towards". Hume construes the word as "concentrate".\(^{190}\) As noted above, merger or union is a possible consequence from this concentration.

---

\(^{188}\) Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 831.

\(^{189}\) Hume, op. cit., p. 436.

\(^{190}\) ibid.
Chapter six continues in the same vein referring to the restraint or cessation of voice, mind, and breath leading to the liberated vision of Brahman.

... by restraining voice, mind and breath (vān-manah-prāṇa-niroðhanād), he sees Brahman through contemplative thought. When, by the suppression of the mind (manah-ksayāt), he sees through self he sees the shining self, ... then ... he becomes selfless (nir-ātmā). Because of his being selfless he is to be thought of as immeasurable, without origin. This is the mark of liberation (mokṣa), the highest mystery.191

Maitrī 6.20

Hume similarly translates the compound manah-ksayāt as "by the suppressing of the mind".192 This, no doubt, is in keeping within the general context of restraint or control over both physiological and psychological processes. Note, however, that the term "ksaya" literally means "destruction" or "lack".193

The restraint/destruction of mind

Thus, a more literal translation of "manah-ksayāt" suggests not only holding back the mind from action but also actual destruction of the mind. Radhakrishnan's commentary names the state referred to in this passage as "unmnībhāva" ("being absent in mind").194 The word "unmnībhāva", however, only finds specific reference in the Brahma Upanisad.195 Such a literal translation of "manah-ksayāt", in the present instance, implies a possible adoption of ideas and yogic practices which are peculiar to Buddhism by the

191 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., pp. 831-832. This passage recurs at Maitrī 6.34.
192 Hume, op. cit., p. 436.
193 Similarly, the term "nirōdha", which is used at the same location in the compound "vān-manah-prāṇa-nirodhanād", could be translated as "destruction".
194 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 832.
195 The Brahma Upanisad is located within the Samnyāsa Upanisads. Farquhar notes that these treatises are posterior to the Maitrī. The Brahma, however, is composite. Consequently, Farquhar places the earliest portions of the Brahma as early as the Maitrī. Farquhar, op. cit., pp. 94-95.
seers of the Maitri. In the following verses, *yoga* is indicated again as the means to fully reveal and to penetrate the light of *Brahman* which is hidden in the body. One-pointedness of consciousness brings about a quiet mind which is free from thought and other hindrances. Thereupon *Brahman* is fully known.

... Verily, this is the heart of *Brahman*\(^{196}\), ... the immortal, ... even the warmth of the body .... Then by intense concentration (*ekågrena*) they disperse the space within the heart that the light, as it were of that (heat) appears. Then one passes speedily into the same condition (of light) ... , so does thought disappear together with its support. And thus it is said, "The ... space in the heart, the blissful, the supreme abode, is our self, our *Yoga* ...."\(^{197}\)

**Maitri 6.27**

The task of self-purification, (and thus the removal of hindrances), in conjunction with the sacred syllable *Om* is said next to produce the perfected worshipper or *yogin* who overcomes transmigrating existence. Greater emphasis is placed here on moral restraints and disciplines of the body and psyche. The first part of this verse outlines the yogic task, method, and goal while describing the major source of spiritual pollution.

... Having passed beyond the elements, the senses and the objects of sense and then ... (having undertaken) the life of a mendicant (*pravrajyâjyam*), and ... having struck down, with the arrow which consists of freedom from self-conceit (*anabhîmadana*), the first guardian of the door to *Brahmā*, (who has) bewilderment ..., greed and envy ..., sloth, sleep and impurity ..., self-love, who seizes ... anger, ... lust, who slays beings ... with ... desires; having slain him, having crossed over with the raft of the syllable *aum* to the other side of the space in the heart, in the inner space which gradually becomes manifest one should enter the hall of *Brahmā* ....\(^{198}\)

**Maitri 6.28**

\(^{196}\) *sic.* Hume translates "*brahmano vâ vaitad*" as "the heat of Brahma". (See Hume, op. cit., p. 440).

\(^{197}\) Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 837.

\(^{198}\) ibid., p. 838.
The remainder of the verse refers to the egoless, perfected state, transmigrating existence, and release from it by means of yoga. The final sentence alludes to the preeminence of the homeless life of the religious mendicant and yogin:

Henceforth being pure, clean, void (of being), tranquil, breathless, selfless, (sánto/práño, níráma) endless, undecaying, steadfast, eternal, unborn, independent, he abides in his own greatness. Thereafter, having seen (the self) which abides in his own greatness, he looks down on the wheel of births and deaths (samsára) as on a revolving wheel (of a chariot). For thus it has been said: "If a man practises yoga for six months and is constantly freed (from the world) then the infinite supreme, mysterious Yoga is accomplished. But if a man, though well-enlightened, is afflicted with passion (rajas) and darkness (tamas), if he is attached to son, wife and family, for such a one, no, never at all. 199

Maitrī 6.28

In short, liberation (mokṣa) into Brahman is achieved by relinquishing desire, mental activity, and self-consciousness while meditating on Brahman (sad-dhyāyā). 200 It is described as

When the five forms (of sense) of knowledge along with the mind stand still (tisthante) and the intellect stirs not, that ... is the highest state. 201

Maitrī 6.30

Radhakrishnan renders tisthante as "stand still". Hume translates it as "cease". 202 Both renditions aim to describe the same emancipated condition of the worshipper. Indeed, liberation is sought via the control of thoughts to such an extent that they cease. Continuing, the Maitrī notes the powerful generative ability of the mind in its imaginative or thinking capacity.

199 ibid., p. 838.
201 ibid., p. 841. "... yadda pañcāvatisthante jñānāni manasā saha, buddhis ca na vicestate tām ādhuḥ paramāṁ gatim ..." This paragraph occurs also at Katha 6.10.
202 Hume, op. cit., p. 443.
One's own thought (cittam), indeed, is samsāra; let a man cleanse it by effort. What a man thinks (cittas), that he becomes (tan-mayo bhavati), this is the eternal mystery.\textsuperscript{203}

\textit{Maitrī} 6.34

Certainly, the observation that "What a man thinks, that he becomes (yac cittas tan-mayo bhavati) ...." accounts for the liberated state of the worshipper. The word "cittas", rendered here by Radhakrishnan as "thinks", also means "fixes the mind upon". Further, Radhakrishnan gives a somewhat incomplete translation of the terms "tan-mayo bhavati" as "that he becomes". "Tan-mayo bhavati" would be represented best, perhaps, by "he becomes identical with that" or "that he becomes absorbed in". The phrase now comes to be: "What a man fixes the mind upon, that he becomes identical with." This translation more clearly indicates the sense of concentration on, and subsequent yogic union with, the object of meditation. Thus the object of meditation, a perceptible or an imperceptible symbol of Brahman, determines the quality and nature of liberation. Liberation is sought via the control of thoughts to such an extent that they cease. Thereafter, the Upanisadic belief system, it appears, decides the character of release. In verse 6.34, thoughts are known as samsāra (transmigratory existence). Mind, being the realm of thought, is both the means of bondage and the means to liberation. Sloth, distraction, agitation, and desire, especially, are hindrances to be removed if thought is to stop, i.e. to become extinct. Concentration, applied to the appropriate object, is the method to bring thought to a halt. Realisation of Brahman is the result. To reach that state, it is understood that cessation of mental activity equates with extinction:

\textsuperscript{203} Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 845. Hume, op. cit., fn. p. 447 points out that the same profound notion occurs in the Buddhist scripture: \textit{Dhammapada} 1.1,2. It is noted also in the Brh. 4.4.5.
Contemplative Practices In The *Upanisads*

... Even as fire without fuel becomes extinct (*upasāmyate*) in its own place, even so thought, by the cessation of activity (*vṛtti-ksayāc*) becomes extinct (*upasāmyate*) in its own source.

Even in a mind which seeks the truth and has quieted down (*upasānta*) in its own place, there arise false ideas due to past acts when deluded by the objects of sense. ... For by the serenity (*prasāda*) of one’s thought, one destroys all actions (*karman*), good or bad.\(^{204}\)

*Maitrī* 6.34

Freedom may be gained by fixing thought on the selected object of concentration to the total exclusion of all other possible thoughts:

> If the thought of a man is so fixed (*bandhanāt*) on Brahman as it is on the things of this world, who will not then be free from bondage?\(^{205}\)

*Maitrī* 6.34

Impurity of mind is associated with desire and agitation. Perfection is associated with absolute stillness.

The mind, it is said, is of two kinds, pure and impure, impure from contact with desire and pure when freed from desire.

By freeing the mind from sloth and distraction and making it motionless (*suniscāla*), he becomes delivered from his mind (reaches mindlessness, *amanibhāvam*), then that is the supreme state.\(^{206}\)

*Maitrī* 6.34

Finally, concentration is acknowledged as the means to self-purification. The *Maitrī* notes also the ineffability of the perfected state:

The happiness of a mind whose stains are washed away by concentration (*samādhi*) and who has entered the self, it cannot be here described by words. It can be grasped by the inner organ (only).\(^{207}\)

*Maitrī* 6.34

\(^{204}\) ibid., p. 845.

\(^{205}\) ibid.

\(^{206}\) ibid.

\(^{207}\) ibid.
In the final analysis, the *Maitrī* takes a firm stance separating the worshipper from the unorthodox contemplative -- in spite of obvious parallels in the basic mechanics of contemplative practices and the probability that the fundamental techniques of yoga derive from heterodox sources. The final chapter of the *Maitrī* appears to contradict an earlier chapter's praise of the religious mendicant (*pravrajyâjyam*) noted above. In a polemic against heretics in general (and, it appears, Buddhism in particular), chapter seven, verse eight states:

> Now then, the hindrances to knowledge .... This is indeed the source of the net of delusion, the association of one who is worthy of heaven with those who are not worthy of heaven, that is it.

> Now there are some who ... are beggars in town, who perform sacrifices for the unworthy .... And others there are who (are) travelling mendicants (*pravrajita*) ....

*Maitrī* 7.8

An analysis of the term *pravrajyâjyam*, rendered above as "religious mendicant", reveals a compound composed of *pravrajya*, meaning "religious mendicant", and *âjyam* which is translated as "melted or clarified butter ... used for oblations, or for pouring into the holy fire at the sacrifice, or for anointing anything sacrificed or offered". Together, the words suggest an orthodox yogin: an important distinction from the *pravrajita* who is denigrated above. The term is translated by Radhakrishnan as "travelling mendicants". This is correct as far as it goes. While it indicates one who has left home to become a religious beggar, the term could also refer to a person who has renounced the home life to become a monk -- as occurred with the early Jainas and others. Thus *pravrajita* comes to suggest the heterodox yogin who, of course, would not be "the master or institutor of a sacrifice". It seems also

---

208 *Maitrī* 6.28

209 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 855.

210 Monier-Williams, op. cit., p. 133
that the Buddhists, as heterodox *yogins* who formed and taught a doctrine that
denies the soul, are accused of false teachings:

> And others there are who love to distract the believers in the Veda
> with false arguments, comparisons and paralogisms, with these one should
> not associate.

> The world bewildered by doctrines that deny the self (*âman*), by
> false comparisons and proofs does not discern the difference between
> wisdom and knowledge.\(^{211}\)

*Maitrī 7.8*

The worshipper must realise that the chosen symbol provides a per-
manent mainstay for meditation on *Brahman*, that the symbol invokes the
bright *Brahman* into all-pervasion and so: "Therefore, one should reverence
(upāśita) [with the symbol] that unlimited bright power."\(^ {212}\)

The above suggests an incorporation of the techniques of *yoga* into
the process of *upāsanā*. The synthesis is observed, in particular, in later
*Upanisads* such as the *Katha*, *Svetāsvatara*, and *Maitrī* dating from approxi-
mately the fourth century B.C. to the second century A.D.

Scrutiny of those Upanisadic passages which refer to techniques of
*yoga* suggests a synthesis of *yoga* with worship, *upāsanā*. *Yoga* appears to be
utilised as a means to render worship powerful and successful. That is to say,
it is expedient. The *Svetāsvatara* notes *upāsanā* as a preliminary to knowl-
dge or realisation of *Brahman*. Further, the *Svetāsvatara* suggests the pro-
truction of *upāsanā* wherein *Brahman* is apprehended by the use of *yoga*.

> He [*Brahman*] is the beginning, the source of the causes which
> unite (the soul with the body). He is to be seen as beyond the three kinds of
> time (past, present and future), and as without parts after having wor-

\(^{211}\) ibid.

\(^{212}\) *Maitrī 7.11*. Hume, op. cit., p. 457.
Contemplative Practices In The Upanisads

shipped (upāsyā) first (pūrvam) that adorable God who has many forms, the origin of all being, who abides in one's own thoughts.213

Svet 6.5

Fog, smoke, sun, wind, fireflies, lightning, crystal moon, these are the preliminary forms which produce the manifestation of Brahma in Yoga (brahmany abhivyaktikārāni yoge).214

Svet 2.11

He [Brahman] is the eternal among the eternals, the intelligent among the intelligences, the one among many, who grants desires. that cause which is to be apprehended (adhigamya) by discrimination (of sāmkhya) and discipline (yoga)--by knowing (jnātva) God, one is freed from all fetters.215

Svet. 6.13

The late Maitrī more clearly indicates the utilisation of yoga techniques within the context of worship, upāsanā. Further, verses 6.3 and 4 of the Maitrī suggest that the use of yoga techniques in this context is worship.

There are, assuredly, two forms of Brahma: the formed and the formless. Now, that which is the formed is unreal; that which is the formless is real, is Brahma, is light.

That light is the same as the sun.

Verily, that came to have Om as its soul (ātman). ... One should absorb himself, meditating that the sun is Om (āditya aum ity evam dhyāyata ātmanam yujñate).

... This Brahma has the name of 'the Lone Fig-tree.' Belonging to It is the splendor which is your sun, and the splendor of the syllable Om. Therefore one should worship (upāṣṭid) it with Om continually. He is the only enlightener of a man.216

Maitrī 6.3,4

213 Radhakrishnan, op. cit., p. 744.

214 ibid., p. 721.

215 ibid., p. 747.

216 Hume, op. cit., pp. 425-426. See also Maitrī 4.4 where Brahman is worshipped (upāsanā) with meditation (cintayā). In addition, check Maitrī 6.8,9.
According to Velkar, insofar as upāsanā "... requires the exclusive devotion of the mind to the object of worship it is the same as Yoga. Yoga is thus mingled with Upāsanā in the Upanisads."\textsuperscript{217}

**Conclusion**

Some of the more important terms relating to contemplative techniques in the principal Upanisads are: upāsanā, yoga, dhyāna, samādhi, dhāranā, and ekāgratā. Two terms, upāsanā and yoga encompass the primary aspects of Upanisadic contemplation such as 1) perceptible and imperceptible contemplative symbols, 2) control of the sense organs, and 3) the different stages in the meditative process, concluding in the synthesis of upāsanā and yoga. The yoga method represents the systematic utilisation, via various techniques, of forms of concentration leading to sense-withdrawal and the full realisation of one-pointedness of mind on a chosen object. The coalescence of upāsanā and yoga involves exclusive concentration upon an object of worship to the degree that absorption into Brahman (and thus liberation) through the nominated object eventuates. The practice of upāsanā embracing yoga techniques is expanded to a high degree in the Maitrī. The process of upāsanā takes up yoga techniques to deepen and strengthen the contemplation in order to attain the realisation of Brahman. As noted above, earlier Upanisads occasionally advocate yoga. It appears, however, that the yoga method as such was not widely recognised, fully endorsed, or extensively employed before the Maitrī. The yoga depicted in the Maitrī resembles practices recorded in the early Buddhist canonical literature and later in the Yoga-sūtras of Patañjali. Obvious parallels exist in the basic mechanics of their contemplative practices. The above suggests, on the evidence examined, that the fundamental techniques of yoga were appropriated by the Upanisads from heterodox sources. Buddhism is the main probable source. Of the two

\textsuperscript{217} Velkar, op. cit., p. 178.
major terms embodying most aspects of *Upanisadic* contemplation, *yoga* has been extensively studied, while *upāsanā*, has been generally neglected.

The term *upāsanā*, in the *Upanisads*, denotes an act of "coming near" an object by way of devotion. Here, various tangible objects, in addition to abstract images fixed internally, are the focus of constant meditation as the means to realise *Brahman*.

The object of meditation may shift from the external, tangible reality to the internal world of the mind. The transition seems to be a progressive one from extroversion to introversion. These contemplative objects help the worshipper to move towards mental one-pointedness or concentration (*ekāgratā*), (and so to the control of the five sense-organs). Concentration equals the intensity of devotion. The efficacy of *yoga* practices to control and master the sense-organs, including the mind, is emphasised.

Upanisadic passages which refer to techniques of *yoga* provide evidence of an amalgamation of *yoga* with *upāsanā*. *Yoga* is employed as a means to render *upāsanā* powerful and successful. *Upāsanā* then applies the mind to exclusive devotion on the object of worship, with such intensity that full knowledge of the divine object occurs. Yogic practices, understood here as a process of unification, are taught to be essential for realising the higher knowledge of *Brahman*, i.e. emancipation.

That is to say, adoration, worship, or devoted veneration of a symbol of *Brahman*, when applied, intensified, and sustained to an efficient degree, induces *dhyāna* (profound meditation) and eventually *samādhi*. The worshipper, while meditating on a symbol of *Brahman*, loses awareness of his separate existence and realises union with *Brahman*. 
In the principal *Upanisads, samādhi* is the most abstract and final stage in a process of devotional meditation resulting in absorption of the individual soul in *Brahman*. *Dhyāna* consequently becomes a part of the process of *upāsanā*. The practitioner is both worshipper and meditator.

This practice of *upāsanā* incorporating *yoga* techniques is developed in the *Maitrī*. The sixth chapter of this *Upanisad* best (or most thoroughly) demonstrates the worshipper's adoption and application of *yoga* to realise the essential unity of *ātman* and *Brahman*. The method for realising such pure unity is presented there as the "sixfold yoga".

Yogic techniques are thus made an essential part of Upanisadic tradition. They resemble, to a large extent, practices depicted in the early Buddhist canonical literature and those of Patañjali's *Yoga-sūtras*.

In addition to the yogic practices of the *Maitrī*, a correspondence can be drawn between the emancipated condition described above and the *nibbāna* of early Buddhism. Both the *Maitrī* and early Buddhism agree about the potent generative ability of the mind in its imaginative or thinking capacity. In the final analysis, however, the *Maitrī*, by directing a powerful polemic against heretics\(^{218}\) takes a firm stance separating the worshipper from the unorthodox contemplative in spite of obvious parallels in the basic mechanics of contemplative practices and the probability that the fundamental techniques of *yoga* have been appropriated from heterodox sources.

The evidence examined above suggests that the *Maitrī*, recognised as the latest of the principal *Upanisads*, adopted both ideas and yogic practices which are peculiar to Buddhism to attain union with *Brahman*. This conclusion undermines the theory of a purely linear development (1) from a Vedic

---

\(^{218}\) See *Maitrī* 7.8. By the time of the *Maitrī*, heterodoxy clearly existed, e.g. Jainism and Buddhism.
Contemplative Practices In The *Upanisads*

(and thus Aryan) origin, (2) through the *Upanisads* to (3) the Buddhist *Tipitaka*. On the one hand, pre-Buddhist *Upanisads*, while suggesting some influence of *yoga*, neither obviously nor clearly include specific yogic techniques into the overall process of *upāsanā*. On the other hand, the sudden appearance of explicit, detailed references to *yoga* in the post-Buddhist *Upanisads* tends to support the theory of a synthesis of indigenous, yogic practices with the Aryan methods and ideas. However, the early Buddhist sources, in addition to specific *yoga* techniques alien to the early Vedic orthodoxy, depict also contemplative practices reminiscent of the early Vedic methods in their basic mechanism. This implies a cross-fertilisation of techniques from Vedic sources. Consequently, early Indian contemplative practices come to involve the bilateral appropriation, utilisation, and individual synthesis of meditative skills by both orthodox and heterodox traditions.

Contemplative practices in the *Upanisads*, we have seen, comprise essentially a synthesis of two practices wherein yogic techniques are incorporated into the process of *upāsanā* (veneration); i.e. *yoga* is appropriated to intensify and extend *upāsanā*. Profound meditation (*dhyāna*), being expedient, is utilised to render *upāsanā* powerful and successful. Here, yogic concentration equals the means to self-purification while being the intensity of devotion. Perceptible and imperceptible symbols of *Brahman* are adopted as objects of veneration (and thus concentration) resulting in one-pointedness.

The term *yoga*, in its Upanisadic form, means to control and to contemplate. It also refers to the meditator's final state: a direct realisation of *Brahman* understood as oneness or union with *Brahman*. In this process, knowledge (*jñāna*) of the significance of the object of worship/meditation is acquired. The practice of *yoga* leading to knowledge of *Brahman* assumes two main roads to the realisation of *Brahman*. 
The *Upanisads* admit a difference between knowledge and profound meditation (*dhyāna*). Knowledge takes one to a thorough understanding of the real nature of the self as being identical with *Brahman* whilst *dhyāna* brings about the direct realisation of *Brahman*, i.e. perfect union.
CHAPTER 4

CONTEMPLATIVE PRACTICES
IN THE PALI SUTTAS

Introduction

The Pali Suttas represent the earliest statements on Buddhist contemplative practices. For this reason, the present division of this study examines mainly the contemplative practices as portrayed in the suttas. Whilst the sutta material is outstanding, for its clarity and detail, it is, nonetheless, subject to interpretation in light of the material in earlier chapters of the present work.

The teaching activity of the Buddha begins with his first sermon to the five ascetics in the Deer Park at Benares.1 The Four Noble Truths (cattāri ariyasaccāni), which the Buddha expounded on this occasion, represent a summing up of his entire teaching. The Four Noble Truths are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Four Noble Truths (cattāri ariyasaccāni)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Dukkha generally translated as &quot;suffering&quot;.(^2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Samudaya the origin of suffering.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Nirodha the cessation of suffering.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Magga the path leading to the cessation of suffering.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Called "Dhammacakkappavattana Sutta" (Sutta of the setting-in-motion of the wheel of the doctrine). See S.V.420-430.

2 Other translations of the term "dukkha" include: "pain", i.e. painful feeling of the body or mind; sorrow; unsatisfactoriness. While such interpretations may be popular, Stcherbatsky believes that, in theory, something else is meant. In his understanding, The idea underlying [dukkha] is that the elements [of existence] are perpetually in a state of commotion, and the ultimate goal of the world process consists in their gradual appeasement and final extinction.

This chapter concerns the fourth Noble Truth: the path leading to the cessation of suffering. In this regard, the sermon at Benares contains the advice that a person entering a religious life must avoid two extremes: (1) the way of the world involving devotion to the sense-pleasures, and (2) that of useless, painful self-torment. By avoiding these two extremes, one gains "...knowledge of that middle path which giveth vision, which giveth knowledge, which causeth calm, special knowledge, enlightenment, Nibbāna."3 The means to avoid these extremes, and thus realise Nibbāna, lies with a middle way involving contemplative practices. Throughout the suttas, the course of meditative practice is described on numerous occasions in different lists of stages such as the "Noble Eightfold Path" (Ariya Atthangika Magga), the "Threefold Training" (Tividha Sikkhā) etc., involving both samatha (tranquility) and vipassañā (insight). The greater part of the evidence indicates that samatha is covered by yoga practices while little detail is offered regarding vipassañā. This chapter, therefore, is particularly concerned with vipassañā and so compares the various lists outlining meditative techniques as a means of determining the nature of early Buddhist contemplative practices.

Meditation, as a means of mental purification, is an essential feature of Buddhism in addition to other early Indian religions. The suttas note the existence of alternative schools which practice meditation. The Ariyapariyesana Sutta4 states that the Buddha's two former teachers, the ascetics, Alara Kālāma and Uddaka, son of Rāma, practised refined forms of meditation.


4 M.I.160-175.
In addition to the practice of mindfulness (sati), the stages which they attained correspond respectively to the third and fourth stages of arūpa (formless) jhāna in the Buddhist system. The Buddha practised the jhānas under these two ascetics before his enlightenment. He rejected these jhānas because of their limited objective. In noting the limitations of the ascetics' practices, the Buddha indicates an extension of their meditation to include disregard, dispassion, stopping of unwholesome states, super-knowledge, awakening, and nibbāna.

This dhamma does not conduce to disregard (virāga) nor to stopping (niruddha) [unwholesome states arising] nor to tranquility (upasāna) nor to superknowledge (abhijñā) nor to awakening (sambodhi) nor to nibbāna, but only as far as .... So I, monks, not getting enough from this dhamma, disregarded and turned away from this dhamma.5

The Buddha extended the meditative method beyond the absorption of jhāna by developing insight (vipassāna) practices whereby the meditator gains full, direct realisation of impermanence (anicca), suffering (dukkha), and impersonality (anattā). The resulting wisdom (paññā) precipitates the


6 The anattā doctrine states that no abiding self, soul, or real ego-entity can be found within or without the psycho-physical phenomena of existence. Being clearly and openly taught only by the Buddha, this doctrine is thus entirely peculiar and central to Buddhism. The notion of anattā not only represents a process of psychological analysis which articulates the true description, but also acts as a soteriological strategy when used as the object of insight (paññā). The Buddhist doctrine of impersonality lies in total opposition to the Upanisad doctrine wherein the Self or soul (atman) is the abiding agent behind the senses, consciousness, etc. Buddhist doctrine analyses the individual into impersonal constituents presented as lists or systematic categories. The doctrine implies that there is no central self which animates the personal constituents. In his work on this subject, Collins states that

... the denial of self in whatever can be experienced or conceptualised - that is, in the psycho-physical being who is exhaustively described by the lists of impersonal elements - serves to direct the attribution of value away from that sphere. Instead of supplying a verbalised notion of what is the sphere of ultimate value, Buddhism simply leaves a direction arrow, while resolutely refusing to predicate anything of the destination, to discuss its relationship with the phenomenal person, or indeed say anything more about it. ... The new criterion for value-judgements and religious behaviour generally was to be nirvāna, which was 'empty' of self and all conceptual content."
attainment of extinction (*nirodha-samāpatti*). In general, the texts equate *vipassanā* with *pañña* (wisdom, insight) in the triad *sīla, samādhi, and pañña* without offering further explanation.

Among the many stereotyped lists of stages in the *suttas* outlining the graduated path from *samsāra* to liberation, the most commonly recognised arrangement is the Noble Eightfold Path (*ariya atthangika magga*).

### Noble Eightfold Path (*Ariya-atthangika-magga*)

| 1) samma ditthi | right view or understanding |
| 2) samma sankappa | right thought or aspiration |
| 3) samma vācā | right speech |
| 4) samma kammanta | right action |
| 5) samma ājīva | right mode of livelihood |
| 6) samma vāyāma | right effort |
| 7) samma sati | right mindfulness |
| 8) samma samādhi | right concentration |

**The Threefold Training (Tividha Sikkhā)**

The *suttas* further arrange this graduated sequence of stages into a scheme known as "the threefold training" (*tisso* or *tividha sikkhā*) or

---


7 S.V.420.

8 See S.III.83. These three groups encompass the more specific formulations of the practice, e.g. the Noble Eightfold Path, the Seven Purifications etc. Other references to the three trainings (*sikkhā*) include D.I.181; S.II.50; 131; A.I.238.
"threefold division (dhammakkhandha). The three are: morality or virtue (sīla), concentration (samādhi), and wisdom (pāññā). For example,

Three are the bodies of doctrine (khandha) ... which the Exalted One was wont to praise; to which he used to incite the folk, in which he established them, and made them firm. And what are the three? The so noble body of the doctrine regarding right conduct (sīlakkhandha), the so noble body of the doctrine regarding self-concentration (samādhhikkhandha), the so noble body of the doctrine regarding intelligence (pāññākkhandha).9

D.I.206

... such and such is upright conduct (sīla); such and such is earnest contemplation (samādhi); such and such is intelligence (pāññā). Great becomes the fruit, great the advantage of earnest contemplation, when it is set round with upright conduct. Great becomes the fruit, great the advantage of intellect, when it is set round with earnest contemplation. The mind set round with intelligence is set quite free from the Intoxications (āsavas), that is to say, from the Intoxication of Sensuality, from the Intoxication of Becoming, from the Intoxication of Delusion, from the Intoxication of Ignorance.11

D.II.81

9 The association of sīla, samādhi, and pāññā is noted frequently in the Suttas. See, for example, M.I.145-146:

Who ... among the monks living in their native district is ... one who is himself endowed with moral habit (sīla) and as one who talks to the monks on the attainment (sampadda) of moral habit; both as one who is himself endowed with concentration (samādhi) and as one who talks to monks on the attainment of concentration; both as one who is himself endowed with intuitive wisdom (pāññā) and as one who talks to monks on the attainment of intuitive wisdom; both as one who is himself endowed with freedom (vimutti) .... I.B. Horner, (tr) *The Collection of Middle Length Sayings*, vol. 1 of 3 vols, (London: Pali Text Society, 1954, 1957, 1959), pp. 187-188. Hereafter, references to *The Collection of Middle Length Sayings* will be in the format "Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 187-188." See Bibliography for details regarding the translators.


11 *Dialogues*, v 2, pp. 85-86.
How the stages sīla, samādhi, and paññā correspond to the Noble Eightfold Path (atthangika magga) is explained by the nun Dhammadinna in the Cūla-vedalla sutta\(^\text{12}\) as follows:

\[\text{Dhammakkhandhas} \quad \text{Noble Eightfold Path}\]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1) sīla</th>
<th>3) right speech (samma vācā)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2) samādhi</td>
<td>4) right action (samma kammanta)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5) right livelihood (samma āvīja)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) paññā</td>
<td>6) right effort (samma vāyāma)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7) right mindfulness (samma sati)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8) right concentration (samma samādhi)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Thus liberating wisdom arises via the practice of contemplation supported by morality (sīla). Consequently, all hindrances such as defilements etc. are eliminated. Nibbāna, the final goal of Buddhism, then ensues. The Pāli word "nibbāna" (Sanskrit "nirvāna") here means final and absolute release from all future rebirth, old age, disease and death, and from all suffering and misery via the "... absolute extinction of that life-affirming will manifested as Greed, Hate and Delusion, and convulsively clinging to existence ...."\(^\text{13}\)

Other early Indian religions using meditation as a means of mental purification include, in particular, Jainism. The Buddha, in a discussion with the Jain Saccaka, mentions a method of physical and mental drill practised by

\(^{12}\) See M.I.301.

earlier ascetics. He then describes his discovery of the meditative method (utilising yogic techniques) whereby he achieved liberation.\textsuperscript{14}

*Yoga*, in the Upanisadic sense, refers to yoking or merging the mind with Brahman. Early Buddhism never uses the word in this sense. The term is employed especially by the *Sāṇkhya* system where the practice known as *Yoga* is notably developed.\textsuperscript{15} *Sāṇkhya* is undoubtedly earlier than Buddhist sources.\textsuperscript{16} Indeed, early Buddhism may have borrowed elements of this system.\textsuperscript{17} Resemblances exist in aspects of their contemplative practices though the overall picture of the early Buddhist contemplative practices suggests a large degree of originality as demonstrated by their development of insight (*vipassanā*) practices culminating in liberating wisdom (*paññā*).

This chapter aims mainly to gauge the extent to which *vipassanā*, *paññā* etc. are an independent Buddhist development. In doing so, it determines also to what extent these practices are a carry-over from orthodox sources. Significant terms relating to Buddhist contemplative practices (such as *vipassanā* and *paññā*) were first identified and examined within the texts. Then, all the terms along with descriptions regarding their specific textual environment and their location within the *suttas* were recorded to form a computer database. Thereafter, the database was sorted and searched for specific terms in question.

\textsuperscript{14} M.I.237-251.

\textsuperscript{15} Although the systematic *Yoga* treatises as they exist today were written down after the rise of Buddhism, some brief reference is made in this work to the practices systematised in Patañjali's *Yoga-sūtras* by way of comparison. The same applies to Jaina sources.


\textsuperscript{17} Macdonell, *A History of Sanskrit Literature*, op. cit., p. 335.
Examination of the data suggests that Buddhist meditative practices (arising from the need to transform and thus purify consciousness) develop into two complex systems. One system comprises yogic techniques whilst the other aims for knowledge. In a manner similar to practices depicted in the *Upanisads*, these contemplative streams coalesce on a sound foundation of morality (*sīla*) to form a new course, in order to gain full knowledge (*paññā*) and thus release from *samsāra*.

**Two Meditative Methods**

The *suttas* identify two meditative practices: *samatha* (tranquility) and *vipassanā* (insight). These two practices, as depicted in the *Suttas*, come together as the main substance of this chapter. The Buddhist texts are, to a great extent, self-explanatory: courses of practice involving aspects of both *samatha* and *vipassanā* are pointed out by the texts and amplified for development.

The *suttas*, however, present the methods of meditation as recommendations suiting the specific nature of individual contemplatives or as detailed explanation of the system of mental development in general. The *Jhānavagga* itemises the greatest number of the various subjects for contemplation commended by the Buddha in the *Nikāyas*. The four applications of mindfulness (*satipatthāna*), the ten *kasinas* or devices, and the *jhānas* form part of a list of one hundred and one meditative subjects ranging from the most concrete external object to the most sublime concept. These methods occur both individually and collectively depending on the occasion, on the suggested purpose, and on the mental disposition of the aspirants. The

---

18 See A.I.61; M.I.117.

19 A.I.34-40.
Mahārāhulovāda Sutta\textsuperscript{20} depicts the Buddha recommending several contemplative subjects to his son Rāhula. These include: the analysis of the four elements, compassion, impurity, and transitoriness etc. Sāriputta, Rāhula’s teacher, suggested he practise mindfulness of in- and out-breathing (ānāpānasati).

The Buddha’s answer in response to Ananda’s question\textsuperscript{21} regarding the means to enlightenment discloses that the liberating factor, be it concentration or insight, is the ascendance of one in a group of emancipating factors. The ascendance of a single factor such as insight or concentration in a group of emancipating determinants makes possible the occasion for the various subjects and methods of meditation depicted in the Pāli Suttas to be arranged into two interrelated and interdependent methods. The suttas, however, suggest a degree of varying achievements (determined by the ability of the meditator, jhāyin\textsuperscript{22}) in meditative technique as opposed to alternative approaches to emancipation.

Thus Buddhism, as depicted in the Pāli Sutta Pitaka, attains its goal, nibbāna, in a fashion similar to the Upanisadic method noted above. That is to say, two meditative systems couple or combine to gain full knowledge (pannā) and thus release. In short, the religion of the Buddha is one of self-enlightenment via self-mastery.\textsuperscript{23}

\textsuperscript{20} M.II.420-426.
\textsuperscript{21} M.II.435-437.
\textsuperscript{22} The term "jhāyin" is used to differentiate the Buddhist meditator from other contemplatives.
\textsuperscript{23} Considering the controversy surrounding Buddhist notions of the self, Collins points out that the Buddhist doctrine of no-self or impersonality (anattā) in the Buddhist texts immediately concerns only a small number of Buddhist intellectuals. He states that ...
... a study of the canonical texts shows clearly that the denial of self, the refusal to allow any 'ultimate' validity to personal terms which are taken to refer to anything real and permanent is insisted on only in a certain kind of conceptually sophisticated theoretical context. The linguistic items trans-
The Religion of Self-Mastery

In the Udumbarikā Sīhanāda Sutta (On Asceticism), self-mastery (damaṁthāya), calm (samathāya), salvation (taranāya), peace (parinibbāna), and liberation (nibbāna) are enumerated not only as qualities of the Buddha but also as attributes of his religious instruction.

Enlightened is the Exalted One; he teaches the religion of Enlightenment. Self-mastered is the Exalted One; he teaches the religion of Self-mastery (damathaya). Calm is the Exalted One; he teaches the religion of Calm (samathāya). Saved is the Enlightened One, he teaches the religion of Salvation (taranāya). At peace is the Exalted One; he teaches the religion of Peace. (Parinibbāna).

To obtain the experience of nibbāna or release (and thus the other attributes of the Buddha), the suttas recommend meditation as the means:

Give not yourselves to wastage in your lives,
Nor be familiar with delights of sense.
He who doth strenuously meditate (jhāyanto),
His shall it be to win the bliss supreme.

Collins, op. cit., p. 71. That is to say, 'self' as a reflexive pronoun, is used frequently in simple narrative contexts where the intention is simply to denote the phenomenal person. Buddhism, in this way, refers to 'self-mastery'. See also Perez-Ramon, Joaquin. *Self and Non-Self in Early Buddhism*, The Hague: Mouton, 1980.

24 Lit., tamed.

25 Translator's footnote states: "Lit., crossed over, and crossing over, a figure applied always to the Four Floods (sensuality, renewed existence, speculative opinion, ignorance) which whelm mankind in everlasting living."

26 Translator's footnote, based on the Commentary, states: "... the driving away for mankind of all the Corruptions (kilesas). For the Ten corruptions, see Bud. Psych. Éthics, pp. 327 ff."


28 *Kindred Sayings*, v 1, p. 36.
Buddhist meditation, as set forth in the *suttas* as the way to salvation and self-mastery, is based primarily upon the Buddha's personal experience and the method by which he gained enlightenment. Meditation is essential and thus pre-eminent in Buddhist practice.

The longest list representing the Buddha's course of practice to liberation that is depicted in the *Sutta Pitaka* occurs in nine different *suttas* found in the *Silakkhandhavagga* of the *Dīgha Nikāya*. This representation, like many similar portrayals, is imbedded in lengthy, wordy statements involving much repetition. In order to clarify the text, the statement of the path is condensed and simplified\(^\text{29}\) as follows:

### List I

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td><strong>dhamma/saddha/pabbajja</strong>: A layman hears a Buddha teach the doctrine, acquires faith or confidence in it, and makes the decision to go forth as a bhikkhu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td><strong>sīla</strong>: He adopts the precepts for bhikkhus (listed in great detail).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td><strong>indriyasamvara</strong>: He practices guarding of the six sense-doors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td><strong>sati</strong>: He practises mindfulness and self-possession (actually described as mindfulness of the body, kāyānussati).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E</td>
<td><strong>santutthi</strong>: He attains a state of contentment with his meagre robes and almsfood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td><strong>nīvaranappahāna/jhāna 1</strong>: He chooses an isolated spot in which to meditate, purifies his mind of the five nīvaranas (hindrances),(^\text{30}) and attains the first rūpa jhāna.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td><strong>jhāna 2</strong>: He attains the second jhāna.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H</td>
<td><strong>jhāna 3</strong>: He attains the third jhāna.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

\(^{29}\) The *Pāli* terms such as *dhamma/saddha/pabbajja* which precede the brief explanations are used as expedient mnemonics to substitute for the original, lengthy descriptions.

\(^{30}\) The five *nīvarana* are: (1) sensuous desire (*kāmacchanda*); (2) ill-will (*vyāpāda*); (3) sloth and torpor (*thīna-middha*); (4) restlessness and worry (*uddhacca-kukkucca*); (5) sceptical doubt (*vicīkicchā*).
I) jhāna 4: He attains the fourth jhāna.

J) ānadassana: He develops knowledge and insight into the nature of the body (kāya) and into the distinction between it and the mind (viññāna).

K) manomaya kāya: He practises calling up a mind-made body

L) iddhis: He develops certain supernormal powers such as the ability to walk on water.

M) dibbasota: He develops the "divine ear", the ability to hear distant sounds.

N) cetopariyañāna: He acquires the "knowledge that penetrates others' minds".

O) pubbenivāsānussatiñāna: He recollects his many former existences in samsāra.

P) sattānam cutūpapātañāna: He observes the death and rebirth of beings according to their kammass,31

Q) āsavānam khayañāna: He acquires the knowledge of the destruction of the cankers, perceives the four noble truths, and knows that he has now done what was to be done.

Of all the various representations of the Buddha's course of practice to liberation that are portrayed in the suttas, the Cūlahatthipadopamasutta depicts perhaps the best statement of the path insofar as it suggests a more precise portrayal of meditation path by excluding stages that may be optional,

31 Sanskrit: *karma*, "action, i.e. wholesome and unwholesome volitions causing rebirth".

32 Pāli "āsavas", literally "influxes", signifies the four cankers of sense-desire or sensuality, of desiring eternal existence or becoming, of wrong views or delusion, and of ignorance. D.II.81 ff. relates:

Now ... the Exalted One ... held that comprehensive religious talk with the brethren, saying:--"Such and such is upright conduct (sīla) ... earnest contemplation (samādhi) ... intelligence (paññā). Great becomes the fruit, great the advantage of earnest contemplation, when it is set round with upright conduct. Great becomes the fruit, great the advantage of intellect when it is set round with earnest contemplation. The mind set round with intelligence is set quite free from the Intoxications (cankers, āsavas), that is to say, from the Intoxication of Sensuality, from the Intoxication of Becoming, from the Intoxication of Delusion, from the Intoxication of Ignorance.

_Dialogues_, v 2, pp. 84-86. As the translator states in a footnote, this paragraph is constantly repeated and is spoken of as if it were a well-known summary.
rather than essential, steps on the meditation path. This representation, like that above, is also imbedded in lengthy, wordy statements involving much repetition. As a consequence, the Cūlahatthipadopamasutta text is similarly condensed and simplified so as to clarify the statement of the path.

List II

1) dhamma/saddha/pabbajja, hearing the Buddhist teaching, acquiring confidence in it, and deciding to become a bhikkhu in order to put it into practice.

2) sīla, adopting the prescribed constraints on bodily conduct.

3) indriyasamvara, guarding the six sense-doors.

4) sati, practising mindfulness.

5) nīvaranappahāna/jhāna 1, jhānas 2-4, practising concentration to eliminate negative mental states and attaining one-pointedness.

6) pubbenivāsānussatiñāna, recollecting one's former existences in samsāra.

7) sattānam cutūpapātañāna, observing the death and rebirth of beings according to their kammas.

8) āsavānam khayañāna, destroying the cankers and thus attaining liberation.

The first five of the above eight stages receive adequate explanation in the suttas and commentaries. It is generally accepted by both Buddhists and scholars that the contemplative course ends at stage five with mastery of the jhānas, i.e. right concentration (samma samādhi), the final stage of Noble Eightfold Path. However, the extension of the path beyond the jhānas to include the "three knowledges" indicates a more complete portrayal of meditation path than that depicted in the Noble Eightfold Path. The te-vijjās, however, receive inadequate explanation in the texts.

33 M.I.179-185. As well, see M.I.344-348 and II.38.5.
Unlike List I, List II lacks the separate stage santutthi (contentment with meagre robes and almsfood) though it does contain a description of santutthi under the sīla stage. As well, List II does not contain items J to N of List I. Stages J to N represent the first five stages of the insight (paññā) group and yet these stages appear to be either unnecessary training for the development of insight or side-tracks on the Buddhist meditative course. That is to say, the often repeated description of the stages leading to enlightenment lacks these five items. List II, by circumventing the digressions, depicts the direct path to enlightenment. Even so, it is very difficult to assess the degree that stages J to N are actually unnecessary developments in the Buddhist meditative path. For example, M.I.166 above indicates that the practices of the Buddha's teachers lack super-knowledge (abhiññā). The supernormal-knowledges (abhiññās) include magical powers (iddhis), divine ear (dībba-sota) etc. The abhiññā which the sutta refers to is probably the last, i.e. the knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (āsavānam khayañāna) -- stage Q of List I, though it is not specifically named.

The most commonly recognised arrangement outlining the graduated path from samsāra to release in the suttas, it was noted, is the Noble Eightfold Path (ariya atthangika magga), beginning with right understanding (sammā-ditthi) and concluding with right concentration (sammā-samādhi). In her explanation regarding the correspondences between the Noble Eightfold Path and the three dhammakkhandhas, the nun Dhammadinna equated the path-steps sammā-ditthi and sammā-sankappa with the stage paññā. On the one hand, Tilmann Vetter supports Dhammadinnā’s equation by concluding that

Persons who practised [paññā] preceded by dhyāna tried to refer to the noble eightfold path for this practise. Sometimes it was interpreted as containing paññā. Paññā can, however, only be inserted into the first two members of the eightfold path. Because for these persons the path to salvation culminates in [paññā] and not in right samādhi, they must conclude, as
did the nun Dhammadinna ..., that the eightfold path is no path which one has to traverse from one stage to the next, but only a list of important means.34

On the other hand, Helmut Eimer, in his work Sketches of the Path of Redemption in Series of Buddhist Concepts35, states that right view (samma-ditthi) and right aspiration (samma-sankappa) cannot be assigned to the area of insight (paññā). Even though samma-ditthi covers the knowledge (ñāna) about the true nature of existence, i.e. the Four Noble Truths etc., such knowledge is not the result of meditative effort as is paññā.36 Indeed, Eimer calls for a differentiation between ditthi and paññā where ditthi represents the preliminary understanding while paññā is the complete understanding.37

A comparison between the Noble Eightfold Path and the detailed portrayal of the path to release as depicted in the conclusions of many suttas reveals that samma-ditthi and samma-sankappa form the beginning of the path to release. Observance of the rules of morality (sīla) belongs to a later part of the path. Consequently, the first two segments of the Noble Eightfold Path, according to Eimer, have no equivalent counterpart in the threefold division of sīla, samādhi, and paññā. Samma-ditthi and samma-sankappa (as the Buddhist metaphysic) represent the primary steps which must be grasped intellectually before proceeding to training in morality etc.38

With samma-ditthi and samma-sankappa properly assigned to the primary steps which must be grasped intellectually before proceeding to training in right speech (samma vācā), right effort (samma kammanta) etc.,

35 Eimer, Skizzen des Erlösungsweges in buddhistischen Begriffssystemen, op. cit.
36 ibid, p. 36.
37 ibid, p. 33.
38 ibid, p. 37.
the Noble Eightfold Path thus lacks stages corresponding to insight (paññā). The last segment of the path, sammā-samādhi, corresponds to the second section of the threefold division. Consequently, the Noble Eightfold Path and the division into sīla, samādhi, and paññā cover different areas of the path to release.39

Several suttas extend the triad sīla, samādhi, and paññā to include a fourth stage, liberation (vimutti):

It is through not understanding and grasping four truths40, O brethren, that we have had to run so long, to wander so long in this weary path of transmigration -- both you and I.

And what are these four? The noble conduct of life (sīla), the noble earnestness in meditation (samādhi), the noble kind of wisdom (paññā), and the noble salvation of freedom (vimutti).41

D.II.122-123

The four concepts sīla, samādhi, paññā, and vimutti are found also in the enumeration of the cattaro dhamma-kkhandha (four bodies of doctrine) in the Sangiti-sutta of the Dīgha Nikāya.42 The meditator, by recognising and realising release during his lifetime, includes liberation (vimutti) in the context of training in insight (adhipaññā).

Two Trainings in Insight: Metaphysic and Realisation

Eimer identifies two sutta explanations for training in insight (adhipaññā) within the three higher trainings (tissō sikkhā). These explanations support the above thesis that sammā-ditthi and sammā-sankappa represent the primary steps which must be grasped intellectually before initiating

39 ibid.

40 In a footnote, the translator states: "Or conditions (dhamma). They must, of course, be carefully distinguished from the better known Four Noble Truths ...."

41 Dialogues, v 2, p. 131.

42 D.III. 229, Eimer, p. 39.
training in morality etc. The first explanation calls for a monk to recognise the nature of reality according to the Four Noble Truths, i.e. in accordance with the Buddhist metaphysic. In the second explanation, the jhāyin recognises and realises release during his lifetime. Whereas the first textual reference enables the tisso sikkhā to include the same route as the triad sīla, samādhi, and pañña, the second extends the path by including liberation (vimutti) in the context of training in insight (adhipañña). That is to say, the jhāyin (in addition to his intellectual recognition of the nature of existence) here experiences release as the result of insight (pañña). The first sutta explanation for training in insight (adhipañña), i.e. recognition of the nature of reality in accordance with the Buddhist metaphysic, is in keeping with the Noble Eightfold Path and the practice of a learner (sekha). The second explanation, where the jhāyin recognises and realises release during his lifetime, extends the path of practice by two factors to represent the course of a perfected one (arahant).

Learner vs. Perfected One: the Eightfold Path vs the Tenfold Path
Both the Mahācattārīṣakasutta and the Jana-vasabha suttanta list ten path factors (maggangas). Commencing with right view (sammā-ditthi), each factor provides the support for the next. The Mahācattārīṣakasutta,

---

43 A.I.235-236.
44 ibid.
45 Eimer, op. cit., p. 41.
46 M.III.76.
47 D.II.217.
having listed the *magganga*ś, differentiates the number of path components appropriate to a learner (*sekha*) and to a perfected one (*arahant*).48

As to this monks, right view (*sammatha-dithi*) comes first. And how, monks, does right view come first? Right purpose (*sammatha-sankappa*) ... proceeds from right view; right speech (*sammatha-vācā*) proceeds from right purpose; right action (*sammatha-kammanta*) proceeds from right speech; right mode of livelihood (*sammatha-dīvā*) proceeds from right action; right endeavour (*sammatha-vāyāma*) proceeds from right mode of livelihood; right mindfulness (*sammatha-sati*) proceeds from right endeavour; right concentration (*sammatha-samādhi*) proceeds from right mindfulness; right knowledge (*sammatha-nāna*) proceeds from right concentration; right freedom (*sammatha-vimutti*) proceeds from right knowledge. In this way, monks, the learner’s course is possessed of eight components, the perfected one’s of ten components.49

The learner’s course of practice, according to this account, concludes at the *jhāna*s, i.e. right concentration (*sammatha-samādhi*), while the course of the *arahant* continues from the *jhāna*s to include right insight (*sammatha-nāna*) leading directly to release (*sammatha-vimutti*).50

The so-called "ten qualities of an adept" (*dasa asekkiyā*51 *dhamma*) also provide these two additional stages to the *atthangika magga* to complete the path up to liberation (*vimutti*): right knowledge or insight (*sammatha-nāna*) and right release (*sammatha-vimutti*).

Monks, there are these ten qualities of an adept (*asekha*).
What ten?
In this matter, ... a monk is possessed of the right view (*sammatha-dithi*) of an adept, of an adept’s right thinking (*sammatha-sankappa*), speech

48 The *Anguttara Nikāya* implicitly assigns higher status to the ten path factors (*magganga*ś) by discussing them much more frequently. For example, the Tens list the ten *magganga*ś at least fifty-four times [A.V.213-310] while in the Eights the eightfold path is listed only twice [A.V.189, 346].

49 Middle Length Sayings, v 3, p. 119.

50 Eimer, op. cit., p. 25.

51 The term "*asekha*" means literally a "not-learner": one who no longer needs to train himself, by having reached perfection in higher moral training, higher mind training, and higher wisdom training.
Contemplative Practices in the Pāli Suttas

(samā vācā), action (samā kammanta), living (samā ājīva), effort (samā vāyāma), mindfulness (samā-sati), concentration (samā samādhi), of an adept's right knowledge (samā nāna) and release (samā vimutti). Thus far a monk is an adept.\textsuperscript{52}

A.V.222

Samā nāna and samā vimutti thus represent pañña and vimutti, i.e. the last two stages following samādhi in the fourfold arrangement. The Learner's path and the perfected one's path with its "ten qualities of an adept" are set out as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Learner's Path</th>
<th>Perfected One's Path</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) samā-ditthi</td>
<td>1) samā-ditthi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) samā-sankappa</td>
<td>2) samā-sankappa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) samā vācā</td>
<td>3) samā vācā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) samā kammanta</td>
<td>4) samā kammanta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) samā ājīva</td>
<td>5) samā ājīva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) samā vāyāma</td>
<td>6) samā vāyāma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) samā-sati</td>
<td>7) samā-sati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) samā samādhi</td>
<td>9) samā nāna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10) samā vimutti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Saccavibhanga-sutta, in its explanation of the individual stages of the atthangika magga, defines right view (samā-ditthi) as knowledge (nāna) of the Four Noble Truths.

And what, your reverences, is the ariyan truth of the course leading to the stopping of anguish (dukkhanirodha)? It is the ariyan Eightfold way (ariya atthangika magga) itself, that is to say: right view (samā-ditthi), right aspiration (samā-sankappa), right speech (samā vācā), right action (samā kammanta), right mode of livelihood (samā ājīva), right endeavour (samā vāyāma), right mindfulness (samā-sati), right concentration (samā samādhi).

And what, your reverences, is right view (samā-ditthi)? Whatever ... is knowledge (nāna) of anguish, knowledge of the arising of anguish,

knowledge of the stopping of anguish, knowledge of the course leading to the stopping of anguish -- this, your reverences, is called right view.\textsuperscript{53}

M.II.251

With knowledge (ñāṇa) referring to sammā-dītthi and to the stage following sammā-samādhi, ñāṇa thus stands both at the beginning and at the last stage before release.\textsuperscript{54}

Bucknell also supports the view that the Buddhist course of practice to release (as expressed in the categories of the Noble Eightfold Path) represents an incomplete summary of the path to the cessation of suffering.\textsuperscript{55} His comparative analysis of the listing of stages in the Buddhist path to liberation argues convincingly that the atthangika magga deserves less status than that generally given it by both practising Buddhists and scholars. Bucknell's study demonstrates that the Noble Eightfold Path represents merely one of many differently worded statements of the Buddha's course of practice to release. His work, in the examination of five alternate lists, notes the omission, by the eightfold path, of right insight (sammañña) and right release (samma vimutti) in a series of stages both sequential and cumulative:

\ldots the order of listing [of stages] represents the sequence in which factors are developed in practice [i.e. sequential] ... also ... factors already established are maintained as new, more advanced factors are developed, at least as far as right concentration [i.e. cumulative].\textsuperscript{56}

\textsuperscript{53} Middle Length Sayings, v 3, p. 298. Eimer, p. 22.

\textsuperscript{54} Eimer, op. cit., p. 25.

\textsuperscript{55} Bucknell, Rod S. "The Buddhist Path to Liberation: An Analysis of the Listing of Stages," Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, 7/2 (1984), 7-40. I am indebted to Dr. Bucknell for providing me with his earlier and much larger manuscript which formed the basis for his subsequent publication noted here. The earlier text is an exhaustive examination of fifty-one lists in the Buddhist canon outlining the path to enlightenment. Please refer to these texts for detailed analysis of the contemplative implications of each stage of the path.

\textsuperscript{56} ibid, pp. 9-10.
The two further stages, *sammā nāna* and *sammā vimutti*, in conjunction with the other factors of the *atthangika magga*, constitute a superior "tenfold path". In accounts of the meditative course and in the tenfold path, right insight is preceded by the *jhānas* and followed by liberation. Dhammadinna, by placing *sammā-ditthi* within the *paññā* category, belies the sequence of listing wherein right insight (*sammā nāna*) precedes right liberation (*sammā vimutti*), i.e. the tenfold path. Further, Dhammadinna’s explanation also fails to mention the extention of the three *dhammakkhandhas* to four. In the context of the differentiation between *ditthi* and *paññā* as well as the extension of the path to include *sammā nāna* and *sammā vimutti*, the following arrangement provides for a more convincing explanation.

### Tenfold Path

| 1. *sammā-ditthi* | = Primary steps: internalising the Buddhist metaphysic |
| 2. *sammā-sankappa* | |
| 3. *sammā vācā* | |
| 4. *sammā kammanta* | = 1. *sīla* |
| 5. *sammā ājīva* | |
| 6. *sammā vāyāma* | |
| 7. *sammā sati* | = 2. *samādhi* |
| 8. *sammā samādhi* | |
| 9. *sammā ūna* | = 3. *paññā* |
| 10. *sammā vimutti* | = 4. *vimutti* |

In the different lists of stages in the path to liberation, the term "*sīla*" varies in its semantic range. In the relationship between the *dhammakkhandhas* and the tenfold path presented above, *sīla* could include

---

57 ibid. p. 8. Bucknell notes that the suttas refer to the list of ten stages by various names such as "the noble path", "the ten qualities of an adept", "the ten states conducing to the ending of the cankers (*dsavas*)", etc. See A.V.244, 222, 237.

the first two path factors, i.e. *samma-ditthi* and *samma-sankappa*, along with the three factors *samma vācā*, *samma kammanta*, and *samma ājīva*.

For example, a comparison between List I above (p. 149) and the tenfold path indicates that they represent a single course of practice expressed in different words. The *Kassapa-Sīhanāda Sutta* groups the items of List I into the following three broad categories: A-B = *sīlakkhandha*, C-I = *samādhi-khandha*, and J-Q = *paññākhandha*. Item A of the *sīla* category has three elements: (i) hearing a *buddha* teach, (ii) acquiring faith or confidence in his doctrine, and (iii) deciding to go forth as a *bhikkhu*. Of these, (i) and (ii), and to some extent (iii) also, imply the acquiring of a basic knowledge about Buddhist doctrine (*dhamma*), about the goal of the Buddhist way of practice, and about that way of practice. Now the first stage of the tenfold path, *samma ditthi*, is defined as an understanding, clouded however by *āsavas*, of the Four Noble Truths. It follows that components (i) and (ii) of item A are functionally equivalent to the first path-factor, *samma ditthi*.

The second path-factor, *samma sankappa*, right resolve or aspiration, is defined as aspiration towards renunciation, non-hatred, and non-harming. Aspiration towards renunciation is the essence of the decision to go forth as a *bhikkhu*, whence component (iii) of item A is equivalent at least to part of the second path-factor. It follows that item A of List I is broadly equivalent to the first and second path-factors together. Item B of List I is the adopting of the numerous precepts (*sīla*). As such, item B corresponds to the third, fourth, and fifth path-factors, i.e. right speech, right action, and right livelihood.

With items A-B of List I corresponding to the broad category *sīlakkhandha* as well as being equivalent to the path factors 1 to 5 of the ten-

---

fold path, it follows that *sīla* must now include *samma ditthi* and *samma sankappa*. As a consequence of this modification, the correspondences between the tenfold path and the *dhammakkhandhas* is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tenfold Path</th>
<th>Dhammakkhandhas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. <em>samma-ditthi</em></td>
<td>1. <em>sīla</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. <em>samma-sankappa</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. <em>samma vācā</em></td>
<td>= 1. <em>sīla</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. <em>samma kammanta</em></td>
<td>2. <em>samādhi</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. <em>samma ājīva</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. <em>samma vāyāma</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. <em>samma sati</em></td>
<td>= 2. <em>samādhi</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. <em>samma sampādhi</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. <em>samma ūpāna</em></td>
<td>= 3. <em>paññā</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. <em>samma vimutti</em></td>
<td>= 4. <em>vimutti</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As noted above, the *suttas* indicate that the eightfold path components are appropriate to a learner (*sekha*) while the tenfold path components are appropriate to a perfected one (*arahant*). This suggests that the eightfold path represents a limited version of the tenfold path culminating in right release (*samma vimutti*). Both eightfold and tenfold paths presuppose the correct method to perfect release -- other methods thus being incorrect by leading to an imperfect, limited state misunderstood as salvation. The Buddhist paths to release (by their specific metaphysic, systematisation of exacting instructions, and singular goal) stand out in references to early Indian contemplative practices. As such, the eightfold and tenfold paths appear to be strictly Buddhist in origin.
The Five Powers

Referring to the path, the suttas repeatedly mention "the five powers" (bala) or "the five controlling faculties" (indriya). The Indriya-Samyuttam explains them as follows:

**The Five Powers (Bala)**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) saddhā = faith in Buddha, Dhamma, Sangha, and the ariyan silas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) viriya = the four padhānas (exertions)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) sati = the four satipatthānas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) samādhi = the four rūpa jhānas</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) paññā = insight into the Four Noble Truths</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When compared with List I, saddhā is a segment of item A: dhamma/saddhā/pabbajja. Viriya covers item C: indriyasamvara, the first of the four padhānas. Sati corresponds with item D: sati. Samādhi takes in items F-I, the four jhānas. By representing insight into the Four Noble Truths, paññā, covers item Q, the last of the "three knowledges" (i.e. āsavānam khayañāna) wherein the cankers (āsava) are destroyed and the jhāyin gains insight into the Four Noble Truths etc. Perfection of the third "knowledge"

---

60 Oldenberg observes that the Yoga-sūtras name, as prerequisites to dhyāna, possession of saddhā, virāya, smrī, samādhi, prajñā (= Buddhist 5 powers) [no source given]. He notes further that the Buddha's teachers Aṇāra and Uddaka possessed these five, and had mastered the jhānas of nothingness and neither-perception-nor-non-perception respectively. Hence, jhāna was well known to pre-Buddhist Yoga. Oldenberg, op. cit., p. 280. See also p. 281 where Oldenberg, in speaking of jhāna, states that both Buddhism and Yoga speak of citta as the "organ" that is responsible. As he sees it, the earlier source is probably Yoga (rather than Buddhism). Also, the Buddhist texts speak of samanas who claimed nirvāṇa could be attained through mastery of the jhānas -- i.e. jhāna was pre-Buddhist.

61 S.V.195.

62 The four exertions form the sixth stage of the path, i.e. right effort (sammā vīyāma). They are 1) the effort to avoid (samvara padhāna) unwholesome states, 2) to overcome (pañhāna padhāna) unwholesome states, 3) to develop (bhāvanā padhāna) wholesome states, and to maintain (anurākkhana padhāna) wholesome states.
suggests the realisation of the two previous "knowledges".\textsuperscript{63} That being so, \textit{pañña} equals \textit{te-vijjā}, the "three knowledges".\textsuperscript{64} The five powers (\textit{bala}) also broadly equal the items of List II. For example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List I</th>
<th>List II</th>
<th>The Five Powers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1) \textit{dhamma/saddhā/pabbajjā}</td>
<td>1) \textit{saddhā}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>2) \textit{sīla}</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>3) \textit{indriyasamvara}</td>
<td>2) \textit{viriya}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>4) \textit{sati}</td>
<td>3) \textit{sati}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-I</td>
<td>5) \textit{jhānas}</td>
<td>4) \textit{samādhi}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O-Q</td>
<td>6-8) \textit{te-vijjās}</td>
<td>5) \textit{pañña}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While it appears that the five powers (\textit{bala}) lack the category "\textit{sīla}", item one (\textit{saddhā}) notes \textit{sīla} in its definition. The exclusion of this indispen-

\textsuperscript{63} Bronkhorst argues that the third knowledge, consisting in the destruction of the cankers, is the only knowledge having an obvious connection with liberation; further, that the first two knowledges give the impression of being later additions to the text. He finds support for his argument in the Chinese \textit{Madhyamāgama} (T26, vol. 1, p. 589c14-23) of the \textit{Sarvāstivādins} where only the knowledge regarding the destruction of the cankers precedes final liberation. According to Bronkhorst, the first two knowledges may have been added to the text in order to emphasise the belief in rebirth determined by one's earlier actions. See Johannes Bronkhorst, \textit{The Two Traditions of Meditation in Ancient India}, (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner, 1986), pp. 114-115. Vetter also supports the thesis that the first two knowledges are later additions by pointing out that, in the canonical reports of the Buddha's enlightenment where the meditative path employs the \textit{jhānas} plus realisation of a higher knowledge,

... the first two kinds of higher knowledge have the verb in the present tense, while the rest of the report, including the kind of knowledge of the four noble truths, has the verb in the aorist. Consequently, we can consider the first kinds of knowledge as later additions.

Vetter, op. cit., p. xxiv, referring to L. Schmithausen, "On Some Aspects of Description or Theories of 'Liberating Insight' and 'Enlightenment'," \textit{Studien zum Jaisnismus und Buddhismus, Gedenkschrift für Ludwig Alsdorf}, Klaus Bruhn & Albrecht Wezler (eds), Weisbaden: Franz Steiner, 1981, pp. 199-250. In a footnote, Vetter undermines his own argument by noting that, "... according to most manuscripts, the present tense is also found in the description of the four stages of dhyāna, which precedes the description of the three kinds of knowledge." (Referring to F. Enomoto, "The Development of the Tisso-Vijjā Thought in the Early Buddhist Scriptures," \textit{Bukkyo Kenkyu XII}, 1982, 63-81.) As a consequence, the argument that the first two knowledges are later additions is inconclusive.

\textsuperscript{64} See Eimer, op. cit., pp. 31 & 35.
sible group from within the list suggests that the intention may have been to record only the mental stages involved.

**The seven factors of enlightenment (bojjangas)**

In addition to "the five powers" (bala), the sutras frequently mention a set of "seven factors of enlightenment" (bojjangas). They are set out below:

**The Seven Factors of Enlightenment (Bojjangas)**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>sati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>dhammaviccaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>viriya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>piti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>passaddhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>samadhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>upekkha</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second of the bojjangas, dhammaviccaya (investigation of dhamma), appears wrongly positioned in the order. Due to dhammaviccaya's broad equivalence with dhamma/saddha/pabbajja, it seems appropriate to place it first in the list. Likewise, sati appears erroneously placed in the sequence. That is to say, elsewhere sati always comes after viriya. With the above in mind, the 'correct' sequence for the first three items would therefore be: dhammaviccaya, viriya, sati. Thereafter, piti, passaddhi, and samadhi follow in the correct order. By considering the accounts of the jhanas in the sutras, it is proper that item seven, equanimity (upekkha), should follow samadhi; as one-pointedness (ekaggata), samadhi is always present in the second, third, and fourth jhanas. Ekaggata is sometimes said to be present
also in the first jhāna.\textsuperscript{65} Upekkha, however, is found in the third and fourth jhānas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List I</th>
<th>List II</th>
<th>The 5 Powers</th>
<th>The 7 Bojjhangas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>1) dhamma/...</td>
<td>1) saddhā</td>
<td>2) dhammavicaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>2) sīla</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>3) indriya...</td>
<td>2) viriya</td>
<td>3) viriya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>4) sati</td>
<td>3) sati</td>
<td>1) sati</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4) pīti</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-I</td>
<td>5) jhānas</td>
<td>4) samādhi</td>
<td>6) samādhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O-Q</td>
<td>6-8) te-vijjā</td>
<td>5) paññā</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sila**

The first two stages of the Noble Path, right understanding (samma-ditthi) and right thought or aspiration (samma-sankappa), form the initial stage in the meditative path: the internalising of the Buddhist metaphysic. As such, samma-ditthi and samma-sankappa act as the initial development of knowledge leading to the gaining of paññā (full knowledge or intuitive wisdom) won by moral purity and concentration. As noted above, samma-ditthi and samma-sankappa alone do not represent paññā: indeed, it was demonstrated that the first two path factors, i.e. samma-ditthi and samma-sankappa, must now be included along with the three factors samma vācā, samma kammanta, and samma ājīva in the sīla division. Samma-ditthi is initiated from an intellectual understanding of the original condition of existence and developed by contemplating the Buddhist metaphysic. That is to say, the es-

\textsuperscript{65} See M.I.294 in addition to the Abhidhamma.
sential nature of phenomena becomes known by contemplating all the con­
stituents of material and mental existence as impermanent (anicca), suffering
or ill (dukkha) and not-self or impersonal (anattā). Sammā-sankappa is
thought free from sensuous desire, ill-will, and cruelty. Buddhist meditation
aims for the direct intuitive perception of these notions. When attained, such
intuition is known as paññā (wisdom). Full maturity of paññā engenders the
realisation of the various stages of purification culminating in the attainment
of complete liberation from all fetters.

The Buddhist Metaphysic
In the development of sammā-ditthi and sammā-sankappa, the Buddhist
metaphysic is taken up and internalised as an act of social conditioning
whereby one world-view is replaced by another. According to Griffiths,
Buddhist contemplative practices involve

... repeated meditations upon standard items of Buddhist doctrine -- the
four truths, the 12-fold chain of dependent origination and so forth -- until
these are completely internalized by practitioners and their cognitive and
perceptual systems operate only in terms of them. Such ... meditations are
designed, then, to remove standard cognitive and perceptual habit-patterns
and to replace them with new ones. Furthermore, these techniques are de­
signed to teach the practitioner something new about the way things are, to
inculcate in his consciousness a whole series of knowledges that such-and­
such is the case.67

66 See A.V.37.
67 Paul J. Griffiths, "The Attainment of Cessation in the Theravāda Tradition," in his On
Being Mindless: Buddhist Meditation and the Mind-Body Problem, (La Salle, Ill.: Open
Court, 1986, pp. 1-42), 13. Bronkhorst provides some support for the view that the
Buddhist metaphysic is taken up initially and internalised. Referring to the Four Noble
Truths, Bronkhorst states:
    Recognition of the Four Noble Truths culminates in knowledge of the path
    leading to the cessation of suffering. This is useful knowledge for someone
    who is about to enter upon this path, but it is long overdue for someone at
    the end of the road. Knowledge of the path must and does precede a person
    commencing upon it. This also applies to the Buddha himself [referring to
    M.I.246-247; S.V.438 etc.].
Bronkhorst, op. cit., p. 89.
In the synthesis of Buddhist doctrine and meditation, the means shapes the result. According to Alan L. Miller, the monastic environment which articulates and maintains the doctrine etc.

... is designed (1) to be a physical and institutional embodiment of the Path to enlightenment itself, and (2) to function as a conditioning agent which, when internalised in meditation, continues to play a significant role in the shaping of the Buddhist enlightenment experience.68

In the context of the sangha or community of Buddhist monks, the aspiring jhāyin consciously seeks to replace one conditioned view of existence with another without necessarily understanding the dynamics of how this is brought about.69 The Buddhist metaphysic, in association with the contemplative environment, represents a form of milieu control. In this context, the ideational content of the tradition becomes an important and necessary part of the contemplative practices. Commencing with a study of the basic doctrines regarding the Four Noble Truths and the path to release etc., the monk systematically attempts, by the cultivation of virtue, self-discipline etc., to remove certain unwholesome attitudes and to implant others in order to confirm the truth of the metaphysic via his inner experience.70

In Buddhism, self-discipline and restraint are expedient. Asceticism, however, is an unskilled state, i.e. when happiness is thought to be achieved through pain. In the Čuladukkhakkhandhasutta71, the Buddha refers to the meditation of several Jains (nigantha) whom he met. They stood erect refusing a seat. Their pain was "acute, painful, sharp, severe". Evil deeds, they be-

---

68 Alan L. Miller, "The Buddhist Monastery as a Total Institution," Ohio Journal of Religious Studies, (7 (1979), 15-29), 17. Here, Miller uses the term "conditioning" "... in the sense appropriate to the sociology of knowledge rather than that of behaviourism."

69 ibid., p. 16.

70 ibid., p. 27.

71 M.I.92-95.
lieve, are worn away by severe austerity. Not doing evil deeds in the future is from control of the mind and the body in this moment. By burning up (tapasa, incandescence) and ending former deeds, and by the avoidance of new deeds, there is "no flowing" (anavassavo) in the future. This, as the Jains see it, results in the destruction of all feeling and all ill. They admit to the Buddha their ignorance regarding the getting rid of unskilled states of mind and the method of generating skilled states here and now. As they see it, however, happiness is achieved through pain, not through happiness: if the contrary were true then one such as King Bimbisāra of Magadha would be happier than the venerable Gotama. The Buddha establishes his skill with the transformation of states by disclosing his ability to stay experiencing happiness for seven days and nights without moving his body and without speaking. The king, the Jains agree, is unable to do so. This being the case, the Buddha dwells more in happiness than King Bimbisāra. The Buddha notes:

Even so did I ... see the peril in unskilled states of mind, the vanity, the defilement, and the advantage, allied to cleansing, in renouncing them for skilled states of mind.\(^72\)

M.I.115

Thereafter, the thought of renunciation arises in him. He realises that:

This thought of renunciation has arisen in me, and it conduces neither to self-hurt nor does it conduce to the hurt of others nor does it conduce to the hurt of both, it is for growth in intuitive wisdom, it is not associated with distress, it is conducive to nibbāna.\(^73\)

M.I.116

In the disciplined efforts of the meditator, the means begin to shape the result insofar as the nature of concentration is qualified by prior training in morality (sīla). That is to say, "... concentration is not just any type of

\(^{72}\) Middle Length Sayings, v 1, p. 150.

\(^{73}\) ibid.
meditation practice, but precisely the concentration-born-of-sīla."\(^{74}\) With the subsequent development of insight (paññā) aided by sīla and this concentration, the attempts toward self-transformation result in

... the total assimilation of the new order such that one spontaneously -- that is without conscious direction of the will ... acts in accordance with that order.\(^{75}\)

This situation constitutes enlightenment.\(^{76}\)

In the context of the threefold training (tīviddha sikkhā), moral purity (sīla visuddhi) forms the necessary basis of concentration or meditation (as a means of mental purification). Determined by the Buddhist metaphysic, morality (sīla) is the primary and necessary support for right concentration (sammā samādhi). It eliminates impure thoughts, words, and actions and is, therefore, a necessary condition for right speech (sammā vācā), right action (sammā kammanta), and right livelihood (sammā āvajja).

The various precepts and numerous pātimokkha rules, i.e. the prohibitions and observances of monastic life, support the aspiration for control of the physical and mental activities essential for the maintenance of moral purity. The five precepts (pañcasīla)\(^{77}\) (pursued regularly by the Buddhist lay-

---

\(^{74}\) Alan L. Miller, "The Buddhist Monastery as a Total Institution," op. cit., p. 27.

\(^{75}\) ibid., p. 28.

\(^{76}\) J.M. Davidson's work supports the notion that doctrine shapes the enlightenment experience. However, he notes that, since the enlightenment experience ... is 'acognitive at its core,' it is misguided to suggest that it can be determined by cognitive variables though ... they do determine the way people talk about these experiences. This criticism would not affect the point that the initiation of the [enlightenment] experience (or other altered states) may be determined by pre-existing cognitive variables.


\(^{77}\) These moral rules are: (1) refraining from killing any sentient being, (2) from stealing, (3) from illicit sexual relations, (4) from lying, (5) from taking intoxicants.
Contemplative Practices in the Pāli Suttas

devotee, upāsaka) reflect a minimal standard of proper behaviour. Holy days and occasions of voluntary self-discipline call for the more exacting eight precepts (atthanga-sīla). The ten precepts (dasa-sīla) of novices leading to the full set of rules obligatory for a fully ordained monk complete a virtuous endeavour characterised by meticulousness. The Buddha advocates morality and the discipline thus:

... 'Come you, monk, be moral (sīla), live controlled by the control of the Obligations (pātimokkha), possessed of (right) behaviour and pasture (dāvāragocarasampanna), seeing danger in the slightest faults; undertaking them, train yourself in the rules of the training.'

M.III.134

The disciplinary rules of the monks provide an institutional structure whereby pleasures of the senses can be controlled for the pursuit of moral excellence in existence. To this end, pātimokkha rules call for purity of livelihood which avoids wrong means such as deceit etc. for fulfilling acceptable wants. Mendicancy is especially suitable. Physical health is important, also, for overcoming unwholesome conditions. Physical fitness is aided by chastity and training in moderate eating etc. In the Sangīti suttanta, ten bad and ten good ways of action are listed:

78 In addition to the above five rules, these precepts include: (6) abstaining from eating after midday, (7) from dancing, singing, theatrical performances, and from the wearing of perfumes, cosmetics etc., (8) from luxurious beds.

79 Here, the seventh precept of the atthanga-sīla is expanded into precepts seven and eight of the dasa-sīla; the eighth precept becomes the ninth; the tenth rule calls for abstaining from receiving gold and silver.

80 See also M.I.354-355.

Ten bad channels of action, to wit, taking life, theft, in­chastity, li­­ing, abuse, slander, idle talk, covetousness, malevolence, wrong views.
Ten good channels of action, to wit, abstention from all the foregoing.\(^{82}\)

Thus far, the gradual training in moral right action embodies adherence to the rules of monastic discipline. In addition, the performance of a harmless livelihood, by not inducing suffering in others, provides a means of sustenance in harmony with the jhāyin's pursuit. A proper mental attitude, furthermore, determines use of the four requisites of robes, almsfood, lodg­­ings, and medicine. The meditator, in this way, cultivates morality as a means of purifying the mind and, as a result, cleanses the subsequent actions issuing from volition. Together, the above provide a suitable foundation for the development of contemplative practices involving restraint of the senses etc. Sīla, when firmly established, acts as a foundation for the next phase in the gradual training: samādhi (concentration).

**Samādhi**

Concentration (samādhi), the second component of the threefold training (tividha sikkhā), constitutes the three path factors: right effort (samma-vāyama), right mindfulness (samma-sati), understood as diligent awareness or attentiveness with regard to activities etc. of the body and mind), and right concentration (samma-samādhi). In the Buddha's soteriological prescription, both right effort and and right mindfulness support right concentration.

**Sammā Vāyama: Right Effort**

Right effort (sammā vāyama) makes up the struggle (1) to abandon evil and unwholesome states of mind or things already manifested, (2) to prevent the arising of evil and unwholesome states or things not yet mani-

\(^{82}\) *Dialogues*, v 3, pp. 247.
Contemplative Practices in the *Pāli Suttas*

fested, (3) to arouse wholesome states or things not yet manifested, and (4) to maintain and develop wholesome states or things already manifested.\(^{83}\) *Sammā vāyāma* restrains the activities of the undisciplined mind in anticipation of the development of more refined states. To this end, cardinal virtues or faculties such as faith, energy, mindfulness, *samādhi*, wisdom etc. are developed and established as antidotes to unwholesome states and conditions antagonistic to concentration.\(^{84}\)

In the pursuit of *samādhi*, practice in restraint of the senses (*indriyesu guttadvāra*) deflects the initial arising of unwholesome states or situations and thus promotes wholesome, virtuous conditions.

... then the Tathāgata disciplines him further, saying: 'Come you, monk, be guarded as to the doors of the sense-organs (*indriya*). Having seen a material shape with the eye be not entranced by the general appearance, be not entranced by the detail. For if you dwell with the organ of sight uncontrolled, covetousness and dejection, evil unskilled states of mind, might flow in. So fare along for its control, guard the organ of sight, achieve control over the organ of sight. Having heard a sound with the ear ... Having smelt a smell with the nose ... Having savoured a taste with the tongue ... Having felt a touch with the body ... Having cognised a mental state with the mind, be not entranced by the general appearance, be not entranced by the detail. For if you dwell with the organ of mind uncontrolled, covetousness and dejection, evil unskilled states of mind, might flow in. So fare along for its control, guard the organ of mind, achieve control over the organ of mind.\(^{85}\)

M.III.134

Control over the sense-organs (*indriya*) equals bringing them to proper development (*bhāvanā*) wherein their influence can be eliminated: evenmindedness and equanimity result. That is to say, the senses submit eventually to "... the unhampered mind well liberated from reaction to sense

\(^{83}\) M.III.294-297.

\(^{84}\) M.II.479. See also S.V.199.

\(^{85}\) *Middle Length Sayings*, v 3, p.180.
impingement."  

Moderate eating enhances such sense restraint. It thus promotes further command of the mind. The jhāyin takes food simply for body maintenance. The old habit of desiring food for decadent reasons is banished by careful reflection. New feelings for self-indulgence in eating are not permitted to arise.

And when ... the ariyan disciple is guarded as to the doors of the sense-organs (indriya), then the Tathāgata disciplines him further, saying: 'Come you, monk, be moderate in eating (bhojane mattañnu). You should take food reflecting carefully, not for fun or indulgence or personal charm or beautification, but just enough for maintaining this body and keeping it going, for keeping it unharmed, for furthering the Brahma-faring, with the thought: Thus I am crushing out an old feeling, and I will not allow a new feeling to arise, and then there will be for me subsistence and blamelessness and abiding in comfort.'

M.III.134

Following moderation in eating for the generation of wholesome states, the Buddha encourages his disciple to purify the mind further by thwarting unwholesome states with wakefulness or sleep reduction.

When ... the ariyan disciple is moderate in eating, then the Tathāgata disciplines him further, saying: 'Come you, monk, abide intent on vigilance (jāgarayam anuyutto) during the day, while pacing up and down, while sitting down, cleanse the mind of obstructive mental states; during the first watch of the night while pacing up and down, while sitting down, cleanse the mind of obstructive mental states; during the middle watch of the night you should lie down on your right side in the lion posture, foot resting on foot, mindful, clearly conscious, reflecting on the thought of getting up again; during the last watch of the night when you have risen and are pacing up and down or sitting down, you should cleanse the mind of obstructive mental states.'

M.III.135

86 ibid., pp. xxx-xxxi referring to M.I.397-398.
87 ibid., p. 180. See also M.III.2.
88 ibid., pp. 180-181. See also M.III.3.
Essentially, Buddhist contemplative practices arising from right effort are aimed at converting unskilled states of mind to skilled states of mind, i.e. states which are conducive to nibbāna, via conscious, judicious effort.

**Skilled states of mind vs. unskilled states of mind**

Unskilled states are perilous. They are to be expelled and nullified. The stopping or cessation of unskilled psychological states induces a new, superior condition in consciousness. The Buddha identifies the problem thus:

> Monks, according to whatever a monk ponders and reflects on much his mind in consequence gets a bias that way.\(^{89}\)

M.I.115

This observation, in its simplicity, is perhaps the most astute of all statements in the Pāli Suttas regarding the human predicament and its rectification. The intention is, firstly, to recognise unwholesome mental conditions, then, secondly, to generate wholesome mental conditions by the concurrent setting up of mindfulness, the application of antidotes, the generation of concentration etc. The conditions are thus suitable for dispelling of ignorance and the arising of knowledge. Here, the Buddha recognises the polarity of unwholesome versus wholesome mental states and the conditions each generate. He then decides to get rid of the unwholesome states identified as thoughts of sense-pleasures, malevolence etc.:

Monks, before my awakening, while I was a bodhisatta, not fully awakened, this occurred to me: 'Suppose that I should fare along with a twofold thought?' So, monks, whatever is thought of sense-pleasures and whatever is thought of malevolence and whatever is thought of harming—that I made into one part; and whatever is thought of renunciation and whatever is thought of non-malevolence and whatever is thought of non-harming, that I made into the other part. While I ... was faring on thus, diligent ardent, self-resolute, thought of sense-pleasures arose, and I comprehended thus: 'This thought of sense-pleasures has arisen in me, but it conduces to self-hurt and it conduces to the hurt of others and it conduces to the hurt of both, it is destructive of intuitive wisdom, associated with dis-

\(^{89}\) *Middle Length Sayings*, v 1, p. 149. (My emphasis.)
tress, not conducive to nibbāna.' But while I was reflecting, 'It conduces to the self-hurt,' it subsided; and while I was reflecting, 'It conduces to the hurt of others,' it subsided; and while I was reflecting, 'It is destructive of intuitive wisdom, it is associated with distress, it is not conducive to nibbāna,' it subsided. So I, monks, kept on getting rid of the thought of sense-pleasures as it constantly arose, I kept on driving it out, I kept on making an end of it.

While I ... was faring on thus, ... thought of malevolence arose ... thought of harming arose, and I comprehended thus: 'This thought of malevolence ... of harming has arisen in me, but it conduces to self-hurt ... not conducive to nibbāna.' But while I was reflecting, 'It conduces to the self-hurt,' ... and while I was reflecting, 'It is ... not conducive to nibbāna,' it subsided. So I, monks, kept on getting rid of the thought of harming as it constantly arose, I kept on driving it out, I kept on making an end of it.90

M.I.114-115

Cognisance of the contraposition of unwholesome versus wholesome mental states (with the conditions each generate) leads to the resolution to get rid of the unwholesome states and thus remove the mind's adverse disposition. Such constitutes sammā vāyāma. The vital implications of negative bias in consciousness preclude the opportunity for salvation via renunciation etc. Existential suffering etc. results. The implications are stated thus:

Monks, if a monk ponder and reflect much on thought of sense-pleasures he ejects thought of renunciation; if he makes much of the thought of sense-pleasures, his mind inclines to the thought of sense-pleasures. Monks, if a monk ponder and reflect much on thought of malevolence ... on the thought of harming, he ejects the thought of non-harming, if he makes much of the thought of harming, his mind inclines to the thought of harming.91

M.I.115

The condition wherein thoughts of sense-pleasures etc. are pandered to and sustained, to the exclusion of the idea of renunciation, is likened to an unruly mob of cows; the cowherd, recognising the situation as involving death, imprisonment, or degradation, strikes the cows with a stick, restrains, and tethers them.

90 ibid.
91 ibid.
Contemplative Practices in the Pāli Suttas

Sammā vāyāma ensures a steady, one-pointed mind free from disturbances. In these conditions, wholesome thoughts such as non-harming etc. lead to the growth of intuitive wisdom, i.e., paññā.

... Monks, if a monk ponder and reflect much on thought of renunciation he ejects thought of sense-pleasures; if he makes much of the thought of renunciation, his mind inclines to the thought of renunciation. Monks, if a monk ponder and reflect much on the thought of non-malevolence ... of non-harming, he ejects thought of harming ... his mind inclines to the thought of non-harming.92

M.I.116

Thus the conversion from thoughts of sense-pleasures and malevolence to thoughts of renunciation and non-harming is the transmutation of consciousness from an unhealthy predicament to the ultimate healthy state.

Contemplative practices which aid the wholesome change of consciousness include the development of the four higher sentiments: i.e. loving-kindness (mettā), compassion (karunā), altruistic or sympathetic joy (muditā), and equanimity (upekṣā).93

The divine abodes (brahma-viharas)
Cultivation of these four sublime or divine abodes (brahma-vihāra)94 constitutes the moral basis and necessary preparation for the overall training of the religious candidate. The stereotype sutta account on the development of the four higher sentiments depicts the jhāyaṇa filling his mind with mettā, pervading the four directions plus above and below. He then identifies with everything while pervading the whole world with a mind full of mettā.95

92 ibid.

93 Oldenberg considers that these practices antedate Buddhism. Oldenberg, op. cit., p. 227.

94 According to Oldenberg, the term brahma-vihāra for mettā, etc. suggests Brahmanic origin -- perhaps yogic in origin. Ibid., p. 281.

95 See, for example, A.V.344-345 and the Tevijja-sutta, D.I.250-251.
meditation counters hate and ill-will. This meditation, along with the habitual mental attitude of the jhâyin to the external world, has special significance for the practitioner of jhânic states. The meditator with developed mettâ practices non-harmfulness both to himself and to others. The Upâli Sutta\textsuperscript{96} states that jhâyins who have attained jhâna and psychic powers (but have yet to develop mettâ) can annihilate others and perhaps themselves through their anger. This indicates directly the ability of concentration to empower both wholesome and unwholesome thoughts and emotions. Mettâ undermines and counters mental disturbance.

The jhâyin continues in the same fashion with karunâ, muditâ, and upekkhâ. Vajirañâna raises the question here of a tenuous link of this meditation with the Upanisads by arguing against a direct theoretical connection with other schools. The cultivation of loving-kindness, i.e. mettâ (Sanskrit: maitrî), as one essential quality of yoga suggests the Upanisadic connection. Chapter three above notes the possible cross-fertilisation of Buddhist meditative practices with the Upanisadic form by indicating the significance of yogic practices (appropriated and synthesised with worship) in the late Maitrî Upanisad. The Maitrî states that such worship/meditation (upâsanâ) generates the realisation of Brahman by holding intensely a symbol of Brahman in the mind to the exclusion of all else. Similarly, the suttas assert that meditative practice of the four brahma-viharas conduces to rebirth in the Brahma-world or companionship with the Brahma gods. Vajirañâna argues against any theoretical correspondence between the Brahma-world with its gods and Brahman. He does not, however, argue against the possibility of the appropriation and modification of this and similar practices by the Upanisadic worshippers to bring about their higher reality. Vajirañâna states:

\textsuperscript{96}M.I.378.
It is possible that the term Brahma-vihāra and the exercise introduced by it have direct connection with other schools... According to the Buddhist Scriptures, this practice is held to have been current as an ascetic ideal long before the rise of Gotama Buddha. From the Buddhist point of view Brahmās means the higher beings born in the Rūpa-world by virtue of meditation. The path to that world, as set forth in this Sutta, is purely Buddhistic... the Haliddavasana Sutta shows that the practice [i.e. metta] can be traced in other schools; but it explains that the Buddhist practice, though not opposed to others in outlook, yet differs greatly in method and results.

In the Buddhist system the Brahma-viharas lead to Nirvāṇa as the ultimate goal; but if they are not developed to that height, the immediate result is the attainment of the Brahma-world. So we read in reference to Mettā, "If he should realise no higher condition (Arhatship), he is re-born in the Brahma-world."97

Cultivation of these and similar contemplations aims generally to replace unwholesome states of mind with wholesome states by the selection of suitable subjects of meditation. Thereafter, the four applications of mindfulness (catu-satipatthāna),98 via their attention to the characteristics of existence, specifically set the stage for the realisation of release.

Sammā Sati: Right Mindfulness

In order to aid the development of a steady, one-pointed mind and the growth of intuitive wisdom, the suttas describe a simple, efficient means of extending intellectual understanding, i.e. the practice of being mindful (sati)99 and self-possessed (sampajāna).

... Let a brother, O mendicants, be mindful and self-possessed (satisampajāna); this is our instruction to you.100

D.II.94

98 The two Satipatthāna Suttas: D.II.290-315, and M.I.55-63 give a thorough discussion of satipatthāna.
99 While noting the close connection of sati with the jhānas as well as its independent description in the Buddhist canon, Bronkhorst suggests that sati "... may have been borrowed from outside movements, because it appears to be known to Jainism." Bronkhorst, op. cit., p. 89.
100 Dialogues, v 2, p. 101. See also D.I.70; A.II.210 etc.
The word "sampajāna", meaning "thoughtful, mindful, attentive, deliberate", is almost synonymous with sati. In the Pâli Suttas, the term "sati" (Sanskrit: smṛti) meaning "memory, recognition etc." is used generally in the context of "intentness of mind, wakefulness of mind, or mindfulness". In Buddhism, sati generates both discernment and clear understanding of the nature of existence coupled with causal conditions. Together, sati and sampajāna refer to the conscious application of bare attention qualified by self-control.

The importance of being self-possessed (sampajāna) and mindful (sati) is one of the lessons most frequently inculcated in the Pâli Suttas. It constitutes the subject of the Mahâ-Satipatthâna Suttanta in the Dīgha Nikāya, the Satipatthâna Suttanta of the Majjhima Nikāya, and the Satipatthâna Samyutta of the Samyutta Nikāya. The doctrine also features in different sections of the Anguttara Nikāya. The requirements for becoming self-possessed (sampajāna) and gaining right mindfulness (sammā sati) are set out as follows:

And how does a brother become self-possessed (sampajāna)?

He acts, O mendicants, in full presence of mind whatever he may do, in going out or coming in, in looking forward or in looking round, in bending in his arm or in stretching it forth, in wearing his robes or in carrying his bowl, in eating or drinking, in masticating or swallowing, in obeying the calls of nature, in walking or standing or sitting, in sleeping or waking, in talking and being silent.102

D.II.94-95

And what, bhikkhus, is right mindfulness (sammā-sati)?

Herein, O bhikkhus, a brother, as to the body, continues so to look upon the body (kāya), that he remains ardent, self-possessed and mindful (sati), having overcome both the hankering and the dejection common in the world. And in the same way as to feelings (vedanā), thoughts (citta)

101 D.I.19, III.31,49,213,270 sq.; A.I.95 etc.

102 Dialogues, v 2, pp. 249-250. See also M.II.135.
and ideas (*dhamma*), he so looks upon each, that he remains ardent, self-possessed and mindful (*sati*), having overcome both the hankering and the dejection common in the world. This is what is called right mindfulness (*samma-sati*).\(^{103}\)

**D.II.313.**

Aiming for control, the *jhāyin* extends, deepens, and applies mindfulness in four ways, i.e. the four *satipatthānas.*\(^{104}\)

**Catu-satipatthāna: the four applications of mindfulness**

*Samma sati* involves the application of mindfulness (*sati*) and clear awareness (*sampajañña*) to contemplating body (*kāyānupassanā*), feelings (*vedanānupassanā*), mind (*cittānupassanā*), and mind-objects (*dhammānupassanā*). The Buddha advocates mindfulness and clear awareness at all times and in every action:

> Come you, monk, be possessed of mindfulness and clear consciousness (*satisampajaññena*). Be one who acts with clear consciousness whether you are setting out or returning\(^{105}\) ... looking down or looking around ... bending back or stretching out (the arm) ... carrying the outer cloak, the bowl, the robe ... munching, drinking, savouring ... obeying the calls of nature ... walking, standing, sitting, asleep, awake, talking, silent.\(^{106}\)

**M.III.135**

The *Satipatthāna Sutta* is one of a number of discourses instructing the *jhāyin* in a means towards overcoming the hindrances (*nīvarana*) by working specifically and directly at mental purification.\(^{107}\) The *jhāyin* must abolish the five *nīvarana* as qualities obstructing clear discernment of the truth. This method employs mindful observation of the hindrances them-

\(^{103}\) ibid., p. 344. See also D.II.94 and M.I.42.

\(^{104}\) M.III.136.

\(^{105}\) See also M.I.274-275.

\(^{106}\) *Middle Length Sayings*, v 3, p. 181.

selves as a practice for eventually undermining their grip on the meditator. The same basic preparation seen in the gradual training applies, i.e. moral discipline, sense-restraint, mindfulness and discernment, and contentment. The method of mindfulness contemplates directly both bodily and mental phenomena to gain insight. The term "anupassanā" included in the compounds kāyānupassanā, vedānānupassanā, cittānupassanā, and dhammānupassanā, equates with viewing, considering, or contemplating of anicca, dukkha and anattā.

The suttas depict the Buddha teaching numerous disciples meditative practices consistent with their individual temperaments and stages of proficiency. Consequently, the meditations become intricate. No aspect of daily life lies beyond mindfulness and clear awareness. While right effort (samma vāyāma) exerts the mind, right mindfulness (samma sati) serves to stabilise it. Both sustain the third path factor of training in higher mentality: right concentration (samma-samādhi).

The satipatthāna meditation comprises many methods encompassing the contemplation of transitoriness (aniccānupassanā108), of suffering

---

108 Regarding the impermanence of body, feeling, perception, and consciousness, the Buddha questions Ananda thus:

If they were to ask you, Ananda, "Friend Ananda, what are the things in which is discerned uprising, in which is discerned passing away, in which is discerned otherwiseness while they last?" What would you reply to such a question?

... It is of body, friends, that uprising is discerned, that passing away is discerned, that otherwiseness while it lasts is discerned. It is of feeling, of perception, of the activities, of consciousness that uprising is discerned. These are the things, friends, in which uprising and so on is discerned. Thus questioned, lord should I make answer.

Well said! Well said, Ananda! It is indeed of body, ... and of feeling, of perception, of the activities, of consciousness.

S.III.37

(dukkhānupassanā) and of non-self or soullessness (anattānupassanā). Mindful observation of the flux of mental processes associated with the hindrances, along with the observed transience of phenomena, provides the means for attaining initial insight into the the marks of existence.

The meditations include contemplation on the components of the individual. These fall into different categories where they become determined as anicca, dukkha, and anatta consecutively. This represents "methodical insight" (naya-vipassanā).

Initially, the practice of satipatthāna makes no effort generally to directly develop concentration. Rather, the jhāyin contemplates initially the rise and fall of physical and mental phenomena from moment to moment in order to impress upon his mind the Buddhist notions regarding the nature of being. Such practice, with sufficient application, cultivates the opportunity for knowledge leading to self-purification to overcome fully the hindrances. Consequently, mindfulness of the hindrances etc. represents a particular route to the development of serenity and full insight should the contemplator be so disposed. The temperament of the jhāyin may dictate alternative primary emphasis on other aspects of the course of practice. The Jana-Vasabha-Suttanta (Jana-Vasabha's Story) depicts the jhāyin developing bare attention followed by concentration and calm before evoking knowledge and insight into the aggregates. Brahmā Sanamkumāra addresses the Thirty-Three Gods:

Now what think ye, my lord gods, Thirty-and-Three, of the completeness wherewith the Exalted One, who knows, who sees, ... hath revealed the Four Inceptions of Mindfulness (the four satipatthānas) for attaining to the Good. And which are the Four? Take, Sirs, a brother who abides subjectively watchful over the body, ardent self-possessed mindful,

---

109 See M.I.8, 190; S.III.167; Patisambhidāmagga I.57; II.57, 63 etc.
110 ibid. See Patisambhidāmagga I.53.
111 Mindfulness can develop deep concentration. See ānāpānasati below.
that he may discern the unhappiness arising from coveting the things of the world. So, subjectively watchful, he attains to right concentration and right calm. He, having right concentration and right calm in his physical being, evokes knowledge of and insight into all other physical forms external to himself. So, again, he abides subjectively watchful over his feelings ... over his heart, ... over his ideas, ardent self-possessed mindful, that he may discern the unhappiness arising from coveting the things of the world. So, subjectively watchful, he attains to right concentration and right calm. He, having right concentration and right calm in his feelings ... his heart ... his ideas, evokes knowledge of and insight into the ideas of others external to himself.\textsuperscript{112}

D.II.216-217.

Mindfulness encompasses both bare attention and concentrated attention to the body, feelings etc. before gaining knowledge and insight. The body, being the agent of consciousness on the physical sphere, supports the mind in its operations regarding all feelings and various states.

**Kāyānupassanā: mindfulness of body**

Mindfulness of the body promotes wholesome knowledge of impermanence, suffering, impersonality etc.

\ldots by whomsoever mindfulness relating to body (kāyāgatasati) is practised and made much of and plunged into, -- in him exist all good states whatsoever that have a part in wisdom.\textsuperscript{113}

A.I.43

Monks, these six things are parts of wisdom. What six?

The idea of impermanence, the idea of the ill in impermanence, the idea of not-self in ill, the idea of renunciation, of dispassion, of ending.\textsuperscript{114}

A.III.334

\textsuperscript{112} ibid., pp. 249-250. A similar reference associating concentration immediately with satipathāna occurs in the Satipathāna Samyutta, S.V.144-145. It enjoins:

Come ye, friends, do ye abide in body contemplating body (as transient), ardent, composed and one-pointed, (ekodibhūtā), of tranquil mind (vipassanacittā), of concentrated mind (ekaggacittā) for insight (ākāna) into body as it really is. [The same follows for feelings, mind, and mind-states.]

Note that the translator renders the term "vipassanacittā" as "tranquil mind". A more accurate treatment might be "insightful mind". Kindred Sayings, v 5, pp. 123-124.

\textsuperscript{113} Gradual Sayings, v 1, p. 39.

\textsuperscript{114} Gradual Sayings, v 3, p. 235.
The development of mindfulness of the body, according to the *Kāyagatāsatisutta*, includes mindfulness of breathing (*ānāpānasati*), the disposition of the body, i.e. the four postures etc. as a means of eliminating unwholesome thoughts and aspirations as well as promoting concentration.

... a monk who is forest-gone ... sits down cross-legged, holding his back erect, arousing mindfulness (*sati*) in front of him. Mindful he breathes in, mindful he breathes out. Whether he is breathing in ... breathing out a long (breath) ... a short (breath), he comprehends, 'I am breathing in ... out a long (breath) ... a short (breath).' He trains himself thinking, 'I will breathe in ... out experiencing the whole body ... tranquillising the activity of body.' ... While he is thus diligent, ardent, self-resolute, those memories and aspirations that are worldly are got rid of; by getting rid of them the mind itself is inwardly settled, calmed, focussed, concentrated. Thus, monks, does a monk develop mindfulness of body.\(^{115}\)

M.III.89

In addition to mindfulness of breathing, the development of mindfulness extends to clear awareness when walking, standing still, sitting down, lying down etc.

... And again, monks, when a monk is walking he comprehends, 'I am walking'; or when he is standing still he comprehends, 'I am standing still'; or when he is sitting down he comprehends, 'I am sitting down'; or when he is lying down he comprehends, 'I am lying down.' So that however his body is disposed he comprehends that it is like that. While he is thus ... the mind itself is inwardly settled, calmed, focussed, concentrated. [And so on for setting out, returning, bending, stretching etc.]\(^{116}\)

M.III.89-90

Further, the meditator reflects precisely on the parts of the body with its various impurities and its placement with regard to the elements of extension, cohesion, radiation, and motion.\(^{117}\) When the body is misunderstood it becomes both hindrance and enslavement. Attachment to the physical body represents one of the ten fetters binding beings to rebirth with its subsequent

\(^{115}\) *Middle Length Sayings*, v 3, p. 130.

\(^{116}\) ibid., pp. 130-131.

\(^{117}\) M.III.89-90.
suffering. Proper analysis of the body reveals various elemental constituents such as skin, hair, nails, teeth etc. all of which are impure and loathsome. Furthermore, it reveals that the body is prone to disease and decay. This ontological quality and process becomes the object for realisation via contemplation. The Buddha says:

Of that brother, brethren, who is versed in conformity to the Norm \(\text{(anudhammo)}\), this is the accordant practice. He should abide in the utter disgust for body, for feeling, for perception, for the activities, for consciousness. So abiding in utter disgust for these, he fully discerns body, feeling, perception, from the activities, from consciousness.

Fully understanding these he is released from body, from feeling, from perception, from the activities, from consciousness: likewise from rebirth, from old age and decay, sorrow and grief, from woe, lamentation and despair. I declare him to be released from suffering.\(^{118}\)

S.III.40-41

Mindfulness or contemplation of the body \(\text{(kāyānupassāna)}\), with realisation of the elemental nature of the physical body, rids consciousness of misconceptions concerning notions of individuality. This provides the formative insight for the attainment of \text{nibbāna}. When practised with feelings of disgust at the loathsomeness of the body, it cleanses the mind of desires.\(^{119}\) With continued training, the meditation induces jhānic states. As such it establishes the path of serenity leading to higher knowledge, psychic powers, and full insight.\(^{120}\)

Some of the most significant contemplations of this type are meditations on impurities or foulness in order to counteract different temperaments. For example, the \text{suttas} recommend meditation on a corpse.

\(^{118}\) \textit{Kindred Sayings}, v 3, pp. 36-37. The passage continues in the same manner as the above, but treated in respect of seeing the impermanence \(\text{(aniccānupassāna)}\), the suffering \(\text{(dukkhānupassāna)}\), the lack of a self in all of these \(\text{(anatthānupassāna)}\).

\(^{119}\) As an object of \textit{samādhi} meditation, \textit{kāyagatāsati} is recommended for those of a lustful disposition.

\(^{120}\) \textit{Kāyagatāsati Sutta} (M.III.88).
This cemetery contemplation (sivathikā), comprising both samatha and the early development of insight (vipassanā), is part of the contemplation of the body (kāyānupassanā satipatthāna). Essentially, the practice internalises and reinforces the Buddhist notions of the three marks of existence: impermanence (anicca), suffering (dukkha), and impersonality (anattā), unlike Upanisadic contemplative practices which internalise symbols of Brahman understood to be eternal.

The meditator perceives that the physical body represents not only a source of endless annoyance but also a fetter binding one to the misery of cyclic existence. Full realisation of the transitory nature of the body engenders the opportunity to escape this suffering. To this end, the suttas recommend various forms of meditating on a corpse to counteract the different types of fleshly disposition in jhāyins.

Vajirānāna notes that the practice of meditation on foulness seems to be exclusively Buddhist. Its occurrence in the monastic rules (vinaya) suggests its introduction during the very early growth of the teaching. Although the loathsomeness of the body was widely appreciated among early Indian sages, this method of meditating upon a dead body is yet to be discovered in any non-Buddhist system of India.

The Satipatthāna Sutta lists nine stages of decomposition of a corpse found thrown into an area to rot as opposed to being burned or buried. These repulsive sights, if contemplated with the sincere desire to overcome hindrances such as lust etc., bring about joy commensurate with the degree of

121 See D.II.290-298 and M.I.119-120.
122 See M.I.424 and A.IV.357.
123 See Vajirānāna, op. cit., p. 167.
124 See M.I.158.
mental concentration employed. This meditation can be terrifying and dangerous. Visiting the cemetery at an unsuitable hour to generate vivid visualisation on a dead body may create the illusion of the corpse rising to pursue the jhāyin. The subsequent terror profoundly affects the meditator, to the degree that he is described as "running away from jhāna" (jhāna-vibbhantaka). These dreadful thoughts are counteracted by gathering courage, by establishing mindfulness, and by considering the fact that a corpse cannot rise to pursue anyone. The meditator then convinces himself that the source of the illusion is in his imagination. He thus replaces the fear with joy to gain success in contemplation. The awe-inspiring vision demonstrates powerfully the creative ability of the mind when concentrated.\(^{125}\) The meditation thus removes hindrances and generates the opportunity for insight (vipassanā) into the decaying nature of existence while reinforcing the desire to escape birth, decay, and death.

In a manner similar to meditation on a corpse, the Satipatthāna Sutta recommends meditation on the four elements (dhātuvavatthāna)\(^{126}\) as part of the contemplation of the body. Here, the meditator engages the analysis of the four elements of his body, i.e. the synthesis of the ingredients earth, water, fire, and air, to consider the absence of any individual or abiding entity therein. Repeated attention to the basic character of the body eventually banishes any notion of individuality. Food sustains the four elements comprising the physical complex. This represents a source of craving, sensual stimulation, and attachment. To counter these unwholesome mental states, the jhāyin

\(^{125}\) See Vajirañāna, op. cit., p. 175.

\(^{126}\) M.I.58 uses the simile of a butcher who, having slaughtered a cow, divides it into separate pieces. Similarly, the meditator contemplates his body with relation to the four elements to eliminate the idea of individuality. D.II.290-314, M.I.184-191, II.420-426, and III.237-247 explain the practice in detail. D.II.290-314 and M.I.118-122 offer a condensed form of this practice.
contemplates the loathsomeness of nutriment with its associated body functions.

The meditation involves developing the awareness that the conditions related to obtaining sustenance represent impediments to following the religious life. That is to say, the meditator must abandon frequently the contemplative practices etc. to search and beg for food. Thereafter, the nutriment requires preparation, eating, subsequent digestion, and elimination. As an object of meditation, the complete digestive process with its production of gases and waste products etc. is described as thoroughly abhorrent. Repeated practice of the contemplation of the loathsomeness of nutriment eliminates hindrances, encourages control of the senses, and engenders realisation of the transient nature of phenomena. The perception of the three marks related to the transience of existence, i.e. anicca, dukkha and anattā, are held in consciousness while the meditator develops further the recollection or mindfulness of death (maranasati).\(^\text{127}\)

To develop this recollection, the jhāyin, for example, reflects on the numerous possibilities for dying such as venomous bites, poisoning, murder etc. He considers immediate personal states of an unwholesome nature that would lead him to suffering should he die presently. The realisation of this stimulates energy and resolution to overcome these unwholesome conditions.

Other subjects of meditation include meditation on calmness\(^\text{128}\) wherein the mind becomes inclined to realise that condition. Complete devotion to this practice thus brings about untroubled states, i.e. the senses become quietened. Thereafter craving ceases.

\(^{127}\) See A.III.304; IV.317; 8.74.

\(^{128}\) The Jhāna-vagga of the Anguttara Nikāya notes this as part of a list of meditations. See A.I.38-46.
Vedanānupassanā: mindfulness of feelings

The contemplation of all feelings (vedanānupassāna) concerns the clear perception of the various agreeable, disagreeable, and indifferent feelings of both body and mind. The Satipatthānasutta states the method for developing mindfulness of feelings -- the judicious application of which results in detached independence:

And how, monks, does a monk fare along contemplating feelings in feelings (vedantsa vedanānupassāna)? Herein, monks, while he is experiencing a pleasant feeling (sukham vedanam) he comprehends: 'I am experiencing a pleasant feeling;' while he is experiencing a painful feeling (dukkham vedanam) he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a painful feeling;' while he is experiencing a feeling that is neither painful nor pleasant (adukkham asukham) he comprehends: 'I am experiencing a feeling that is neither painful nor pleasant.' While he is experiencing a pleasant feeling in regard to material things ... in regard to non-material things he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a pleasant feeling in regard to non-material things;' while he is experiencing a painful feeling in regard to material things ... in regard to non-material things he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a painful feeling in regard to material things ... in regard to non-material things he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a feeling that is neither painful nor pleasant in regard to material things ... in regard to non-material things he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a feeling that is neither painful nor pleasant in regard to material things ... in regard to non-material things he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a feeling that is neither painful nor pleasant in regard to material things ... in regard to non-material things he comprehends, 'I am experiencing a feeling that is neither painful nor pleasant in regard to non-material things.' This he fares along contemplating the feelings in feelings internally ... externally ... internally and externally. Or he fares along contemplating origination-things in the feelings, ... dissolution-things ... origination-dissolution-things in the feelings. Or, thinking, 'There is feeling,' his mindfulness is established precisely to the extent necessary just for knowledge, just for remembrance, and he fares along independently of and not grasping anything in the world.129

M.I.59

By recognising how feelings come about as well as the suffering and transiency inherent in feelings, the meditator frees himself.

There are these three feelings, brethren. What three? Feeling that is pleasant, feeling that is painful, and feeling that is neither pleasant nor painful. These, brethren, are the three feelings.

Collected, 'Ware, the mindful follower
Of the Awakened One well understands
Feelings, and how they come to be, and where
They cease, and what the way to feelings' end.
That brother who hath ended them, therefor
No longer hungereth. He is set free.

129 Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 75-76.
There are these three feelings, brethren...

Pleasure or pain or feeling that is neither,
The inner and the outer, all that's felt --
He knows to be ill. He sees the world
False, perishable. He see, by contact with it,
That it is transient, and frees himself.

... when a brother, ardent (in his task),
Lets not his mind run riot, thereupon
That wise one every feeling understands.

There are these three feelings, brethren...

Pleasant feelings, brethren, should be regarded as ill. Painful feelings as a barb. Neutral feelings should be regarded as impermanence.

When a brother regards pleasant feelings as ill, painful feelings as a barb, neutral feelings as impermanence, such a one is called ... 'rightly seeing.' He has cut off craving, broken the bond, by perfect comprehension of conceit he has made an end of ill.130

S.IV.204-207

Nyanaponika draws attention the crucial position of feeling in the Buddhist formula of conditioned origination (patīccasamuppāda), which shows the conditioned arising of suffering. Feeling represents the primary reaction to any sense impression and, as such, has the potential to originate craving and further clinging with subsequent suffering.

Sense impression is said to be the principal condition of feeling (phassa-paccayā vedanā), while Feeling, on its part, is the potential condition of Craving, and subsequently, of more intense, Clinging (vedanā-paccayā tanhā, tanhā-paccayā upādānam).131

By making feeling the object of mindfulness, feeling loses its emotional weight, egocentric reference, and thus its potential to bring about craving etc.

130 Kindred Sayings, v 4, pp. 136-139.
Cittânupassanâ: mindfulness of consciousness

The contemplation of the state of the mind (cittânupassanâ) similarly employs the clear perception of the consciousness in general as it appears in its various moods and states. The Satipatthânasutta states the method as follows:

And how, monks, does a monk fare along contemplating mind in mind (cîtte cîtanupassî)? Herein, monks, a monk knows intuitively the mind with attachment as a mind with attachment; he knows intuitively the mind without attachment as a mind without attachment ... the mind with hatred as a mind with hatred ... the mind without hatred as a mind without hatred ... the mind with confusion as a mind with confusion ... the mind without confusion ... the mind that is contracted ... the mind that is distracted ... the mind that has become great as a mind that has become great ... a mind that has not become great as a mind that has not become great ... the mind with (some other mental state) superior to it ... the mind with no (other mental state) superior to it ... the mind that is composed as a mind that is composed ... the mind that is not composed as a mind that is not composed ... the mind that is freed as a mind that is freed ... the mind that is not freed as a mind that is not freed ... Thus he fares along contemplating the mind in the mind internally ... externally ... internally and externally. Or he fares along contemplating origination-things ... dissolution-things ... origination-dissolution things in the mind. Or thinking, 'there is mind,' his mindfulness is established precisely to the extent necessary just for knowledge, just for remembrance, and he fares along independently of and not grasping anything in the world.

Examination of consciousness in this way helps rob it of notions of permanence and egocentricity while enhancing its wholesome power of discrimination. The Buddha teaches the immediate use of cittânupassanâ.

Then again, ... as regards mind ... a brother being conscious of a mind-state with mind experiences mind-states, conceives a passion for them, and of that passion for mind-states which exists for him personally he is aware, "I have a passion for mind-states." Now in so far as he is thus aware of his personal passion for mind-states, I say the Norm is of immediate use, apart from time, bidding one come to see, leading on, to be experienced, each for himself, by the wise.

132 Translator notes "The mind fallen into sloth and torpor".

133 Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 76-77.

134 Kindred Sayings, v 4, p. 21.
The Sālayatana Samyutta states a method utilising mindful discrimination for affirming insight regarding the states of mind. In response to a question, the Buddha says:

There is indeed a method, brethren, by following which a brother ... could affirm insight (aṭṭhamānyadeyya) ... And what is that method? ...

... cognizing a mind-state with the mind, ... is that recognition to be understood by belief or inclination, by hearsay, by argument as to method, by reflection on reasons, by delight in speculation? Are not these states to be understood by seeing them with the eye of reason?

Surely, lord.

Then, brethren, that is the method by following which a brother, apart from belief ... could affirm insight.\textsuperscript{135}

S.IV.138-139

Also included in the four applications of mindfulness is mindfulness of mental-objects (dhammānupassanā).

\textsuperscript{135} ibid., pp. 88-89.
Dhammânupassanâ\textsuperscript{136}: mindfulness of mind-objects

The contemplation of mental objects or ideas (dhammânupassanâ) from various points of view concerns the five hindrances (niñvarana), i.e. sensuous desire, ill-will, sloth and torpor, restlessness and scruples, and doubt. Additionally, the same attitude of bare attention to ideas or mental objects (dhammâ) from various points of view involves the five aggregates (khandhas), dispositions, the "Six Internal and External Spheres of Sense" and the fetters that arise because of them, the "Seven Factors of Enlightenment", and the Four Noble Truths. From the viewpoint of the hindrances:

... Herein, monks, a monk fares along contemplating mental objects (dhammû) in mental objects from the point of view of the five hindrances (niñvarana). And how, monks, does a monk fare along contemplating mental objects in mental objects from the point of view of the five hindrances? Herein, monks, when a subjective desire for sense-pleasures is present, a monk comprehends that he has a subjective desire for sense-pleasures; or when a subjective desire for sense-pleasures is not present he comprehends that he has no subjective desire for sense-pleasures. And in so far as there comes to be an uprising of desire for sense-pleasures that had not arisen before, he comprehends that; and in so far as there comes to be a getting rid of desire for sense-pleasures that has arisen, he comprehends that. And in so far as there comes to be no future uprising of desire for the sense-plea-

\textsuperscript{136} There is some difficulty with the meaning of "dhamma". This complex term is said to be derived from "dha", "to hold, support; that which forms a foundation and upholds". Buddhaghosa gives a variety of meanings. At Dīgha Nikāya Commentary 1.99 and Dhammapada Commentary 1.22 he renders the term as: (1) applied to good conduct; (2) to preaching and moral instruction; (3) to the nine-fold collection of Buddhist scriptures; and (4) to cosmic law. Buddhaghosa provides another fourfold meaning at Dhammasangani Commentary 38: (1) doctrine as formulated; (2) condition or causal antecedent; (3) moral quality or action; and (4) "the phenomenal" as opposed to "the substantial", "the noumenal", "animistic entity". Rhys Davids and Stede interpret "dhamma" by a fourfold connotation: doctrine, right or righteousness, condition, phenomenon. According to Rhys Davids and Stede, in its psychological application and meaning, dhamma refers to "...mentality as the constitutive element of cognition & of its substratum, the world of phenomena. It is that which is presented as "object" to the imagination & as such has an effect of its own:- a presentation ... or idea, ... or purely mental phenomenon as distinguished from a psycho-physical phenomenon, or sensation ...." That is to say, a mental object or idea. See T.W. Rhys Davids & William Stede, Pāli-English Dictionary, (New Delhi: Oriental Books Reprint Corporation, 1975; 1st publ. 1921-25), pp. 335-336. In this section, the word is translated "mind-effects" or "ideas". Thomas states that; "Dhamma may mean 'thing' in general, but [in the present context] it is used of the things in the mind, thoughts, or ideas. Mind is treated as one of the senses, the sixth internal sense, and dhammas are its object, just as sights and sounds are objects of other senses." Edward J. Thomas, The History of Buddhist Thought, (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1971, 1st publ. 1933), p. 54. For a detailed examination of this complex term from a philosophical standpoint, see Stcherbatsky, op. cit.
sures that has been got rid of, he comprehends that. [The paragraph is repeated for ill-will, sloth and torpor, restlessness and scruples, and doubt.]

... It is thus that he fares along contemplating mental objects in mental objects internally, or he fares along contemplating mental objects in mental objects externally, he fares along contemplating mental objects in mental objects internally, or he fares along contemplating mental objects in mental objects internally and externally.13

M.I.60-62

The practice of mindful attention to ideas or mental objects (from the point of view of the five hindrances) thus helps weaken the hold these hindrances possess over the mind of the jhāyin by creating the opportunity to generate wholesome mind objects etc. When rid of its base proclivities (i.e. the mental defilements etc.) hindering the functioning of insight, consciousness becomes self-confident, free from remorse, fearless, and cool. As such, consciousness is pliable and wholesome (kusala). In this way, it is suited for further transformation to more refined and sublime states. From the point of view of the five aggregates (khandhas), the meditator considers ideas (dhammā) and reflects:

... Such is material form, such is its genesis, such is its passing away; such is feeling -- perception -- the mental activities -- such is cognition, its genesis, its passing away.138

D.II.302

The contemplation of ideas (dhammā) continues in this way as to dispositions as well as the "Six Internal and External Spheres of Sense", i.e. the organs and objects of sight, hearing, smell etc., and their resultant fetters. Thereafter,

... a brother, as to ideas (dhammā), continues to consider ideas with respect to the Seven Factors of Enlightenment. And how does he do this?


138 Dialogues, v 2, pp. 335-336.
Herein, ... a brother, if there be present to him subjectively mindfulness as a factor of enlightenment, is aware that it is present. Or if it be absent, he is subjectively aware of its absence. And how there comes an uprising of such mindfulness not hitherto uprisen -- of that, too, is he aware; and how there comes a full development of such mindfulness when it has arisen -- of that too is he aware. And so too with respect to the other subjective factors of enlightenment: search the truth, energy, joy, serenity, rapture, equanimity .... [and similarly for the Four Noble Truths].\textsuperscript{139}

In addition to the \textit{catu-satipatthāna}, the \textit{suttas} recommend other forms of mindfulness.

\textbf{The six recollections (anussati).}

Isolation in lonely places, such as a forest or a cemetery provides the opportunity for the arising of fears and dangers during meditation. To maintain a safeguard and a defence against such occurrences, the \textit{jhāyin} develops mindfulness on six recollections (\textit{anussati}):

\begin{table}
\begin{tabular}{|l|}
\hline
1) the Buddha \\
2) the Doctrines \hspace{1cm} \textit{Dhamma} \\
3) the order of Buddhist monks \hspace{1cm} \textit{Sangha} \\
4) morality \hspace{1cm} \textit{sīla} \\
5) generosity \hspace{1cm} \textit{cāga} \\
6) the gods \hspace{1cm} \textit{devatā} \\
\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

The \textit{suttas} cite these as "a list of subjects to be kept in mind (\textit{anussati-tthāni})".\textsuperscript{140} When practised, the first three recollections provide self-protection by soothing the mind when such emotions as fear and dread

\textsuperscript{139} ibid., pp. 336-337.

\textsuperscript{140} D.III.250, 280; A.III.284, 312.
Contemplative Practices in the Pāli Suttas

appear. 141 Generally, these six recollections also bring about insight in the scheme of higher progress. 142 Initially, the qualities of the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Sangha are the main objects of faith (saddhā) for the religious aspirant. The six recollections reinforce these qualities by gradually rendering them more readily seen or understood. As such, the recollections represent the means of realising greater mental purity. 143 Meditation on them alone leads only to a concentrated mind. 144 This practice may aid the jhāyin’s initial development of insight or vipassanā.

Meditation on the Buddha via visualisation (buddhanussati) is practised in a secluded dwelling. Here, the jhāyin repeatedly recollects the virtues of the Buddha by visualising the Buddha in his inner being and by feeling constantly the immediate proximity of the Buddha. Consequently, the meditator experiences exaltation of mind. This strengthens increasingly both faith and devotion while restraining those actions leading to moral corruption. That is to say, the mind restrains lust, hatred etc. by visualising the Buddha and making the image its object of attention. 145 This process applies also to the Dhamma and the Sangha. The generation of an internal image of the Buddha so as to create a particular state of being is reminiscent of Upanisadic meditation, where the symbol of Brahman is internalised and worshipped with sufficient intensity to produce some degree of realisation. In the context

141 Dhajagga Sutta, S.I.219.

142 See M.I.37.

143 The Sambādhokāsa Sutta (A.III.314) describes the recollections as opportunities for the converted (sotāpanna) to attain absolute purity.

144 M.I.37-38. Thinking: "Possessed of unwavering confidence in ... dhamma am I", he acquires knowledge of the goal ... the mind is well concentrated (cittam samādhiyati). [same for the Order etc.] Middle Length Sayings, v 1, p. 47.

145 See A.VI.10, 25.
of the above, both contemplative approaches represent the overcoming of undesired states by holding a specific image in mind.

As an object of meditation, the term "dhamma" includes the notions of the actual course of training to be practised: i.e. sīla, samādhi, and paññā. It also incorporates that which is to be penetrated or attained. The jhāyin attains a degree of concentration by establishing mindfulness of the Dhamma by recollecting its various virtues in these forms.146

Development of meditation on the Sangha or order of Buddhist monks occurs in solitude. Such recollection on the virtues of the sangha counters lust, hatred, and delusion thus permitting the arising of concentration with joyful freedom from hindrances (nīvarana).147 Regarding the remaining recollections, i.e. meditation on morality (sīla), on generosity (cāga), and on the gods (devatā), the jhāyin further develops concentration on the object by contemplating moral purity appropriate to his station.148 He continues to counter the mental obstacles of greed, hatred, and delusion via recollection of generosity. Liberality thus conduces to freedom from covetousness and meanness. This results in friendliness and cheerful progress in meditative practice.

Meditation on the devas requires taking the gods as examples by calling to mind their virtues of learning, wisdom etc. so as to appropriate these qualities for himself. By doing so, the jhāyin continues to enhance the cleansing of a mind soiled by passion, hatred, infatuation etc.149 This practice resembles the Upanisadic contemplative technique whereby Vedic deities

146 D.II.93; M.I.181.
147 M.I.181; A.I.208.
148 S.II.70.
149 A.I.210; III.287.
such as Surya and Rudra-Siva etc. are worshipped/contemplated (upāsanā) as manifestations of Brahman.

Resemblance of satipatthāna to upāsanā

In some ways, the method of Buddhist satipatthāna meditation resembles the Upanisadic contemplative method of upāsanā. Upāsanā, in its initial aspect of worship, brings to mind the notion or symbol of Brahman. In worship, this phase of upāsanā applies a broad form of attention to the meditative object. Intense concentration on Brahman has yet to be employed for realisation. Mindfulness (sati) likewise takes up a particular object or notion for the contemplative application of broad attention. Intense concentration, too, has yet to enter the contemplative process. Etymological examination of the Pāli Buddhist term "satipatthāna" reveals correspondence in method with upāsanā. The compound "satipatthāna" derives from the words "sati" and "upatthāna". Sati, in the present context, means "attention, awareness", or "mindfulness". Upatthāna, the second part of the compound, means literally "setting forth" or "putting forward". In conjunction, the terms represent "setting up of mindfulness". Upatthāna may be rendered as "attendance, waiting upon". Significantly, the word also translates as "worship". This is more apparent in translation of the Sanskrit term "upasthāna" from which the Pāli word "upatthāna" originates. Upasthāna means "the act of placing one's self near to, going near to in order to worship, worshipping, any object approached with respect". In this sense, the asso-

150 Oral communication with the Venerable Nyanaponika Thera confirms his belief that the Pāli term "sati" derives from the Sanskrit word "smṛti" meaning originally "memory" or "remembrance". (See Nyanaponika, op. cit., p. 9.)

151 The meaning of the term "upasthāna" resembles that of the word "Upanisad" which translates generally as "to sit down near to" or "to approach". [upa (towards, near) + ni (down) + the root sad (to sit).] Native authorities, however, understand "Upanisad" to mean "setting at rest ignorance by revealing the knowledge of the supreme spirit", thus suggesting the result of upasthāna. See M. Monier-Williams, A Sanskrit-English Dictionary, (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, 1981; 1st publ. 1899), p. 201.
ciation of the Pāli term sati with upatthāna relates to the coalition of bare attention with worship -- or a similar mode of approach.

**Summary of sammā sati**

In right mindfulness, the jhāyin moves from an initial intellectual understanding of transience, unsatisfactoriness, and emptiness to the focus of attention on all external and internal events as they arise. Mindfulness of the body consists of exercises such as contemplation of body movements or postures (iriyāpatha), reflection on the parts of the body (kāyagatāsati), observation of in- and out-breathing (ānāpānasati) etc.

The meditator advances then to the arising and passing away of feelings, states of consciousness, and mental objects or ideas (dhammā). Bare attention, directed towards the flux of existence (while void of intellectual or emotional reactions to it), generates a depersonalised demeanour of witnessing a stream of psychic processes. In this way, bare attention is correspondingly evanescent. Physical and mental phenomena are accepted thus as disparate yet interconnected occurrences.

Sātīpatthāna represents the initial systematic effort to fully realise the internalised Buddhist metaphysic. That is to say, aspects of existence are taken up as subjects for mindfulness (sati) within the context of the Buddhist ontology. The development of vipassanā generates degrees of insight ranging from a fundamental intellectual understanding to a profoundly intuitive insight. In this process, the practice of sātīpatthāna is an incipient movement, from a primary intellectual grasp of the nature of existence, towards the penetrating intuitive realisation of it by judicious use of two forms of attention: mindfulness (sati) and concentration (samādhi). That is to say, with skill in developing sati, knowledge of the nature of existence begins to extend beyond an intellectual understanding. The meditator moves now towards the
right way for realising release. Subsequent training in contemplative skills, whereby attention is applied further and honed to keenness, provides sufficient additional control of consciousness to attain the meditative absorptions (jhānas) and, as a consequence, to be able to experience powers.

The process or development of insight, i.e. the practice of vipassanā, includes the involvement of sati in its early stage and, in its later stage, the necessary involvement of samādhi. Any confusion of sati with vipassanā is a consequence of the early involvement of sati in the process or development of insight meditation (vipassanā). Vipassanā per se is the result of this practice and is so named because of the close association of resulting insight with mindfulness meditations (satipatthāna). Sati, however, does not correspond with vipassanā. Any assumption by scholars in this regard finds no foundation in the suttas.

Samma-Samādhi: Right Concentration

Tranquility (samatha) is a calm, clear and serene state of mind attained by strong mental concentration -- a high degree of which is indispensable for insight.152 The Buddha, when questioned about it, explained it thus:

> May it be, lord, that a monk can acquire such concentration (samādhi) that in this body, together with its consciousness (sa viññānake), he has no notion of "I" or "mine", or any tendency to vain conceit: that likewise in all external objects he has no such notion or tendency: may it be that he can so abide in the attainment of release of heart (cetoñimuttī), the release by insight (paññāvīmuttī), that he has no such notion or tendency? ... By what process can it be?

152 In the Cūḷavedallasutta, Dhammapadīnā defines concentration (samādhi) as follows: Whatever ... is one-pointedness (citassā ekaggatā) of mind, this is concentration (samādhi); the four arousings of mindfulness (satipatthāna) are the distinguishing marks of concentration; the four right efforts (sammappādānā) are the requisites for concentration; whatever is the practice, the development, the increase of these very things, this is herein the development of concentration. M.I.301

Middle Length Sayings, v 1, p. 363.
In this matter ... a monk has this idea: This is the calm (samatha),
this is the excellent state, to wit,—rest from all activities, the forsaking of
all substrate (of rebirth), the destruction of all craving, passionless, making
to cease, Nibbāna. That is how a monk can acquire such concentration
(samādhi) ....

The method for developing tranquility (samatha) constitutes the pro-
gressive integration of the mind by fixing it upon a single wholesome ob-
ject. Unwholesome states obstructing its arising are thus subdued. The de-
velopment of samatha corresponds with samādhi, i.e. a state of unification of
mind defined by the absence of mental wandering and perturbation. It is im-
bued further with clarity and inward serenity. The course of practice is re-
ferred to as the samādhi system of meditation because the development of
serenity arrives at fruition in jhāna-samādhi.

The jhānas
The jhānas embody the most esteemed form of concentration (samādhi). In
the context of the Noble Path they are right or perfect concentration issuing in
a contentless mind, i.e. a mind free of cerebration and sense-activity. The
mental unification they induce makes them instrumental in the development
of full insight. Eight levels of absorption, arranged hierarchically, are
cultivated: the four material jhānas (rūpa jhāna) and the four immaterial
jhāna (arūpa jhāna). The Pāli Suttas often commend the jhānas for pro-
ducing the mental purification essential as a foundation for wisdom. The
jhāyin, having abandoned the five hindrances (nīvarana), fur-


154 The Jhānavagga of the Anguttara Nikāya, (A.I.34-40), gives the fullest list found in
the Nikāyas of the various meditative objects recommended by the Buddha.

155 The Pāli canonical texts list variously four, five, eight, and nine jhānas. For the four-
fold scheme see: D.I.74-77; for the fivefold scheme see: D.I.183-84, II.112; M.I.41,
I.159-60; Vibhanga 183-84, 245; for the eightfold fold scheme see: D.III.260; for the
ninefold scheme see: S.II.222. For a consideration of the relationship between the fourfold
scheme and the fivefold scheme, see See Henepola Gunaratana, The Path of Serenity and
ther purifies the mind by promoting, in the practice of the jhānas, five positive mental factors.

**Positive Mental Factors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Mental Factors</th>
<th>Pali Words</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) applied or initial thought</td>
<td>vitakka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) sustained or discursive thought</td>
<td>vicāra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) rapture</td>
<td>pīti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) joy</td>
<td>sukhā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) one-pointedness or concentration</td>
<td>ekaggatā</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The stereotyped formula describing the jhānas, repeated eighty or more times throughout the suttas, is as follows:

He, ... aloof from pleasures of the senses, aloof from unskilled states of mind, enters on and abides in the first meditation (jhāna), which is accompanied by initial thought (vitakka) and discursive thought (vicāra), is born of aloofness and is rapturous (pīti) and joyful (suḥkha). ...

And again, ... a monk by allaying initial and discursive thought, his mind subjectively tranquillised and fixed on one point (ekodibhāvam), enters on and abides in the second meditation (jhāna), which ... is born of concentration (samādhi) and is rapturous (pīti) and joyful (suḥkha). ...

And again, ... a monk by the fading out of rapture, dwells with equanimity (upekṣā), attentive and clearly conscious, and experiences in his person that joy (suḥkha) of which the ariyans say: 'Joyful lives he who has equanimity and is mindful (upekṣako satimā sukhavihārī),' and he enters on and abides in the third meditation (jhāna). ...

And again, ... a monk by getting rid of joy, by getting rid of anguish (dukkha), by the going down of his former pleasures and sorrows, enters

---

156 See M.I.181-182.

157 Oldenberg notes that one verse from the Mahābhārata (XII.195.15), which is older than the Yoga-sūtras says: "vicāra, viveka, and vitarka appear when one is deeply collected in the first dhyāna." According to Oldenberg, this seems like a versified abbreviation of the standard Buddhist description of first jhāna. Oldenberg, op. cit., pp. 279-280; also p. 310, note 210. He refers also to Hopkins, JAOS, XXII, 357.
and abides in the fourth meditation (jhâna), which has neither anguish nor joy, and is entirely purified by equanimity (upekkhā) and mindfulness (sati).158

M.I.181-182

One-pointedness (ekaggatâ = ekodibhâva), unlike the other jhâna factors, is not specifically mentioned in the stereotyped, sutta formula for jhâna 1, nor indeed for jhânas 3, and 4. Whereas jhânas 3 and 4 clearly suggest the inclusion of one-pointedness (ekaggatâ), its presence or absence in the first jhâna is a disputed issue.159 However, the Mahâvedallasutta, in an isolated occurrence, includes one-pointedness as a positive mental factor. Here, Sâriputta is questioned regarding the negative mental factors to be abandoned, i.e. the five hindrances (nîvarana), and those to be possessed.

And what, your reverence, is the first meditation (jhâna)?

As to this, your reverence, a monk, aloof from pleasures of the senses ... enters on and abides in the first meditation which is accompanied by initial thought (vitakka) and discursive thought (vicdra), is born of aloofness, and is rapturous (pîtî) and joyful (sukha). This ... is the first meditation.

Of how many factors, your reverence, is the first meditation?

Your reverence, the first meditation is five-factored: if a monk has entered on the first meditation there is initial thought and discursive thought and rapture and joy and one-pointedness of mind (citkekaggatd). Thus, your reverence, the first meditation is five-factored ....

Your reverence, in regard to the first meditation, five factors are abandoned, five are possessed: if a monk has entered on the first meditation, desire for sense-pleasure (kâmaccchanda) is abandoned, malevolence (vyddhâda)... sloth and torpor (thîna-middha) ... restlessness and worry (uddhacca-kukkucca) ... are abandoned, doubt (vicikicchâ) is abandoned, but there is initial and discursive thought (vitakka-vicdra), rapture (pîtî) and joy (sukha) and one-pointedness (ekaggatâ) of mind. Thus, your reverence, in regard to the first meditation, five factors are abandoned, five are possessed.160

M.I.294-295

158 Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 227-228.


160 Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 354-355.
The Anupadasutta also includes one-pointedness (ekaggatā), along with the other four positive mental factors in a list of components belonging to the first jhāna.

The Lord spoke thus: ... And those things which belong to the first meditation: initial thought (vitakka) and sustained thought (vicāra) and rapture (pīṭī) and joy (sukha) and one-pointedness (ekaggatā) of mind, impingement, feeling, perception, will, thought, desire, determination, energy, mindfulness, equanimity, attention ....

M.III.25

Thus, the constituents of absorption (jhānanga) preclude the hindrances (nīvarana) and focus the mind on the selected object. With expertise, the meditator attains the first jhāna. Thereafter the remaining jhānas are cultivated to the degree where equanimity (upekṣā) arises as an additional mental factor. The following table shows the gradual elimination of cruder mental elements and the advent of upekṣā in jhānas 1-4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jhāna 1</th>
<th>Positive Mental Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 1</td>
<td>vitakka-vicāra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 2</td>
<td>pīṭī</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 3</td>
<td>sukha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 4</td>
<td>(ekaggatā)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Attainment of each jhānic level entails the progressive elimination of cruder mental elements. In each instance, the inherent coarseness and proximity of the lower jhāna is perceived as jeopardising the higher jhāna -- thus generating ambition for more elevated and refined mental states. Consequently, applied and sustained thought (vitakka-vicāra) are abandoned to attain the second jhāna; rapture (pīṭī), joy (sukha), and concentration...

161 Middle Length Sayings, v 3, pp. 77-78. See also Vibhanga 263, Vism III.21 (p. 88), Abhidhammattha Sangaha 1.7 where one-pointedness is included in the five positive factors of the first jhāna.
(ekaggatā) remain. With the elimination of pīti, equanimity (upekkhā) arises and the third jhāna ensues, leaving sukhā and ekaggatā. Sukhā, too, is disposed of to reach the fourth stage. In this instance, equanimity (upekkhā) and ekaggatā are present factors.162 Thereafter, the development of the four immaterial jhānas (arūpa jhāna) purifies concentration further. The Sangīti Suttanta presents the four arūpa jhānas as follows:

Fourfold doctrines, friends, have been perfectly set forth by the Exalted One who knows, who sees, the Arahant, Buddha supreme. ... Which are these? ...

Four Jhānas of Arūpa-consciousness, to wit:—Herein, brethren, a brother, by passing beyond the consciousness of matter, by the dying out of the sensation of resistance, by paying no heed to the idea of difference, at the thought: 'Space is infinite!' attains to and abides in the conceptual sphere of space as infinite (ākāsasatāna). (2) Having wholly transcended this, at the thought: 'Infinite is consciousness!' he attains to and abides in the conceptual sphere of consciousness as infinite (vijñānaatāna). (3) Having wholly transcended this, at the thought: 'It is nothing!' he attains to and abides in the conceptual sphere of nothingness (agniṣṭhānaatāna). (4) Having wholly transcended this, he attains to and abides in the sphere of neither consciousness nor unconsciousness (nevāsatāna).

D.III.221 & 224

Strictly speaking, the four arūpa jhānas belong still to the fourth jhāna as they possess the same two constituents: equanimity (upekkhā) and concentration (ekaggatā). They differ, however, according to their object of

162 The Abhidhamma presents, generally, a fivefold division of the rūpa jhānas covering the same spectrum of contemplative practice. In this scheme, applied and sustained thought are overcome in separate stages. Sutta texts such as A.I.299 provide the basis for the fivefold division:

Thus indeed, monk, you must train yourself.
When, monk, this concentration (samādhi) is thus made-become and developed by you, then you should make become this concentration with initial and sustained application (vitakka-vicāra); make it become without initial application (avitakka) but with sustained application (vicāra) only; make it become without either initial or sustained application (avitakka-avicāra) ....

A.IV.299

Gradual Sayings, v 4, p. 199.

concentration. Gradual elimination of cruder mental elements, it was noted, typifies the rūpa jhānas.

The purification of concentration via the development of the four immaterial jhānas (arūpa-jhāna) is set out in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jhāna</th>
<th>Object of Concentration</th>
<th>Positive Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 5</td>
<td>ākāsānañcāyatana</td>
<td>upekkhā &amp; ekaggatā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 6</td>
<td>viññānañcāyatana</td>
<td>upekkhā &amp; ekaggatā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 7</td>
<td>ākiñcaññāyatana</td>
<td>upekkhā &amp; ekaggatā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>jhāna 8</td>
<td>nevasaññānāsaññāyatana</td>
<td>upekkhā &amp; ekaggatā</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Passage through the arūpa jhānas comes about by overcoming objects of successive delicacy. They are as follows: the sphere of boundless space (ākāsānañcāyatana), which objectifies the infinity of space; the sphere of boundless consciousness (viññānañcāyatana), where infinite consciousness is taken as the object of meditation; the sphere of nothingness (ākiñcaññāyatana) pertaining to the non-existent feature of consciousness; and the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception (nevasaññānāsaññāyatana). This stage represents a semi-conscious state eclipsed only by the state of complete cessation of consciousness.164

---

164 This is the ultimate skilled state mentioned frequently in the suttas. Most often named saññā-vedayita-nirodha, "the cessation of feeling and perception", it is also called nirodha-samāpatti, "the attainment of cessation". It is achieved via the transmutative powers peculiar to Buddhism's sustained and uninterrupted form of meditation and is distinguished by total absence of mental activity. This meditative level is higher than those known to either of the Buddha's former teachers, Āḷāra Kāḷāma and Uddaka Rāmaṭutta. The unshakable freedom of mind that results is the goal of those designated the "Brahma-farers" (Majjhima Nikāya I. 197, 201). Vetter supports the conclusion that "the cessation of feeling and perception" is a Buddhist innovation. See Vetter, op. cit., p. 67. By proposing that "the cessation of feeling and perception" is an addition to the list of eight jhānas, Bronkhorst indirectly supports the conclusion that saññā-vedayita-nirodha is a Buddhist innovation; he states:

... the presence of feeling (vedayita) in the final Cessation of Ideations and Feelings must give rise to suspicion, since the whole list [of graded exercises] seems aimed at the dissolution of ideations and leaves no
The eight absorptions together comprise the "eight attainments" (samāpatti). Sometimes a ninth attainment, the attainment of extinction (niruddha-samāpatti), is added.\(^{165}\) The quality of mind that results from the development of jhānic states provides the opportunity to realise full knowledge or wisdom (paññā): i.e. the last factor of the threefold training.

**Anāpānasati: mindfulness of in-and-out-breathing**

In a similar sense to satipatthāna where the meditator takes up particular subjects for exercises in mindfulness, the jhāyin engages in exercises for the development of samādhi meditation. One particular contemplative practice, i.e. mindfulness with regard to in-and-out-breathing (anāpānasati) comprises both samatha and an initial degree of insight. The Satipatthāna Sutta\(^ {166}\) offers methods of practice which provide the foundation for insight meditation. The suttas describe mindfulness of in-and-out-breathing as one of the most important practices leading to the attainment of levels of jhānic concentration. The Anāpānasati Sutta (*Discourse on Mindfulness of Breathing*) gives methods of practice comprising both serenity and insight meditation. The Buddha endorses it as a complete method for attaining nibbāna. He lauds it as the "noble abode" (*āriya-vihāra*), and as the "Buddha-abode" (*tathāgata-vihāra*).\(^ {167}\)

---

\(^{165}\) The commentaries speak frequently of the eight attainments as constituents of concentration when it is considered as a major component of the threefold training (*tīviddha sikkhā*).

\(^{166}\) M. III. 78-88, D.I. 290-314.

\(^{167}\) S.V. 326.
The practice of ānāpānasati calms the body and mind. The Patisambhidā-magga\textsuperscript{168} elaborates the practice under the name of ānāpānasati-samādhi meaning "concentration acquired by, or founded on mindfulness of in-and-out-breathing". The mindfulness may be established on either the in-breath or the out-breath or both. The following discourse recommends ānāpānasati-samādhi as an object of samatha meditation. It also gives an explanation of the method of practising the meditation and its development.

Monks, this concentration on mindfulness of respiration, being cultivated and practised, tends to the peaceful, the sublime, the sweet and happy: at once it causes every evil thought to disappear and tranquillizes the mind.\textsuperscript{169}

Vajirānāna notes that the method of practising this contemplation, as described in this discourse, is Buddhist exclusively. The system of breath-control, i.e. prāṇyāma, practised by the ascetics of other schools appears to be a different system entirely. The suttas depict the most rigorous, dangerous, and torturous form of this exercise as the "ecstasy of not breathing, (appānika-jhāna)."\textsuperscript{170} This is related regarding the great exertion of the Buddha before his enlightenment. Through practicing this form of breath control, the Buddha realises that it only leads to physical torture. Recognising that it was not the means to enlightenment, he rejects it. Thereafter, he returns to an earlier method learned in his infancy. Through this he had attained the first jhāna. This method, he realises, leads to happiness plus the

\textsuperscript{168} Khuddaka Nikāya, Book 12. Ānāpānasati-samādhi here receives special attention. This makes it the longest treatment of the subject in Pāli literature.

\textsuperscript{169} Translated by Vajirānāna, op. cit., p. 235.

\textsuperscript{170} See Mahāsaccaka Sutta (M.I.243).
purification of the mind from the āsavas.\footnote{Vajirañāṇa, op. cit., pp. 235-236.} Ānāpānasati, in contrast to appānika-jhāna, embodies intrinsically peace, safety, serenity, and happiness by calming both body and mind. As such, it is conducive to the development of insight.

The four stages of ānāpānasati encompass the four foundations of mindfulness, i.e. body, feelings, mind, and mental objects. Having found a suitable location for meditation such as a dwelling in a forest etc., and having fulfilled the preliminary religious requirements, the jhāyin assumes the posture most suitable for his meditation. The discourse recommends that he sit cross-legged, keeping the upper part of the body erect with chest, neck, and head straight. Thereafter, all sensory thoughts become excluded from consciousness by the fixation of attention upon the tip of the nose and by the detached mindful observation of the rise and fall of the breath. Thus, the jhāyin regulates both body and mind by focusing attention upon the object.

Mindfulness of the processes of breathing develops and establishes degrees of insight and concentration. Initially, the meditator trains himself by noting the breath as it is inhaled and exhaled. He realises the divisions of breathing as the means to develop concentration and wisdom. This is followed by conscious calming of the body by the breathing process. With continued practice through increasingly subtle stages, this results in complete serenity and samādhi wherein, at the fourth jhāna, the breath stops.\footnote{See S.IV. 293.} As such, this form of ānāpānasati meditation develops samatha.

A degree of insight grows as well following further contemplation of the joy associated with jhāna. Confusion is removed with the realisation of the transient nature of this joy. The same applies to contemplation of feeling
(vedanânapassanâ). Anâpânasati proceeds next to contemplation of the mind (cittânupassanâ).\(^{173}\)

Having attained the jhânic states, the meditator contemplates the impermanent, momentary nature of the mind in these stages while continuing to breathe in and out. Thus he sets the mind free. That is to say, realisation of the first jhâna releases the mind from the hindrances (nîvarana). The second jhâna frees the mind from reasoning and investigation (vitakka and vicâra). By way of the third jhâna, consciousness is released from zest (piti), while the fourth jhâna removes happiness and pain (sukha and dukkha). By entering into and then emerging from the jhânas, the jhâyin contemplates the mind associated with them. It is thus understood and realised as transient (anicca) and impermanent.\(^{174}\) Thereafter, he frees the mind from the idea of happiness by contemplating painfulness. Contemplation of non-ego then releases consciousness from the idea of self, and so on.

The final part of ânâpânasati involves contemplation of ideas or mind objects (dhammânupassanâ), the fourth satipatthâna.\(^{175}\) Training in ânâpânasati continues whilst contemplating transitoriness. The meditation involves initially the transitoriness inherent in the five aggregates comprising the individual. Breathing in and breathing out, the meditator recognises that each aggregate, i.e. the physical body, sensation, perception, the mental elements, and consciousness, is inherently impermanent.

... in body contemplating body (kâtyânupassi) (as transient) a monk dwells ardent, self-possessed and mindful ....

\(^{173}\) Vajirañâna, op. cit., pp. 251-252, referring to Patisambhidâmagga I.187. See also S.V.295 and A.IV.299-300.

\(^{174}\) For example, see M.III.108.

\(^{175}\) S.V.295.
Now ... I declare that this in-breathing and out-breathing is a certain body (kāyānātanar).

... Aware of the mental factors (cittasankhāra) I shall breathe in: aware of the mental factors I shall breathe out. ... at such time, in feelings contemplating feelings (vedāṇḍsu vedāṇḍnupassī), he dwells ardent, self-possessed and mindful ....

Now ... I declare that this in-breathing and out-breathing, this close attention to it, is a certain feeling.

... Aware of mind (citta) I shall breathe in; aware of mind I shall breathe out. ... in mind contemplating mind (citte cittānupassī) (as transient), a monk dwells ardent, self-possessed and mindful .... 176

S.V.323-324

Following the recognition that each aggregate is inherently impermanent, the meditator continues his in-breathing and out-breathing out while directly contemplating impermanence. This follows with training in clear perception of freedom from passion and of cessation involving the elimination of the cankers (āsavas) at various stages of meditative practice as well as the final cessation of nibbāna. 177 Finally, training in ānāpānasati continues with the discernment of renunciation.

Contemplating impermanence (aniccaṇupassī) I shall breathe in: Contemplating impermanence I shall breathe out. Contemplating dispassion (virāgānupassī) I shall breathe in: Contemplating dispassion I shall breathe out. Contemplating cessation (nīrodhaṇupassī) I shall breathe in: Contemplating cessation I shall breathe out. Contemplating renunciation (patīnasaggaṇupassī) I shall breath in: contemplating renunciation I shall breathe out; at such time, in mind-states contemplating mind-states (dhammesu dhammaṇupassī), a monk dwells ardent, self-possessed and mindful ....

Abandoning whatever dejection arises from coveting, seeing it with the eye of insight (pajñād), he is completely disinterested.

Wherefore I say, ... at such a time that monk dwells in mind-states contemplating mind-states (dhammesu dhammaṇupassī), ardent, self-possessed and mindful ....

... just so, ... by dwelling in body contemplating body (kāye kāyānupassī) ... in feelings contemplating feelings (vedāṇāsu vedāṇupassī) ... in mind contemplating mind (citte cittānupassī) ... in mind-


177 See S.V.326; 327; 333; 341.
states contemplating mind states (dhammesu dhammānupassī), evil unprofitable conditions are made less.  

S.V.324-325

In the course of its gradual development, insight generates the renunciation of mental impurities that bring about the combination of the aggregates. With the realisation of the inherent limitation of conditioned reality, insight points the mind towards release (nibbāna). The suttas thus depict the development of ānāpānasati-samādhi associated with any one of the four satipatthānas. Alone, this meditation provides all the requirements for release. The Buddha, in the following passage, enjoins Rāhula to develop mindfulness of in-breathing and out-breathing as the means to tranquilise the body, after which the mind will become concentrated and free.

As to this, Rāhula, a monk who is forest gone or gone to the root of a tree or gone to an empty place, sits down cross-legged, holding his back erect, arousing mindfulness in front of him. Mindful he breathes in, mindful he breathes out. ... He trains himself thinking: 'I shall breathe in tranquilising the activity of the body'; he trains himself thinking, 'I shall breathe out tranquilising the activity of the body.'

He trains himself thinking 'I shall breathe in experiencing rapture'; he trains himself thinking, 'I shall breathe out experiencing rapture.' He trains himself thinking 'I shall breathe in ... out experiencing happiness ... I shall breathe in ... out experiencing the activity of thought ... rejoicing in thought ... concentrating thought ... freeing thought.' He trains himself thinking 'I shall breathe in ... out beholding impermanence ... beholding dispassion ... beholding stopping ... beholding casting away.'

Mindfulness of in-breathing and out-breathing if developed thus, Rāhula, if made much of thus, is of great fruit, of great advantage. When, Rāhula, mindfulness of in-breathing and out-breathing has been developed thus, has been made much of thus, then those which are the last in-breaths and out-breaths are also stopped only when they are known, not when they are unknown.

M.I.425

Training in ānāpānasati, according to the Buddha's instructions, enables the jhāyin to gain control over consciousness and the body. Developing

178 Kindred Sayings, v 5, p. 325. See also M.III.82-85.

179 Middle Length Sayings, v 2, pp. 96-97.
concentration of the mind and penetrating impermanence, the meditator realises renunciation and cessation. The *Satipatthāna Samyutta* associates mindfulness of breathing with the abandonment of the desire to do as a means to attain release. It states:

As he dwells in body contemplating body (as transient), ardent, ... that desire to do, that is in body, is abandoned. By the abandoning of desire to do, the Deathless is realized. So with feelings ... mind ... mind-states ... that desire to do, that is in mind-states, is abandoned. By the abandoning of desire to do, the Deathless is realized.\(^{180}\)

S.V.181-182.

The *Anāpānasati Sutta* offers a sectional presentation of the *Satipatthāna Sutta*. In doing so, it depicts the Buddha discoursing on the ability of the four satipatthānas to bring the seven factors of enlightenment (or links in awakening, *bojjhanga*) involving concentration and equanimity etc. to completion through knowledge:

Monks, the four applications of mindfulness, when developed thus, made much of thus, bring to fulfilment the seven links of awakening (*bojjhanga*).

And how, monks, when the seven links of awakening are developed, how when they are made much of, do they bring to fulfilment freedom through knowledge? Herein, monks, a monk develops the link in awakening that is mindfulness (*satisambojjhanga*) and is dependent on aloofness, dependent on detachment, dependent on cessation, ending in abandoning.\(^{181}\) he develops the link in awakening that is investigation into things (*dhammavicayasambojjhanga*) ... the link in awakening that is energy (*virajasambojjhanga*) ... that is rapture (*ptisambojjhanga*) ... tranquility (*passaddhisambojjhanga*) ... the link in awakening that is concentration (*samādhisambojjhanga*) ... that is equanimity (*upekhāsambojjhanga*) and is dependent on aloofness, dependent on detachment, dependent on cessation, ending in abandoning. Monks, when the seven links in awakening are developed thus, are made much of thus, they bring to fulfilment freedom through knowledge.\(^{182}\)

M.III.87-88

\(^{180}\) *Kindred Sayings*, v 5, p. 159.

\(^{181}\) Translator's footnote states this is both abandonment of the defilements and the mind's leap into nībbāna.

\(^{182}\) *Middle Length Sayings*, v 3, pp. 127-129.
Diligent application of the four foundations of mindfulness thus provides the basis for full development of necessary factors such as samādhi and abandoning etc. to gain full knowledge and release.

Paññā

Abhiññā: Supernormal Knowledges
Perfection in concentration gives access to five 'higher powers' or supernormal knowledges (abhiññās).\(^ {183} \) The Brahmajāla Sutta\(^ {184} \) depicts such concentration (ceto-samādhi) with its ability to produce supernormal powers. The sutta also distinguishes between imperfect concentration and perfect concentration. A meditator, when undergoing mental concentration and the onset of various powers, draws, from his experiences, false conclusions leading to illusory beliefs if he expects existence (i.e. the self and the world) to be eternal or be liable to annihilation. Perfect samādhi, according to the Sāmaññaphala Sutta,\(^ {185} \) realises fully the true nature of the self and the world as momentary flux.\(^ {186} \) The five 'higher powers' or supernormal knowledges are as follows:

The Five Supernormal Knowledges (Abhiññās)

| 1) iddhi vidhā | magical powers |
| 2) dibba sota | divine ear |
| 3) ceto-pariya-ñāna | penetration of the mind of others |

\(^ {183} \) For a study on this topic, see Lindquist, Sigurd. *Siddhi und Abhiññā. Eine Studie über die klassischen Wunder des Yogas*, Uppsala: Lundquistska Bokhandeln, 1935.

\(^ {184} \) D.I.13.

\(^ {185} \) D.I.73-84.

\(^ {186} \) Note, also, that concentration is practiced by other religious systems as demonstrated in the previous chapter. The practice of samādhi, as depicted in the Pāli Suttas, however, is mainly developed within the context of the Noble Eightfold Path in order to eliminate the ten fetters (samyojana) that shackle one to existence.
4) *dibba-cakkhu*  
**divine eye**

5) *pubbenivāsanussati*  
**remembrance of former existences**

The higher powers (*abhiññās*) represent knowledge of (1) magical powers (*iddhi vidhā*) such as walking on water without sinking; (2) divine ear (*dibba sota*) where one hears both divine and human sounds, nearby and distant; (3) penetration of the mind of others (*ceto-pariyañña*); (4) divine eye (*dibba-cakkhu*) which sees the passing away and rebirth of beings, and (5) remembrance of former existences (*pubbenivāsanussati*). There is a sixth *abhiññā*, knowledge of the extinction of all cankers (*āsavakkhaya*), attainable through complete insight.\(^{187}\)

The *jhāyin* initiates the development of wisdom by purified moral discipline and concentration. Wisdom has the specific characteristic of piercing the true nature of phenomena. It understands the particular and general features of things through direct, unmediated realisation. The Buddha states that the meditator with concentrated mind knows and sees things as they are. Consequently, the proximate cause of wisdom is concentration developed through *jhānic* techniques.\(^{188}\)

Right concentration (*samma samādhi*) existing, the knowing and seeing (things) as they really are (*yathābhūtañnadassana*) of him who is complete in right concentration is fully based. Knowing and seeing things as they really are existing, the revulsion-and-fading of interest (*nibbidāvirāga*) of him who is complete in knowing and seeing things as they really are is fully based. Revulsion-and-fading of interest existing, the release by knowing and seeing (*vimuttīñnadassana*) of him who is complete in revulsion-and-fading of interest is fully based.\(^{189}\)

A.V.4-5

\(^{187}\) See D.III.281; M.I.22-23, 34-35, II.18-22; A.III.99 etc. for stereotype text referring to the *abhiññās*.

\(^{188}\) *Anguttara Nikāya* V.3.

\(^{189}\) *Gradual Sayings*, v 5, pp. 4-5.
In the development of *samatha*, the attainment of *jhāna* accomplishes two functions: (1) it produces a foundation of mental purity and inner collectedness required initially for developing insight-contemplation; and (2) it serves as a meditative object to be examined with unhindered (i.e. concentrated) insight in order to discern *fully* the three marks of impermanence, suffering and selflessness.\(^{190}\) The first function of *jhāna* is thus concerned with the development of tranquility (*samatha*). The second function of *jhāna* is directly concerned with the development of insight (*panñā*). *Jhāna* fulfills the first function by overcoming the five hindrances, corruptions of the mind and obstacles to wisdom, which prevent the *jhāyin* from seeing phenomena as they are. The arising of wisdom requires great concentration. This, in turn, requires freedom from hindrances. The attainment of *jhāna* brings this about. After emerging from full absorption, the serene, unhindered mind is susceptible to penetrating insight.

...when the mind is free of these five debasements (*upakkilesa*, i.e. the five hindrances, *nivarana*), it is pliable and workable and bright, nor is it brittle, but is rightly composed (*samma samādhi*) for the destruction of the cankers (*āsavānam khayāya*); and one can bend the mind (*abhinirmāmeti*) to the realization of psychic knowledge (*abhiññā*) of whatever condition is realizable by psychic knowledge (*abhiññā*), and become an eyewitness in every case, whatever the range may be. ...

Should one wish: Having destroyed the cankers (*āsavānam khayāya*), I would enter and abide in the emancipation of mind (*ceto vimutti*), in the emancipation of insight (*panñhāvimutti*), which is free of the cankers, having realized that state by my own knowledge (*abhiññā*) even in this very life -- one becomes an eye-witness in every case, whatever the range may be.\(^{191}\)  

A.III.16-19

Right or perfect concentration (*samma samādhi*) as defined in the *Pāli Suttas*, i.e. as the *jhānas*, is taken up and augmented with insight practices (*vipassanā*) for the successful completion of the contemplative process.

---

\(^{190}\) M.I.349-353. See also III.104-109.

In this way, perfect concentration becomes the proximate cause of the thorough development of insight.

Full knowledge or intuitive wisdom (paññā), as it relates to the Noble Path, is the penetrative understanding (by immediate meditative experience) of the Buddhist metaphysic concerning the Four Noble Truths, the notions of cause and effect, transience etc. as encapsulated in right understanding (samma-ditthi) and right aspiration (sammā-sankappa).

Your reverence, one is called 'Intuitively wise (paññavā) ...' Now what are the respects in which one is called 'intuitively wise,' ...?" ...
... if it is said 'He comprehends (pajñāṇāti) ...' he is therefore called 'Intuitively wise.' And what does he comprehend? He comprehends 'This is anguish ... This is the arising of anguish ... This is the stopping of anguish ... This is the course leading to the stopping of anguish.' ...

What is knowable, your reverence, by purified mental consciousness (parisuddhena manoviññānena) isolated from the five sense-organs?192 ...
... thinking, 'Ether is unending,' the plane of infinite ether is knowable by pure mental consciousness isolated from the five sense-organs, thinking, 'Consciousness is unending,' the plane of infinite consciousness is knowable; thinking, 'There is not anything,' the plane of no-thing is knowable.

By what means does one comprehend a knowable mental object (dhamma), your reverence? ...
... by means of the eye of intuitive wisdom (paññā).
But what is intuitive wisdom for, your reverence? ...
... intuitive wisdom is for super-knowledge (abhinnatthā), for apprehending (parinnatthā), for getting rid of.
But how many conditions are there, your reverence, for bringing right understanding (samma-ditthi) into existence?
There are two conditions, your reverence, for bringing right understanding (samma-ditthi) into existence: the utterance of another (person) (parato ghoso) and wise attention (yoniso manasikāro).193

The above passage translates "yoniso manasikāra" as "wise attention". Elsewhere, the suttas describe the practice of yoniso manasikāra as

192 Translator notes: "That is, in the fourth jhāna."
193 Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 351-353.
"from attention to the cause."\textsuperscript{194} \textit{Yoniso} is the ablative form of the noun \textit{yoni} meaning "womb, origin, place of birth" etc. Thus \textit{yoniso} literally means "down to its origin or foundation"; that is to say, "thoroughly".\textsuperscript{195} \textit{Manasikàra} literally means "attention, pondering, or fixed thought". Hence, \textit{yoniso manasikàra} together, when given a more literal translation, suggest a sense of "pondering on something thoroughly to realise its foundation or origin". In the early Buddhist teachings, this expression is used to draw a direct relationship from the mind to the external world of chaos, flux, danger, and multiplicity.\textsuperscript{196}

In Buddhism, the observation of transience becomes internalised as the concepts concerning the three marks of existence, (i.e. (1) \textit{anicca}, impermanence, (2) \textit{dukkha}, suffering, and (3) \textit{anattà}, "non-self" or soullessness) and fully realised when attended with jhânic intensity. Such realisation provides the foundation of enlightenment. The Buddha states:

\begin{quote}
So long as the brethren shall exercise themselves in the realization of the ideas of the impermanency (\textit{anicca-saññà}) of all phenomena, bodily or mental, the absence [in them of any abiding principle] of any "soul" (\textit{anatta-saññà}), of corruption ... of Nirvana (\textit{nirrodha-saññà}) -- so long may the brethren be expected not to decline, but to prosper.\textsuperscript{197}
\end{quote}

D.II.79

In the preliminary stage of meditative practice, the \textit{jhàyin} gains firstly a thorough logical and systematic understanding of these characteristics of life. This intellectual understanding represents the formative stage leading to

\textsuperscript{194} See, for example, D.II.31.


\textsuperscript{197} \textit{Dialogues}, v 2, p. 84.
the development of insight where the three marks of existence become subjects for contemplation involving concentration.

The *Sâmaññaphala Sutta*\(^{198}\) explains a scheme of contemplative training involving reflection upon the body with the desire to acquire full knowledge. This reflection leads to some understanding of the body's delicate, impermanent nature; furthermore, that consciousness, being linked to and sustained by the body, is likewise ephemeral. Subsequent reflection develops knowledge and insight (*ñânadassana*, later entitled *vipassanâ*) whereby realisation of the nature of the body engenders a degree of indifference.

... the Bhikshu, by the putting away alike of ease and of pain, by the passing away alike of any elation, any dejection, he had previously felt, enters and abides in the Fourth (*jhâna*), a state of pure self-possession and equanimity, without pain and without ease.

... just so ... does the Bhikshu sit there so suffusing even his body with that sense of purification, of transience, of heart, that there is no spot in his whole frame not suffused therewith. ...

With his heart thus serene, made pure, translucent, cultured, devoid of evil, supple, ready to act, firm, and imperturbable, he applies and bends down his mind to that insight that comes from knowledge (*ñânadassana*). He grasps the fact: "This body of mine has form, it is built up of the four elements, ... it is continually renewed by so much boiled rice and juicy foods, its very nature is impermanence (anicca), it is subject to erosion, abrasion, dissolution, and disintegration; and therein is this consciousness (*vîññâna*) of mine, too, bound up, on that does it depend.\(^{199}\)

D.I.75-76

Conditioning in right understanding (*samma-ditthi*) along with preparation in right aspiration (*sammâ-sankappa*) combine on a secure moral basis and are intensified with the necessary aid of jhânic purity, and concentration.

---

\(^{198}\) D.I.47-85.

\(^{199}\) *Dialogues*, v 1, pp. 86-87.
Thus insight into existence as it really is (ñānadassana/vipassana\textsuperscript{200}), with gradual and efficient training, deepens by degrees from an intellectual comprehension to full intuitive knowledge (paññā). Insight (vipassanā) becomes wisdom (paññā) on the solid foundation of morality assisted by the power of samādhi.

There are, monks, these five ... hindrances (nīvarana), which overspread the heart (ceto ajjhārūha), which weaken insight (paññā). ... Monks, that a monk, being rid of these five ... hindrances (nīvarana), ... which weaken insight (paññā), ... shall realize the excellence of knowledge and insight (ñānadassana) proper to Ariyans, which goes beyond man's conditions -- that surely shall be.\textsuperscript{201}

A.III.63-64

Monks, a monk who has given up five factors (pañcangavippahīna, i.e. has abandoned the five hindrances nīvarana) and is complete in five factors (pañcangasamanndgata) is called in this dhamma-discipline "All-proficient\textsuperscript{202}, one who has lived the life, the best of men." ... Herein a monk is complete in the sum total of a master's virtues (stālakkhandha), of a master's concentration (samādhikhandha), in the sum total of a master's insight (paññākkhandha), release (vimuttikkhandha), the release by knowing and seeing (vimuttīñānaddassananikkhandha).\textsuperscript{203}

A.V.16

Monks, in the moral (stīlasampanna) and virtuous (upanisasampanna), right concentration (sammā samādhi) perforce thrives; when there is right concentration, true knowledge and insight (yathābhūtaniñānaddassana) perforce thrive in one who has right concentration (samādhi) ...\textsuperscript{204}

A.III.20

Monks, these two conditions have part in knowledge (bodhiphāgiya). What two?

\textsuperscript{200} i.e. knowing and seeing things as they really are: the insight that the body is impermanent and that the mind is bound up with it.

\textsuperscript{201} Gradual Sayings, v 3, pp. 51-52.

\textsuperscript{202} Kevalī. The translator notes: "... 'One lovely in virtue, nature and insight' (an all-rounder) is so called. ... The word is also used for nibbāna ...."

\textsuperscript{203} Gradual Sayings, v 5, p. 12.

\textsuperscript{204} Gradual Sayings, v 3, p. 14.
Calm and introspection (samatho ca vipassanā ca) ... 
Monks, if introspection (vipassanā) be cultivated, what profit does it attain? Insight (paññā) is cultivated. 205

A.I.61

The jhāyin, in this way, penetrates perfectly the knowledge of the Four Noble Truths regarding the universality of suffering or unsatisfactoriness, its origin, its cessation, and the way leading to the end of suffering. Wisdom consists also of the establishment of thoughts of renunciation of sense-desire, harmlessness, and non-injury.

The peak of meditative endeavour eventuates thus as the result of a causal association between training in morality, in concentration, and in wisdom. Good conduct leads, by stages, to release. The Buddha indicates this point in answer to Ananda’s questions. His response demonstrates a causal transition via moral habits and concentration to knowledge and vision in accordance with reality. These lead, finally, to revulsion, to fading of interest, and to release.

Pray, sir, what is the object, what is the profit of good conduct?
Why, Ananda, freedom from remorse (avipattisāro) is the object ...

is the profit of good conduct.
... what is the object ... of freedom from remorse?
Joy (pānuija), Ananda ....
... what is the object ... of joy?
Rapture (pīti), Ananda ....
... what is the object ... of rapture?
Calm (passaddhi), Ananda ....
... what is the object ... of calm?
Happiness (sukha), Ananda ....
... what is the object ... of happiness?
Concentration (samādhi), Ananda ....
... what is the object ... of concentration?
Knowing and seeing things as they really are (yathābhūtaññadassana), Ananda ....
What is the object, sir, ... of knowing and seeing things as they really are?
Revulsion and fading of interest (nibbidāvīrāga), Ananda ....
... what is the object ... of revulsion and fading of interest?

205 Gradual Sayings, v 1, p. 55.
Release by knowing and seeing (vimuttinānadassana) is the object and profit of these.\textsuperscript{206}

A.V.1-2

The doctrine regarding paññā, noted at D.I.208, involves:

1. The Nāṇa-dassana—the insight which sees that the body is impermanent, and that mind (Viññāna) is bound up with it, has no existence independent of it.
2. The power of calling up mental images.
3. The perception of the Four Truths as to sorrow and the Eightfold Path; the rooting out of one's mind of the Intoxicants (the Asāvas); and the final assurance, consequent thereon, of Emancipation gained.\textsuperscript{207}

This passage offers in effect a complete course of meditative development ending in deliverance, i.e. moral purity and concentration win paññā (full knowledge or intuitive wisdom). In the following passage Ananda explains what is meant by paññā.

And what, Ananda, is this so noble body of doctrine regarding the intellect (paññā) in praise of which the venerable Gotama was wont to speak; to which he used to incite the folk, in which he established them, and made them firm?\textsuperscript{208}

Ananda replies:

With his heart thus serene, made pure, translucent, cultured, devoid of evil, supple, ready to act, firm, and imper turbable, he applies and bends down his mind to that insight that comes from knowledge. He grasps the fact: "This body of mind has form, it is built up of the four elements, it

\textsuperscript{206} Gradual Sayings, v 5, pp. 1-3. The following from p. 3 sums up the causal transition succinctly:

So you see, Ananda, good conduct has freedom from remorse as object and profit; freedom from remorse has joy; joy has rapture; rapture has calm; calm has happiness; happiness has concentration; concentration has seeing things as they really are; seeing things as they really are has revulsion and fading of interest; revulsion and fading of interest have release by knowing and seeing as their object and profit. So you see, Ananda, good conduct leads gradually up to the summit.

A.V.2

\textsuperscript{207} Dialogues, v 1, pp. 269-270. This answer is also verses 83, 85, and 97 of the Sāmañña-phala Sutta: Dialogues v 1, pp. 86-93, D.I.76-83.

\textsuperscript{208} Dialogues v 1, p. 270.
springs from father and mother, it is continually renewed by so much boiled rice and juicy foods, its very nature is impermanence, it is subject to erosion, abrasion, dissolution, and disintegration; and therein is this consciousness (viññāna) of mine, too, bound up, on that does it depend.

With his heart thus serene, ... and imperturbable, he applies and bends down his mind to the calling up of a mental image. He calls up from this body another body, having form, made of mind, having all (his own body's) limbs and parts, not deprived of any organ.

With his heart thus serene, ... he directs and bends down his mind to the knowledge of the destruction of the Deadly Floods (dāsava). He knows as it really is: "This is pain." He knows as it really is: "This is the origin of pain." He knows as its really is: "This is the cessation of pain." He knows as it really is: "This is the Path that leads to the cessation of pain." He knows as they really are: "These are the Deadly Floods." He knows as it really is: "This is the origin of the Deadly Floods." He knows as it really is: "This is the cessation of the Deadly Floods." He knows as it really is: "This is the Path that leads to the cessation of the Deadly Floods." To him, thus knowing, thus seeing, the heart is set free from the Deadly Taint of Lusts (kamasava), is set free from the Deadly Taint of Becomings (bhavasava), is set free from the Deadly Taint of Ignorance (avijjasava). In him, thus set free, there arises the knowledge of his emancipation, and he knows: "Rebirth has been destroyed. The higher life has been fulfilled. What had to be done has been accomplished. After this present life there will be no beyond!"

This, young Brahman, is that so noble body of doctrine regarding the intellect (pajñā), of which that Exalted One was wont to speak in praise; to which he used to incite the folk, in which he established them, and made them firm.209

D.I.208

In the Mahāvedallasutta, Sāriputta differentiates between intuitive wisdom (paññā) and poverty in intuitive wisdom. Full knowledge or intuitive wisdom (paññā), it was noted, involved the penetrative understanding of the Buddhist metaphysic concerning the Four Noble Truths etc. Regarding poverty in intuitive wisdom, Sāriputta says:

Your reverence, one is called: 'Poor in intuitive wisdom (paññā) ....' Now what are the respects in which one is called 'Poor in intuitive wisdom, your reverence?"

Your reverence, if it is said "He does not comprehend ...This is anguish (dukkha) ... This is the arising of anguish ... This is the stopping of

209 ibid., p. 270.
This passage goes on to associate, and thus equate, paññā with discriminative consciousness (viññāna) due to its ability to differentiate pleasure and pain and to differentiate neither pleasure nor pain. Their perceived difference is that intuitive wisdom is to be developed whilst discriminative consciousness is for comprehending (parinñeyyam). Feeling (vedanā) and perception (saññā) are then associated with discriminative consciousness:

... whatever one feels (vedeti), that one perceives (sañjānati); whatever one perceives that one discriminates; therefore these states are associated, not dissociated, and it is not possible to lay down a difference between these states ....

Sammā ñāna: right insight

In the following passage, the Buddha describes his own enlightenment experience. In doing so, he reviews the transmutation of consciousness from an unhealthy state to the ultimate healthy state. In this summary, he alludes to the concurrence of both meditative systems recorded in the Pāli Suttas, i.e. samatha (tranquility) and vipassanā (insight). The passage depicts the movement from the fourth stage of jhāna to realisation of the three knowledges (te-vijjā). Thereafter, the Buddha gains full intuitive understanding of the Four Noble Truths along with the realisation that he is liberated.

... remembering there is something to be done, did I think: those are mental states.
Monks, unsluggish energy was stirred up in me, unmuddled mindfulness was set up, the body was tranquil, impassible, the mind composed, one-pointed (ekaggam). Then I, aloof from pleasures of the senses, aloof from unskilled states of mind, entered on and abided in the first meditation (jhāna) ... with the mind subjectively tranquillised and fixed on one point (ekodibhāvan), I entered and abided in the second meditation ... the third meditation ... I entered into and abided in the fourth meditation which has neither anguish nor joy, and which is entirely purified by equanimity and mindfulness.

Thus with the mind composed, quite purified, quite clarified, without blemish, without defilement, grown soft and workable, fixed, immovable, I directed my mind to the knowledge and recollection of former habitations (pubbenivāsānussati-ñāna): I remembered a variety of former habitations, thus: one birth, two births, three ... four ... five ... ten ... a hundred ... a thousand ... a hundred thousand births ....

Then with the mind composed, quite purified ... I directed my mind to the knowledge of the passing hence and the arising of beings (sattānam cutūpapāta-ñāna). ... I comprehend that beings are mean, excellent, comely, ugly ....

Then with the mind composed ... fixed, immovable, I directed my mind to the knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (āsavakkhaya-ñāna). I understood as it really is: This is anguish, this is the arising of anguish, this is the stopping of anguish, this is the course leading to the stopping of anguish. I understood as it really is: These are the cankers (āsavas), this is the arising of the cankers, this is the stopping of the cankers, this is the course leading to the stopping of the cankers. Knowing this thus, seeing thus, my mind was freed from the canker of the sense-pleasures, and my mind was freed from the canker of becoming, and my mind was freed from the canker of ignorance. In freedom the knowledge came to be: I am freed; and I comprehended: destroyed is birth, brought to a close is the Brahmavāra, done is what was to be done, there is no more of being such or such. This, monks, was the third knowledge attained by me in the last watch of the night; ignorance was dispelled, knowledge arose, darkness was dispelled, light arose, even as I abided diligent, ardent, self-resolute.\(^{213}\)

M.I.117

The three knowledges (te-vijjā) are set out as follows:

The Three Knowledges (Te-vijjā)

1) pubbenivāsānussati-ñāna: knowledge and recollection of former existences in samsāra
2) sattānam cutūpapāta-ñāna: knowledge of the death and rebirth of beings
3) āsavakkhaya-ñāna: knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (āsavas)

\(^{213}\) Middle Length Sayings, v 1, p. 151. See also M.II.348.
Thus, according to the suttas, the series of stages that a jhāyin must pass through to attain enlightenment is as follows: having developed wholesome moral habit, control of the sense organs, and mindfulness, the meditator practises the jhānas. Thereafter, he directs his mind to the successive realisation of the "three knowledges" (te-vijjā), as a result of which...

... the mind is freed from the canker of becoming and the mind is freed from the canker of ignorance. In freedom the knowledge comes to be that he is freed, and he comprehends: Destroyed is birth, ... done what is to be done, there is no more of being such and such.214

M.I.183-184

In the passage above, release is attained following perfection of the "three knowledges" preceded by the jhānas.215 This series of stages corresponds well with those depicted in the tenfold path noted above. In the tenfold path, sammā ṇāna is similarly preceded by the jhānas (sammā-samādhi) and followed by liberation (sammā vimutti). Since, in addition, the names of the "three knowledges" all end in the term "ṅāna", it may be inferred that the "three knowledges" are identical with sammā ṇāna. With the "three knowledges" corresponding with right insight (sammā nāna), the last three stages of the tenfold path are set out thus:

214 ibid., p. 229. See also M.I.22-23.

215 This account (and other textual evidence) signifies that both the first and second "knowledges" are essential for perfection of the third vijjā (knowledge of the destruction of the cankers, āsavānam khayaṅkāna) which brings about release. Indeed, such knowledge may even constitute liberation (vimutti). Should this be so, vimutti is included under right insight (sammā ṇāna) and paṭīdā.
The Nidāna-samyutta\textsuperscript{217} provides further clarification of the nature of sammā rūpa. Susīma the Wanderer asks the Buddha for clarification regarding the claim by some monks that they are freed by insight (panna vimutti) yet experience neither the supernormal powers (abhīṇās) preceding the destruction of the cankers (āsavas)\textsuperscript{218} nor the immaterial jhānas. The Buddha gives Susīma an extended lesson on right insight (samma nana) commencing with a succinct statement on cause and effect as well as release.

First, Susīma, [comes] knowledge of the law of cause [and effect] (dhammatthiti-nana),\textsuperscript{219} afterwards [comes] knowledge about Nibbāna (nibbāne nānanti).\textsuperscript{220}

S.II.124

In order that Susīma may fully know the reality of cause and effect as well as nibbāna, the Buddha employs a catechism for pointing out (1) the impermanence (anicca), (2) the pain (dukkha), and (3) the impersonality of

\begin{itemize}
  \item \textbf{8. sammā-samādhi} = the jhānas
  \item \textbf{9. sammā rūpa} =
    \begin{itemize}
      \item 1. pubbenivāsānussatiññāna
      \item 2. sattanānam cutūpātattāññāna
      \item 3. āsavānam khayaññāna
    \end{itemize}
  \item \textbf{10. sammā vimutti} = liberation\textsuperscript{216}
\end{itemize}

\textsuperscript{216} Bucknell, "The Buddhist Path to Liberation," op. cit., p. 33.

\textsuperscript{217} S.II.120-127.

\textsuperscript{218} That is to say, 1) magical powers (iddhi vidhā), 2) divine ear (dibbasota), 3) penetration of the minds of others (cetopariya rūpa), 4) divine eye (dibba cakkhu or cutūpātattāññā), and 5) remembrance of former existences (pubbenivāsānussatiññāna). The sixth supernormal knowledge (which is not mentioned directly in this passage) is knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (āsavānam khayaññāna). Items four to six appear frequently as the "three knowledges" (te-vijja).

\textsuperscript{219} The term concerns both knowledge of having a footing in the Dhamma as well as knowledge of causes and effects, i.e. an understanding of the Buddhist metaphysic. See also S.II.24-26.

\textsuperscript{220} Kindred Sayings, v 2, p. 88.
body, feelings, perception, activities, and consciousness (anattā) in the past, present, and future. The well-taught disciple is to regard existence in this way, i.e. according to the Buddhist metaphysic, so as to generate the necessary conditions for attaining freedom. The path to right insight (sammañña) thus commences with the intellectual understanding of cause and effect.

... Now what think you, Susîma? Is the body permanent or impermanent?
Impermanent, lord.
But that which is impermanent, is it painful or pleasant?
Painful, lord.
But that which is impermanent, painful, changeable by nature, do we well to contemplate it as:—this is mine, I am it, it is my spirit?
Not so, lord.
And is not the same true of feeling, of perception, of activities, of consciousness?
It is, lord.
Wherefore, Susîma, whatsoever body, past, future or present, internal or external, coarse or fine, mean or lofty, far or near—of all body to say it is not mine, I am not it, it is not my spirit:—so is this to be regarded by right insight (sammañña) as it really is. And so too are feeling, perception, activities, consciousness to be regarded.

S.II.124-125

Having generally established his metaphysic in dialogue with Susîma, the Buddha continues his catechism in order to determine the extent of Susîma's knowledge, i.e. his degree of realisation of the metaphysic. The Buddha's interrogation explores Susîma's grasp of conditioned origination (paticcasamuppāda) by asking if he recognises or realises each aspect of existence in this way.
Old age and dying are conditioned by birth: Susîma, seest thou this?
Even so, lord.
Birth is conditioned by becoming:-- Susîma, seest thou this?
Even so, lord.
Becoming is conditioned by grasping:-- Susîma, seest thou this?
Even so, lord.
Grasping is conditioned by craving ... craving by feeling ... feeling by contact ... contact by sense ... sense by name-and-shape ... name-and-shape by consciousness ... consciousness by activities ... activities by ignorance:-- Susîma, seest thou this?
Even so, lord.
When birth ceases, old age-and-death ceases:-- Susîma, seest thou this?
Even so, lord.
When grasping ceases becoming ceases; when craving ceases, grasping ceases; when feeling ceases, craving ceases; when contact ceases, feeling ceases; when sense ceases, contact ceases; when name-and-shape ceases, sense ceases; when consciousness ceases, name-and-shape ceases; when activities cease, consciousness ceases; when ignorance ceases, activities cease:-- Susîma, seest thou this?
Even so, lord.

S.II.125-126

The extent of Susîma's knowledge thus far has been detailed and affirmative. However, the Buddha's continued questioning reveals that, even though Susîma may intellectually know and see existence as profoundly conditioned etc., his "knowledge" does not extend to include any of the supernormal knowledges, i.e. the abhiññas which include the "three knowledges" (te-vijjà).

Then surely thou, Susîma, thus knowing, thus seeing, dost enjoy divers mystic powers (iddhi-vidhā):-- being one thou canst become many, being many thou canst become one; thou goest here visible there invisible without let or hindrance through wall, through rampart, through hill as if through air; thou divest into earth and up again as if in water; thou walkest on water without cleaving it as if on earth; thou travellest seated cross-legged through air as if thou wert a bird on the wing; thou canst handle and stroke with the hand this moon and sun, mighty and powerful though they be, yea, even to Brahmaworld canst thou dispose of thyself in the body?
Not so, lord.

221 Passati, realise, know, recognise.

222 Kindred Sayings, v 2, pp. 89-90.

223 Posited by Bucknell to correspond with right knowledge (samma ñâna).
Then surely, Susīma, thus knowing thus seeing, thou canst hear, with pure deva-hearing (dībba-sota) passing that of men, sounds divine and human, be they remote or near?

Not so, lord.

Then surely, Susīma, thus knowing thus seeing, thou canst understand with thy mind the mind of other beings (parassa cetopariya ñāna), other persons, so that thou knowest the character of their thought?224

Not so, lord.

Then surely, Susīma, thus knowing thus seeing, thou canst remember divers former lives (pubbenivāsānussatiñāna), even one birth or many,225 in circumstance and detail?

Not so, lord.

Then surely, Susīma, thus knowing thus seeing, with pure deva-vision (dībba cakkhu or cutūpāpātāñāna) passing that of men thou canst behold beings as they go according to their deeds, deceasing, re-arising?

Not so, lord.

Then surely, Susīma, thus knowing thus seeing, thou attaining by volition canst dwell in those stages of deliverance where the Rūpa-world is transcended and the Immaterial [world is reached]?

Not so, lord.226

S.II. 126-127

Thus Susīma displays the disparity between his intellectual knowledge and direct understanding; he has learnt the knowledge about release, nibbāna, as well as the causal law yet he lacks supernormal knowledges (abhiññās) and freedom from doubt regarding the perfect knowledge of gnosia (aññā).227 Consequently, the Buddha admonishes him for his error.

Verily, Susīma, transgression hath caused thee, so foolish, so stupid, so wrong art thou, to transgress, who didst gain admission as a thief of the Norm into this Norm and Discipline so well set forth.228

S.II.127

Susīma's transgression indicates that more is required than intellectual knowledge of the nature of existence to attain release. Even though the attainment of the material jhānas is implied, the passage suggests further that,

224 A condensation of the formula on S.II.121.
225 A condensation of the formula on S.II.121.
226 Kindred Sayings, v 2, pp. 90-91.
227 ibid., fn. p. 91.
228 ibid., p. 91.
Contemplative Practices in the Pāli Suttas

samma\textit{tha alone} does not bring liberation. It is right insight (\textit{samma\ ñ\ddot{a}na}), which necessarily includes direct experience of the Buddhist metaphysic, that brings liberation. Such is indicated by Susim\'a's demonstration that he has some understanding of conditioned origination etc. but he lacks the \textit{experience} of the \textit{abhiñ\ddot{n\dot{a}s}}; the higher knowledges (or perhaps part thereof) are to be intuitively realised to gain right insight (\textit{samma\ ñ\ddot{a}na}).

The early stage of catechism indicates the intellectual aspect of the Buddhist metaphysic while the latter portion, by Susim\'a's non-attainment of the higher knowledges (\textit{abhiñ\ddot{n\dot{a}s}} etc., points to the direct realisation of the metaphysic. Thus, the intellectual understanding of cause and effect has its intuitive counterpart in the \textit{abhiñ\ddot{n\dot{a}s}} which include the "three knowledges" (\textit{te-vijj\ddot{a}}).

The above passage from the \textit{Nid\ddot{a}na-samyutta} is largely in accord with the series of stages that a \textit{jh\ddot{a}yin} must pass through to attain enlightenment, i.e. release comes about when the meditator directs his mind to the successive realisation of the "three knowledges" (\textit{te-vijj\ddot{a}}) following development of moral habit, control of the sense organs, mindfulness, and the \textit{jh\ddot{a}nas}. To a large degree, this \textit{sutta} also upholds the inference by Bucknell that the realisation of the "three knowledges" is identical with right insight (\textit{samma\ ñ\ddot{a}na}).\textsuperscript{229} \textit{Samma\ ñ\ddot{a}na} results with the perfection of experiencing existence according to the intellectual knowledge of cause and effect. The phrase "... so this is to be regarded by right insight as it really is"\textsuperscript{230} equals the internalisation and full realisation of the Buddhist metaphysic. The \textit{sutta} states that such

\textsuperscript{229} Bucknell, Rod S. "The Buddhist Path to Liberation," op. cit., p. 33.

\textsuperscript{230} ibid., p. 89.
regard brings about repulsion which leads to freedom wherein the meditator knows that "birth is perished".\textsuperscript{231}

So beholding, Susima, the well taught Ariyan disciple feels repulsion at body, feeling, perception, activities, consciousness. Feeling repulsion he is not attracted by them. Unattracted he is set free. Knowledge comes to him freed as to being freed,\textsuperscript{232} and he knows that birth is perished, that the divine life is lived, done is what was to be done; there is nothing further of these conditions.\textsuperscript{233}

S.II.125

The sentence "Knowledge comes to him freed as to being freed, and he knows that birth is perished ...." corresponds with the "third knowledge" (āsavānam khayañāna) wherein the jhāyin brings about the destruction of the cankers (āsavas) and attains a profound realisation of (as opposed to mere knowledge about) the Four Noble Truths. Further, the meditator perceives that he is now liberated from rebirth: "... birth is perished ...."

Profound comprehension of existence and the subsequent freedom from birth, i.e. "... done is what was to be done; there is nothing further of these conditions"\textsuperscript{234}, is freedom from the sense-pleasures or lust (cetovimutti) and freedom from ignorance (paññāvimutti), i.e. the destruction of the cankers (āsavas).

The doctrine of rebirth forms an essential part of the Buddhist metaphysic. Release from the continuous cycle of death and rebirth conditioned by both wholesome and unwholesome volitions (kamma) is the goal of all Buddhist spiritual endeavour, i.e. nibbāna. The Buddha's references to the cycle of rebirth, and liberation from it, constitute an explanation of his expe-

\textsuperscript{231} ibid., p. 89.

\textsuperscript{232} See also S.II.94.

\textsuperscript{233} Kindred Sayings, v 2. p. 89.

\textsuperscript{234} ibid., p. 89.
rience of release within the context of his metaphysic. Thus the belief system of the Buddha, by its incorporation of various contemplative techniques, determines both meditative method and its result. Those occasions when the *suttas* depict the Buddha urging the development of the "three knowledges" (*te-vijjā*) following mastery of *jhānas* also suggest, as stated above, that the eightfold path (*atthangika magga*) is incomplete as a statement of the Buddha's course of practice.\(^{235}\)

All "three knowledges" assume the doctrine of rebirth. The third "knowledge" (whereby the *jhāyin* brings about the destruction of the cankers (*āsavas*) and release from rebirth) involves full realisation of the Buddhist metaphysic as recognised by right view (*samma-dītthi*) and as encapsulated in the Four Noble Truths. In addition to the Four Noble Truths, the description of the third "knowledge" indicates a penetrating realisation of the notion of cause and effect, i.e. conditioned origination (*patīcchasamuppāda*).

Buddhist contemplative practices, it was noted, can be divided into (1) the development of tranquility (*samatha*) and (2) the development of insight (*vipassanā*).\(^{236}\) *Samatha* is equated with the practice of concentration and attainment of the *jhānas*, i.e. *samādhi*.\(^{237}\) Whereas *samatha* is clearly detailed in the *suttas*, the practice of *vipassanā* is not. In order to determine the true character of the practice of *vipassanā*, recent research by Bucknell compares ostensibly parallel lists of stages in the Buddhist course of practice. By doing so, the stage or stages which consistently come after the *jhānas* or *samādhi* are identified. Bucknell notes that

\(^{235}\) Rod S. Bucknell, & Martin Stuart-Fox, "The 'Three Knowledges' of Buddhism," (*Religion*, 13, (1983), 99-112), 101 (referring to M.I.179-184, 344-348; II.38 etc. See also M.I.21-24 where the Buddha, describes his own development of the "three knowledges" on the night of his enlightenment and subsequent release).

\(^{236}\) See M.I.494; S.V.52; D.III.213 etc.

\(^{237}\) See A.IV.360.
... all passages [of the suttas] in which vipassanā is mentioned together with concentration (as samatha, samādhi, jhāna etc.) possess one noteworthy feature: vipassanā is invariably listed after concentration, never before it.\(^{238}\)

Mindfulness (sati), when mentioned with concentration (e.g. as in the Noble Eightfold Path) is uniformly listed before concentration.\(^{239}\) In both listing and practice, the stages represent a sequential development, that is to say, mindfulness (sati) is meant to precede concentration (samādhi) and insight (vipassanā) to follow concentration. Thus sati and vipassanā are different, though related, practices. This being the case,

Just as different sequential positions of sati and vipassanā permit us to infer that sati and vipassanā are different, so (one would expect) identical sequential positions of vipassanā with other stages may permit us to infer that vipassanā and those other stages are identical or equivalent.\(^{240}\)

In all of the lists examined, the te-vijjā (the "three knowledges") follow after the practice of the four rūpa jhānas and are positioned before the realisation of liberation (vimutti). Vipassanā holds the same sequential position as the "three knowledges". Consequently, vipassanā is presumed to correspond with the te-vijjā.\(^{241}\) On the textual evidence, it thus appears that (1) the knowledge and recollection of former existences in samsāra (pubbenivasanussati-ñāna), (2) the knowledge of the deaths and rebirth of beings according to their kamma (sattanam cutūpapāta-ñāna), and (3) the knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (āsavakkhaya-ñāna) are active insight practices.


\(^{239}\) ibid., p. 3. See D.I.62-84, 100, 124 etc.; M.I.179-184, 344-348; II.38; D.II.120 etc.

\(^{240}\) ibid., p. 4.

\(^{241}\) ibid.
If, as Bucknell has it, right insight \((\text{samma} \ \text{nāna})\) equals the "three knowledges" \((\text{te-vijjā})\) (or their functional equivalent), and these in turn are synonymous with the practice of insight \((\text{vipassanā})\), then the perfection of that practice must correspond with the direct, intuitive realisation of conditioned origination \((\text{patīcchasamūppāda})\) etc. With immediate insight, desire and ignorance are eliminated and the chain of cause and effect is broken. This being so, the successive realisation of the "three knowledges" \((\text{te-vijjā})\) represents meditative practices peculiar to Buddhism.

The suttas do not explicitly identify the method by which the meditator directs his mind to the successive realisation of the "three knowledges" \((\text{te-vijjā})\) and thereby attains release. The attainment of cessation \((\text{nīrodha-samāpatti})\) or extinction of perception and feeling \((\text{sāññā-vedayita-nīrodha})\), however, encompasses the destruction of the cankers \((\text{āsava})\) and thus represents the functional equivalent of the "third knowledge", i.e. \(\text{āsavakkhaya-nāna}\), knowledge of the destruction of the cankers. It follows that the method whereby cessation is attained corresponds with, or is the functional equivalent of, the successive realisation of the "three knowledges" \((\text{te-vijjā})\).

**Cessation: the Synthesis of Concentration with Insight**

The suttas, it was noted, discuss a variety of approaches to release depending on the disposition of the \(\text{jhāyin}\) etc. In the Buddhist meditative context, salvation implies varying degrees of skill in \(\text{jhāna}\) combined with wisdom, \(\text{pannā}\). Three types of \(\text{jhāyin}\) with these qualities stand out: (1) the mind-freed \((\text{cetovimutta})\), (2) the wisdom-freed \((\text{paññāvimutta})\), and (3) the

242 S.II.150.

freed-both-ways (*ubhatobhâgavimutta*). The problem of being bound to existence is stated thus:

> These five strands of sense desire ... are called the noose by the Exalted One. What five? Forms cognized by the eye, longed for, alluring, ... bound up with passion and desire; sounds cognized by the ear ... smells by the nose ... tastes by the tongue ... contacts by the touch ... alluring ... bound up with passion and desire -- these five strands of sense desire are called the noose by the Exalted One.

A.IV.449

The first solution to the problem resulting in freedom requires skill in *samatha*, i.e. in all levels of *jhâna* wherein the hindrances are removed and the cankers destroyed by wisdom: the *cetovimutta*.

> ... If cultivated, what profit does calm (*samatha*) attain? The mind is cultivated. What profits from a cultivated mind? All lust is abandoned. ... the ceasing of lust is the heart’s release (*cetovimutti*, mind-freed) ...

A.I.61

The meditative process to liberation by mind is as follows:

> Consider, reverend sir, the monk who, aloof from sense desire, ... enters and abides in the first musing (*jhâna*)--thus far, reverend sir, and in one particular did the Exalted One declare a way from the noose.

> But there, too, is a noose; and what is it there? In so far as thought applied and sustained is not ended (*vitakkavicdrd aniruddhd*), that there is the noose.

> Now consider, sir, the monk who ... enters and abides in the second musing ... the third ... the fourth ... in the sphere of infinite space ... of infinite consciousness ... of neither perception or non perception ... in the ending of perception and feeling (*saññâvedayitanirodha*) and sees by wisdom...

\[244 \text{A.IV.449-455. See also A.I.61.}\]

\[245 \text{Gradual Sayings, v 4, p. 296.}\]

\[246 \text{Gradual Sayings, v 1, pp. 55-56.}\]
(paññā) that the cankers are completely destroyed -- thus far and with no (further) particular did the Exalted One declare a way of escape from the noose.247

A.IV.450-451

The mind-freed jhāyin escapes the noose of sense-desire by attaining the highest level of jhāna ending in the cessation of perception and feeling. Thereafter, paññā sees the destruction of the āsava.

The second solution: i.e. the wisdom-freed (paññāvimutta), also requires skill in the meditative absorptions. In this instance, however, he fully penetrates and understands, by paññā, all levels of jhāna through to the cessation of perception and feeling. In the overall context of the passage, this section suggests that the meditator realises wisdom outside the jhānas.

Wisdom-freed (paññāvimutta), wisdom-freed, he is called, sir; and as to what has the wisdom-freed been declared by the Exalted One?

Consider, sir, the monk who, aloof from sense desire, ... enters and abides in the first musing (jhāna) and by wisdom understands it -- thus far, sir, in one particular has the wisdom-freed been declared by the Exalted One.248

A.IV.452-453

By applying wisdom from the lowest to the highest level of the absorptions, the meditator becomes paññāvimutta (wisdom-freed) through his remote understanding of their nature.

The final approach, the freed-both-ways (ubhatobhāgavimutta), indicates the full synthesis of tranquility with insight. In this instance, the jhāyin "... enters and abides in the first musing and to the extent of that sphere

247 ibid., p. 296.
248 This process continues through all the eight jhānas to the cessation of perception and feeling. Ibid., p. 297.
abides with body attuned to it and by wisdom understands it ...." Continuing to apply this method, the jhāyin also enters the remaining levels of jhāna through to the cessation of perception and feeling. Thus it appears that wisdom is applied from within jhāna.

Freed-both-ways (ubhatobhāgavimutta), freed-both-ways, he is called, sir; and as to what has the freed-both-ways been declared by the Exalted One?

Consider, sir, the monk who, aloof from sense desire, ... enters and abides in the first musing and to the extent of that sphere abides with body attuned to it and by wisdom understands it -- thus far, sir, in one particular has the freed-both-ways been declared by the Exalted One ....

A.IV.453

Freed-both-ways (ubhatobhāgavimutta), as depicted in this passage (where the meditator enters all the meditative absorptions up to the cessation of perception and feeling), suggests a singular approach to freedom by the combining of serenity (samatha) with insight (vipassanā). Initial consideration of the term "ubhatobhāgavimutta" suggests a meditator not only skilled in one method to freedom by mind but also expert in a second approach utilising wisdom. Further consideration of the passages above, however, indicates that freed-both-ways (ubhatobhāgavimutta) represents, in fact, expertise

249 Yathā yathā ca tad āyatinam tathā tathā nam kāyena phassītvā viharati, paññāya ca nam pajñānāti. Ibid.

250 Schmithausen notes what may be a similar synthesis of tranquility with insight occurring in the Anupadasutta (i.e. M.III.25 ff). In that sutta’s description of the liberation process involving the cessation of perception and feeling, ...

"... in each stage of meditative concentration all the mental factors occurring in that stage are ‘fixed immediately upon [their appearance]’ ..., [and] they are known, i.e. consciously noticed, when originating, being present, and disappearing. This entails the comprehension that these factors in fact arise after not having existed before, and that after having existed they disappear again (i.e. that experience shows or confirms their impermanence). [This] seems to express an aspect of observation that goes beyond the mere noticing of the presence of the respective factors though not posterior to it in a temporal sense."

Schmithausen, op. cit., p. 231.

251 Ibid.
in a complete amalgamation of both methods thus engendering an altogether unique approach to release.

Griffiths finds some difficulty with this synthesis of methods. He justly asks

... why it should be thought that the gaining of the attainment of cessation should make a favourable prelude for the exercise of intellectual analysis and the concomitant destruction of 'defilements'... there are substantial intellectual difficulties involved in reconciling and combining into a coherent soteriological system the paradigmatically enstatic techniques involved in attaining cessation and the paradigmatically ecstatic techniques involved in intellectual analysis aimed at knowledge.252

By way of resolving the above problem, Griffiths offers a historical explanation. He suggests that

... soteriological orthodoxy arrived at the position that proper soteriological method must necessarily involve some degree of analytical/intellectual meditation upon central items of Buddhist doctrine. Put still more simply, it quickly became orthodoxy for Indian Buddhist intellectuals that salvation must involve some degree of intellectual appropriation of doctrine, and any canonical material which appeared to present a self-consistent and coherent set of soteriological practices which involved no such intellectual activity therefore needed to be amended to accord with such orthodoxy.253

Though the above historical explanation may be relevant and accurate to some degree, it suggests an a priori judgement that precludes the possibility, in the first instance, of a bona fide synthesis of two seemingly divergent methods of contemplation.

The cessation of bodily, verbal, and mental formations
The attainment of cessation (niruddhasamâpatti) or the cessation of perception and feeling (saññâvedayitanirodha) amounts to a ninth attainment in Buddhist meditation (the rûpa and arûpa jhânas being the other eight).

253 ibid., p. 23.
Cessation of all mental activity is what distinguishes this achievement. Only those possessing the four rūpa jhānas as well as the four ārupa jhānas realise this cessation. Worldlings, stream-enterers, and once-returners (including those possessing all eight attainments or jhānas) cannot achieve it. Non-returners and arahats lacking mastery over the eight attainments also do not attain cessation. Stream-enterers and once-returners lack the necessary qualifications. The attainment of cessation requires complete experience and application of both serenity (samma) and insight (vipassana).254

In relation to concentration and the four supramundane paths of the Noble Ones, the Buddha discusses four proper modes of being addicted to pleasure which conduce to cessation and nibbāna. These entail the jhānas, i.e. the "rapture of utter purity of mindfulness (upekhsatipārisuddhi) and equanimity", plus the four fruits of jhāna.

... by the passing away of the joy and the sorrow he used to feel, he enters into and abides in the fourth Jhāna, rapture of utter purity of mindfulness and equanimity, wherein neither ease is felt nor any ill. These four modes of being addicted and devoted to pleasure ... conduce absolutely to unworldliness, to passionless, to cessation, to Nibbāna. ...

It may happen ... that Wanderers teaching other doctrines than ours may declare: For those who live addicted and devoted to these four modes of pleasure, brother, how much fruit, how many advantages are to be expected? Them ye should answer thus: Four kinds of fruit, brother, four advantages are to be expected. What are the four? Firstly, the case of a brother who by the complete destruction of the three fetters becomes a Stream-winner, saved from disaster hereafter, certain to attain Enlightenment. Secondly, the case of a brother who by the complete destruction of the three fetters has so diminished passion and hate and illusion that he has become a Once-returner, and returning but once to this world will make an end of Ill. Thirdly, the case of a brother who by the complete destruction of the five last fetters, will be reborn in another world, thence never to return, there to pass away. Fourthly, the case of a brother who, by the destruction of the mental Intoxicants, has come to know and realize for himself, even in this life, emancipation of intellect (ceto vimutti) and emancipation of insight (parināvīmucchi), and there abides.255

D.III.132

254 Patisambhiddāmagga I.97.
With the destruction of fetters according to their four degrees of enlightenment experience (realised by each path) along with the stages of salvation or fruits resulting from them, the noble ones come to know the emancipation of mind/emancipation of insight (cetovimutti/paññāvimutti) in this life.

The realisation of cessation represents the zenith of the graduated process aimed at stopping the formation of the psycho-physical process. The nun, Dhammadinnā, explains three types of formations: (1) the bodily formation (kāyasankhāra), (2) the verbal formation (vacsankhāra), and (3) the mental formation (cittasankhāra or manosankhāra). In-and-out-breathing (āṇḍpāṇa) equates with a physiological process related with the bodily formation.\textsuperscript{256} The verbal formation equals applied and sustained thought (vitakka-vicāra: i.e. mental factors directing verbalisation. Perception and feeling (sāññā vedayita), i.e. cognitive processes connected with the mind, amount to the mental formation.\textsuperscript{257} The correspondences between the three formations and the various processes etc. are set out as follows:

1) the bodily formation = in and out breathing 
2) the verbal formation = applied and sustained thought 
3) the mental formation = perception and feeling 

For the jhāyin entering the attainment of cessation, the verbal formation ceases in the second jhāna, the bodily formation ceases in the fourth jhāna, and finally, the mental formation ceases with entrance into cessation.\textsuperscript{258} No experience occurs while the cessation of perception and feeling endures; it is a condition distinguishable from death only by a residual heat

\textsuperscript{256} See, for example, M.II.56. 
\textsuperscript{257} M.III.298-302. 
\textsuperscript{258} M.I.302. See also S.IV.217.
and vitality in the unconscious meditator's body. That is to say, the meditator who has attained \textit{saññāvedayitanirodha}, on the one hand, loses the physical, verbal, and mental activities while retaining heat and vitality. The dead person, on the other hand, loses even heat and vitality.\textsuperscript{259} Regarding the nature of \textit{saññāvedayitanirodha}, Griffiths states:

... it seems fair to draw the conclusion that vitality and heat cannot be said to be experienceable in the attainment of cessation, since, if they were, experiences would occur (which is contrary to the very definition of the condition) ... an individual in the attainment of cessation is conceived of as being without all but the most basic autonomic physical functions. Respiration has ceased completely, and it is likely ... that heartbeat, blood pressure, body temperature and metabolic levels in general have fallen to a very low level. All that remains is a certain minimal level of bodily heat coupled with a dormant, but still present, 'life-principle' -- which seems to mean little more than that the practitioner has the possibility of leaving this condition and restarting normal physical activities, just as a charcoal fire, carefully banked and covered with ash, may appear to be dead but can in reality be rekindled without too much difficulty. ... Actions are not initiated and stimuli are not responded to; the continuum of mental events which constitutes the psychological existence of the practitioner ... runs out into silence.\textsuperscript{260}

The attainment of cessation differs from the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception\textsuperscript{261} and the attainment of fruition. These are states of consciousness made up of consciousness and mental factors (\textit{cetasika}), i.e. the consciousness concomitants: feeling, perceptions, and formations.\textsuperscript{262} Cessation, however, equals the stopping of the consciousness together with its factors. The fourth \textit{arūpa jhāna} does not presuppose any achievements in insight or any attainment of \textit{ariyan} calibre. Both Buddhist

\textsuperscript{259} M.I.296.


\textsuperscript{261} \textit{Nevasaññānāsaññāyatana}.

\textsuperscript{262} See \textit{Nānamoli Thera}, (tr) \textit{The Path of Purification (Visuddhimagga)}, (Kandy: Buddhist Publication Society, 1979; 1st publ. 1956), pp. 367, 481, & 824; also \textit{Vibhanga} 263; \textit{Milinda-panha} 87; D.III.266.
and non-Buddhist meditators achieve it.\textsuperscript{263} The attainment of fruition, however, harmonises serenity (samatha) and insight (vipassana).\textsuperscript{264} Nibbâna is its object. Each fruition opens only to those noble ones who have achieved the corresponding level of deliverance.\textsuperscript{265} It is entered by a preliminary course of practice in insight contemplation on the three marks of existence.\textsuperscript{266} The attainment of cessation, as distinct from both, takes cessation as its object.\textsuperscript{267} Only non-returners and arahats having the eight absorptions can realise it. Cessation is attained via the conjunction of serenity (samatha) and insight (vipassana).\textsuperscript{268}

Insight knowledge of the three marks of existence, anicca, dukkha, and anatta, concerns directly the concentration necessary for full realisation of the four satipatthânas. In the Satipatthâna Samyutta, the Buddha describes a foolish inexperienced monk as not concentrated in jhâna and, consequently, unable to fully appreciate the transience of body, feelings, mind, and mindstates or objects.

\textsuperscript{263} For example, neither-perception-nor-non-perception appears to correspond with asamprajîñâta samâdhi (also known as “dharma-megha-samâdhi”, “cloud of dharma”) in the āstîngika yoga of Patañjali. Here, the jhâyin “... feels that he is saturated (with virtues) and ... has a feeling of ‘Enough’ in respect to all knowledge and all consciousness ...” and so precipitates the subject-orientated enstasy - asamprajîñâta samâdhi.” Asamprajîñâta samâdhi is a subject-oriented samâdhi in that it is attained without the aid of an object, i.e. by supreme detachment or abandonment of all worldly objects. Both nevasaṅgâdāsaṅgâdâyatana and asamprajîñâta samâdhi represent the limits of all karmic action. Edward F. Crangle, “A Comparison of Hindu and Buddhist Techniques of Attaining Samâdhi,” in R.A. Hutch & P.G. Fenner (eds), \textit{Under the Shade of a Coolibah Tree}, (Lanham: University Press of America, 1984, pp. 187-199), pp. 189-194 citing Eliade, op. cit., p. 84.

\textsuperscript{264} Gunaratana, op. cit., pp. 190-191.

\textsuperscript{265} D.III.132.

\textsuperscript{266} Ēnānamoli, op. cit., pp. 828-829. See S.III.13-15; M.III.96.

\textsuperscript{267} ibid., p. 824. See S.V.324; Patisambhidamagga I.97, II.98.

\textsuperscript{268} See, for example, A.IV.421-426; also, Patisambhidamagga I.97.
... monks, here some foolish, inexperienced, unskilful monk abides in body contemplating body (as transient), ardent, composed, and mindful, by restraining the dejection in the world arising from coveting; but, though he abides in body contemplating body, his mind is not concentrated (na samādhiyati), the corruptions of mind are not abandoned, he takes no proper note of that. So as regards feelings ... mind and mind-states ... though he abides in mind-states contemplating mind-states, yet his mind is not concentrated, the corruptions of mind are not abandoned, he takes no proper note of that matter.

... monks, here we may have some wise, experienced, skilful monk. He abides in body contemplating body (as transient), ardent, composed, and mindful, by restraining the dejection in the world arising from coveting. As he thus abides, his mind is concentrated (samādhiyati), the corruptions are abandoned, he takes proper note of the matter. So as regards feelings ... mind and mind-states, in contemplating mind-states his mind is concentrated, the corruptions are abandoned, he takes proper note of that matter.270

S.V.150-152

Whereas the foolish meditator's inability with samādhi excludes him from realisation of transience in the four satipatthānas, the wise jhāyin develops concentration on these. Consequently he fully understands the nature of psycho/physical formations. Indeed, the process of concentration development enables the purification of mind via the getting rid of unskilled thoughts associated with desire, and aversion etc. by attention to characteristics associated with skilled states. As a result, his mind steadies, calms, and becomes one-pointed.271

The means to cessation according to the Buddha

The nature of cessation is discussed in the following report to the Buddha by a wandering mendicant named Pottapâda:

... long ago, Sir, on several occasions, when various teachers, Samanas and Brahmans, had met together, and were seated in the debating hall, the talk fell on trance (abhisāhā-nirōdho: the cessation of consciousness) and the question was: "How then, Sirs, is the cessation of consciousness brought about?"

269 i.e. the five hindrances.

270 Kindred Sayings, v 5, pp. 129-130.

271 M.I.119-122.
Now on that some said thus: "Ideas come to a man without a reason and without a cause, and so do they pass away." ... Thus did they explain the cessation of consciousness.

On that another said: "That, Sirs, will never be so as you say. Consciousness is a man's soul. It is the soul that comes and goes. When the soul comes into man he becomes consciousness, when the soul goes away out of a man he becomes unconsciousness." Thus did they explain the cessation of consciousness.

On that another said: "That, Sirs, will never be so as you say. But there are certain Samanas and Brahmans of great power and influence. It is they who infuse consciousness into a man, and draw it away out of him. When they infuse it into him he becomes conscious, when they draw it away he becomes unconscious." Thus did they explain the cessation of consciousness.

Then, Sir, the memory of the Exalted One arose in me, and I thought: "Would that the Exalted One ... were here, he who is so skilled in these psychical states." for the Exalted One would know how trance is brought about?272

How, ... Sir, is there cessation of consciousness?273

D.I.179-180

In the passage above, the term "abhisãña-nirodha" is translated as "cessation of consciousness". The Rhys Davids & Stede Pali-English Dictionary states that the term "abhisãña" is found "only in the compound abhisãña-nirodha. The prefix abhi qualifies, not sañña, but the whole compound, which means 'trance'. It is an expression used not by the Buddhists, but by certain wanderers."274 The context of the question thus suggests that, while the wanderers knew and believed that consciousness could be stopped, they did not know the method of bringing this about. It is in this way that the Buddhist compound "anupubbabhisañña-nirodha-sampajâna-samâpatti"275 differs from abhisãña-nirodha: it is a succinct explanation of the method.

---

272 Sañña-nirodhassa pakataññã.
273 Dialogues, v 1, pp. 246-247.
274 Rhys Davids & Stede, Pali-English Dictionary, op. cit., p. 70. (Emphasis is mine.)
275 Noted at D.I.184.
Following Potthapāda’s statement about complete trance and his request for information on cessation, the Buddha replies with instruction regarding the causal nature of training in trance (jhāna) where ideas come and go with training. He continues discoursing on removal of the five hindrances by the induction of all the levels of jhānic absorption including the arūpa stages. He describes how, on reaching the summit of consciousness, the jhāyin finally gathers insight to realise a more perfect state void of consciousness.

Thus also is it that through training one idea, one sort of consciousness, arises; and through training another passes away. This is the training I spoke of ....

So from the time, Potthapāda, that the Bhikkhu is thus conscious in a way brought about by himself (from the time of the First Rapture), he goes on from one stage to the next, and from that to the next until he reaches the summit of consciousness. And when he is on the summit it may occur to him: ‘Twere better not to be thinking. Were I to go on thinking and fancying (abhissamkhareyyam), [perhaps ‘perfecting’ or ‘planning out.’], these ideas, these states of consciousness, I have reached to, would pass away, but others, coarser ones, might arise. So I will neither think nor fancy any more.” And he does not. And to him neither thinking any more, nor fancying, the ideas, the states of consciousness, he had, pass away; and no others, coarser than they, arise. So he touches cessation (nirodham phusati). Thus is it, Potthapāda, that the attainment of the cessation of conscious ideas takes place step by step.

Now what do you think, Potthapāda? Have you ever heard, before this, of this gradual attainment of the cessation of conscious ideas?276

No, sir, I have not.277

D.I.180-185

According to the Buddha, release from the five hindrances through all stages of jhāna permits the jhāyin to touch cessation. Thinking, planning etc. possess a transient nature which causes the jhāyin to fall away from the summit of consciousness. By not thinking and planning, the meditator realises

276 Anupubbābhisaṅgā-nirodha-sampajāna-sampāpatti. The translator notes that the foregoing discussion on trance is perhaps the earliest one on the subject in Indian literature. The pre-Buddhist Upanisads do not mention it.

277 Dialogues, v 1, pp. 247-251.
cessation. Thus change is utilised, in a gradual way, to attain the changeless.278

The Buddha concludes his instruction to Potthapâda by informing him that cessation involves one summit, and yet several summits, where the cessation of one state of consciousness generates knowledge dependent on that state until the final cessation.

And does the Exalted One teach that there is one summit of consciousness, or that there are several?

In my opinion, Potthapâda, there, is one, and there are several.

But how can the Exalted teach that there both is one, and that there are also several?

As he attains to the cessation (of one idea, one state of consciousness) after another, so does he reach, one after another, to different summits up to the last. So is it ... that I put forward both one summit and several. ...

It is the idea, Potthapâda, the state of consciousness (saññā), that arises first, and after that knowledge. And the springing up of knowledge (ñāna) is dependent on the springing up of the idea, of the state of consciousness.279

D.I.185

The cessation of one state of consciousness generating knowledge dependent on that state until the final cessation thus demonstrates the interpenetration of concentration and insight to bring about utter release from change and rebirth. Here, as Griffiths explains,

... the problem of bondage to the cycle of rebirth and redeath is solved by (attaining) complete affective disentanglement from the universe,

278 Instruction concerning the causal nature of training in ājīva leading to a more perfect state also brings to mind the passage from the Nidāna-samyutta (S.II.120-127) referred to above, where the Buddha notes that first comes knowledge of the law of cause and effect (dhammatthiti-ñāna) to be followed by knowledge about Nibbāna (nibbāne ṇā-nanti)(S.II.124).

279 Dialogues, v 1, pp. 152.
... to die without returning ... and it is with this goal that the attainment of cessation is to be paradigmatically identified.\textsuperscript{280}

\textbf{Nine cessations: the meditative object determines the result}

The nun Dhammadinnā, as noted above, defined concentration in relation to the activities of the body, of thought, and of mind; body relates to breath, thought concerns speech, and mind involves perception and feeling. Cessation of the three in turn, she states, involves deepening levels of jhānic intensity. Perception and feeling ceases with the transcending of the last jhāna. The suttas describe this as getting rid of the fetters so as to move from instability to stability.\textsuperscript{281}

The shift, in fact, involves nine successive cessations. That is to say, the four rūpa jhānas, along with the four arūpa jhānas plus cessation of perception and feeling, involve the successive stopping of hindrances and other factors until consciousness ceases.\textsuperscript{282} In the words of Griffiths, "... these techniques combine to form a coherent and far-reaching set of enstatic practices ... designed to withdraw the practitioner from emotional attachments to and contacts with the world ...."\textsuperscript{283} The object of concentration, in the context of

\textsuperscript{280} Griffiths, "The Attainment of Cessation in the Theravāda Tradition," op. cit., p. 16.

\textsuperscript{281} M.I.454-456.

\textsuperscript{282} See D.III. 265. The \textit{Anussati-Vagga} refers to the eight jhānas and the three brahma vihāras as "eleven doors to the deathless" though they are impermanent.

the metaphysic, determines the result of meditation. For example, this meditational theme is evident in the Anuruddhasutta where Anuruddha explains the emancipation of mind to the householder Pañcakanga. Here, meditation on various notions or objects brings about new states: i.e. "uprisings into new becoming".

These, householder, are four uprisings into a (new) becoming. What four? As to this ... someone, thinking (meditation) of limited light, abides suffusing and pervading (it in meditation); at the breaking up of the body after dying he arises in companionship with the Devas of limited Light. As to this, householder, someone, thinking of boundless light, abides suffusing and pervading (it in meditation); at the breaking up of the body after dying he arises in companionship with the Devas of boundless Light. As to this ... someone, thinking of tarnished light, abides suffusing and pervading (it in meditation); at the breaking up of the body after dying he arises in companionship with the Devas of tarnished Light. As to this ... someone, thinking of pure light, abides suffusing and pervading (it in meditation); at the breaking up of the body after dying he arises in companionship with the Devas of pure Light. These, householder, are four uprisings into a (new) becoming.246

The attainment of cessation, as distinct from regular jhānic practice, takes no transient object in the normal sense. Instead, the mind is turned towards the so-called Deathless. This non-object of meditation determines finally the ultimate state of release. As stated previously, only non-returners and arahats achieving the eight jhānas can realise it through the synthesis of serenity with insight.

The practice of insight (vipassanā bhāvanā) comprises essentially the examination of psycho/physical phenomena to discover their marks of impermanence, suffering, and selflessness.285 In addition to the development

285 D.I.76.
of tranquility, **jhāna** directly concerns the development of insight (**paññā**),\(^{286}\) i.e. the **jhānas** serve as immediate and powerful subjects of contemplation to be scrutinised with unhindered (i.e. concentrated) insight, in order to discern fully their soteriological limitations, i.e. the three marks of impermanence, suffering and selflessness.

**Jhāna and cessation as objects of meditation**

Jhānic concentration aids in the destruction of the cankers thus providing the opportunity for insight into the marks of existence.\(^{287}\) The following **Sutta** passage depicts this using the different jhānic levels as subjects of meditation for this realisation. Thereafter, the **jhāyin** takes **nibbāna** as his meditative object and aims for the ending of perception and feeling.

> Verily, monks, I say canker-destruction (**āsavānam khayaṃ**) depends on the first musing (**jhāna**); verily, I say canker-destruction depends on the second musing ... on the third ... on the fourth ... on the sphere of infinite space ... of infinite consciousness ... of nothingness; verily, I say canker-destruction depends on the sphere of neither perception nor non perception. ... 

> Consider the monk who, aloof from sense-desires, ... enters and abides in the first musing: whatever occurs there of form, feeling, perception, minding (**sankhāra**) or consciousness, he sees wholly as impermanent (**anicca**) phenomena, as ill (**dukkha**), ... not the self (**anattato**). He turns his mind away from such phenomena and, having done so, brings the mind towards the deathless element with the thought: "This is the peace, this is the summit, just this: the stilling of all mind-activity (**sabbasankhārasamātha**), the renouncing of all (rebirth) basis, the destroying of craving, passionlessness, ending (**nirodha**), the cool (**nibbāna**)." And steadfast therein he wins to canker-destruction (**āsavā khaya**); if not ..., just by reason of that Dhamma zest, that Dhamma sweetness he snaps the five lower fetters and is born spontaneously and, being not subject to return from that world, becomes completely cool there ....

> Verily monks, it is said: I say canker-destruction (**āsavā khaya**) depends on the first musing; and it is for this reason that it is said.

\(^{286}\) **Paññā** encompasses a wide field comprising understanding, knowledge, wisdom, insight. **Vipassanā** (insight) is the specific knowledge or wisdom leading to liberation. The decisive liberating factor is thus insight-wisdom (**vipassanā-paññā**).

\(^{287}\) A.IV.421-426.
Monks, it is said: I say canker-destruction depends on the second ... third ... and fourth musing ... on the sphere of infinite space...of infinite consciousness ... of nothingness ... therefore.

Thus, monks, as far as perception prevails there is gnosis-penetration (aṇñāpatisvedha: comprehension of insight). Moreover, monks, those spheres -- both the attainment of the sphere of neither perception nor non perception and the ending of perception and feeling -- are ones which, I say, ought to be properly made known by musers, skilled in the attainment, skilled in emerging therefrom, after they have attained and emerged therefrom.288

A.IV.421-426

When the jhāyin enters each level of jhāna then leaves jhāna for reflection on it to engender insight as to its impermanence etc. as dictated by the metaphysic, the residual effects of jhāna condition consciousness as it reflects. Such reflection is not only a clarification of the dynamics of the jhānic state but also an intuitive realisation from the jhānic state. Concentration, in these peculiar circumstances, serves to enhance the discriminatory function of consciousness while empowering the development of insight (paññā).

In the process of Upanisadic contemplative practices, it was noted above that the meditator takes a symbol of Brahman as his meditative object for realisation. In the highest level of Buddhist contemplative practices (attainable only by an adept), awareness similarly takes non-awareness or the cessation (niruddha) of consciousness as its object for realisation. In the attainment of cessation or extinction (niruddha-samāpatti), awareness and its concomitants cease altogether. That is to say, consciousness arises that takes as its object the signless, no-formation, no-becoming, nibbāna.289 Consequent

288 Gradual Sayings, v 4, pp. 284-286. See also M.I.349-353 regarding the impermanence of the jhānas as well as of the brahma viharas.

289 King, in an examination of the interaction of jhāna with vipassanā, sees these practices as stemming from different world-views. He notes, however, their similarity as processes. He states:

The two elements are akin internally ... one leading to a blissful union with Ultimate Reality (Brahman) even in this life, the other to a going out of/from all existence. But apart from differing goals and world-views, the two processes (jhānic and vipassanā) as processes are quite similar. ... both seek states transcending time-space oriented, sense-informed consciousness. Jhānic 'awareness' is for its duration locked away from ordinary
But the physical-mental process comes to an end. Having attained nibbāna, the jhāyin (as in the earlier stages) immediately reflects on the experience just past.290

The impermanence of concentration of mind in insight

The following passage from the Cūlassūññatasutta suggests an intermediary stage between using the different jhānic levels as objects of meditation and taking nibbāna as the final meditative object. The sutta notes the conjunction of concentration and insight wherein the jhāyin comprehends the impermanence of concentration of mind in insight (vipassāncitta samādhi) and realises freedom from the cankers.

Awareness. And the continuing jhānic advance represents a progressive refinement of the subject-object nature of consciousness by the increasing subutilization of the object of awareness, until we reach neither-perception-nor-nonperception as an object base of consciousness. On the vipassanīc side is the attainment ... of a direct awareness of 'unformed nibbāna' ... Thus, though the jhānic awareness, no matter how refined at its upper levels, differs from the vipassanīc fruits, both types transcend ordinary consciousness. ... [As he sees it, the yogic] "parent" of the jhānic process sought a unitive awareness with Brahman ... That was its moksa or release. In its Buddhist adaptation, the process was deprived of its traditional goal, but the process itself was retained. Since the Buddhist goal is Nibbāna -- which is the Buddhist moksa -- the jhānic process by definition must lead there also, if it is to contribute in any way to the Buddhist quest. But true to its yogic quality, as a meditation process, it logically heads toward a state in which the total cessation of ordinary consciousness is accomplished -- though with no Brahman realization as content.


290 Regarding the later attitude to the attainment of saññāvedayitanirodha with its associated samatha practices, Griffiths states

... that by the time of such systematic thinkers such as Buddhaghosa ... the attainment of cessation was not given an especially prominent place as a soteriological goal. That this is so reflects the broad consensus on the nature of enlightenment and the methods appropriate to gaining it which had emerged in the Theravāda tradition by this period: the methods of observational and intellectual analysis and the transformation of the perceptual and cognitive skills of the practitioner which goes with them had become normative and it was therefore impossible for the paradigmatically enstatic methods connected with the attainment of cessation to be anything more than marginal. The consensus is, if anything, still more marked among the orthodox intellectuals of contemporary Theravāda Buddhism. Griffiths, "The Attainment of Cessation in the Theravāda Tradition," op. cit., p. 27.
... a monk, not attending to the perception of the plane of no-thing, not attending to the perception of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, attends to solitude grounded on the concentration of mind that is signless (vippasanañcitta samādhi, the concentration of mind in insight). ... His mind is satisfied with, pleased with, ... freed on the concentration of mind that is signless. He comprehends thus: 'This concentration of mind that is signless is effected and thought out. But whatever is effected and thought out, that is impermanent, it is liable to stopping.' When he knows this thus, sees this thus, his mind is freed from the canker of the sense-pleasures and his mind is freed from the canker of becoming and his mind is freed from the canker of ignorance.291

M.III.107-108

Thus having destroyed the cankers and attained insight into the impermanent nature of existence with the aid of high jhānic levels of consciousness, cessation may be realised. Essentially, concentration acts as the efficient cause of knowing and seeing life as it really is. The following passage from the Nidāna Samyutta indicates this.

And what is that which is the cause of liberation? Passionlessness (virāga) is the answer. Yea, I say that passionlessness is causally associated with liberation.

And what is that which is the cause of passionlessness? Repulsion (nibbidā) is the answer. ...

And what is that which is the cause of repulsion? The knowledge and vision of things [yathābhūtaññadassana] as they really are is the answer. ...

And what is that which is the cause of knowledge and vision of things as they really are? Concentration (samādhi) is the answer. Yea, I say that concentration is causally associated with the knowledge and vision of things as they really are.

And what is that which is the cause of concentration? Happiness [sukha] is the answer. [etc.]292

S.II.29-31

From the state of ignorance, the development of concentration engenders knowledge and vision of things as they really are. This in turn leads to repulsion, dispassion, and, finally, liberation. The Pāli term for "knowledge

291 Middle Length Sayings, v 3, pp. 150-151.
and vision of things as they really are" is "yathābhūtaññadassana". The Cūlasaṅkhamanasutta\textsuperscript{293} appears to contradict this causal association by stating that all jhānic states are higher than knowledge and vision. The sutta employs the term "ñānadassana" for "perfect knowledge" or "having a vision of truth", i.e. recognition of truth. Etymologically, the term is a compound of "ñāna" + "dassana". Dassana means, literally, "seeing" or "noticing". On the one hand, "ñāna" translates as a faculty of understanding included in paññā (wisdom, perfected knowledge). Paññā signifies the spiritual wisdom embracing the fundamental truths of morality and conviction (such as anicca, dukkha, and anatta). On the other hand, ñāna relates to common experience\textsuperscript{294} and thus to common knowledge or theoretical understanding. This suggests a form of wisdom capable of weakening, but unable to destroy, the cankers. This requires direct, intuitive wisdom engendered by the conjunction of insight with concentration. Consequently, the suttas state:

... by passing quite beyond the plane of neither-perception-nor-non-perception (nevāsaññāsaññāyatanā), entering on the stopping of perception and feeling (saññāvedayitanirodha), abides in it. And having seen by intuitive wisdom (paññā) his cankers (dāsava) are utterly destroyed. This too ... is a state that is higher and more excellent than knowledge and vision (ñānadassana).\textsuperscript{295}

M.I.204

Insight resulting from ñānadassana weakens the defilements. In synthesis with jhāna and the subsequent realisation of cessation (saññāvedayitanirodha),\textsuperscript{296} the defilements become purified and destroyed.\textsuperscript{297}

\textsuperscript{293} M.I.202-204.

\textsuperscript{294} Rhys Davids & Stede, op. cit., p. 287.

\textsuperscript{295} Middle Length Sayings, v 1, p. 252.

\textsuperscript{296} Referring to the statement following the description of attaining cessation, i.e. "And having seen by intuitive wisdom (paññā) his cankers (dāsava) are utterly destroyed", Vetter suggests that "Probably the best interpretation of this formula is that one did not only consider the state of cessation as an end in itself, but also considered it to be a means of releasing oneself from rebirth." Vetter, op. cit., p. 70.
Sammā Vimutti: Right Liberation

In the tenfold path, the meditator begins by developing right view (samma-ditthi) and right aspiration (samma-sankappa). That is to say he internalises the Buddhist metaphysic. Thereafter, in the textual account of the process of enlightenment, the meditator practices the jhānas. With expertise in concentration, he develops in succession the "three knowledges", which lead from an intellectual understanding of cause and effect to a profound realisation of paticcasamuppāda etc., i.e. he practices vipassanā. Proper development of the "three knowledges" corresponds with the penetrative understanding of cause and effect. This constitutes right knowledge or insight (sammañña).

It was noted above that the successive realisation of the "three knowledges" (te-vijjā) culminates in knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (āsavakkhaya-ñāna) with subsequent realisation of liberation. It was also noted that the attainment of cessation (niruddha-samāpatti) likewise encompasses the destruction of the cankers (āsavakkhaya). Insofar as the conjunction/synthesis of samatha (i.e. concentration, the jhānas) with vipassanā (insight into the Four Noble Truths, paticcasamuppāda etc.) brings about cessation (niruddha-samāpatti) and the destruction of the cankers (āsavakkhaya) followed by release, the fusion of samatha with vipassanā represents the functional equivalent of the "three knowledges" (te-vijjā).

297 Note the following passage, where concentration in conjunction with insight leads to realisation of the Four Noble Truths, to the destruction of the āsavas, and to release. Here, pañña appears to refer to common knowledge or theoretical understanding:

Putting away these five hindrances, when the mind’s corruptions are weakened by insight (pañña), aloof from sensuous appetites ... he enters and abides in the first musing (jhūna) ... [etc.] 

A.III.93.

Gradual Sayings, v 3, pp. 75-76.
Fully matured, the amalgamation of concentration practices (samatha) with insight practices (vipassanā) makes possible the attainment of cessation (saññāvedayitanirodha), wherein the jhāyin realises ceto-vimutti/paññā-vimutti (liberation of mind/liberation through understanding), which in turn precipitates release from rebirth. In this fashion, both the course of contemplative practices and subsequent release of the Buddha are distinguished from those of his counterparts in other traditions. This warrants ceto-vimutti/paññā-vimutti being equated with "right release" (samma vimutti) in the absence of any detailed explanation of sammā vimutti in the suttas.

Conclusion
The Visuddhimagga, when considering purification of view, establishes a contrast between two types of jhāyins.298 They are distinguished by their course of contemplative development. These types of jhāyins are called (1) the samathayānika, one "who takes serenity (samatha) as his vehicle", and (2) the vipassanāyānika, one "who takes insight (vipassanā) as his vehicle". This unqualified distinction is not found in the suttas. On the basis of commentary, it is sometimes supposed that such a distinction implies the possibility of a method of practice leading directly to wisdom without the previous development of jhānic concentration.

Qualification for the development of full insight, according to the suttas, requires prior training. That is to say, jhāyins cultivate a gradual practice in mindfulness and self-possession (satisampajañña),299 shame and fear of blame or sin (hirottappa),300 sense restraint (indriyasamvara),301 moral practice (sīla) and right concentration (sammā samādhi). Each of these forms

298 Vism 587-588.

299 See D.I.70 and A.II.210 for a description of satisampajañña.

300 See M.I.271 and A.I.50.

301 See D.II.281; M.I.269, 346; S.I.54; A.III.360; IV.99; V.113 sq., 136, 206.
the foundation of the one following. Right concentration (sammā samādhi) is defined as the four jhānas: the final qualifying attainment for attempting the development of insight leading to wisdom. In terms of the threefold training (sikkhā), concentration must be accomplished before extending and deepening insight towards full understanding.

The various subjects and methods of meditation depicted in the Pāli Suttas may (if one so wishes) be classified and separated into two interrelated and interdependent systems suggesting different achievements in contemplative practice rather than alternative approaches to nibbāna. The first is the development of tranquility (samatha-bhāvanā), sometimes called development of concentration (samādhi-bhāvanā). The second is the development of insight (vipassanā-bhāvanā) or the development of wisdom (paññā-bhāvanā).

The practice of samatha development creates a tranquil, concentrated consciousness, an experience of inner calm. This acts as a powerful aid in the generation of wisdom. The method forms the progressive integration of the mind by fixing it upon a single wholesome object. Unwholesome states preventing its arising are thus calmed and suppressed. The development of samatha brings about samādhi. This is a state of unification of mind devoid of mental wandering and arousal. Tranquility (samatha) is thus a synonym of concentration (samādhi), one-pointedness of mind (cittekaggatā), and undistractedness (avikkhepa).

302 The interdependence of this group is noted in the Sati-Vagga, A.IV.336.
303 For example, see D.313.
304 For example, see Vajirañāna, op. cit., p. 341.
The course of practice is referred to occasionally as the samâdhi system of meditation because the development of tranquility is realised in jhâna-samâdhi. The mental unification that the jhânas bring about facilitates the development of full insight. Any of eight levels of absorption are cultivated. The Suttas often advocate the jhânas for generating the mental purification essential as a foundation for wisdom. The jhânas purify the mind by promoting wholesome factors which overcome defiling elements, the five hindrances (nîvarana). Attainment of each jhânic level entails the progressive elimination of mental elements that hinder progress. Utmost perfection in such concentration provides access to five "higher powers" or supernormal knowledges (abhiññâs).

Vipassanâ development, as also noted above, aims to realise a full intuitive understanding of the true nature of existence. Having gained an initial intellectual understanding of the nature of existence, the jhâyun begins to systematically internalise the Buddhist metaphysic, in the first instance, via the broad non-discursive observation of the changing phenomena of the psycho/physical complex, i.e. the practice of mindfulness (sati). At this stage of contemplative development, the degree of insight is partial and limited. It remains for this superficial understanding of the Buddhist metaphysic to be intensified and deepened via its association with the practice of samatha.

Sati and samatha development, as previously stated, are common to both Buddhist and non-Buddhist contemplative practices. For example, contemplative practices in the Upanisads, we have seen, comprise essentially a synthesis of two practices wherein yogic techniques are incorporated into the process of upâsanâ (veneration). That is to say, samatha meditation (i.e. yoga) is adopted to intensify and extend upâsanâ. Profound meditation (Sanskrit: dhyâna; Pâli: jhâna), being useful and appropriate to the circumstances, is taken up to render upâsanâ powerful and successful. In this in-
stance, yogic concentration equates with the intensity of devotion as well as the means to self-purification. Perceptible and imperceptible symbols of Brahman are adopted as objects of veneration (and thus concentration) resulting in one-pointedness. That is to say, the worshipper/meditator of the Maitrī Upanisad etc. takes up particular subjects for exercises in the development of mindfulness and samādhi meditation by adopting an external or internal symbol of Brahman to worship and to apply the focus of his attention with jhānic intensity. The worshipper considers the ensuing full realisation to be eternal.

The Pañcattaya Sutta,305 while explaining the bases of false conceptions, mentions the viññāna-kasina (life-force or consciousness device). Here, the sutta notes some meditators claiming the viññāna-kasina as immeasurable and permanent. However, the Buddhist position, unlike the Upanisadic claims regarding similar meditative subjects, views even this object of meditation as transient.306 Be that as it may, Buddhist practice, as depicted in the Pāli Sutta Pitaka, attains its goal, nibbāna, in a fashion similar to the Upanisadic method outlined here. As with the Upanisadic system of upāsanā, the yogic techniques of one meditative system are incorporated into the second meditative system. That is to say, two seeming meditative systems, i.e. samatha development comprising yogic techniques, plus vipassanā development aiming for knowledge, couple or combine to bring full knowledge or wisdom (paññā) and so release. Samatha, in the sense of control and contemplation, is taken up by the process of vipassanā to amplify and extend insight. Profound meditation (jhāna) is utilised to render knowledge potent. Yogic concentration is the means to self-purification while increasing the degree of paññā by providing greater penetrative power resulting in release.

305 M.II.229.
306 See A.V.60.
Consciousness is trained to realise all aspects of existence as depicted in the Pāli Suttas. Continuous internalisation of the Buddhist notions of existence, developed and heightened by satipatthāna techniques and jhānic concentration, renders experience of existence identical with those notions.

Satipatthāna meditation, when compared with the narrow forms of concentrative meditation, entails a broad spectrum of attention. Narrow forms of concentrative meditation, i.e. the jhānas with their keen awareness, engender calm or tranquility (samatha). Tranquility (samatha) and insight (vipassanā) are thus identical with concentration (samādhi) and wisdom (pāñña). Together they are conducive to the superior knowledge of nibbāna wherein all lust and ignorance are abandoned. Of the contemplative practices depicted in the suttas, the so-called vipassanā meditation (i.e. the broad focus of attention group characterised, in the initial stage, by the utilisation of forms of mindfulness, satipatthāna) receives scant attention. The texts, however, depict the development of samatha meditation (i.e. the narrow focus of attention group characterised by concentration, samādhi) in great detail.307 Rather than two distinct styles of meditation, the suttas suggest two aspects of a single contemplative practice. Sammā-ditthi and sammā-sankappa (as primary intellectual understanding, and thus the genesis of the process of vipassanā) along with satipatthāna exercises initially install the Buddhist metaphysic (i.e. the characteristics of existence etc.) firmly in the jhāyin's consciousness; samatha meditation purifies consciousness to enhance and empower realisation of the metaphysic at the conclusion of the process of

307 By way of illustration, the number of references to contemplative praxis in the computer database compiled for this chapter reveals that references to the development of "vipassanā" number slightly more than those for "samatha". Regarding details of the meditative practices, however, "pāñña" of the vipassanā group occurs approximately twice as often as "sīla" while references to the practice of "samādhi" of the samatha group are double those of "pāñña". Of all the terms and relevant methods investigated, "jhāna" of the samatha practice is most frequently employed; references to "jhāna" are three times as frequent as those to "samādhi".
vipassanā. On some occasions, the contemplative practices involve greater attention to one or the other aspect. On different occasions, the development of the practices mingles the two aspects in varying degrees. Complete knowledge or insight results from their full development and balanced synthesis. That is to say, the notions associated with the content or objects of broad-focus vipassanā meditation, i.e. the concepts of the three characteristics of existence: transience (anicca), unsatisfactoriness (dukkha), and emptiness (anattā), when combined with the narrow focus of jhānic concentration, become fully realised (i.e. actualised).

Instruction in Buddhist ontology, augmented with the contemplative practices of samatha development and vipassanā development, thus leads from an intellectual understanding of the nature of existence to the actual immediate experience of being according to the metaphysic. Buddhist metaphysical notions regarding the true nature of reality (i.e. imperceptible symbols of reality), along with the immediate personal experience of existence (i.e. perceptible signs of existence), become topics for insight and thus objects of concentration climaxing in one-pointedness and realisation. The opportunity exists now for the complete elimination of sense-desire, of desiring eternal existence, of wrong views, of ignorance etc., i.e. nibbāna. With freedom, the release of nibbāna, comes the elimination of the cankers (āsava) and the ten binding fetters of existence308 rooted in the three tendencies to attachment, hostility, and delusion.

308 The first five fetters pertain to the sensuous world while the remainder pertain to the higher world. They are (1) belief in a permanent individuality (sakkādyaditthi), (2) doubt (vīcikicchā), (3) belief in religious rites and ceremonies (silabbataparāmāsa), (4) sensuous passion (kāmacchanda), (5) malice (vyāpāda), (6) desire for existence in the world of form (ruparāga), (7) desire for existence in the formless world (arūparāga), (8) pride (māna), (9) distraction (uddhaacca), and (10) delusion (avijjā). See A.V.17.
Paññā, in its highest development, fuses concept with reality. The Buddhist conception of reality, when taken as an object of meditation and concentrated upon with sufficient scope and intensity, becomes that reality in profound realisation. This process is similar, in many ways, to Upanisadic contemplative practices wherein the meditator takes up a concrete/abstract symbol of Brahman. Devoted veneration thereon is intensified via application of the acute concentration of dhyāna until realisation of Brahman ensues. In the Buddhist context also, concentrative meditation (jhāna/samādhi) acts as a soteriological tool. In this instance, the goal of insight (paññā) is the object of meditation. As such it determines the result of the application of jhānic attention. It appears that concentration is taken up by vipassanā meditation in much the same way as it is by upāsanā of the Upanisads.

As with the Upanisadic contemplative tradition, the highest level of jhānic concentration here too immerses the mind totally in its object, resulting in a condition of profound psychic identification. Again like the Upanisadic meditative practices, wherein yogic techniques are incorporated into the process of upāsanā (veneration), the Buddhist contemplative system integrates yogic techniques into the process of insight (vipassanā). Samatha meditation, being expedient, is taken up here to render the nascent insight (derived from the Buddhist metaphysic and satipatthāna) powerful and successful. Yogic concentration is the means to self-purification while increasing the intensity or depth of understanding cum realisation.

Of the two systems, the cultivation of insight, in this way, becomes the essential means to salvation. Understanding is the primary counteractant to the ignorance supporting bondage and suffering. The deepening of understanding from the shallow and wide observational quality of mindfulness

---

practice \((satipatthāna)\) to the magnitude of profound wisdom \((pāṇīḍa)\), however, requires a measure of concentration \((samādhi)\) produced by samatha meditation. The development of samatha, like the development of vipassanā, is equally an essential component of the Buddhist meditative process. The two components of meditation unite to produce enlightenment and the end of suffering. Samatha development and vipassanā development amount to the two conditions for full understanding. As noted above, the cultivation of mind, on the one hand, generates the abandonment of lust resulting in the mind’s release \((cetovimutti)\). On the other hand, the cultivation of introspection \((vipassanā)\) also brings about release \((pāṇīḍavimutti)\) via the cessation of ignorance.\(^{310}\)

The Anisamsa Vagga notes the mechanics of release by tranquilisation of the mind and by insight. The practice brings about pure equanimity and certain knowledge.\(^{311}\) Pure equanimity and certain knowledge thus correspond with two apparent approaches causing the mind’s release \((cetovimutti)\) and release by insight \((pāṇīḍavimutti)\). Cetovimutti (deliverance by mind) implies the full development of calm \((samatha)\), i.e. proficiency in concentration \((samādhi)\). Pāṇīḍavimutti indicates profound expertise in the refining and perfecting of introspection or insight \((vipassanā)\) on the path to wisdom \((pāṇīḍa)\).\(^{312}\) On the whole, scholars and contemplatives of modern Theravāda Buddhism divorce the development of calm \((samatha)\) from the methodical

\(^{310}\) A.I.61.

\(^{311}\) A.V.32.

\(^{312}\) See A.I.61 above where the cultivation of calm \((samatha)\) represents the cultivation of mind \((citta)\) resulting in the abandoning of all lust \((rāga)\); where also the cultivation of introspection \((vipassanā)\) represents the cultivation of insight \((pāṇīḍa)\) resulting in the abandoning of all ignorance \((avijjā)\). Thus, concentration freed from lust is cetovimutti while introspection freed from ignorance is pāṇīḍavimutti.
development of insight (vipassanā). With the advent of the Burmese satipatthāna (mindfulness) method of meditation earlier this century, Theravāda Buddhism (largely but not entirely) speaks now of two contemplative methods. Of these, the systematic development of insight (vipassanā) solely via satipatthāna meditation becomes elevated to the status of paramount practice. The development of jhānic skills now endures something of a contemporary eclipse. Nonetheless, the distinction between the practice of calm (samatha) and the practice of insight (vipassanā) is not explicit in the Pāli Suttas. That is to say, the earliest and most authoritative of Buddhist canonical sources offering instruction in meditation indicate a single method wherein two interdependent and interactive aspects mature to a flawless soteriological harmony. Both aspects of the contemplative process reduce or decline in value to the degree that they are viewed as separate systems of meditation. Bringing both aspects (or both systems) together generates the converse, resulting in augmentation of the meditative process; i.e. the whole, here, is greater than the parts.

The powers of the Buddha extend, as a single practice, from intellectual insight to intuitive understanding by way of moral habit and concentration etc. The Buddha offers this summary:

Monks, if a monk should wish: 'By the destruction of the cankers, having realised by my own super-knowledge here and now the freedom of mind, and freedom through wisdom that are cankerless, entering thereon, may I abide therein,' he should be one who fulfils the moral habits, who is intent on mental tranquility within, who does not interrupt (his) meditation, who is endowed with vision, a cultivator of empty places. 314

M.I.35-36

313 For example, see Vajirāñāna, op. cit., p. 343 and Gunaratana, op. cit., pp. 146-150 & 199-200 etc. Both texts divide the practice into two complex systems.

314 Akankheyyasutta: Discourse On What One May Wish, Middle Length Sayings, v 1, pp. 44-45.
Through his own efforts in generating moral purity and mental serenity, the jhāyin eliminates the corruptions of sense-desire etc. thus engendering wisdom and freedom of mind. The resulting wisdom (paññā), by precipitating the attainment of extinction (nirodhā-samāpatti), represents the decisive liberating factor of Buddhism. Thus vipassanā, and not jhāna, is the specifically Buddhist practice.

Further, it has been noted in this chapter that early Buddhist contemplative practices resemble (in their basic mechanics) Brahmanical practices examined in earlier chapters. Both Brahmanical and early Buddhist approaches employ broad and narrow focus of attention techniques. As well, each utilises a similar synthesis of techniques in that concentration is brought to bear on internalised aspects of the metaphysic peculiar to the tradition. The Buddhist application of the wide focus type of attention, i.e. sati, mindfulness, resembles (in its fundamental mechanism) the pre-Buddhist upāsanā of the early Vedic/Upanisadic stream. This suggests a cross-fertilisation of practices from the early Vedic/Upanisadic source.
CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

As noted in the Introduction, historical studies concerning the origin and development of early Indian contemplative practices fall into two main camps. One major school of thought argues for a Vedic origin developing linearly through the *Upanisads* to the Buddhist canonical literature; the other postulates a synthesis of Vedic/Aryan methods and ideas with indigenous yogic practices. This work has sought to contribute to an eventual resolution of this problem by examining certain of the most relevant textual evidence from a critical historical perspective.¹

The study has been restricted to the practices of the earliest significant and formative periods, as portrayed in the *Rg Veda*, the principal *Upanisads*, and the *Pāli Sutta Pitaka*. The picture that has emerged from this study can be summarised as follows.

The early Vedic contemplative, the *rsi*, is portrayed as seeking to realise a vision, or bring a vision to mind. He employs word and sacrifice in an attempt to bring his mental picture to reality. The method of the *rsi*, based on devotional prayer/visionary thought (*dhīh*), provides the basis for the development of orthodox contemplative praxis: the practice whereby a vision becomes actualised foreshadows the later practice

¹ That is to say, this work has aimed to learn about early Indian contemplative practices by analysis of textual material regarding their origin and development. This has provided the opportunity to develop an evaluation of the relative importance of data as they relate to the central question of the thesis.
known as *upāsanā* (worship/meditation), first referred to in the *Brāhmanas*.

In the practices of the *Brāhmanas* and *Aranyakas*, the performance of the mental sacrifice in close association with the external rite represents both an initial recognition of the efficacy of mind and contemplation to acquire further self-control, and a movement towards the utilisation of *yoga* techniques by way of complete internalisation of the sacrifice. Meditation is eventually substituted for the external sacrifice. With applied visualisation involving a degree of attention, the external sacrifice becomes a form of worship/meditation (*upāsanā*).

These early contemplative practices are instrumental. Devotional prayer/visionary thought (*dhīh*) and substitution-meditation (*upāsanā*) are used to bring about worldly changes such as the destruction of enemies. The mental performance of the sacrifice in close association with the external rite represents a possible precursor to practices aimed at gaining control over one's destiny. Thereafter, this ability develops to the full interiorisation of the material sacrifice by the technique of worship/meditation (*upāsanā*) to gain the same outcome. This practice represents an embryonic stage in the growth of *upāsanā*, which becomes fully developed in the *Upanisads*.

The *Rg Veda* discloses the early Vedic aspiration and limited ability to direct and apply the mind for particular material ends. Further, this text reveals only the rudiments of classical *yoga* with its customary pessimism. Yogic practices therefore clearly lie beyond the Vedic/Aryan context.

The *Rg Veda* depiction of the rṣi differs from that of the other contemplatives in lacking references to austerities, self-denial, etc. The
muni (ecstatic), brahmacārin (religious student), and yati (ascetic) are involved in the demonstration of potent mind techniques similar to yogic techniques and different from those involved in the worship of gods and the performance of sacrifice by the rṣi. The evidence suggests that these ascetics etc. represent the forerunners of later yogic contemplatives.

The data derived from this examination of Vedic texts suggest an influence on Vedic contemplatives by pre-Aryan yogins of aboriginal origin - possibly the munis (ecstatics). Further, the data reveal an early distinction between two meditative approaches which later merge. This undermines theories arguing for a purely Vedic/Aryan origin for Indian contemplative practices; as well, it reinforces the view that yogic disciplines were practiced initially as a separate method from those documented in the early Vedic hymns. In the Upanisadic period, the ceremonial worship of the earlier period shifts to meditative worship (upāsanā). In the Upanisads, the term upāsanā denotes an act of "coming near" an object by way of devotion. In upāsanā practice, various tangible objects, in addition to abstract images fixed internally, become the focus of constant meditation as the means to realise Brahman. Thus a predominantly mental exercise comes to be the preferred religious practice.

Upāsanā is aimed at attaining a mental perception, or even a complete intuitive realisation, of Brahman. Here (as was demonstrated in Chapter 3) the process of upāsanā has taken up yoga techniques. In its Upanisadic usage, the term yoga means control and contemplation. It also refers to a direct realisation of Brahman, oneness or union with Brahman, the culmination of the meditator's striving. Yoga practices are efficacious in control and in mastering the sense-organs, including the
mind. They are blended with *upāsanā* to render it powerful and successful. *Dhyāna* thus becomes a part of the process of *upāsanā* in order to bring about the direct realisation or perfect union with *Brahman*. Thus the practitioner becomes both worshipper and meditator.

Earlier *Upanisads* occasionally advocate *yoga*. Before the *Maitrī*, however, specific yogic techniques as such are not obviously or clearly included in the overall process of worship (*upāsanā*). The incorporation of the techniques of *yoga* into the process of *upāsanā* is demonstrable, in particular, in later *Upanisads* such as the *Katha*, *Svetāsvatara*, and the post-Buddhist *Maitrī* where it is most developed. The *Maitrī* explicitly identifies *yoga* techniques and advocates the use of *yoga* to gain the intuitive realisation of *Brahman*.

The *yoga* depicted in the *Maitrī* resembles practices recorded in the early Buddhist canonical literature and later in Pāṇḍitā’s *Yoga-sūtras*. Obvious correspondences exist in the basic mechanics of the contemplative practices advocated by these three schools. The evidence suggests that the ideas and fundamental techniques of *yoga* have been appropriated by the *Upanisads* from heterodox sources. Buddhism is the most probable source. This conclusion further undermines the theory of a purely linear development. The sudden appearance of explicit, detailed references to *yoga* in the post-Buddhist *Upanisads* lends support to the theory of a synthesis of indigenous, yogic practices with the Aryan methods and ideas.

The earliest *Upanisads* describe a broad focus form of attention in the worship of internalised symbols (*upāsanā*). Similarly, the Buddhists texts describe a wide focus type of attention in mindfulness (*satipatthāna*) practice. In mindfulness practice, the meditator takes up
notions from the Buddhist metaphysic for contemplation. Bare attention to certain aspects of existence reinforces these notions. Buddhist meditation is aimed at direct intuitive perception of these notions. Intense concentration (samādhi) via jhānic techniques generates insight (nāna/panna) or full realisation of the Buddhist ideas regarding reality. This brings about dispassion and release from conditioned existence (nibbāna).

In the *Upanisads*, it was noted, external and internal symbols representing *Brahman* come to be utilised as objects for devotional practice leading to the taking up of concentrative techniques with subsequent intuitive realisation of union with *Brahman* in samādhi. As such, these symbols (with their associated meanings) represent the Upanisadic counterpart of the Buddhist metaphysic. The Buddhist metaphysic is, in the first instance, systematised and internalised as right view (samma ditthi) and right aspiration (samma sankappa). Thereafter, the metaphysic is employed as the object for mindfulness exercises (satipatthāna).

In the later stages of Buddhist practice (as shown in Chapter 4), the conjunction/synthesis of concentration meditation (samatha) with insight practices (vipassanā) generates the conditions necessary for immediate, direct, inner realisation of the Buddhist metaphysic and thus precipitates release according to the Buddhist metaphysic and soteriology. The incorporated samatha practices are required to empower the understanding of the Buddhist metaphysic in a process similar to that of Upanisadic practices. However, the Buddhist metaphysic joins initially with satipatthāna meditations and concentration (samatha); on this foundation, the union develops eventually into right insight (samma nāna) and right release (samma vimutti), the synthesis of samatha and vipassanā. Right insight (samma nāna), which necessarily includes intu-
itive realisation of the Buddhist metaphysic, is what brings liberation. Concentration acts as an aid to generate a direct experience of the true nature of existence and release. The cultivation of samatha, whilst having served mainly as a preparation for insight, works also within the practice of vipassanā meditation.

Vipassanā represents the Buddha's exclusive and original discovery. The practice of insight meditation (vipassanā), as a discrete meditation following on from (though continuing to utilise) concentration (samatha), distinguishes the Buddha's course of practice from those of the other meditative schools, including both early Vedic and Upanisadic practices with their particular world-views.

The Buddhist course of practice leading to release may be described as a sequential and cumulative path wherein an initial understanding of the Buddhist world-view leads, via training in morality and the refinement of concentration and insight practices, to the profound realisation of suffering etc. as it really is.

The samādhi of the early Buddhist jhānas and of the Upanisads consists of techniques involving gradual elimination of hindrances and cultivation of consciousness until the psychic flux is arrested. In the Upanisads, release is union with Brahman through this samādhi. In the early Buddhist texts, this experience is identified as soteriologically limited and as merely a means to insight-based liberation. The early Buddhists, like the Upanisadic sages, take up certain objects for contemplation. They too manipulate external material circumstances to affect both the internal and external environment for personal benefit. However, the contemplative objects of Buddhism, with their resultant insight (vipassanā) or wisdom (paññā), are altogether unique.
Furthermore, realisation of these objects, via intense concentration and insight, brings about a result completely different from the Upanisadic realisation. Hence, the practice and progression of *vīpāsana* and *paññā* in Buddhism have clearly developed independently of orthodox contemplative practices. These practices in no way represent a carry-over from orthodox sources. Similarly, the *yoga* practices, involving jhānic techniques taken up by the later Upanisadic sages and extensively documented by the Buddhist contemplatives, appear to be heterodox practices probably of indigenous origin.

The hymns of the *Ṛg Veda*, along with the *Brāhmaṇas* and *Aranyakas*, depict little of a pessimistic attitude towards existence. In contrast, the *Upanisads* and the *Pāli Suttas* of early Buddhism express world-views characterised by pessimism along with a preoccupation with personal transformation and ultimately emancipation from this world — liberation through the application of *yoga* techniques.

The later Vedic contemplatives deny both external and internal sacrifices. Concerned with salvation, they rely on mental techniques to achieve a goal completely different from that of the early Vedic *ṛṣi*. The early Vedic practice of worship-meditation (*upāsana*), though utilised for an altogether different purpose from later contemplative techniques, provides (in its fundamental mechanics) a basis for the subsequent development and practice of *upāsana* depicted in the principal *Upanisads*. To the degree that the antecedent practice of *upāsana* resembles a particular contemplative technique of early Buddhism, namely mindfulness (*satipatthāna*), the earlier Vedic/Upanisadic practice of worship-meditation also provides (in its basic mechanics) a foundation for one aspect of Buddhist meditation. As the method of *upāsana* predates early Buddhism, Buddhist *satipatthāna* techniques probably owe their genesis
to the Vedic stream of contemplative practice, while also owing an indirect debt to the early non-Vedic contemplatives. The objects of *satipatthāna*, however, are peculiarly and entirely Buddhist in origin.

Upanisadic and early Buddhist contemplative practices represent similar approaches employing both wide and narrow forms of attention resulting in a synthesis of techniques. Influenced by their specific doctrines, the meditators' unique objects of awareness, such as abstract symbols of *Brahman* or metaphysical notions appear, however, to determine the contemplative path and, as a consequence, the end result. As well, they affect what can be said about the final state of the released. As depicted in the texts of these and other soteriological systems, such unique objects and their apparent function in meditation could form a valuable subject for further research.  

This study has not yielded a neat resolution of the conflict between the linear theory and the synthesis theory regarding the origin and development of early Indian contemplative practices. Rather, it has drawn attention to certain relevant considerations, hitherto neglected, which suggest that it is not simply a matter of choosing between the two competing theories. The evidence indicates that early Indian contemplative practices developed neither in a simple linear fashion nor as a result of a single synthesis. It indicates, rather, a zigzag progression wherein Aryan/Brāhmanical contemplative practices both influenced, and were influenced by, indigenous yogic disciplines.

2 See Appendix 3.
APPENDIX 1

The Dravidian/Indo-Aryan Interface

With regard to a synthesis of Aryan and non-Aryan systems in the post-Vedic period, the picture is complicated somewhat by the difficulty in identifying the indigenous people of India. For example, the Dravidians, while being non-Vedic and non-Aryan, in fact may not be among the aboriginal races of India. MacAlpin argues that the Dravidians were not indigenous to India. On the basis of the modern distribution of Dravidian speakers and family-tree relationships, he concludes that the Dravidians, like the Aryans, came from the west at about the same time as the Aryans and moved through the Indus Valley "... during the height of the Harappan civilization and must have played some part in it."¹

Similarly, Southworth decides that Dravidian and Indo-Aryan speakers must have been in contact with each other in the Indus Valley, at the latest around the middle of the second millennium B.C.² Southworth, however, believes that the Dravidians precede the Aryans by a millennium or more in their journey from the west.³ While noting that many scholars accept the argument that the presence of retroflex consonants, etc. in Sanskrit came about through contact with the

² ibid., p. 263.
³ ibid., p. 206.
Dravidians, Southworth raises the interesting point that both Aryans and Dravidians may have borrowed from an indigenous source, i.e. through contact with languages that existed in India when Dravidian speakers arrived there. According to Southworth, "There is clear evidence of the presence of other important ethnic groups, speaking other languages, in the area of contact, but their identity is unknown."

Though the Vedic texts mainly describe the hostile aspects of the Dravidian/Indo-Aryan interface, no doubt wholesome social relationships existed as well. Basham notes that

The polarity of Aryan and Dravidian which has been made much of in recent generations seems to have meant very little in earlier times. Even in the time of Manu, Dravidians were acceptable to Aryans if they performed the necessary penances and rituals. [Indeed,] ... it was possible for almost any non-Aryan who had wealth and influence to find a Brahmin who would supervise the rituals and penances necessary to induct him into the Aryan order.

The Distinctiveness Of Dravidian Culture
Dravidian culture stands out among early Indian groups. For example, Hart points out that, whereas the Indo-Aryans commonly described an unchaste woman, the ancient Dravidians never mentioned such a character. Chastity, for the Dravidians, was extremely meaningful as marriage was their most important encounter with the sacred.


5 ibid., p. 191.


Today, an ideal of chastity not too different from the early Tamil one pervades all of India .... This trait ..., virtually universal today, spread from indigenous groups, chiefly from the Deccan culture of the Dravidians, and was embraced more and more by Aryan society.  

Further, according to Hart,

... it appears virtually certain that the practice of attributing power to woman as is found in early Tamil and Sanskrit ... was one that originated with the indigenous peoples of India, and probably with the megalithic Deccan Dravidian, which flourished in the first millennium B.C. Beginning about the third century B.C., practices associated with the sacred power attributed to woman began to make their way into Aryan India ....

Hart also notes that great numbers of Dravidian words began to find their way into Sanskrit and Indo-Aryan during the period of the epics. Both the Dravidian and the Aryan world-views are reflected in their respective poetry. While the Aryan mythology about the gods who were worshipped tended to dispose Sanskrit literature to narrative storytelling, Tamil (in the absence of mythology) generated "... the subjective, anonymous, introspective lyric using mainly suggestion ...."

As opposed to the Aryan gods who could suddenly spring into existence at ceremonies and be the subjects of stories, the Tamil deities were understood to be omnipresent, capricious or unstable concentrations of power that existed in particular things.

Harappan Civilisation

With regard to Harappan Civilisation and the stratification of the early Indo-Aryans, see Parpola's recent study which pays particular attention to the "priest-king" statue and its peculiar trefoil motif. According to Parpola, his work "...gives new evidence for the Harappan

---

8 ibid., pp. 118-119.
9 ibid., p. 117.
11 ibid., pp. 191-192.
and Dravidian origin of many conceptions and cultic practices that are central in later Indian religions, not only in Saivism and Sākta Tantrism, but in the Vedic ritual, too.\textsuperscript{12}

APPENDIX 2

Following the location of specific terms in the primary sources, entire passages containing these terms were initially transcribed, with the aid of a word-processing programme, onto the hard disk of a personal computer. A single electronic file thus represented an individual passage. The beginning of each file listed a file name, the specific term, and the source of the term (both primary and secondary) in order to identify the data contained therein. A brief summary of the context of the passage then preceded the passage itself.¹

Eventually, the electronic files containing the collected data grew to an excessive number. Consequently, the information became difficult to manage with the limited processing abilities of both the word-processing programme and the microcomputer. It was possible to identify and locate those files containing specific terms. Thereafter, the files were examined individually. Using the word-processed format, manipulation and evaluation of the data was extremely time-consuming and tedious. These problems were overcome, to a large degree, by using a text-oriented database management system (DBMS). That is to say, a microcomputer programme specifically designed to organise textual information.

¹ For example, a section containing the word "sati" (mindfulness) might also refer to jhānic states or perhaps locate the term within a list of seven powers including faith, energy, wisdom. See A.III.322-325; A.IV.3.
The numerous files containing information generated by the word-processor were converted to plain text (ASCII) format. These files were then imported into the DBMS and transformed into database format (i.e. as individual records containing pieces of data of variable length) to create one large file. The length of the imported ASCII file determined the size of the specific record it occupied within the large database file.

In the database format, selected records or all records in the file could be viewed. Specification of any term, part thereof, or combination of terms acts as a request to retrieve records containing text-data for examination. A retrieval word limits the selection of records: a partial match or a complete match of a requested word with a word in a record determines the selection of records for viewing. The provision of additional words in a request causes the retrieval to be more selective. Requests are performed on the entire database file.

The retrieval options can retrieve the particular term noted at the beginning of each record as well as locate the same term in a group of words anywhere in a record or in a relative position to other words. The display of information before and after the specified term creates a contextual field of information which can be browsed. Requested words are highlighted throughout the record regardless of context.

---

2 The term ASCII refers to a character coding scheme: American Standard Code for Information Intelligence. It has come to imply text-oriented data.

3 A common format that can be used by any programme. It lacks the special formatting that most programmes use for their data. A pure ASCII file contains line-oriented text with each line terminated by a carriage return and an optional line feed.

4 The database file can contain any number of records. Its size is limited by the available space on the hard disk of the microcomputer.
For example, a request for the word "jhāna" causes only records containing the word "jhāna" to be retrieved. A request for "samaṭha" and "vipassanā" selects only records containing these words in either order. A further request could call for instances where these words only occur in a given order, or together, etc. In addition, it is possible to call for records not containing these words.

Furthermore, the DBMS can count either the number of records containing a specified term or the total number of occurrences of a word in the database file in order to assess the probable preoccupation of the texts with certain practices. Examination of the selected records could then reveal the main sources referring to these practices. The output of such requests may be directed to the computer monitor, to a printer, or to a unique database file for detailed examination. Thus, the database can be sorted, searched, and analysed to determine the juxtaposition, frequency, and distribution of specific terms in context. However, the relatively rapid retrieval time of information represents the main advantage of using a database management system.

Following a request, the DBMS (unlike the word-processing programme) may use all of the main memory of the microcomputer to hold as much of the database file as will fit. Doing so greatly accelerates the processing of multiple records by reducing the number of disk accesses normally made on the file.

At the time of compiling the textual data, methodological literature was almost nil. Peter Norton's Inside the IBM PC\(^5\) helped eliminate most of the mystique regarding the fundamentals of the IBM microcomputer. The principles of operating this computer were mastered with the

---

aid of Van Wolverton's invaluable *Running MS DOS*.\(^6\) Thereafter, the intention was to create an improved model of a paper card index system on microcomputer. The basics of planning, building, and using a relational DBMS\(^7\) on a microcomputer were provided by Kroenke & Nilson in their *Database Processing for Microcomputers*\(^8\) and by Robert A. Byers in his *Everyman's Database Primer*.\(^9\) The principles involved were adapted later to suit a text-oriented DBMS created for commercial purposes. At that time, both popular and scholarly works made little reference to text-oriented DBMS either online or on microcomputer.\(^10\) Thus I developed and compiled the microcomputer database of terms in their context.

With the advent of improved storage technologies and lower storage costs, the number of text databases available through commercial online search and information retrieval systems as well as CD-ROM products will probably surpass databases of all other types.\(^11\) It is pleasing to note the University of California's project to compile a CD-ROM computer library of the Buddhist Pâli Texts. The Dhammakâya Foundation...


\(^7\) In relational systems, the information is usually small and, as a rule, arranged in the rows and columns of tables: e.g. dates, place names, code words, etc.


\(^10\) The following journals, however, provided useful discussion and software analysis: *Computing and History Today*, Association of History and Computing, R.J. Morris (ed.) Department of Economic and Social History, William Robertson Building, George Square, Edinburgh, EH88 9JY Scotland; *Social Science Computer Review*, published by Duke University Press, Box 6697, College Station, Durham NC 27708 England.

tion, in conjunction with the University of California, has recently created a database of all but eight volumes of the Pāli Text Society (PTS) edition of the Canon for mastering as a compact disk. The Foundation has since commenced adding "... a further 200 volumes to the database, comprising all of the PTS-published Tipitaka commentaries, sub-commentaries, English translations and reference works."¹² No doubt these texts will become available, eventually, in electronic form readable by the scholar using a microcomputer. Such will provide a tremendous and invaluable resource for Indology.

APPENDIX 3

Comparison of the Buddhist techniques for attaining *samādhi* with the Hindu *yoga* system developed much later by Patañjali shows that the final state of the released as described in the two systems is not very different. The eman­cipated state of Patañjali's *Yoga-sūtras* and the Buddhist *nibbāna* are both described as pure, free of defilements, uncompounded, infinite, and eternal (though *nibbāna* is not simply the result of *samādhi* practice). In addition, both are deeply concerned with unconditioned consciousness.¹

The stages in Patañjali's system of *yoga* and the process of *yoga* presented in the *Maitrī Upanisad* show a remarkable similarity with the early Buddhist system. In the light of the above, it can be inferred that Patañjali's system owes its origin, method, and structure to the early Buddhist system.

Comparison of the later sixfold *yoga* of the *Maitrī Upanisad* and Patañjali's *astanga yoga* with the Buddhist Tenfold Path to deliverance demonstrates a correspondence in contemplative technique which mainly emphasises the development of concentration. The comparison also shows an emerging conscious inclusion of a specific metaphysic, along with a code of ethical conduct into the Vedic stream of meditative practice. In the *Maitrī*, *tarka* (i.e. contemplative enquiry or inference in conformity with the scriptures) represents the internalising of the metaphysic of the Upanisadic sixfold *yoga* while *yama* and *niyama* of Patañjali's *astanga yoga* correspond with the physical discipline category (*śīla*) of Buddhist practice. Whereas internalisation of the Buddhist metaphysic leads beyond jhānic union (*via* insight) to

¹ The above comparison is quoted in full in this appendix. See below: *A Comparison of Hindu and Buddhist Techniques of Attaining Samādhi*. 
cessation, the Upanisadic tarka inclines to the union with Brahman in samâdhi -- and no further.

The failure to include a metaphysic in the astanga yoga creates a false impression that the system is merely a practical method which excludes the intellect from the process of meditation. Though Patañjali does not acknowledge a debt to anyone for his work, the commentators on the Yoga-sûtras identify his aphorisms on yoga as a treatise or pamphlet on the Sâñkhya system. Though some differences exist between Sâñkhya and Yoga, both agree on notions regarding "... the evolution of the universe from primary matter, the enumeration of the twenty-five categories of existence and the attainment of release through knowledge of the Self ...."² Patañjali holds the view that avidyâ is a positive, though mistaken, form of knowledge as opposed to ignorance.³ The maintenance of these beliefs acts as an implicit metaphysic. The transformation of such knowledge begins as an intellectual exercise to be realised intuitively through astanga yoga. The following table demonstrates the relationship of the stages in the various paths to salvation.

³ ibid., p. 8.
Paths To Salvation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>METAPHYSIC</th>
<th>EARLY UPS.</th>
<th>TENFOLD P.</th>
<th>SIXFOLD YOGA</th>
<th>ASTANGA YOGA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>S. Ditti</td>
<td>S. Sankappa</td>
<td>Tarka</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PHYSICAL DISCIPLINE</th>
<th>PHYSICAL DISCIPLINE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S. Vācā</td>
<td>S. Kammanta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Ajiva</td>
<td>Prānayāma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pratyāhāra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Niyama</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>āsana</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Prānayāma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pratyāhāra</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MENTAL DISCIPLINE</th>
<th>MENTAL DISCIPLINE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upāsanā</td>
<td>S. Vāyāma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Satī</td>
<td>Dhāranā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S. Samādhi</td>
<td>Dhyāna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Samādhi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dhāranā</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dhyāna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Samādhi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSIGHT</th>
<th>INSIGHT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S. Šāna</td>
<td>S. Vimutti</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There follows a comparison of Hindu and Buddhist techniques of attaining samādhi.

**A Comparison of Hindu and Buddhist Techniques of Attaining Samādhi**

_Yogas cittavṛtti-nirodyah_ 5

Yoga is the cessation of mind-movement.

Thus wrote Patanjali at the beginning of his _Yoga-sūtras_, relating to his technique of attaining final emancipation (mokṣa). Both Yogic and Buddhist schools of thought share fundamental presuppositions about yoga. Included, among others, are: a) the equation: existence equals suffering, and b) the doctrine of the possibility of obtaining transcendental knowledge (jñāna, prajñā). In addition, both schools stress a form of self-discipline for obtaining release. The growing preoccupation of contemporary western studies in religion and the therapies etc., with the nature of consciousness, the essential characteristics of human suffering, and the freedom from such, leads invariably to the examination and theoretical consideration of the individual’s efforts to master consciousness.


5 Patanjali’s _Yoga-sūtras_, I.2.
Our editors, in the Introduction, understand such expertise to encompass "... a greater capacity to deploy various forms of attention in a host of ways towards any particular objects, thoughts, and feelings which make up the whole of our sensory environments." Yogic practices, however, aim also to reduce those aspects of the consciousness flow which are viewed as hindrances to attaining the "... ideal of perceptual and cognitive freedom," i.e., the final emancipation of highest samādhi. It is my intention, in this essay, to compare Hindu and Buddhist techniques of achieving samādhi and thus to contribute, hopefully, a little to the clarification of some consciousness studies in Eastern traditions of philosophy, psychology, and religion.

In particular, I will examine the method relating to the samādhi of Patañjali's Yoga-sūtras and to that of the Buddhist P. rūpa and arūpa jhānas. In these cases, technique refers to the gradual removal of hindrances, to the refinement of consciousness, until the psychic flux is arrested and the experience of complete fusion of the subject and object of meditation ensues: then, "... the true nature of the object shines forth not distracted by the mind of the perceiver ...." 7

In Patañjali's system of yoga there are eight steps (astanga) or stages: two, namely moral restraints (yama) and disciplines of the body and psyche (niyama), are considered to be necessary preliminaries to the remainder: three are accessory to mind control by governing the disciplining of body (āsana), vital force (prānayāma) and senses (pratyāhāra) and the final three stages are the process by which the experience of unification occurs. These are concentration (dhyāna), meditation (dhyāna) and enstasy (samādhi), described as stasis and conjunction. 8 These three steps are known as "samāyama". The eighth stage, stasis, is the final phase of the unification process.

Dhāranā is "... holding the mind in a motionless state ..." by fixing it to some mental or external object by repeated effort. Eventually, an even current of thought (dhyāna), undisturbed by other thoughts, is directed towards the object, thus allowing the yogin "... to intercept the flux of ordinary activity," (citta-vṛtti) 9 which gradually diminishes as the absorption deepens. The result is samādhi.

When samādhi is obtained with the aid of an object of concentration, this is called "samprajñāta-samādhi"; the lower form of samādhi which is "the accurate knowing of distinguishables." 10 In samprajñāta-samādhi are eight ontological levels of the contemplated object and degrees of fusion attained. Each level has its own mode of function or logic. It may be that the states are not discrete but are differences discerned on a

---

6 Sanskrit has been used throughout except in cases where the Pāli seemed appropriate. These are marked with the letter "P".


continuum. These are: (a) vitarka, (b) vicāra, (c) ānanda and (d) asmitā, each of which have two forms: "sa" forms and "nir" forms. "Sa" forms are "propertied" when the object of meditation is associated with deliberation and reflection: the mind names the object (sabda), gives it significance (artha) and "... properties by comparison with some other thing (smtti) on the basis of remembered experience." They have a sense of "I".

"Nir" forms are those without deliberation and reflection: the mind does not interfere and so there is no "I" sense.

Both types are "seeded" (sabija); that is, they are "... in relation with a 'substratum' (support) and produce tendencies that are like 'seeds' for the future functions of consciousness." 12

Sa-vitarka samādhi, then, is enstasis when the mind has a gross (sthūla) aspect of the object of concentration as its base, while being accompanied by deliberation and reflection. It is a direct perception of the object that extends into the past and future. Nir-vitarka samādhi is the moment when the object is empty of name and meaning: when the mind ceases linking verbal and logical associations with it and the object is "... grasped directly ... as a concrete and irreducible datum." 13

Sa-vicāra samādhi is the level of knowing the subtle (sūksma) or inner aspect of the object of concentration accompanied with deliberation and reflection. However, in nir-vicāra samādhi, when absorption deepens and supramental reflection ceases "... thought then becomes one with these infinitesimal nucleuses of energy which constitute the true foundation of the physical universe." 14

At this same point of enstasis are found two other forms of contemplation; Ananda-samādhi, associated with supreme joy -- unspeakable bliss. This becomes the object of concentration, and all perception, including that of the subtle aspect, is abandoned. This leads to asmita-samādhi: the stage at which the self becomes the sole object of reflection and "... the yogi reaches his true self and understands 'I am (asmi) other than my body'." 15

This level of knowing is also called "dharma-megha-samādhi": the "cloud of dharma" in which the yogin "... feels that he is saturated (with virtues) and ... has a feeling of "Enough" in respect to all knowledge and all consciousness ..." and so precipitates the subject orientated enstasy -- asamprajñāta-samādhi. 16

---

11 ibid, p. 15.
13 ibid., pp. 81-83.
14 ibid., p. 83.
15 ibid., p. 84, quoting Vijñānabhikṣu's *Yogasāra-samgraha*.
16 ibid.
Asamprajñāta-samādhi, procured by supreme detachment or abandonment (para-vairāgya) of all worldly objects, still remains seeded with subconscious impressions (samskāras) but these are burnt up with repeated practice until the yogin attains the nirbija (without seed) state of kaivalya — "... the enstasis of total emptiness, without sensory content or intellectual structure ... in which the yogin is actually all Being." Emancipation!

The samādhi of Buddhism is considered to be similar to that of the Yoga-sūtras and the meditational techniques bear some similarity, as I hope to show. In this instance, I will examine, mainly, the different Buddhist raptures (P. jhāna) in relation to samprajñāta-samādhi and asamprajñāta-samādhi.

The Noble Eightfold Path of the Buddha, like Patañjali’s astanga-yoga, is concerned also with moral, bodily, and mental discipline. The last three members of the Path are directly related to the unification process. These are: (a) "right exertion" (P. samma-vāyama), which, by controlling the emotive reactions to external activity, wards off unwholesome mental activity; (b) "right mindfulness (P. samma-sati), which is the cultivation of awareness in order to keep the mental contents under constant control and to produce relaxation of body and mind. This is done by choosing a certain body function, such as breathing, and following it with the mind; and (c) the development of "right unification" (P. samma-samādhi) which comprises of eight meditative phases named P. "jhāna".

These phases of consciousness are progressively refined until all false ideas of life, matter and the hindrance of thought are dispersed. Like the levels of samādhi in the Yoga-sūtras, these are divided into two main types: (1) the P. rūpa jhānas which are attained by concentration and meditation on a mental or external form, and (2) the P. arūpa jhānas: the "formless attainments".

The four P. rūpa jhānas, the practice of mind-object contemplation, possess five psychological elements which are reduced as the concentration of mind intensifies. These are (1) investigation (vitarka, P. vitakka), (2) reasoning (vicāra), (3) zest (P. piti), (4) happiness (P. piti-sukha) and (5) one-pointedness of mind (P. ekaggatācitta).

The first P. jhāna is the state of mind in which the meditation is disassociated from sense desire and the five psychological factors, previously mentioned, arise in the meditator. The object of reflection is taken up and considered at length. This seems, to me, to be similar to the "sa" forms of samprajñāta-samādhi in which the object of concentration, in its gross and subtle aspects, is considered in similar light.

17 Feuerstein, op. cit., p. 132.
19 ibid., p. 170.
However, as concentration and bliss intensifies, the second P. jhāna is entered and the obstacles of applied and discursive thinking are dispensed with. 22 The "nir" forms of nir-vitarka and nir-vicāra samādhi bear a resemblance to this state in the sense that the gross and subtle aspects of that meditation are experienced without reflection.

When the third P. jhāna is entered, zest (P. pītī) is dispensed with, leaving happiness (P. pītī-sukha) and one pointedness of mind (P. ekaggata-citta). In this state, "... the sense of self is still further diminished ... there supervenes a clear, unruffled, perfectly conscious bliss ...." 23 Ananda samādhi resembles this experience because of supreme joy being its object of concentration. However, the tranquil, all satisfying happiness (P. pītī) of the third P. jhāna gives way to the subtle joy of tranquil mindfulness 24 which probably bears a greater resemblance to the transition towards asmita samādhi.

The last stage of the P. rūpa jhānas is reached when any kind of emotion is stopped and all that remains of the five psychological factors is one-pointedness of mind (P. ekaggata-citta); consciousness of opposites is transcended creating perfect equanimity 25 and consciousness passes beyond to the first of the P. arūpa jhānas: the formless attainments. I am reminded, here, of the renunciation of dharma-megha-samādhi and the entry to the subject orientated enstasy of asamprajñāta-samādhi by supreme detachment and abandonment of all worldly objects.

It is at this point of the essay that I would like to draw attention, again, to seeded consciousness and consciousness without seed. When it is seeded, consciousness is affected by suppressed ideas and feeling which remain as tendencies within the mind: these tendencies lose their power to germinate in the higher realms of consciousness. 26

I feel that the P. arūpa jhānas resemble the sabija-asamprajñāta-samādhi, which is seeded, at least, due to the inclination to sustain this samādhi. The formless attainments are seeded to the degree that they owe their movement, through the levels of consciousness, to karmic momentum and that the fourth P. arūpa jhāna is the stage of transition to consciousness without seed. As consciousness becomes increasingly purified "... the complete removal of one (P. arūpa) stage constitutes the attainment of the next." 27

---

23 Humphries, op. cit., p. 180, quoting Bhikkhu Silacara.
24 Feuerstein, op. cit., p. 58.
27 Vajirañāna, op. cit., p. 332.
Hindu Techniques

Samprajñāta-Samādhi - Subject-Object Orientated
"seeded"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samprajñāta-Samādhi</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sa-vitarka samādhi</td>
<td>&quot;with deliberation &amp; reflection&quot;; gross object of concentration is &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sa-vicāra samādhi</td>
<td>&quot;with deliberation &amp; reflection&quot;; &quot;inner&quot; aspect of object of concentration is &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sa-ānanda samādhi</td>
<td>&quot;with deliberation and reflection&quot;; bliss as object of concentration is &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sa-asmitā samādhi</td>
<td>&quot;with deliberation and reflection&quot;; self as object of concentration is &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-samādhi</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nir-vitarka samādhi</td>
<td>not &quot;with deliberation and reflection&quot;; gross object of concentration is not &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nir-vicāra samādhi</td>
<td>not &quot;with deliberation and reflection&quot;; &quot;inner&quot; aspect of object of concentration is not &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-samādhi</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nir-ānanda samādhi</td>
<td>bliss as object of concentration; not &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nir-asmita samādhi</td>
<td>self as object of concentration; not &quot;propertied&quot;.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Dharma-megha-samādhi (the "cloud of dharma")

Asamprajñāta - Subject Orientated
"seeded"

Burning up subconscious impressions.

Kaivalya - Without seed.
Appendix 3

Buddhist Techniques

Four P. Rūpa Jhānas - Subject-Object Orientated
"seeded"

First P. jhāna - Five psychological factors present:
1) Investigation/application of thought (vitarka, P. vitakka);
2) Reasoning/discursive thought (vicāra);
3) Zest (P. pīti);
4) Happiness (P. pīti-sukha);
5) One-pointedness of mind (P. ekaggatācitta).

Second P. jhāna - Three psychological factors present:
1) Zest (P. pīti);
2) Happiness (P. pīti-sukha);
3) One-pointedness (P. ekaggatācitta);
   Feeling of bliss intensified.

Third P. jhāna - Two psychological factors present:
1) Happiness (P. pīti-sukha);
2) One-pointedness of mind (P. ekaggatācitta).

Fourth P. jhāna - One psychological factor present:
1) One-pointedness of mind (P. ekaggatācitta).

Four Arūpa Jhānas (P.) - Subject Orientated
"seeded"
1st formless attainment: P. ākāsānañcaññayatana.
2nd formless attainment: P. viññānañcaññayatana.
3rd formless attainment: P. ākiñcaññayatana.
4th formless attainment: P. nevasaññāñcaññayatana.

Nirvāna (P. nibbāna) - without seed.
The first formless attainment is when the meditator abandons form as his object of concentration and practices space concentration\textsuperscript{28} to realise the sphere of space-infinity (P. ākāsāñcañcādyatana). Even so, he "... sees that his attainment is shadowed by the rūpa jhāna (and) wishes to attain the state of infinite consciousness, considering it to be even more tranquil."\textsuperscript{29} By continuing this practice, he passes beyond the sphere of infinite space and enters the sphere of infinite consciousness: the second formless attainment (P. viññāñcañcādyatana).

This, also, is seen as an imperfection so "... the consciousness lets go of every concept ... and enters a sphere where no-thing at all exists, not even the perception of nothingness (P. akīcañcādyatana). Self-consciousness is eliminated and "... the knower and known are merged in unity."\textsuperscript{30}

Yet, the bliss of its tranquility is felt as subtle perception and this can only be neutralised by entering the sphere of neither-perception-nor-non-perception (P. nevasaññāñcāñcādyatana). Thus, "... the limit of all karmic action is reached"\textsuperscript{31}; the yogin is at the final and transitional stage to the attainment of nirvāṇa "... which is the total suspension of mind, mental properties, and the mental qualities associated with mind."\textsuperscript{32}

There is similarity between Yogic and Buddhist techniques of attaining samādhi but in each case the emancipation is thought to be different. While admitting that yogins and non-Buddhist ascetics could have access to the eight transic states (P. jhānas), the Buddhists denied the authenticity of any claim by non-Buddhists to the attainment of the ninth state which is the release of nirvāṇa: the destruction of consciousness and sensation which was specifically a discovery of the Buddha.\textsuperscript{33} Whilst Buddhists (and others) would argue that kaivalya and nirvāṇa are completely different, the argument is perhaps not so clear. There is a striking correspondence between kaivalya and nirvāṇa in that both are thought of as pure, free of defilements, uncompounded, infinite, and eternal. Both are profoundly concerned with unconditioned consciousness. Furthermore, some doubt exists as to what is implied by the "destruction" of consciousness; i.e. when consciousness "stops" or "ceases" on the attainment of nirvāṇa.

It is not said to be annihilated. It no longer transmigrates.\textsuperscript{34} What happens to it? Perhaps this is the essential difference between kaivalya and nirvāṇa: the fact that Buddhist makes no positive statement about the final state of the released. Buddhist doctrine declares: "In the dead man, not only are the three formations (verbal, bodily and thought formations) stilled but
vitality is cut off. In a man who has entered the attainment of the dissolution of perception and sensation, although the (three) formations are stilled, vitality, heat and the faculties are not cut off. This is the difference.”

It could be that this difference applies equally to the achiever of kaivalya and that nirvāṇa equates with the nirbiṣa state of kaivalya.

In conclusion, I note that both Hindu and Buddhist yogins, after a period of moral and physical discipline, developed proficiency at attaining a degree of enstasy with the object of their concentration and, by the gradual removal of hindrances to consciousness, managed to intensify the degree of enstasy; eventually, object-orientated enstasy was transcended and a degree of formless attainment/subject-orientated enstasy ensued. This, however, was still liable to subtle partiality but was eventually surpassed to attain liberation and “… the knowledge of the ultimate reality of all objects, material and phenomenal.”

---

35 Upatissa, op. cit., p. 325.


Bapat, P.V. "Dhutangas (or ascetic practices of purification in Buddhism)," *Indian Historical Quarterly*, 13 (1937), 44-51.


Bharadwaja, K.D. "The Cult of Bhakti, Kalyāna Kalpataru (Gorakhpur), 19 (no date), 721-728.


Bibliography


*Computing and History Today*, Association of History and Computing, R.J. Morris (ed.) Department of Economic and Social History, William Robertson Building, George Square, Edinburgh, EH8 9JY Scotland.


Bibliography


Gonda, J. *Vedic Literature (Samhitâs and Brâhmanas)*, Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz, 1975.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Bibliography


Joshi, K.S. "On the Meaning of Yoga," Philosophy East and West, 15/1 (1965), 53-64.


Radhakrishnan, S. Indian Philosophy, vols 1 & 2, N.Y: Macmillan, 1929.


*Social Science Computer Review*, published by Duke University Press, Box 6697, College Station, Durham NC 27708 England.


Bibliography


